Reconciling Privatization with Human Rights

Antenor Hallo de Wolf
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. v
List of Abbreviations ............................................................................................................ xvii

Chapter I
General Introduction ............................................................................................................... 1

1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1
2. Problem and object of study ......................................................................................... 7
   2.1. Context of study ......................................................................................................... 7
   2.2. Human rights and privatization ............................................................................. 10
3. Methodology and structure of the study ...................................................................... 12

Part I
Theoretical Framework ........................................................................................................ 17

Chapter II
Privatization in Context ..................................................................................................... 19

1. Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 19
2. Privatization: definition, historical context, and nature ............................................. 19
   2.1. Defining privatization and its rationale ................................................................. 19
   2.2. Privatization – nationalization cycle in brief ....................................................... 22
       2.2.1. The privatization of ‘core’ or ‘intrinsic’ State functions ................................. 23
       2.2.2. The privatization of networks, and municipal services and utilities .......... 33
       2.2.3. Some observations ......................................................................................... 36
   2.3. Dynamic nature and rationale .............................................................................. 37
   2.4. Preliminary conclusions ......................................................................................... 40
3. Methods of privatization ............................................................................................... 41
   3.1. Privatization through the transfer of ownership .................................................. 42
   3.2. Privatization through the transfer of management ............................................... 42
   3.3. Privatization through contracting out .................................................................... 43
   3.4. Privatization through deliberate withdrawal or incapacity .................................. 43
   3.5. Preliminary conclusions ......................................................................................... 44
4. Privatization and its actors ........................................................................................... 44
   4.1. The State ................................................................................................................ 45
   4.2. International Financial Institutions (IFIs) ............................................................ 47
   4.3. National and Multinational Business Enterprises ................................................. 52
Chapter III  
Issues of Doctrine .............................................................................. 59

