

Liberalization of Electricity Markets and Public Service Obligations in the Energy Community

Rozeta Karova

Table of Contents

List of Figures	xv
List of Tables	xvii
List of Abbreviations	xix
Preface	xxi
Acknowledgements	xxiii
Introduction	xxv
Part I	
The Framework	1
Chapter 1	
From a Textbook Model to an Incrementally Developing European Model for the Liberalization of Electricity Markets	3
1. The Textbook Model of Electricity Market Liberalization	4
2. Regulation of Electricity Markets before Liberalization: Strong Regulation of a Natural Monopoly	7
2.1. Definition of Regulation	7
2.2. Rationales for Regulation	8
2.2.1. Network Industries: The Case of Electricity	10
2.2.2. The Concept of a Natural Monopoly	11
2.2.3. Regulation of a (Natural) Monopoly	12
2.3. Regulatory Strategies	15
2.4. Regulation of the EU Electricity Markets before Liberalization	18

Table of Contents

3.	Liberalization of the Electricity Markets in the EU: Compromise between the Member States	19
3.1.	The European Policy for Liberalization of Electricity Markets in the EU	19
3.1.1.	Defining the Concept of Privatization and Reasons for Privatization	23
3.1.2.	Deregulation of the Electricity Industry	25
3.2.	Indicators for Liberalization	27
3.3.	Introducing Competition in the Electricity Industry	28
3.3.1.	Competition in the Wholesale Generation Market	30
3.3.2.	Competition in the Retail Supply Market	32
3.4.	Change in the Regulatory Strategy: Less Restrictive Regulation of the Remaining Monopolistic Activities	33
4.	The Incrementally Developed European Model of Liberalization	37
4.1.	The De Facto Liberalization of the European Electricity Markets	37
4.2.	The European Model of Liberalization of the Electricity Industry	39
5.	The EU Legal Framework	41
5.1.	Application of the Treaty Rules to the Electricity Sector	41
5.2.	Sector-Specific Legislation	43
5.2.1.	Sector Inquiry and the Third Package for Liberalization	45
5.2.2.	Overview and Development of the Key Provisions of the Electricity Directive	48
6.	First Intermediary Remarks	51

Chapter 2

PSO as a Regulatory Tool to Tackle the Impact of Electricity Market Liberalization 53

1.	Sequential Development of the PSO Concept and its Interpretation in Case Law	54
1.1.	Change in the Policy of State Intervention in Markets	54
1.2.	The Tensions between Conflicting Values and Regulatory Techniques	56
1.3.	The Legal Basis for Services in the General Interest and the CJ Case Law	58
1.3.1.	Article 37 TFEU and Article 106 TFEU	58
1.3.1.1.	Article 37 TFEU	59
1.3.1.2.	Article 106 TFEU	60
1.3.1.3.	The Energy Monopoly Cases	63
1.3.2.	Article 14 TFEU: From the Treaty of Amsterdam to the Lisbon Treaty	65
1.3.3.	Article 36 European Charter on Fundamental Rights	67

2.	SGEI Seen through the Eyes of the Different Actors in the Liberalization Process: The European Commission, the European Courts and the Member States	68
2.1.	The Commission's Documents: How difficult it is for European Definitions to Develop?	68
2.1.1.	Services of General Interest	70
2.1.2.	Services of General Economic Interest	71
2.1.3.	Non-economic Services of General Interest	73
2.1.4.	Public Service Obligation	74
2.1.5.	The Link between the Public Service Obligation and Universal Service	76
2.2.	Public Service Obligations: A Sector-specific Regulatory Tool to Balance Conflicting Values	78
2.3.	The EU Legislator: Conditions for PSOs Assessment under Article 3 Electricity Directive	80
2.3.1.	Publication of PSO and Article 3(2) Electricity Directive	80
2.3.2.	Notification of PSO	81
2.3.3.	PSO as a Justification for Derogations from the Electricity Directive	82
2.3.4.	Financial Compensation or Granting Exclusive Rights	82
2.4.	The Member States Filling in the Gaps: National Solutions for Implementing PSOs	87
2.4.1.	Types of PSOs	88
2.4.2.	Price of Electricity Supply: Regulated End-user Energy Prices	89
2.4.2.1.	End-user Energy Price Regulation in the Member States of the EU: An Overview	90
2.4.2.2.	The Commission's View on Regulated End-user Electricity Prices: Investigations and Infringement Procedures	92
2.4.3.	Security of Electricity Supply	95
2.4.3.1.	What Is Security of Electricity Supply?	95
2.4.3.2.	How Can Security of Supply Be Provided?	99
2.4.4.	Security of Electricity Supply in the EU Acquis	99
2.4.4.1.	Security of Supply Measures that the Member States Adopt for Ensuring Security of Supply, and the Commission's Position	102
2.5.	The Court of Justice Corrective Function: How much Flexibility Remains for Member States?	105
2.5.1.	CJ's Interpretation of Regulated End-user Prices as a PSO: Questioning the Speed of the UK-Inspired Commission Policy for Liberalization?	105

