Lords of The Land

Indigenous Property Rights and The Jurisprudence of Empire

MARK HICKFORD DPhil (Oxon)
2008 New Zealand Law Foundation International Research Fellow

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
# Table of Contents

Preface and Acknowledgements vii  
List of Maps xiii  
List of Abbreviations xv  
Key Māori Terms xvii  
Table of Cases xix  
Table of Legislation and Bills xxiv

## 1. Preliminaries

Overture—forging native title in an empire of variations, 1837 to 1862 1  
Chapter outline 6  
Three key ingredients—non-justiciability, conceptual incommensurability, or jurisdictional incommensurability: the pre-eminence of politics and political constitutionalism in the making of native title 10  
The dynamism of native title—the politics of negotiability and the jurisprudence of empire 20  
‘Lords of the Land’—mid-nineteenth-century New Zealand was not a place for ‘banal constitutionalism’ 31  
Unravelling and reframing Māori constitutional and political thought on territorial rights 37

## 2. An Empire of Variations: Problems of Settlement and the Property Rights of Indigenous Populations 40  
Seeing native title through stadialism and ius gentium entwined 40  
Trails of transmission to a particular colony and the relevance of empire 47  
A New Zealand Association advocating ‘systematic colonization’ 61  
From Association to Company 82  
A corporation acquiring territories 99  
Several proclamations and a treaty 107  
Conclusion: conversing with a corporation 107

## 3. Incredulity from a Distance: Disputing the Content of Indigenous Proprietary Entitlements, 1840 to 1844 110  
Disciplining ‘adventurers without law’: the uses of ius gentium, 1840 to 1844 116  
Unsettling intelligence, ‘disciplining moments’, and the extent of native title 139  
Conclusion 162

## 4. ‘Vague Native Rights to Land’: Constitutionalism, Native Title, and Pursuing Settling Spaces, 1844–1853 164  
Interrogating customs and sources of unease 175  
Custom and its discontents, part I—Bell, Stanley, Hope, and Howick 180  
Denouement: two Greys and the survival of ‘occupancy’; 1845–1853 193  
Symonds contextualized 202
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Placing the Treaty of Waitangi—native title and court decisions as a resource for colonial government disciplining subjects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whither the Treaty of Waitangi? The conditionality of United States jurisprudence applied to New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Custom and its discontents, part II—Martin, Merivale, and the third Earl Grey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Wesleyan Missionary Society, the incidents of native title, and living with abstract disagreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Aborigines' Protection Society—'magisterial jurisdiction' and 'territorial jurisdiction'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Modus vivendi</em> and proprietary rights—the politics of negotiability and living with indeterminacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand’s lost whig foundations—diversity and balance in a ‘baroque’ constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional pluralism, constitutional adjustment, and native title—constitutions as process and negotiability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native title illuminating British political debates about colonial constitutional design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. **Extricating 'Native Title from its Present Entanglement'—Recognizing Diversity and the Problem of a Liberal Constitution** 244

| A jurisprudence in the shadows—balanced constitutions and native title | 245 |
| Jurisdictional incommensurability, conceptual incommensurability, and non-justiciability—the electoral franchise and native title | 249 |
| Jurisdictional incommensurability continued—a board of inquiry in 1856 | 267 |
| 'They are all entangled or matted together' | 269 |
| Constitutional condominium or consociation—reconceiving Crown–Māori relations in colonial New Zealand | 273 |
| This 'tendency to self-organization'—colonial administration looking for inroads, intersections, and uptake | 276 |
| The philosophy and political economy of individualizing native title through Crown grants—1856–1860 | 283 |
| How to transform native title—indigenous communities as vectors of, and volunteers for, change | 286 |
| The necessity for courts to investigate native title—'Negotiations and diplomacy will have no force, and no public support' | 298 |
| State-building and experimentation—the Native Territorial Rights Bill and the 'exclusive use and occupancy of any lands' | 300 |
| 'No well-defined law' to guide and 'exclusive use and occupancy' | 303 |
| Fashioning statutory windows of communicability between indigenous custom and English law | 320 |
| 'How to reconcile this work of civilization with the fair claims and rights of the natives is the problem which the Government has to solve' | 324 |
| Conclusions | 327 |
Table of Contents

6. Exploring the Dynamics and Consequences of 'Occasional Association'

The metaphor and problem of 'occasional association'

'Occasional negotiation' and the metaphor of

'occasional association'—an extended essay in two parts

Part I—the Native Council Bill of 1860—an exceptional experiment in

legislative design and imperial constitutionalism

Governing subjects as strangers and legislative design—double government,

British South Asia, the Cape Colony, and New Zealand

Part II—the conditionality of the introduced colonial constitution—the

revival and denouement of an imperial native council option

'The incorporation of the two races in one body politic'—letters

patent and an imperial native council: native title, administering native
districts, and the levers of imperial military assistance and funding

An imperial native council option confounded—the second cut

Conclusions—a study in failure

7. 'Tribunals Independent of a Prince', 1859–1862—Exploring the

Dynamics and Consequences of 'Occasional Association', Part II

'Whatever may be the true theory of native tenure'—of native title,

mana, and seignorial rights

Negotiations for the acquisition of the Pekapeka block in

Waitara, 1859 and 1860

Warring memoranda—setting the scene

Indigenous orders, the conditionality of the introduced colonial

constitution, and the three sticks of law, the divine being, and the mana

of New Zealand in disunion

Constitutional reflections—living with indeterminacy and disagreement

Communal or tribal rights, political autonomy, and rights of government as

a parochial and trans-oceanic theme—the political constitutionalism of

native title, New Zealand, Algeria, and the law of nations

'It seems agreed that native title is marvellously complex'

Casting Waitara as a constitutional moment—Martin's

The Taranaki Question and a beginning to the warring of pamphlets

'A country without law and a prince'—the Treaty as an usher for rights-talk;

individual and collective rights

Who interprets?—'Tribunals independent of the prince' and

the meanings of the Treaty of Waitangi

The Native Land Court, 1861–1862: a 'title sifted through' a statutory tribunal

8. Conclusions—Constitutional Design and the Treaty of Waitangi:

Balanced Constitutions, Native Title, and the Normativity of Political

Constitutionalism

Bibliography

Index