1. Introduction .................................................................................. 59
2. Privatization under national law .................................................. 60
   2.1. Privatization and national constitutions .................................. 61
      2.1.1. Substantive constraints ...................................................... 62
      2.1.2. Procedural constraints ...................................................... 67
      2.1.3. Constraints based on Constitutional/legal traditions ........... 67
   2.2. Preliminary conclusions .......................................................... 68
3. Privatization under general international law ............................... 69
   3.1. Relevant State obligations under international law ................. 76
      3.1.1. Obligations pertaining to International Treaty Law .......... 77
      3.1.2. Obligations pertaining to the principle of non-intervention .. 78
      3.1.3. Obligations pertaining to state responsibility ................. 79
      3.1.4. Obligations erga omnes .................................................. 90
      3.1.5. Some observations ......................................................... 91
   3.2. Obligations of non-State actors .............................................. 91
      3.2.1. Obligations of international financial institutions ............. 91
         3.2.1.1. Indirect human rights obligations? .............................. 94
         3.2.1.2. Practical accountability through internal auditing .......... 99
      3.2.2. Obligations of business enterprises ................................. 108
         3.2.2.1. Legal obligations and regulatory efforts .................... 112
         3.2.2.2. The search for accountability .................................. 121
      3.2.3. Some observations ......................................................... 124
   3.3. Preliminary conclusions ......................................................... 125
4. Privatization under human rights law .......................................... 126
   4.1. Obligations emanating from human rights treaties ................. 128
      4.1.1. Specific human rights obligation of States: General background .............................................. 129
      4.1.2. Positive and negative obligations ................................... 132
         4.1.2.1. Negative obligations and privatization ....................... 133
         4.1.2.2. Positive obligations and privatization ....................... 136
         4.1.2.3. Positive obligations: a duty to regulate privatized activity? .............................................. 142
      4.1.3. Obligations to respect, protect and fulfill .......................... 145
   4.1.4. Core obligations with respect to economic social and cultural rights .............................................. 148
   4.1.5. Some observations ......................................................... 149
2.2.1.3. The private entity must act in a public or governmental capacity ........................................ 222
2.2.2. Private actors acting under orders of, or whose conduct is controlled by the State ........................................ 224
2.3. Indirect state responsibility for failure to exercise due diligence ........................................ 230
2.4. Preliminary conclusions ........................................ 234
3. Responsibility of privatized actors as State actors exercising functions of a public nature ........................................ 236
3.1. Private actors as State organs under international and regional human rights treaties ........................................ 244
  3.1.1. Private actors as State organs in the case law of UN human rights treaty bodies ........................................ 245
  3.1.2. Private actors as State organs in the case law of the European Court of Human Rights ........................................ 248
  3.1.2.1. Public authority cases ........................................ 249
  3.1.2.2. Article 34 ECHR cases ........................................ 252
  3.1.2.3. Cases regarding responsibility for the conduct of non-State actors ........................................ 254
  3.1.3. Some observations ........................................ 257
3.2. Applicability of EU law to private actors exercising functions of a public nature ........................................ 258
  3.2.1. EU competition law and governmental authority ........................................ 258
  3.2.2. Freedom to provide services and official authority ........................................ 260
  3.2.3. Applicability of directives to private actors ........................................ 263
  3.2.4. Applicability of EU procurement law to private actors acting on behalf of the State ........................................ 269
    3.2.4.1. Contracting authorities or other bodies governed by public law ........................................ 269
    3.2.4.2. Other contracting entities not necessarily being public undertakings ........................................ 275
  3.2.5. Some observations ........................................ 277
3.3. Functions of a public nature and public authorities in the United Kingdom ........................................ 278
  3.3.1. Judicial review of private actors exercising public functions ........................................ 279
  3.3.2. Human rights review of private actors exercising public functions ........................................ 285
    3.3.2.1. Definition of a ‘public authority’ under the Human Rights Act ........................................ 286
    3.3.2.2. Interpretation of the Human Rights Act’s ‘public authority’ by British courts ........................................ 289
  3.3.3. Some observations ........................................ 301
3.4. Applicability of constitutional norms to private actors in the United States ........................................ 303
3.4.1. The state action doctrine ........................................ 306
  3.4.1.1. The 'public function' test .................................. 307
  3.4.1.2. The 'nexus' test ........................................... 314
  3.4.1.3. The 'joint action' test .................................... 316
  3.4.1.4. Private prisons ............................................ 318
3.4.2. Some observations ............................................ 321
3.5. Private entities as governmental actors in Canada ............... 322
  3.5.1. Formal applicability of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms ........................................ 323
  3.5.2. Charter applicability to non-State actors ................. 325
    3.5.2.1. Applicability to non-State actors that are considered to be 'government' ................................... 327
    3.5.2.2. Applicability to non-State actors performing a 'governmental function' .................................... 331
3.5.3. Some observations ............................................ 334
3.6. Applicability of public law norms in non common law countries ... 335
  3.6.1. Applicability of public law norms in France to public services carried out by private actors ............... 335
    3.6.1.1. The concept of service public ............................ 336
    3.6.1.2. The concept of contrat administratif .................... 340
  3.6.2. Applicability of public law norms in to privatized activities: the case of Ecuador .......................... 342
  3.6.3. Some observations ............................................ 347
3.7. Preliminary conclusions ......................................... 348
4. Concluding remarks ............................................. 351

Part II
Practice and Sectorial Analysis ....................................... 353

Chapter V
Privatization and the Practice of Human Rights Monitoring Mechanisms .... 355

1. Introduction ...................................................... 355
2. The UN human rights treaty bodies and privatization ............... 357
  2.1. Human Rights Committee ........................................ 359
    2.1.1. General Comments ......................................... 359
    2.1.2. Case law .................................................. 360
    2.1.3. Examination of State reports .............................. 363
  2.2. Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights ............ 368
    2.2.1. General Comments ......................................... 368
    2.2.2. Examination of State reports .............................. 372
2.3. Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination . 379
  2.3.1. General Comments .................................................. 379
  2.3.2. Examination of State reports .................................... 380
2.4. Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women . 382
  2.4.1. General Comments .................................................. 382
  2.4.2. Examination of State reports .................................... 383
2.5. Committee Against Torture ........................................... 385
  2.5.1. General Comments .................................................. 385
  2.5.2. Examination of State reports .................................... 386
2.6. Committee on the Rights of the Child ................................ 390
  2.6.1. General Comments .................................................. 390
  2.6.2. Examination of State reports .................................... 391
2.7. Preliminary conclusions ............................................. 394
3. The European human rights supervisory mechanisms and privatization . 395
  3.1. European Court of Human Rights ................................... 396
    3.1.1. Non-admissible or manifestly ill-founded privatization cases . 396
    3.1.2. Privatization as an issue of (indirect) concern before the European Court of Human Rights ........... 399
  3.2. European Committee on the Prevention of Torture ................. 406
    3.2.1. Prison privatization in the Netherlands Antilles ........... 407
    3.2.2. Prison privatization in the United Kingdom .................. 409
    3.2.3. Private Security services and the CPT ....................... 411
  3.3. European Committee for Economic and Social Rights ............... 413
    3.3.1. Privatization and the right to work .......................... 414
    3.3.2. Privatization, the right to bargain collectively and the right to strike ................................. 416
    3.3.3. Privatization, health care, social security and other welfare related rights ......................... 419
  3.4. Preliminary conclusions ............................................. 422
4. The International Labor Organization and privatization ............... 423
  4.1. Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations ........................................... 423
    4.1.1. Privatization and the prohibition of forced labor .......... 424
    4.1.2. Privatization and the freedom of association ............... 429
    4.1.3. Privatization and the protection of wages .................... 431
    4.1.4. Privatization and Social Security ........................... 431
    4.1.5. Privatization and the prohibition of discrimination at work ......................................................... 433
    4.1.6. Privatization and employment injury benefits ............... 434
    4.1.7. Privatization and employment .................................. 434
  4.2. ILO Bodies Dealing with complaints and allegations ............... 438
    4.2.1. The ILO Governing Body ........................................ 438
    4.2.2. Committee on Freedom of Association .......................... 440
    4.2.2.1. Privatization, job dismissals and anti-trade union discrimination ................................. 440
## Contents

