THE LAW AND POLITICS OF WTO WAIVERS

Stability and Flexibility in Public International Law

ISABEL FEICHTNER
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements page xiv

1 Why study the WTO waiver? 1

PART I: The stability/flexibility challenge in public international law and particularly the WTO 5

2 The stability/flexibility challenge in public international law 6

A. International law as public law 6

B. The flexibility challenge 8

   I The domestic perspective 8
   II The intra-regime perspective 10
   III The inter-regime perspective 11

C. Ways to flexibilize international law: exceptionalism, managerialism and transnational political law-making 12

   I Exceptionalism 13
   II Managerialism 14
   III Transnational political law-making 15

3 The WTO – public law of conflict management 20

A. The objectives of the WTO: reciprocal trade liberalization, protection of individual autonomy or conflict management? 21

   I Trade liberalization to enhance welfare 21
   II Trade liberalization to protect individual autonomy 23
   III Conflict management 24

B. WTO law: contract or public law? 31

   I WTO law as contract 31

vii
CONTENTS

1 Law as fallback option in a community of interests under the GATT 1947 32
2 Law as an instrument to ensure efficient compliance 34

II WTO law as public law 38
1 WTO law's constitutive function 39
   1.1 From the protection of actual trade flows to the protection of market conditions 39
   1.2 Security and predictability for economic operators 41
   1.3 Legitimating compromise between competing interests 42
   1.4 Integration with other legal regimes 42
2 WTO law as restriction on the exercise of public authority 43
3 WTO law as constitution? 43

III Conclusion 45

C. Flexibility challenges 45
I Domestic preferences 46
II Claims of inadequacy and injustice 50
III Regime coordination 53

D. The potential of the waiver power to achieve flexibility 55

PART II: The practice and law of waivers 57

4 The waiver power and practice of the GATT 1947 and the WTO 58

A. The waiver power of the GATT 1947 and the WTO 58

B. The waiver practice of the GATT 1947 and the WTO 62
   I Individual waiver decisions 65
   1 Waivers to account for capacity problems 66
      1.1 Waivers that extend transitional periods to implement obligations under the Customs Valuation Agreement 66
      1.2 Individual Harmonized System waiver decisions 70
      1.3 Waivers of Cuba's obligation under Art. XV:6 GATT 72
   2 Waivers to accommodate policy preferences 73
      2.1 WTO practice 73
         (a) Waivers legalizing trade-related investment measures 73
         (b) Waivers of the obligation to comply with specific commitments 79
      2.2 GATT 1947 practice 83
         (a) Waivers to legalize protectionist measures 84
CONTENTS

(i) US Agricultural Waiver 84
(ii) Hard-core Waiver and other waivers to legalize residual quantitative restrictions 86
(iii) UK Margins of Preferences Waiver 88
(iv) Waivers legalizing tariff surcharges – a special case of waivers to address the inefficiency of legal rules 90
(b) Waivers to legalize market integration 91
(i) ECSC Waiver 91
(ii) US Automotive Products Waiver 93
(c) Conclusion 96

3 Preferences – waivers to pursue external policy objectives 97
3.1 Selected tariff preferences before the Generalized System of Preferences 99
3.2 Towards a general exception from the most-favoured-nation principle for preferences 103
3.3 Special trade preferences after negotiation of the Generalized System of Preferences 110
(a) GATT practice on special preference schemes outside the GSP 111
(b) WTO practice on special preferences outside the GSP 114
(i) The Cotonou and Bananas Waivers 116
(ii) The CBERA, ATPA and AGOA Waivers 119
(iii) EC GSP + preferences 121

4 Conclusion 122

II Collective waiver decisions 124
1 Deferral of the obligation to comply 125
1.1 Art. XX Part II GATT 1947 125
1.2 Art. 70.9 TRIPS Agreement 126
2 Modification of legal rules 130
2.1 GATT and WTO waivers to legalize trade preferences under the Generalized System of Preferences and among developing countries 132
(a) 1971 waivers to legalize preferences under GSP and between developing countries 132
(b) 1999 waiver for preferential tariff treatment for least-developed countries 137
2.2 The TRIPS Waiver 139

3 Regime linkage 143
3.1 Collective Harmonized System waivers: effective cooperation in a regime complex 144
3.2 The Kimberley Waiver: deference to another international legal regime to avoid norm conflict 152

4 Conclusion 157
CONTENTS

III One waiver power – multiple flexibility instruments: a typology of waiver decisions 157

C. Unadopted and unrequested waiver decisions 158

5 The law of waivers 163

A. Waiver decisions as secondary law 163
   I Qualification as secondary legal acts 163
   II Legal effects of waiver decisions 169
      1 Legal effects for the beneficiary of the waiver decision 169
      2 Legal effects for the organization and members who are not beneficiaries of the waiver decision 170

