Blame it on the WTO?

*A Human Rights Critique*

SARAH JOSEPH
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Cases</th>
<th>xix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of Conventions, Declarations, and other Instruments</td>
<td>xxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xxxi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Introduction

1. **Introducing the WTO and International Human Rights Law Regimes**
   A. The World Trade Organization
       * Raison d'être of the WTO
   B. The International Human Rights Regime
       * UN standards
       * UN human rights institutions and enforcement machinery
       * Regional systems
       * The ICCPR and the ICESCR
   C. A Closer Look at Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights
       * Progressive obligations
       * Maximum available resources
       * Immediate obligations under the ICESCR
       * Justiciability of ICESCR rights
   D. Human Rights and Customary International Law
   E. Conclusion

2. **Relationship between the WTO and International Human Rights Law**
   A. Underlying Values
       * Freedoms and rights under trade law and human rights law
       * Non-discrimination
       * Rule of law
       * Economic efficiency and enhanced welfare
       * Cultural and economic relativism
   B. Normative Relationship between the WTO and International Human Rights Law
       * WTO jurisprudence and human rights
       * Human rights jurisprudence and the WTO
   C. Conclusion
3 Democratic Deficit and the WTO

A. The Two Components to the WTO/Democratic Deficit Argument 56
   'Non-trade' interests 58
   Developing States 62
   Dispute settlement 65
   WTO secretariat 67
   Conclusion on WTO processes 68
B. The Relevance of International Human Rights Law 71
C. Democratic Deficit, the WTO, and the International Human Rights Law Regime: A Comparison 78
   Democratic deficit and the international human rights regimes 78
   Comparison with the WTO 81
   Conclusion 84
D. Does the WTO Promote Democracy? 84
E. The Paradox of Power Politics and Participation Rights in the WTO 87
F. Conclusion 88

4 'Human Rights' Restrictions on Trade 91

A. Human Rights Trade Measures 92
   General human rights sanctions 92
   Product-based trade measures based on human rights 96
B. Do Human Rights Trade Measures Prima Facie Breach GATT/GATS? 97
   'Like' goods and services 98
   Discrimination against 'like' goods 101
   Quantitative restrictions 102
C. Articles XX GATT and XIV GATS 104
   Extraterritorial application of Article XX exceptions 106
   Process of interpreting Article XX and Article XIV exceptions 107
   Protection of public morals and public order 108
   Protection of health 110
   The test of 'necessity' 111
   Protection of environment 114
   The chapeau 115
   Conclusion on GATT/GATS jurisprudence 117
D. The SPS and TBT Agreements 120
   The SPS 120
   The TBT 126
E. Waivers 129
F. A 'Labour Rights' Clause for the WTO? 130
G. The Potential Emancipatory Effect of 'Good' Trade 137
H. Conclusion 140
5 The WTO, Poverty, and Development 142
   A. Poverty and Human Rights Violations 143
   B. Current WTO Rules and Developing States 144
      Bias against developing States within the WTO 145
      Special and differential treatment 146
   C. The Uruguay Round Bargain 149
      GATS 150
      TRIPS 152
      TRIMS 154
      Non-tariff barriers 155
      Accession 156
      The Northern side of the bargain 158
      Conclusion on current WTO rules 160
   D. Free Trade, Economic Growth, and Poverty 160
      Comparative advantage: theory and practice 161
      Freer trade and economic growth 164
      Freer trade, poverty, and inequality 165
   E. Liberalization and Development: The Way Forward for Developing States 169
      Loss of tariff revenue 170
      Institutional reforms and social safety nets 170
      Static and dynamic comparative advantage 171
      Infant industry protection 173
      Conclusion 175
   F. Developing States, the WTO, and Human Rights 178
   G. Conclusion 180

6 The WTO and the Right to Food 181
   A. The Right to Food 181
      World hunger statistics 183
   B. Trade and Food 185
      WTO agricultural rules 185
   C. Food and Trade: An Uneasy Combination 192
      Subsidized imports and food aid 193
      Trade efficiency and food 194
      Volatile markets 196
      Cartelization 197
      Export orientation 200
      Specialization 202
      Environmental damage 203
      Conclusion 204
   D. Empowering Smallholder Farmers 204
   E. Food and Intellectual Property 207
   F. Conclusion 210
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>TRIPS and the Right to Health</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. The Right to Health</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Arguments in Favour of Patents</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. TRIPS Requirements for Pharmaceutical Patents</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Does TRIPS permit States to comply with human rights duties regarding access to drugs?</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. A Reconsideration of the Justification for Intellectual Property Problems regarding patents in the pharmaceutical industry</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A radical proposal?</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other alternatives to IP</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F. The IP Maximalist Trend</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G. Conclusion</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Extraterritorial Human Rights Duties</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Extraterritorial Obligations under International Human Rights Law</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Declaration on the Right to Development and Millennium Development Goals</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Treaties</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICESCR</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Responsibility and Causation in a World of Inequality and Neediness</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Practical Operation of Extraterritorial Duties</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. Balancing Human Rights in North and South</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F. Conclusion</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>WTO Reform, the Doha Round, and Other Free Trade Initiatives</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 3 and democratic deficit</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapter 4 and human rights trade measures</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapters 5 and 6: developing States and the WTO</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chapters 6 and 7: TRIPS and human rights</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Potential Reforms in Light of the Issues Raised in Chapters 3 to 7</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deferential doctrines</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Obligations of non-discrimination rather than minimum standards</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Respecting consumer choice</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A caveat regarding the first three reform proposals</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A human rights exception and a social clause</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Human rights impact assessments</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Human Rights Declaration</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deferring to expert opinion</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. The Doha Development Round: The Story So Far
   Agricultural negotiations 277
   Non-Agricultural Market Access (NAMA) 278
   Other 279
   Other free trade agreements 281
C. Conclusion 283

10 Conclusion
   A. Free Trade Fundamentalism 288
   B. The Purported ‘Neatness’ of Free Trade Rules 290
   C. Global Free Trade: Efficiency and Distribution 291
   D. Equalizing the Regimes 293
   E. Final Thoughts 296

Bibliography 299
Index 319