Table of Contents

2.5.2.	Justification of Regulated End-user Prices as PSO: Lessons from the Member States	109
2.5.2.1.	Regulated Prices for Vulnerable Customers (Article 3(7) and Article 3(8)) – Is it Allowed as Protection?	109
2.5.2.2.	Regulated Prices for All Households and Small Businesses – Justified as a PSO under the Universal Service Provision?	112
2.5.2.3.	Regulated End-user Electricity Prices for Medium- and Large size Businesses – also Justified as a PSO?	113
2.5.3.	CJ’s Interpretation of Member States’ Measures Related to Security of Supply	113
2.5.4.	Interaction between the Security of Supply Measures and the Establishment of Competitive Electricity Markets	114
2.5.4.1.	Assessment under Competition Law	115
2.5.4.2.	Assessment under the Electricity Acquis	116
2.5.5.	Justification of Measures for Security of Electricity Supply as a PSO: Lessons from Member States	117
3.	Second Intermediary Remarks	119

Chapter 3

The Power of the Commission in Implementing the Incrementally Developed European Model of Electricity Market Liberalization in Third Countries 123

1.	Export of the European Model to Central and Eastern Europe	124
1.1.	The European Union’s Policy towards CEE	124
1.2.	Regulatory Strategies in CEE	126
1.3.	Lessons from Exporting the EU Electricity <i>Acquis</i> to the CEE Countries	127
2.	The New EU Policy and Regulatory Strategies for the Liberalization of SEE Electricity Markets	128
2.1.	The European Union’s Energy Policy towards SEE	128
2.2.	The Athens Process: New Policy and Establishment of the Energy Community	131
2.2.1.	The Athens Memoranda	132
2.2.2.	Treaty Establishing the Energy Community	132
2.3.	Regional Initiatives for SEE	136
2.3.1.	Benefits from Regional Integration in SEE	137
2.3.2.	Regionalization Imposed on the SEE Countries from Outside	138
2.3.3.	Open Regionalism and Regional Ownership of Regional Initiatives in SEE	141
2.4.	The Rationale behind the Athens Process	142
2.4.1.	The Rationale of the EU to Launch the Athens Process	143

2.4.2.	The Rationale of the SEE countries	148
2.4.2.1.	Benefits from Regional Integration and Establishing a REM	148
2.4.2.2.	The EU Membership Perspective	155
2.4.3.	Concluding Remarks on the Rationale behind the Athens Process	157
2.5.	Regulatory Strategies in the SEE	159
2.5.1.	Regulation of the Electricity Industry in Former Yugoslavia	159
2.5.2.	Regulatory Strategies for the Liberalization of Electricity Markets in the SEE: Using the Same Tools as in the Old Member States	162
3.	Third Intermediary Remarks	163

Part II

Analysis of Electricity Market Liberalization in SEE	165
---	------------

Chapter 4

Implementation of the Incrementally Developed European Model of Electricity Market Liberalization in Third Countries	167
---	------------

1.	What is so specific about the SEE Electricity Markets?	168
1.1.	The Problems and Developments of the SEE Countries in the Years of Transition	168
1.2.	Difference between the Needs and Expectations of the Developing and Developed Countries	170
1.3.	Differences between the SEE and CEE Countries	173
2.	Establishing a REM	175
2.1.	Preconditions for Establishing a REM	176
2.2.	Benefits from the Creation of a REM and Obstacles for Effective Integration	177
2.3.	Development of the European ERI	179
2.4.	Definition of the SEE REM	182
3.	Implementing the European Model – Phase I: National Reforms as Preconditions for SEE REM	183
3.1.	Legislative Reforms	185
3.2.	Institutional Reforms	191
3.2.1.	Independence and Competences of the NRAs	194
3.2.2.	International Cooperation and Regional Institutional Activities	195
3.3.	Economic and Structural Reforms: Restructuring and Privatization	196
3.4.	Wholesale Electricity Markets in the Contracting Parties	205
3.4.1.	Generation Markets	205
3.4.2.	TSOs Unbundling	207
3.4.3.	TPA and Adoption of Technical Rules	211