B. Substantive requirements for the exercise of the waiver competence 173
   I The waiver competence 173
   II Obligations that can be waived 175
   III Substantive requirements 181
      1 The ‘exceptional circumstances’ requirement 182
         1.1 Textual, systematic and historical interpretation 183
         1.2 Case law 184
         1.3 Waiver practice 185
         1.4 The rhetorical and procedural function of the ‘exceptional circumstances’ requirement in the waiver process 188
      2 No other legal justification 189
      3 No substantial trade diversion 193
      4 Consistency with the organization’s objectives 194

C. The waiver procedure and process 196
   I The waiver request 197
   II Examination of waiver requests 201
      1 The organs involved 202
      2 The examination process 204
      3 Representation of the collective interest – the role of Secretariat and chairpersons 209
      4 Institutional linkages and participation of NGOs 213
   III Decision-making 216
      1 Decision-making by the GATT CONTRACTING PARTIES 217
      2 Decision-making in the WTO 218

D. Form and content of waiver decisions 221
   I The form of waiver decisions 221
   II The duration of waivers 223
CONTENTS

III The terms and conditions governing the application of waivers 225
   1 Preambles and chairperson statements 225
   2 Terms and conditions in the operative part of waiver decisions 228
      2.1 Requirements relating to the measure which is legalized by the waiver 228
      2.2 Phase-out and implementation requirements 229
      2.3 Notification, information and reporting requirements 230
      2.4 Compensation, consultation and dispute settlement 231
      2.5 Consequences of non-compliance with terms and conditions 234
   3 Creation of new obligations 237

E. Interpretation 238
   I Narrow interpretation of waiver decisions? 238
      1 Interpretation of individual waiver decisions 240
      2 Interpretation of collective waiver decisions 243
   II References to non-WTO law to interpret waiver decisions 246

F. Review of waiver decisions 247
   I Political review 247
   II Judicial review 252
      1 Judicial review of waiver decisions 253
      2 Judicial review of compliance with the terms and conditions of a waiver decision 257
         2.1 Violation complaints based on the alleged violation of a treaty obligation 257
         2.2 Violation complaints based on the alleged violation of the terms of a waiver decision 258
      3 Non-violation complaints: liability for measures legalized by waiver decisions 259
         3.1 Non-violation complaints under the GATT 1947 and in the WTO 259
         3.2 Non-violation complaints with respect to measures justified by a waiver 262
            (a) Requirements for a successful non-violation complaint 264
            (b) Inconsistency of the measure with treaty law 265
            (c) Nullification or impairment 266
            (d) Consequences of a successful non-violation complaint 269
            (e) When should non-violation complaints be admissible? 269
G. Waivers and domestic law 270
   I The effect of waiver decisions in domestic legal orders 270
   II Waivers required by domestic law 271
   III Waivers and direct effect 272

H. Conclusions 272

PART III: The potential of waivers to address the stability/flexibility challenge in international law 275

6 The potential of the waiver as a flexibility device 276

A. The accommodation of individual needs and preferences in international legal regimes 278
   I Reservations 278
      1 Reservations to international treaties 279
      2 Reservations under the GATT 1947 and in the WTO 284
   II Variable geometry 288
   III General rules and exceptions and the need for additional exit options 293
      1 General rules 293
      2 Special and differential treatment 294
      3 Escape clauses 295
      4 The need for additional exit options 296
         4.1 The potential of waivers in light of the uncertainty concerning the operation of legal rules 297
            (a) Uncertainty as to the effects of compliance 297
            (b) Uncertainty as to the scope of obligation 299
         4.2 Waivers as exception for domestic preferences 300
   IV Limitations on law enforcement 305
      1 Subsidiarity 306
      2 Compliance management 308
   V Conclusion 310

B. The accommodation of collective needs and preferences: waivers compared to interpretation and amendment 311
   I The need for political solutions to norm and interest conflicts 312
   II The waiver as deference to another international legal regime 317
   III Norm change through waivers 323

C. Conclusion 325

7 The politics of the waiver process 327

A. The waiver process: bargaining, administration, debate 329
I  Three types of international law-making: bargaining, administration and transnational politics 330
   1  Bargaining 330
   2  Administration 331
   3  Transnational politics 332
II  Waiver processes in the WTO 335
   1  Special preferences waivers: bargaining for consensus 335
   2  Harmonized System waivers: administration in the WTO 339
   3  The TRIPS Waiver: political debate on norm change 341

B. The potential of the waiver process in increasing the legitimacy and effectiveness of WTO law 344
   I  The right to request a waiver 344
   II  Timely consideration of waiver requests 345
   III Separation and specification of issues 345
   IV Openness of the process to non-legal and non-economic arguments 347
   V  The requirements of a reasoned request and a reasoned decision 349

8  Conclusion 353

Bibliography 355
Index 381