

# Blame it on the WTO?

*A Human Rights Critique*

SARAH JOSEPH

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Conventions, Declarations, and other Instruments</i>	xxv
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxxii

<i>Introduction</i>	1
---------------------	---

<b>1 Introducing the WTO and International Human Rights Law Regimes</b>	7
A. The World Trade Organization	7
<i>Raison d'être</i> of the WTO	11
B. The International Human Rights Regime	13
UN standards	13
UN human rights institutions and enforcement machinery	14
Regional systems	16
The ICCPR and the ICESCR	17
Differences between the ICCPR and the ICESCR	19
Positive and negative rights	21
The tripartite nature of all human rights	22
C. A Closer Look at Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights	23
Progressive obligations	23
Maximum available resources	25
Immediate obligations under the ICESCR	26
Justiciability of ICESCR rights	27
D. Human Rights and Customary International Law	29
E. Conclusion	31
<b>2 Relationship between the WTO and International Human Rights Law</b>	32
A. Underlying Values	32
Freedoms and rights under trade law and human rights law	34
Non-discrimination	38
Rule of law	39
Economic efficiency and enhanced welfare	40
Cultural and economic relativism	44
B. Normative Relationship between the WTO and International Human Rights Law	46
WTO jurisprudence and human rights	50
Human rights jurisprudence and the WTO	54
C. Conclusion	55

<b>3</b>	<b>Democratic Deficit and the WTO</b>	56
A.	The Two Components to the WTO/Democratic Deficit Argument	56
	'Non-trade' interests	58
	Developing States	62
	Dispute settlement	65
	WTO secretariat	67
	Conclusion on WTO processes	68
B.	The Relevance of International Human Rights Law	71
C.	Democratic Deficit, the WTO, and the International Human Rights Law Regime: A Comparison	78
	Democratic deficit and the international human rights regimes	78
	Comparison with the WTO	81
	Conclusion	84
D.	Does the WTO Promote Democracy?	84
E.	The Paradox of Power Politics and Participation Rights in the WTO	87
F.	Conclusion	88
<b>4</b>	<b>'Human Rights' Restrictions on Trade</b>	91
A.	Human Rights Trade Measures	92
	General human rights sanctions	92
	Product-based trade measures based on human rights	96
B.	Do Human Rights Trade Measures Prima Facie Breach GATT/GATS?	97
	'Like' goods and services	98
	Discrimination against 'like' goods	101
	Quantitative restrictions	102
C.	Articles XX GATT and XIV GATS	104
	Extraterritorial application of Article XX exceptions	106
	Process of interpreting Article XX and Article XIV exceptions	107
	Protection of public morals and public order	108
	Protection of health	110
	The test of 'necessity'	111
	Protection of environment	114
	The chapeau	115
	Conclusion on GATT/GATS jurisprudence	117
D.	The SPS and TBT Agreements	120
	The SPS	120
	The TBT	126
E.	Waivers	129
F.	A 'Labour Rights' Clause for the WTO?	130
G.	The Potential Emancipatory Effect of 'Good' Trade	137
H.	Conclusion	140

<b>5</b>	<b>The WTO, Poverty, and Development</b>	142
A.	Poverty and Human Rights Violations	143
B.	Current WTO Rules and Developing States	144
	Bias against developing States within the WTO	145
	Special and differential treatment	146
C.	The Uruguay Round Bargain	149
	GATS	150
	TRIPS	152
	TRIMS	154
	Non-tariff barriers	155
	Accession	156
	The Northern side of the bargain	158
	Conclusion on current WTO rules	160
D.	Free Trade, Economic Growth, and Poverty	160
	Comparative advantage: theory and practice	161
	Freer trade and economic growth	164
	Freer trade, poverty, and inequality	165
E.	Liberalization and Development: The Way Forward for Developing States	169
	Loss of tariff revenue	170
	Institutional reforms and social safety nets	170
	Static and dynamic comparative advantage	171
	Infant industry protection	173
	Conclusion	175
F.	Developing States, the WTO, and Human Rights	178
G.	Conclusion	180
<b>6</b>	<b>The WTO and the Right to Food</b>	181
A.	The Right to Food	181
	World hunger statistics	183
B.	Trade and Food	185
	WTO agricultural rules	185
C.	Food and Trade: An Uneasy Combination	192
	Subsidized imports and food aid	193
	Trade efficiency and food	194
	Volatile markets	196
	Cartelization	197
	Export orientation	200
	Specialization	202
	Environmental damage	203
	Conclusion	204
D.	Empowering Smallholder Farmers	204
E.	Food and Intellectual Property	207
F.	Conclusion	210

<b>7</b>	<b>TRIPS and the Right to Health</b>	214
	A. Intellectual Property Protection: A Human Right?	214
	B. The Right to Health	217
	C. Arguments in Favour of Patents	220
	D. TRIPS Requirements for Pharmaceutical Patents	221
	Does TRIPS permit States to comply with human rights duties regarding access to drugs?	226
	E. A Reconsideration of the Justification for Intellectual Property	230
	Problems regarding patents in the pharmaceutical industry	235
	A radical proposal?	237
	Other alternatives to IP	239
	F. The IP Maximalist Trend	241
	G. Conclusion	244
<b>8</b>	<b>Extraterritorial Human Rights Duties</b>	245
	A. Extraterritorial Obligations under International Human Rights Law	245
	The Declaration on the Right to Development and Millennium Development Goals	247
	B. Treaties	248
	ICCPR	248
	ICESCR	249
	C. Responsibility and Causation in a World of Inequality and Neediness	255
	D. Practical Operation of Extraterritorial Duties	259
	E. Balancing Human Rights in North and South	261
	F. Conclusion	264
<b>9</b>	<b>WTO Reform, the Doha Round, and Other Free Trade Initiatives</b>	265
	Chapter 3 and democratic deficit	265
	Chapter 4 and human rights trade measures	266
	Chapters 5 and 6: developing States and the WTO	267
	Chapters 6 and 7: TRIPS and human rights	267
	A. Potential Reforms in Light of the Issues Raised in Chapters 3 to 7	268
	Deferential doctrines	268
	Obligations of non-discrimination rather than minimum standards	268
	Respecting consumer choice	269
	A caveat regarding the first three reform proposals	270
	A human rights exception and a social clause	271
	Human rights impact assessments	272
	A Human Rights Declaration	274
	Deferring to expert opinion	274
	Conclusion	275

B. The Doha Development Round: The Story So Far	276
Agricultural negotiations	277
Non-Agricultural Market Access (NAMA)	278
Other	279
Other free trade agreements	281
C. Conclusion	283
<b>10 Conclusion</b>	<b>285</b>
A. Free Trade Fundamentalism	288
B. The Purported 'Neatness' of Free Trade Rules	290
C. Global Free Trade: Efficiency and Distribution	291
D. Equalizing the Regimes	293
E. Final Thoughts	296
<i>Bibliography</i>	299
<i>Index</i>	319