Table of Contents

3.5. Retail Electricity Markets in the Contracting Parties	211
3.5.1. DSO Unbundling from the Supply and Generation Activities	211
3.5.2. Definition of Traders and Suppliers	216
3.5.3. Licensing and Numbers of Traders and Suppliers	222
3.5.4. Market Opening and Eligibility Threshold	230
4. Implementing the New European Policy for SEE – Phase 2: Market Design and Cross-Border Issues	241
4.1. National Market Designs	242
4.2. Standard Market Design for SEE REM	251
4.3. Cross-Border Issues	253
4.3.1. Inter-TSO Compensation Mechanism (ITC Mechanism)	253
4.3.2. Access Charges	255
4.3.3. Capacity Allocation and Congestion Management: The SEE CAO	255
4.3.3.1. The ERI Approach towards Common Congestion Management	257
4.3.3.2. The Common Congestion Management in the Eight REM: The SEE CAO	259
4.3.3.3. Transparency Requirements	263
5. Outlining the Progress and Identifying the Obstacles in the Liberalization Reforms in the Contracting Parties	263
5.1. Progress in the Reforms at National and Cross-Border Levels	264
5.2. Obstacles to Trade in the SEE REM	265
6. Fourth Intermediary Remarks	267

Chapter 5

Rethinking Liberalization through an Analysis of PSO: Is PSO a Useful Tool to Tackle the Impact of Electricity Market Liberalization in the Contracting Parties?	269
1. Understanding the PSO in the Contracting Parties	270
1.1. Assessment of PSOs in the Contracting Parties under Article 3 Electricity Directive	270
1.2. Defining the PSOs in the Contracting Parties – Are They Clearly Described, Transparent, Non-discriminatory and Verifiable?	271
2. Price of Supply PSO Measures in the Contracting Parties	278
2.1. End-user Energy Price Regulation in the Contracting Parties	278
2.1.1. Legislative Analysis of Tariff Methodologies	278
2.1.2. Customer Categories in the Contracting Parties	291
2.1.3. Regulated Prices, Tariff Evolution and Cross-subsidies in the Contracting Parties	295
2.1.4. Breakdown of Electricity Revenues	299
2.1.5. Relationship Between Tariff Levels and Consumption Patterns	302

2.1.6.	Reversibility and Road Maps for Abolishing Regulated Prices: Tariff Reforms	302
2.1.7.	Some Summary Remarks on Regulated End-user Electricity Prices	304
2.2.	Interaction Between the Regulated End-user Electricity Prices and Opening the Retail Electricity Markets to Competition: How much Discretion Remains for the Contracting Parties after Learning the Member States' Lessons?	305
3.	Alternatives to the Regulated End-user Electricity Prices	310
3.1.	Energy Poverty and the Affordability Issue	310
3.2.	Protection of Vulnerable Customers in the Member States: An Overview	315
3.3.	Protection of Vulnerable Customers in the Contracting Parties	317
3.3.1.	Definition of Vulnerable Customers	317
3.3.2.	Measures for Protection of Vulnerable Customers	320
3.3.3.	Concluding Remarks on the Definition and Measures for Protection of Vulnerable Consumers in the Contracting Parties	331
3.4.	Customer Protection in the Contracting Parties	332
4.	PSO Measures Related to Security of Supply in the Contracting Parties	334
4.1.	Security of Supply in the Energy Legislation of the Contracting Parties	334
4.2.	Analysis of the Security of Supply Measures in the Contracting Parties	338
4.3.	The Interaction Between the Security of Supply PSOs and Opening of the Wholesale Electricity Markets to Competition: Drawing on the Lessons from the Member States	344
5.	Fifth Intermediary Remarks	346
Conclusion		349
1.	Conceptual Remarks	350
1.1.	Recommendations in Relation to Understanding and Defining the PSOs	351
1.2.	Proposal for Notification of PSOs	353
2.	The Role of the Different Actors in the Liberalization Process	356
3.	Recommendation for more Efficient Use of the PSO Tool	360
3.1.	Policy Lessons for the Contracting Parties Related to Price of Supply PSO and Proposal for Alternative Measures for Customer Protection	361
3.1.1.	Proposals for Identification of Vulnerable Customers	363
3.1.2.	Proposals for Measures for Protection of Vulnerable Customers Other than Price Regulation	364
3.2.	Policy Lessons for the Contracting Parties in Relation to the Security of Supply PSO Measures	366

Table of Contents

3.3. Regulated Price of Electricity Supply and SoS Measures as PSOs: Interaction	368
4. Policy Lessons for the EU and the Path Forward for the Contracting Parties	370
Appendices	375
Annex I: Market Participants in the Electricity Markets of the Contracting Parties	375
Annex II: Energy Consumption and Supply, and Installed Capacity to Meet Electricity Demand in the Contracting Parties	382
Bibliography	389
Table of Statutes	403
Table of Cases	413
Energy Community Documents	415
Index	423