Philosophical Foundations of Language in the Law

Editors
PROFESSOR ANDREI MARMOR
Professor of Philosophy and Maurice Jones Jr Professor of Law, University of Southern California

PROFESSOR SCOTT SOAMES
Director, School of Philosophy, University of Southern California

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

List of Contributors ix

1. Introduction 1

2. The Value of Vagueness 14
   Timothy Endicott
   1. Introduction 14
   2. Legal instruments and legal standards 15
   3. Varieties of vagueness in legal instruments 17
   4. The guidance value and the process value of precision 19
   5. Arbitrariness and the normative principle 20
   6. The arbitrariness of precision 22
   7. Precision can be impossible 24
   8. Vague standards delegate power in ways that may comport with the purpose of the law 26
   9. Vague standards can encourage desirable forms of private ordering that achieve the law's purposes 27
   10. Summary 28
   11. Conclusion 29

3. What Vagueness and Inconsistency Tell Us about Interpretation 31
   Scott Soames
   1. Two kinds of vagueness 31
   2. Vagueness and the interpretation of legal, and non-legal, texts 33
   3. The value of vagueness 38
   4. Consequences for textualism 42
   5. Extending the lesson to the resolution of inconsistencies 44
   6. A note about legal positivism 51
   7. Purpose and normativity 52

4. Vagueness and the Guidance of Action 58
   Jeremy Waldron
   1. Introduction 58
   2. State v Schaeffer 59
   3. The model of rules 62
4. The model of standards 63
5. Judgment and guidance 66
6. Raz on authority 67
7. Minimal guidance? 70
8. Thick predicates 72
9. Inchoate rules? 73
10. Chilling behavior 75
11. From traffic to torture 79
12. The lesbian rule 81

   Andrei Marmor
   1. The implied content of speech 84
      1.1 Implicatures 85
      1.2 Presuppositions 87
      1.3 Semantically encoded implications 89
   2. The normative framework of strategic speech 92
   3. Strategic speech in the law 96

6. Textualism and the Discovery of Rights 105
   John Perry
   1. Introduction 105
      1.1 Textualism 105
      1.2 Discovering rights 109
      1.3 Meaning-textualism and the death penalty 111
   2. Two models for discovering rights 112
      2.1 Preliminaries: meaning, reference, extension, and conception 112
      2.2 The Change Model 113
      2.3 The Knowledge Model 115
   3. Cruel and unusual punishments 116
      3.1 Introduction 116
      3.2 Cruel punishments 118
   4. Moral vision and constitutional interpretation 128
   5. Conclusion 129

   Gideon Rosen
   1. Jurisprudence as the science of legal effects 130
   2. A role for the philosophy of language 131
   3. Contract law and the law of the contract 134
## Contents

4. Gaps, default rules, and unenforceable provisions 135  
5. Textualism, hypothetical intentionalism, and the objective theory of contract 138  
6. Ambiguity 141  
7. Beyond ambiguity: Soper's Estate 147  
8. Personal meaning as the ground of contractual obligation 152  
9. An alternative account of 'personal meaning' 157  
10. Skepticism about plain meaning 159  
11. Some conclusions 163  

8. Modeling Legal Rules 165  
  Richard Holton  
  1. Introduction 165  
  2. Particularism and rules 166  
  3. That's it 167  
  4. Distinguishing, overturning, and other legal actions 171  
  5. Alternative I: Could legal rules be generics? 173  
  6. Alternative II: Are legal rules governed by nonmonotonic logic? 176  
  7. Conclusion 183  

9. Trying to Kill the Dead: De Dicto and De Re Intention in Attempted Crimes 184  
  Gideon Yaffe  
  1. Introduction 184  
  2. Background: attempt, intention, and mens rea standards 187  
  3. The solution 192  
    3.1 The de dicto and the de re 193  
    3.2 The commitments constituted by de dicto and de re intentions 198  
    3.3 The mens rea standard and beliefs about circumstances 201  
    3.4 Disjunctive descriptions of circumstances 208  
    3.5 The position in action 212  
  4. Conclusion 216  

10. Legislation as Communication? Legal Interpretation and the Study of Linguistic Communication 217  
  Mark Greenberg  
  1. Introduction 217  
  2. Motivating the communication theory 221  
  3. Refining the communication theory 226  
  4. Raising doubts about the communication theory 233
Contents

5. Different components and notions of communicative content 241
6. Legislation and communication 250
7. Conclusion 256

Bibliography 257
Legal Citations 265
Index 267