The Law of Succession: Testamentary Freedom

European Perspectives

Edited by Miriam Anderson and Esther Arroyo i Amayuelas

European Studies in Private Law (5)
 CONTENTS

Preface v
Contents vii
Abbreviations xviii
Authors xxvi

PART 1 Harmonization of Succession Law in Europe: The Current Debate

CHAPTER 1 Need and Opportunity of Convergence in European Succession Laws
Walter Pintens 3

1 Introduction 5
2 Need for Convergence in European Substantive Succession Laws 6
3 Opportunity of Convergence in European Substantive Succession Laws 8
  3.1 Spontaneous Harmonisation 8
  3.1.1 The Statutory Portion of the Surviving Spouse 8
  3.1.2 Compulsory Portion of Children 12
  3.2 Institutional Unification 19
  3.2.1 Achievements 19
  3.2.2 Promotion of What We Have 21
  3.3 Legal Scholarship 21
4 Conclusions 22

CHAPTER 2 Testamentary Freedom or Forced Heirship? Balancing Party Autonomy and the Protection of Family Members
Andrea Bonomi 25

1 Introductory Remarks 27
2 The Connecting Factor of the Last Habitual Residence of the Deceased 29
3 The Choice of Applicable Law 31
4 Agreements as to Succession 34
5 The Public Policy Exception 36
6 Final Remarks 38
New Trends in Catalan Succession Law

CHAPTER 3
Between Tradition and Modernisation: A General Overview of the Catalan Succession Law Reform
Esther Arroyo i Amayuelas – Miriam Anderson

1 Introduction

1.1 The Diversity of Private Law Systems in Spain

1.2 Catalonia: From the 1960 Compilation to a Civil Code

2 An Overview of the Law of Succession in Book IV of the Catalan Civil Code

3 The Law of Succession and Legal Tradition: New Rules for Old Principles

3.1 The Appointment of an Heir Is a Prerequisite for the Validity of a Will

3.2 The Heir As a Universal Successor

3.3 Nemo Pro Parte Testatus, Pro Parte Intestatus Decedere Potest

3.4 Semel Heres, Semper Heres

4 The Impact of Social and Economic Changes on the Law of Succession

4.1 Freedom of Testation and Respect for the Testator's Wishes

4.1.1 New Grounds for Unworthiness and a Longer List of Victims of Reprehensible Conduct

4.1.2 A New Ground for Disinheritance: The Lack of Normal Family Interaction Attributable to the Forced Heir

4.1.3 The Protection of the Elderly Testator

4.2 The Adaptation of the Law of Succession to New Family Models

4.2.1 The Equalization of Spouses and Cohabitants

4.2.2 Improvements in the Position of the Surviving Spouse or Cohabitant

4.3 Succession within the Family Business: The Modernization of Inheritance Agreements

5 Changes within Tradition: The Incomplete Reform of the Forced Share

6 Conclusions

CHAPTER 4
Testamentary Freedom and Its Limits
Esteve Bosch Capdevila

1 Introduction

1.1 The Testator's Will as the Supreme Law of Succession

1.2 Protecting Testamentary Freedom

1.3 The Types of Limits to Testamentary Freedom
2 Limits Derived from the Testator's Wishes
2.1 Provisions in a Will Aiming to Prevent Future Testamentary Modification or Revocation
2.2 Ad Cautelam Clauses: Do They Protect or Limit Testamentary Freedom?
2.2.1 The Admission of Ad Cautelam Clauses in the Catalan Legal Tradition and in the Precedents of Book IV of the CC Cat
2.2.2 The Silence of Book IV of the CC Cat Regarding the Ad Cautelam Clauses
3 The Limits Imposed by a Third Party: The Problems Caused by Captatorias Institutiones
4 The Legal Limits to the Content of Testamentary Provisions
4.1 Limits that Affect the Conditions that a Testator Can Impose
4.1.1 Limits Deriving from the Principle Semel Heres Semper Heres
4.1.2 Limits Derived from Certain Conditions Being Unlawful
4.2 Limits Affecting Specific Clauses
4.2.1 The Incompatibility between Testate and Intestate Heirs and Testamentary Freedom
4.2.2 The Limits Imposed on Fideicommissum
4.3 The Lineage Principle
4.4 Discriminatory Clauses

CHAPTER 5
Freedom of Testation, Compulsory Share and Disinheritance Based on Lack of Family Relationship
Antoni Vaquer Aloy
1 Preliminary Remarks
2 Reforms of the Compulsory Share in European Laws of Succession: No Abrogation, Only Reduction
3 A Weaker Compulsory Share in Catalonia
4 The New Ground for Disinheritance in Art. 451-7.2 e of the Catalan Civil Code
4.1 Subsistence of the Compulsory Share, with Widening Grounds for Disinheritance
4.2 Behaviour-Based Succession Systems
4.3 Compulsory Share, Disinheritance and Descendants' Behaviour in Catalan Law
5 Concluding Remarks
CHAPTER 6  Freedom of Testation Versus Freedom to Enter Into Succession Agreements and Transaction Costs
Susana Navas Navarro

