Nanotechnology Law and Policy

Cases and Materials

Victoria Sutton
Paul Whitfield Horn Professor
Texas Tech University School of Law

CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS
Durham, North Carolina
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Statutes</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About the Author</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter One • Nanotechnology Law and Policy</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Nanotechnology Defined</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard P. Feynman, <em>There's Plenty of Room at the Bottom</em> An Invitation to Enter a New Field of Physics</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 History of Nanotechnology Regulation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frederick A. Fiedler Glenn H. Reynolds, <em>Legal Problems of Nanotechnology: An Overview</em></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Regulating Emerging Technologies</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Nano-Proprietary, Inc. v. Keesman</em></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.1 Addressing Uncertainty</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.1.1 Risk Assessment and Nanotechnology</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nanomaterial Risk Assessment Workshee</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DuPont™ Light Stabilizer for Use as a Polymer Additive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.1.2 The Precautionary Principle</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.2 The Regulation of Biotechnology</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.3 The Regulation of a Hydrogen Economy</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Nanoethics</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deb Bennett-Woods, <em>Integrating Ethical Considerations into Funding Decisions for Emerging Nanotechnologies</em></td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 2 • Risk Assessment, Science and Regulation in Nanotoxicity</strong></td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Kennecott Greens Creek Min. Co. v. Mine Safety and Health Admin.</em></td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jody A. Roberts, <em>Collision Course? Science, Law and Regulation in the Emerging Science of Low Dose Toxicity</em></td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 3 • Consumer Products Safety and Nanotechnology</strong></td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The First Nanomaterial Commercial Product Incident</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. Germany Reports First Nanoprodut Recall</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. Surface Spray Called Free of Nanoparticles</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.9 National Environmental Policy Act 143
National Environmental Policy Act 143
Questions and Problems 144

Chapter 5 • The Food and Drug Administration and Nanotechnology 145
5.1 Introduction 145
Nanotechnology: A Report of the U.S. Food and Drug Administration 147
5.2 Wine and Nanotechnology: Tax Code Revisions 163
Materials and Processes Authorized for the Treatment of Wine and Juice (2004R-517P) 163
J. Clarence Davies, Nanotechnology Oversight: An Agenda for the New Administration 165
5.3 Cosmetics 168
5.3.1 Sunscreen Products 169
Barnaby J. Feder, Nanoparticles in Your Sunscreen: Too Hot to Handle? 169
5.3.2 Report from the Cosmetics Industry on Nanotechnology Regulation 2006 171
CTFA Nanotechnology White Paper 172

Chapter Six • State and Local Issues in Nanotechnology 177
6.1 Introduction 177
6.2 City of Berkeley 177
Matthew T. Heartney & John L. Carlton, City of Berkeley Begins Implementation of Nanotechnology Ordinance 177
6.3 City of Cambridge 181
6.4 States 182
6.4.1 California 182

Chapter Seven • Constitutional Issues and Nanotechnology Law 187
7.1 Introduction 187
7.2 Privacy Issues 187
Jacob Heller & Christine Peterson, Nanotechnology and Surveillance 187
7.3 Expectation of Privacy and Search and Seizure Issues 189
7.3.1 Fourth Amendment Search and Seizure 189
7.3.2 The Foundation of “Expectation of Privacy” in Searches 189
Kyllo v. United States 193
7.4 Right Not to Speak and Labeling 203
Stauber v. Shalala and Kessler 203
International Dairy Foods Association v. Amestoy, Attorney General of the State of Vermont 205
Notes 211

Chapter Eight • International Approaches to Regulation of Nanotechnology 213
8.1 Introduction 213
8.2 International Issues and Approaches to Regulation of Nanotechnology 214
Diana M. Bowman & Graeme A. Hodge, A Small Matter of Regulation: An International Review of Nanotechnology Regulation 214
Gary E. Marchant, Transnational Models for Regulation of Nanotechnology 228
8.3 Australia
Diana M. Bowman & Graeme A. Hodge, Nanotechnology “Down Under”: Getting on Top of Regulatory Matters 244

8.4 Canada
Anita Nador & Brian Gray, Nanotechnology in Canada 255

8.5 China
Lerwen Liu & Li-De Zhang, Nanotechnology in China—Now and in the Future 258

8.6 Cuba
Nanotech Development in Cuba Strategic 263

8.7 European Union
Citizens’ Jury to Tackle Nanotech 264

8.8 Germany
Thorsten Beyerlein, The Need and Purposes of a “Nanotechnology Act” in Germany and Europe 266

8.9 Japan
Luca Escoffier, A Brief Review of Nanotechnology Funding and Patenting in Japan 276

8.10 Mexico and Latin America
Guillermo Foladori & Edgar Zayago Lau, Tracking Nanotechnology in Mexico 281
Guillermo Foladori, Nanotechnology in Latin America at the Crossroads 294

