Grain Subsidies in Ukraine

The Role of WTO Law and the EU-Ukraine Association Agreement

By

Kateryna Zelenska
Contents

Acknowledgements xi
List of Abbreviations XII

Introduction 1
Identification of the Research Subject 1
Subject of the Study 4
The Course of Examination 4

1 Economic Aspects of State Support Measures (Subsidies) with Specific Consideration of Agriculture 7
  1.1 Nature and Impact of Subsidies 7
  1.2 Specificity of Agricultural Sector 11
    1.2.1 Features of Agricultural Markets 11
    1.2.2 Components of Agricultural Policies 13
    1.2.3 Development Aspects of Agricultural Policies 14
    1.2.4 Effects of Agricultural Support 15
    1.2.5 Justification of Agricultural Subsidies in Light of the Concept of Multifunctionality 16

Conclusion of Chapter 1 18

2 Introduction to Agricultural Policies in Ukraine 20
  2.1 Process of Agricultural Transition in Ukraine 20
    2.1.1 The Nature of Agricultural Transition 20
    2.1.2 Agricultural Transition in Eastern Europe: Common Trends and Specific Features in Ukraine 25
  2.2 Legal Framework of Agricultural Policies in Ukraine 40
    2.2.1 Lex generalis and Lex specialis of Grain Trade Regulation 40
    2.2.2 Organisation Forms of Agricultural Production in Ukraine 44
  2.3 Objective Handicaps for Agricultural Growth 50
    2.3.1 Grain Production Costs 50
    2.3.2 Farm-gate Prices 52
    2.3.3 Sustainability Concerns 52

Conclusion on Chapter 2 53

3 External Factors with Influence on Ukrainian Grain Policies 54
  Scope of the Chapter 54
  3.1 Implementation of Agricultural Disciplines within World Trade Law 55
CONTENTS

3.1 Emerging Power of the WTO 55
3.1.2 Particularities of Multilateral Regulation on Agricultural Trade 61
3.1.3 A Short Overview of the AoA Disciplines 63
3.1.4 Agricultural Policies in the Framework of the Doha Reform Process 83

3.2 Agricultural Commitments within Regional Trade Agreements 92
3.2.1 Issues Emerging with Proliferation of RTAs 92
3.2.2 Incorporation of Agriculture into Trade Deals 106

Conclusion of Chapter 3 151

4 Subsidy Definition: International Approaches in Regulation 152
Scope of the Chapter 152
4.1 Definition of Subsidy under WTO/GATT Law 152
4.1.1 Overview of Criteria 152
4.1.2 The Element of "financial contribution" (Art. 1.1.(a)(i) of the SCMA) 153
4.1.3 The Element of "government or any public body" 155
4.1.4 Alternatives to the Requirement of "financial contribution by government": Granting of Income or Price Support (Art. 1.1.(a)(i) of the SCMA) 157
4.1.5 The Element of "benefit" (Art. 1.1.(b) of the SCMA in Conjunction with Art. 14 of the SCMA) 158
4.1.6 The Element of "specificity" (Art. 1.2. of the SCMA) 159
4.1.7 Incorporation of Agricultural Subsidies into General Disciplines 160
4.1.8 "Peace Clause" Expiry and the Interplay between the SCMA and the AoA 161

4.2 The EU Approach to Subsidies 166
4.2.1 Introduction 166
4.2.2 The Element of Benefit ("aid in any form") 169
4.2.3 The Element of "public costs" 170
4.2.4 The Element of "selectivity" 172
4.2.5 State Aid v. Subsidy: ECJ Interpretation 173
4.2.6 Agricultural Subsidies in the EU State Aid System 173

4.3 Interplay of the WTO and EU Subsidy Concepts 190
4.4 Regulation of Subsidies in Ukraine 192
4.5 Incorporation of State Aid Regulation into the Framework of EU-Ukraine Co-operation 194
4.6 The EEU Approach to Domestic Support Regulation 200

Conclusion of Chapter 4 204
5 The EU Practice on Agricultural Support 206
   Scope of the Chapter 206
   5.1 The Development of European Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) 206
   5.2 Pillar I Measures Applicable to Cereals 210
      5.2.1 Grain Interventions 210
      5.2.2 Direct Payment Schemes 217
   5.3 Examples of Domestic Support “Greening” within Pillar II 233
      5.3.1 Investment Aid 233
      5.3.2 Risk Management Instruments of the CAP 235
   Conclusion on Chapter 5 243