1  Introduction 107
2  The Legislator's Choice: An Inheritance Agreement Prevails Over and Is Sometimes Incompatible With a Will 109
3  The Deceased's Choice: Succession Within the Family Business 112
3.1  Preliminary Remarks 112
3.2  The Family Estate: From "Homestead" to "Business"? 115
3.3  Economic Costs Derived from Entering into Succession Agreements 117
3.3.1  Transaction Costs and the Choice of the Successor 118
3.3.2  Economic Costs Derived from the Deceased's Change of Mind 120
3.4  Possible "Efficient" Instruments for Succession Within the Family Business 123
4  Final Conclusions 125

PART III  National Perspectives on the Law of Succession in the 21st Century

CHAPTER 7  Freedom of Testation in England and Wales
Roger Kerridge

1  Introduction 131
2  History 131
3  Trusts as a Restraint on Freedom of Testation 134
4  The Mortmain Act 136
5  The 'Construction' (or Interpretation) of Wills 137
6  The Pla and Puncernau Case Viewed from England 139
7  Contracts to Leave Property by Will, Proprietary Estoppel and Mutual Wills 142
7.1  Validity of a Contract to Leave Property by Will 142
7.2  Proprietary Estoppel 142
7.3  Mutual Wills 143
8  Freedom of Testation in England in the Twentieth and Twenty First Centuries 145
9  What Problems Are There Under the 1975 Act? 148
10 Particular Problems with Children and Step-children 151
11 Reform of the 1975 Act 151
CHAPTER 8

Law of Succession and Testamentary Freedom in Germany
A. Röthel

1 Introduction 157
2 Testamentary Freedom and Public Policy (§ 138 BGB) 157
2.1 Conditional Inheritance: "Undue Influence" on Heirs? 158
2.2 Wills in Favour of Disabled People or of People in Need versus Social Welfare 159
2.3 The "Rule Against Perpetuities" 159
2.4 Particular Testamentary Prohibitions 161
3 Testamentary Freedom and the Compulsory Portion (§§ 2303 ff. BGB) 162
3.1 Overview of the Basic Concept 163
3.2 Reforms in the Law on Compulsory Portion (2009) 164
3.2.1 Increase of Compulsory Portions Due to Inter Vivos Donations (§ 2325 BGB latest amendment) 164
3.2.2 Deferment (§ 2331a BGB latest amendment) 164
3.2.3 Deprivation of the Compulsory Portion (§ 2333 BGB) 164
4 Testamentary Freedom and Inheritance Agreements 165
4.1 Overview of the Applicable Law 165
4.2 Reform Debate 165
5 Summary: Requirements of Freedom of Testation Fit for the Present Day 166

CHAPTER 9

The Law of Succession in Hungary
Zoltán Csehi

1 Introduction 169
2 Freedom of Testation versus Ordre Public 170
2.1 Restrictions Imposed by Human Rights and Fundamental Rights 171
2.1.1 Preliminaries on Human Rights 171
2.1.2 The Modern Hungarian Constitution 172
2.1.3 The Practice of the Constitutional Court Concerning Succession 173
2.2 Public Law Restrictions 175
2.3 Private Law Restrictions 175
3 Freedom of Testation versus Legally Granted Hereditary Rights 177
3.1 Preliminaries on Compulsory Share 177
3.2 Functions of the Compulsory Share 177
3.3 The Rules on Compulsory Share 180
3.3.1 Beneficiaries 180
3.3.2 Extent 182
# The Law of Succession: Testamentary Freedom

| 3.3.3 | Basis | 182 |
| 3.3.4 | Facts Affecting the Allocated Share | 183 |
| 3.3.5 | Payment | 183 |
| 3.3.6 | Obligor | 183 |
| 3.3.7 | Collisions with Other Rights | 184 |
| 3.3.8 | The Future of the Compulsory Share | 184 |
| 4 | Freedom of Testation versus Freedom to Enter into Inheritance Agreements | 184 |
| 4.1 | Contracts Regulated Outside the Law of Succession | 185 |
| 4.1.1 | Support Contract | 185 |
| 4.1.2 | Life Insurance | 185 |
| 4.1.3 | Savings Deposits | 185 |
| 4.1.4 | Copyright | 186 |
| 4.2 | Contracts Within the Law of Succession | 186 |
| 4.2.1 | Inheritance Contracts | 186 |
| 4.2.2 | Donatio Mortis Causa | 188 |
| 4.2.3 | Contract Among Descendants on Anticipated Inheritance | 189 |
| 5 | De Lege Ferenda | 190 |

