The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America

POLITICS, GOVERNANCE, AND JUDICIAL DESIGN

DANIEL M. BRINKS
University of Texas at Austin

ABBY BLASS
University of Texas at Austin
Contents

List of Figures xi
List of Tables xiii
Acknowledgments xv

1 Constitutional Justice in the Americas at the Turn of the Millennium 1
   1.1. Recent Trends in the Design of Constitutional Justice Systems 4
   1.2. Constitutional Governance Theory in a Nutshell 8
   1.3. Constitutional Ferment in 19 Latin American Countries, 1975–2009 11
   1.4. Contributions 15
   1.5. Looking Ahead 17

2 Judicial Power and the Design of Constitutional Justice 19
   2.1. Understanding and Measuring Judicial Power 20
   2.2. Disaggregating Judicial Power 22
      2.2.1. Autonomy 23
      2.2.2. Authority 28
      2.2.3. Interacting Autonomy and Authority 30
   2.3. Uneven Growth of Judicial Power in Latin America 31
      2.3.1. Using the Quantitative Measure to Describe the Region 31
      2.3.2. Qualitative Overview of Regional Trends 36
      2.3.3. Individual Countries 40
   2.4. Correlation or Causation: Do Formal Institutions Matter? 43
   2.5. Conclusion 47
3  Constitutional Governance and the Politics of Judicial Design 49
   3.1. Putting Existing Theories on the Same Plane 50
   3.2. A Unifying Theory: Courts as Mechanisms of Constitutional Governance 55
   3.3. Principles of Design for Constitutional Governance 57
   3.4. Alternative Logics 60
      3.4.1. Diffusion of Regional and Period Models 61
      3.4.2. Learning 62
      3.4.3. Regime-Specific Logics (Legitimacy) 63
   3.5. Conclusion 64

4  Identifying the Political Origins of Constitutional Justice through Quantitative Analysis 66
   4.1. From Theory to Hypotheses to Operationalization 67
      4.1.1. First Principle: The Ruling Coalition and the Scope of Authority 69
      4.1.2. Second Principle: The Originating Coalition and the Constitutional Governance Coalition 72
   4.2. Alternative Explanations 73
      4.2.1. Testing for Learning 73
      4.2.2. Testing for Diffusion 75
      4.2.3. Testing for Authoritarian Preferences 75
   4.3. Results 75
      4.3.1. The Courts' Scope of Authority 76
      4.3.2. Ex Ante Autonomy 80
      4.3.3. Ex Post Autonomy 82
      4.3.4. Combining the Three Dimensions 84
   4.4. Illustrative Cases 87
   4.5. Implications 88

   5.1. The History of Guatemala's Constitutional Justice System 96
   5.2. Key Features of the 1985 System of Constitutional Justice 106
   5.3. The Emergence of a Robust and Autonomous System in Guatemala 110
      5.3.1. The Originating Coalition and the Construction of the CGC 111
      5.3.2. The Originating Coalition and the Scope of Constitutional Justice 118