6 Interplay between State Support for Grain in Ukraine and International Trade Commitments 244
   Scope of the Chapter 244
   6.1 Reference Point: Ukraine’s WTO Domestic Support Commitments 244
   6.2 Overview of State Support for Grain in Ukraine 245
   6.3 Price Support 246
      6.3.1 Direct Support 246
      6.3.2 State Grain Pledges 247
      6.3.3 Commodity and Financial Interventions for Cereals 250
      6.3.4 Provisional Price Administration 255
      6.3.5 State Forward Purchases 256
   Intermediary Summary 261
      6.3.6 Direct Price Controls 262
      6.3.7 Market Alternatives to State Price Interventions 264
   6.4 Quasi Income Support 265
      6.4.1 Subsidised Credits and Loans 265
      6.4.2 Leasing Subsidies 270
      6.4.3 Other Input Subsidies 272
   Intermediary Summary 277
      6.4.4 Alternatives for Input Subsidies 277
      6.4.5 Insurance Subsidies for Agricultural Producers 281
   6.5 Shortcomings of Agricultural Direct Support in Ukraine 286
      6.5.1 Foreseeability Concern 286
      6.5.2 Selectivity v. Equity 288
      6.5.3 Efficiency 289
   Intermediary Summary 290
   6.6 Indirect Support: Tax Subsidies 291
      6.6.1 Introduction to Ukraine’s System of Agricultural Taxation 291
6.6.2 Fixed Agricultural Tax (FAT) Regime 292
6.6.3 VAT Regime for Agricultural Production 297
6.6.4 Taxation of Private Households 309
Intermediary Summary 309
6.6.5 Taxation in the Framework of EU-Ukraine Co-Operation 310
6.6.6 General Summary on Agricultural Taxation in Ukraine 319
6.7 Legal Changes of Domestic Support after Ukraine's WTO Accession 321
6.7.1 The Factor of Economic Crisis 321
6.7.2 Changes in the Structure of Agricultural Support 322
6.7.3 Economic Impact of the WTO Accession on the Ukrainian Agricultural Sector 324
6.8 The Case of "External Domestic Support": Co-operation with China 325
6.8.1 China's Agricultural Credits 325
6.8.2 Assessment of Chinese Credits in the Light of WTO Law 330
Intermediary Summary 339
6.9 Proposals for Agricultural Policy Reform in Ukraine 340
6.9.1 Promotion of Private Investment 340
6.9.2 Direct Tackling of Farm Income Problem 344
Conclusions on Chapter 6 346

7 Export Measures for Foodstuffs: Rationale, Forms, and Impact 348
Scope of the Chapter 348
7.1 Export Restrictions 349
7.1.1 Rationale of Export Restrictions in Agricultural Trade 349
7.1.2 Factors Contributing to the Emerging Significance of Export Restrictions 350
Intermediary Summary 353
7.1.3 Regulation of Export Restrictions within the WTO/GATT System 353
Intermediary Summary 363
7.1.4 The Case of Export Duty 363
7.1.5 Export Restrictions and Investment Measures 366
7.1.6 Interplay of Export Restrictions and Subsidies 368
Intermediary Summary 370
7.1.7 Export Restrictions in the Doha Process 371
Intermediary Summary 372
7.2 Agricultural Export Policies in Ukraine 372
7.2.1 General Legal Framework 372
CONTENTS

7.2.2  *Ukraine's Sunflower Export Policies*  373
7.2.3  *Export Measures in the Cereals Sector*  376
7.2.4  *New Mechanisms of Quasi-Voluntary Export Restrictions by Exporters*  380

7.3  *Credibility of Ukraine's Justifications for Export Restraints*  382
7.3.1  *Arguments at the National Level*  382
7.3.2  *Arguments at the Multilateral Level*  383

7.4  *Alternative Measures*  390
7.4.1  *National Level*  390
7.4.2  *Regional Level*  392
7.4.3  *Global Approach: Alternative Measures at the Multilateral Level*  395

Intermediary Summary  400

7.5  *WTO Disciplines on Export-Incentive Measures in the Context of Ukraine's Agricultural Policies*  400
 *Rationale for the Examination*  400
7.5.1  *Distribution of Non-Commercial Stocks*  401
7.5.2  *Payments Financed by Virtue of Governmental Action*  404
7.5.3  *Reduction of Export Marketing Costs*  407
7.5.4  *Export Credit and Insurance Schemes*  408
7.5.5  *Regulation of Export-Incentive Measures within the EU-Ukraine AA*  412

Intermediary Summary  414

7.6  *Export Impact of State Trading*  414
7.6.1  *GATT Disciplines*  414
7.6.2  *STES in Agriculture*  418
7.6.3  *State Trading in Ukraine*  420
7.6.4  *State Trading Issues within the EU-Ukraine Cooperation*  425

Intermediary Summary  427

Conclusion on Chapter 7  428

Final Conclusions  429

Bibliography  435

Index  452