## Chapter 10

**Freedom of Testation in Italy**

Andrea Fusaro

| 1 | Freedom of Testation and *Ordre Public* | 193 |
| 1.1 | Freedom To Make a Will: Different Types of Wills | 193 |
| 1.2 | *Ordre Public* | 193 |
| 1.2.1 | The Prohibition of Indefinite Settlements | 193 |
| 1.2.2 | Conditions Imposed on the Heir | 194 |
| 2 | Intestacy | 194 |
| 3 | Freedom of Testation and Hereditary Rights Legally Granted | 195 |
| 3.1 | Forced Share | 195 |
| 3.2 | Subjects | 196 |
| 3.3 | Quotas and Rights | 196 |
| 3.4 | Calculation of the Forced Share | 197 |
| 3.5 | The Reduction of Testamentary Dispositions and Donations | 197 |
| 3.6 | The Circulation of Assets | 197 |
| 4 | Freedom of Testation versus Freedom to Enter into Inheritance Agreements | 198 |
| | Annex: Draft of a Family Agreement | 200 |
## CONTENTS

### CHAPTER 11

**Acquisition of Property by Succession in Dutch Law. Tradition between Autonomy and Solidarity in a Changing Society**

J. Michael Milo 203

1. Introduction 205
2. Principles and Developments in Dutch Succession Law 205
2.1 Principles and Other Determining Factors 205
2.2 Developments in Precodified Dutch Law 208
2.3 From the First Codification Onwards 211
3. Contemporary Succession Law in General 214
3.1 Succession and Matrimonial Property Law 214
3.2 Succession, Systematization, and Acquisition of Property 215
3.3 Intestate Succession 217
3.4 Testamentary Dispositions and Restrictions 218
4. Position of the Spouse and the Children 223
4.1 Intestate Positions of Spouse and Children 223
4.2 Testate Position of Spouse and Children 225
4.3 Forced Heirship 226
5. Concluding Remarks 226

### CHAPTER 12

**The Norwegian Approach to Forced Share, the Surviving Spouse's Position and Irrevocable Wills**

Peter Hambro 229

1. Introduction 231
2. The Forced Share Inheritance 231
3. The Contents of Wills 234
4. The Position of the Surviving Spouse 235
5. Irrevocable Wills 238
6. Other Irrevocable Instruments 239
6.1 Insurance Policies 239
6.2 Pre- and Postnuptial Agreements 240

### CHAPTER 13

**Restraints on Freedom of Testation in Scottish Succession Law**

Eric Clive 241

1. Underlying Values 243
2. Freedom of Testation and Protection of Certain Claimants 245
2.1 Fixed Share for Spouse or Civil Partner 246
2.2 Fixed Share for Issue 249
2.3 Protection of Cohabitants 251
3. Other Restraints on Freedom of Testation 253
THE LAW OF SUCCESSION: TESTAMENTARY FREEDOM

3.1 Inheritance Tax 253
3.2 Limitations on Accumulation of Income 254
3.3 Limitations on Future Liferents 255
3.4 Purposes Otherwise Contrary to Public Policy 256

CHAPTER 14 Freedom of Testation in Slovenia
Suzana Kraljić 257

1 Introduction 259
2 Freedom of Testation 260
2.1 Ordre public 260
2.2 Forced Share and Exheredatio 260
3 Especial Limitations for Agricultural Holdings 265
4 Inheritance Agreements 267

CHAPTER 15 Freedom of Testation, Legal Inheritance Rights and Public Order under Spanish Law
Sergio Cámara Lapuente 269

1 Overview 271
2 Limits on the Freedom to Dispose Mortis Causa in the Spanish Civil Code and in the Autonomous Communities 271
2.1 Legal Frame 271
2.2 Description of the ex lege Rights in Favour of the Deceased's Family 272
2.3 Assessment of the Main Legislative Trends 278
2.3.1 Strengthening the Legal Position of Surviving Spouses 278
2.3.2 Legal Rights in Favour of a Cohabitant 279
2.3.3 Scarce Enlargement of the Grounds of Disinheritance and Unworthiness 281
2.3.4 Special Protection for Certain Social Groups 282
3 Material Freedom of Testation 283
3.1 The Current Debate Regarding the Suppression or Modification of the Forced Share ('Legitima') 283
3.1.1 Arguments in Favour of Forced Shares ('Legitimas') 284
3.1.2 Arguments in Favour of Testamentary Freedom 285
3.2 Proposed Solutions 286
3.3 Channels for Relaxation without Eliminating the Forced Share 289
3.3.1 Reforms Already Implemented in the Spanish Civil Code 289
3.3.2 Other Reforms that Might be Suitable in View of Comparative Law (Both Interregional and International) 290
3.4 Other Possible Enlargements of Material Freedom of Testation 293
4 Formal Freedom of Testation 293
  4.1 Testamentary Forms 293
  4.2 Inheritance Agreements, Joint Wills and Other
       Mortis Causa Instruments 294
  4.3 Delegation of the Power to Make a Will, Appointment of
       Representatives with the Power to Choose Beneficiaries or
       to Distribute the Estate, or Appointment of Trustees
       ('fiducia sucesoria') 296
  4.4 Notaries' Plea for Further Reforms 299
  5 Freedom of Testation and Public Order 299
     5.1 Is the Forced Share a Matter of Public Order? 299
     5.2 Does the Spanish Constitution Guarantee the Forced Share? 300
     5.3 Scope of Spanish Public Order in International Succession 301
     5.4 Public Order and Fraud to the Law of Succession 303

Bibliography 308