8.11 The Middle East
8.11.1 Israel
Bob Rosenbaum, Mariana Ardetz, Dr. Daphne Getz, Dr. Daniel Shefer, Dr. Amnon Frenkel & Heather A. Stone, Israel’s Nanotechnology Research Landscape: A Survey of Israeli Nanotechnology Capabilities and Technology Transfer 306

8.11.2 Iran
Iran’s Global Nanotechnology Ranking Improves to 25th 324

8.12 Romania
Adina Morozan & Ioan Stamatin, Nanotechnology in Romania 324

8.13 Russia
Mikhail Ananyan, Nanotechnology in Russia: From Laboratory Towards Industry 329

8.14 South Africa
Keith Campbell, Nanotechnology, South Africa Moves to Create Nanotechnology Partnerships with Other Developing Countries 333

8.15 Developing Nations
Noela Invernizzi & Guillermo Foladori, Nanotechnology and the Developing World: Will Nanotechnology Overcome Poverty or Widen Disparities? 335

Chapter Nine • Intellectual Property Issues in Nanotechnology
9.1 Introduction to Patents and Nanotechnology
Application of Troiel 347
Application of Rinehart 353
Gardner v. TEC Systems, Inc. 359
Texas Instruments, Inc. v. United States International Trade Commission 365
Laurie A. Axford, Patent Drafting Considerations for Nanotechnology Inventions 368
John Josef Molenda, The Importance of Defining Novel Terms in Patenting Nanotechnology Inventions 371
Blaise Mouttet, Nanotechnology and U.S. Patents: A Statistical Analysis 374
9.2 The Utility Requirement 375
David S. Almeling, Patenting Nanotechnology: Problems with the Utility Requirement 375
9.3 The Written Description Requirement 389
J. Peter Paredes, Written Description Requirement in Nanotechnology: Clearing a Patent Thicket? 389
9.4 The Enablement Requirement 405
Melissa D. Schwaller & Gaurav Goel, Getting Smaller: What Will Enablement of Nanotechnology Require? 405
9.5 The Nonobviousness Requirement 414
N. Scott Roe, Nanotechnology: When Making Something Smaller Is Nonobvious 414
9.6 Best Mode 428
Matthew J. Dowd, Nancy J. Leith & Jeffrey S. Weaver, Nanotechnology and the Best Mode 428
9.7 Infringement 441
Robert A. Voigt, Jr. & Edward T. Mickelson, Nanotechnology—Related Inventions: Infringement Issues 441
9.8 Enforceability 447
Louis M. Troilo, Patentability and Enforcement Issues Related to Nanotechnology Inventions 447
9.9 Doctrine of Equivalents 453
Andrew Wasson, Protecting the Next Small Thing: Nanotechnology and the Reverse Doctrine of Equivalents 453
Chapter 10 • Scientific Evidence and Nanotechnology 461
10.1 Introduction 461
10.2 The Legal Foundation of Scientific Evidence 461
Frye v. United States 461
Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 463
Review 469
General Electric Company v. Joiner 469
Review 474
Kumho Tire Company v. Carmichael 475
Review 482
Chapter 11 • Nanotechnology Research and Experimentation Regulation 483
11.1 Laboratory Biosafety and Biosecurity Regulation 483
Chapter 12 • National Security, Terrorism and Nanotechnology 485
12.1 Introduction 485
12.2 Military Uses and Regulation of Nanotechnology 486
Calvin Shipbaugh, Offense-Defense Aspects of Nanotechnologies: A Forecast of Potential Military Applications 486
12.3 Nanotechnology and the Chemical and Biological Weapons Treaties 493
Robert Pinson, *Is Nanotechnology Prohibited by the Biological and Chemical Weapons Conventions?* 493

12.4 Export Controls and Nanotechnology 501


Notes 508

Chapter 13 • Civil Liability and Nanotechnology 511

13.1 State Law and Common Law Remedies 511

13.2 Federal Tort Claims Act 512

Chapter 14 • The Future of Nanotechnology Law 513

14.1 Introduction 513

14.2 Is Nanotechnology a Revolution or a New Field? 513

14.3 Final Thoughts and an Overview of the Future of Nanotechnology Law 514

Index 517