Chapter VII  
Privatization of Essential Public Utilities ............................................... 529

1. Introduction ......................................................................................... 529
2. The privatization of water utilities: definition, (historical) context, and techniques ................................................................. 536
   2.1. Defining the privatization of water utilities .................................. 537
   2.2. The nature of essential network and water utilities and universal service obligations .................................................. 539
   2.3. Methods and modes of the privatization of water utilities ........ 544
       2.3.1. Service contracts .................................................................. 545
       2.3.2. Management contracts .......................................................... 546
       2.3.3. Lease contracts .................................................................... 546
       2.3.4. Concession contracts ............................................................. 547
       2.3.5. Build-Operate-Transfer contracts ......................................... 548
       2.3.6. (Full) divestiture .................................................................. 548
   2.4. Historical overview and reasons behind the privatization of water utilities ................................................................. 548
       2.4.1. Privatization of water utilities in 'developed’ countries ......... 549
       2.4.2. Privatization of water utilities in developing countries ...... 551
   2.5. Recent developments in the privatization of water utilities ....... 557
   2.6. Issues of general interest regarding privatization of water utilities and related services ....................................................... 565
       2.6.1. Private vs. public water ........................................................... 566
       2.6.2. Regulation of privatized water utilities .................................. 568
       2.6.3. Privatization of water utilities and GATS ................................ 575
           2.6.3.1. GATS: scope and application ......................................... 577
           2.6.3.2. GATS and privatization of water utilities? .................... 579
   2.7. Preliminary conclusions ................................................................. 585
3. The privatization of water utilities and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights ................................................................. 586
   3.1. The relationship between the privatization of water utilities and human rights ................................................................. 587
   3.2. The right to water: definition and normative content .............. 593
       3.2.1. Definition of the right to water ............................................. 593
       3.2.2. Normative content of the right to water ............................. 596
   3.3. Scope of obligations under the right to water ......................... 599
       3.3.1. General obligations ............................................................. 599
       3.3.2. Specific obligations of the right to water ............................ 601
       3.3.3. Core obligations of the right to water ................................ 610
       3.3.4. Violations of the right to water .......................................... 612
   3.4. Preliminary conclusions ................................................................. 617
4. Case study: the privatization of water utilities in the city of Buenos Aires
   4.1. The privatization of essential utilities in Argentina: background
   4.2. The Buenos Aires water concession
   4.3. Outcomes of the Buenos Aires water privatization
      4.3.1. Availability
      4.3.2. Quality
      4.3.3. Accessibility
         4.3.3.1. Physical accessibility
         4.3.3.2. Economic accessibility
         4.3.3.3. Non-discrimination accessibility
      4.3.4. Violations analysis
         4.3.4.1. Violations of obligation to respect
         4.3.4.2. Violations of obligation to protect
         4.3.4.3. Violations of obligation to fulfill
         4.3.4.4. Violations of core obligations
      4.3.5. Some observations
   4.4. Accountability for the effects of the privatization of water utilities in Buenos Aires
   4.5. Legal remedies available to individuals
   4.6. Preliminary conclusions
5. Concluding remarks

Chapter VIII
Summary and General Conclusions

1. Summary
2. Conclusions and recommendations

Samenvatting
Selected Bibliography
Table of Cases
Index
Curriculum Vitae