The Judiciary in Central and Eastern Europe

Mechanical Jurisprudence in Transformation?

By
Zdeněk Kühn
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS  
[Page: xiii]

## INTRODUCTION  
[Page: xv]

I. Searching for the Continuity in Legal Thinking of Post-Communist Europe  
[Page: xv]

II. Roadmap of the Book  
[Page: xviii]

## CHAPTER ONE. THE ORIGINS OF CENTRAL EUROPEAN LEGAL CULTURE  
[Page: 1]

I. The Austrian Legal Tradition  
[Page: 4]

II. The Central European Legal Systems in the Aftermath of World War I  
   II.1. Hungarian Law  
   [Page: 4]
   II.2. Polish Law  
   [Page: 6]
   II.3. Czechoslovak Law  
   [Page: 7]

III. The Status of Judges and its Problems  
[Page: 9]

IV. Legal Professions in Central Europe Prior to Communism  
[Page: 14]

V. The Experience of World War II  
[Page: 17]

## CHAPTER TWO. SOCIALIST LEGAL CULTURE IN CENTRAL EUROPE: AN INTRODUCTION  
[Page: 21]

I. The Success of Stalinization  
[Page: 31]

II. The Political Trials of the 1950s  
[Page: 31]

III. From the 1960s through the 1980s  
[Page: 34]

IV. The Transformation of the Legal System  
   IV.1. Towards Law Comprehensible to All  
   [Page: 36]
   IV.2. The Inclusion of Laymen  
   [Page: 40]
   IV.3. Restricting the Competence of the Courts and the Proliferation of Decrees  
   [Page: 43]
   IV.4. Leaving the Continental Tradition  
   [Page: 46]
   IV.5. The Prosecutor: The Main Guardian of Socialist Legality  
   [Page: 50]
V. Law and Everyday Life 45
VI. Law Students during Socialism 49
VII. The Legal and Social Status of Lawyers and Judges in Particular 52
VIII. Assessing Judicial Independence 57
IX. Conclusions: Central European Legal Culture on the Eve of 1989 62

CHAPTER THREE. FROM STALINIST ANTI-FORMALISM TO SOCIALIST TEXTUAL POSITIVISM: CENTRAL EUROPEAN JUDICIAL METHODOLOGY DURING THE COLD WAR

I. Ideologies of Judicial Decision-Making 67
  I.1. The Ideologies of Bound and Free Judicial Decision-Making in Comparison 69
  I.2. Formalism and Anti-Formalism in Judicial Reasoning 74
  I.3. The Decline of Formalism and Bound Judicial Decision-Making in Western Law 77
  I.4. Western European Judicial Practice 86

II. The Socialist Judge in the 1950s: A Builder of Communism 88
  II.1. The Soviet Idea of Law 88
    II.1.1. Antecedents: Anti-Positivism
    II.1.2. Towards Stalinist Law: A New Concept of Law and Its Inner Contradiction
    II.1.3. The Origins of Stalinist Judicial Activism
  II.2. The Aftermath of the Communist Takeover and the Beginnings of the Transformation of Judicial Rhetoric 98
    II.2.1. Stalinist Decentralized Constitutional Review: A Short-Lived Novelty
    II.2.2. Marxist Ideology in Adjudication
    II.2.3. Identification of Law with Morality?
    II.2.4. The Instrumental Concept of the Law
    II.2.5. Heavy Emphasis on Criminal Sanctions

III. The End of Stalinism and the New Socialist Textual Positivism 116
  III.1. Post-Stalinist Desiderata: Stability and Formality 116
  III.2. The Contradiction between Claimed Anti-Formalism and Practiced Ultra-Formalism 120
### Table of Contents

#### III.4. Constructing the Concept of Limited Law
- III.4.1. Legal Education
- III.4.2. Socialist Scholarship
- III.4.3. Static Interpretation of the Law
- III.4.4. Western Law as Seen by Communist Lawyers
- III.4.5. The Communist Countries Did Not Need Long-Lasting Codes but Ever-Changing Laws

#### IV. Socialist Legal Injustice: Formalism versus Anti-Formalism Revisited

#### V. An Attempt to Explain the Rationale of Socialist Ultra-Formalism

#### CHAPTER FOUR. INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES AFTER THE COLLAPSE OF COMMUNISM

| I. | The Replacement of Judges | 164 |
| II. | Introducing the Actors | 169 |
| II.1. Professional Career Judges Born from Infant Judges | 169 |
| II.2. Who Are Central European Constitutional Justices? | 174 |
| III. | The Rise of Litigation | 176 |
| IV. | The Independence of Judges after the Fall of Communism | 178 |
| V. | Towards More Efficient Procedure | 182 |

#### CHAPTER FIVE. JUDICIAL METHODOLOGY IN A POST-COMMUNIST WORLD: OVERCOMING THE CONCEPT OF LIMITED LAW?

| I. | The Judicial Discourse on Formalism. The Institutional Background | 191 |
| I.1. Unpublished Case Law | 191 |
| I.2. Constitutional and Ordinary Courts | 192 |
| II. | Discourse between the Czech Constitutional Court and Ordinary Courts. The Ideology of the Bound Judicial Decision-Making Challenged | 199 |
| II.1. The Concept of 'Mechanical Jurisprudence': A Slow Transformation | 199 |
II.2. Limited Law and Limited Sources of Law

II.2.1. Listening to Legal Academia
II.2.2. The Issue of Precedent
II.2.3. The Czech Constitutional Court on the Binding Force of Precedents of Ordinary Courts

III. Textual Positivism: Public Critique and the Position of Legal Science

IV. The Issue of the Binding Force of Decisions of Constitutional Courts

IV.1. Case Study: 'The War of Courts' in Poland and the Czech Republic
IV.2. The Problem of Interpretation Consistent with the Constitution

V. Making New Constitutionalism Inclusive vis-à-vis the Ordinary Courts: The Problem of the 'Over-Centralization' of Centralized Judicial Review

V.1. Former Czechoslovakia: The Empires of Centralized Judicial Review
V.2. Poland: Activism of the Ordinary Judges and the Battle over Centralized Judicial Review
V.3. On Disobedient Judges: The Polish and Czech Situation Compared
V.4. Centralized versus Decentralized Constitutional Review Revisited

VI. Learning Abroad: Comparative Constitutionalism and Central European Constitutional Courts

VII. New European Judges

VII.1. The Application of EU Law prior to EU Enlargement
VII.1.1. Examples of Application
VII.1.2. Examples of Non-Application
VII.2. Central European Judges as New "European" Judges
VII.2.1. The Application of European Law: General Maxims
VII.2.2. Constitutional Courts
VII.2.3. Ordinary Courts I: Textual Positivism and European Law
VII.2.4. Textual Positivism and European Law: Case Scenario
VII.2.5. Ordinary Courts II: Two Different Conceptions of Law

VII.3. Reconsidering the Principle Iura novit curia: Authoritarian versus Authoritative Approach to Law
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Contents</th>
<th>xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS. RETHINKING THE FUTURE OF THE CENTRAL EUROPEAN JUDICIARY</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUBJECT-MATTER INDEX</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDEX OF PERSONAL NAMES</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABOUT THE AUTHOR</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>