Contents

The Author xvi
Preface xvii
Acknowledgements xix

Sample forms reproduced in this book can be found on the book website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell

Chapter 1 The Dispute Board Concept 1
What is a dispute board? 2
What makes a dispute board unique? What can be achieved by using a dispute board? 3
Recommendations vs Binding Decisions 4
Non-binding recommendations 4
Interim-binding decisions 5
Differences between dispute boards and arbitration, mediation, adjudication and alternative dispute resolution (ADR) 6
History of dispute boards 8
Growth of dispute boards 10
An overview – composition of dispute boards and their operation 11
The chairperson’s role 11
Appointment and membership 12
Board member qualities 13
The importance of early appointment and of regular site visits 13
Routine operations 14
Subcontractors 15
FIDIC Conditions of Subcontract for Construction 15
Formal vs Informal operations 16
Hearings 17
Dispute board procedures 19
Dispute board costs 19
Why dispute boards work 20
Why dispute boards are claimed not to work 22
International aspects 24
The future 24

Chapter 2 Types of Dispute Boards 25
The Dispute Review Board (DRB) 25
The Dispute Adjudication Board (DAB) 26
The Combined Dispute Board (CDB) 26
Common Aspects of all Dispute Boards 26
Dispute board formation 28
Other forms of board dealing with disputes 30

Chapter 3  Legal Basis for Dispute Boards 31
Legal Systems – Overview 31
Common law 31
Civil law 32
The Historical Development of Dispute Boards 33
Contemporary Legal Development of Dispute Boards 35
The engineer/arbitrator as judge 35
The engineer as quasi-arbitrator 37
The development of non-statutory adjudication 40
The development of statutory adjudication in the UK 42
Mandatory Provisions 43
The process under the Act 43
The Scheme for Construction Contracts 44
The Act – Main Areas – Is There a Dispute? 45
Does the dispute arise under a construction contract? 47
Is the contract in writing within the meaning of s. 107? 48
The process 48
Procedures under the Scheme 51
Notice of Adjudication 51
Appointment of an adjudicator 52
The referral notice 52
Adjudicator’s Powers and Duties 52
Changes to the Housing Grants Act 53
Adjudication and Dispute Boards in England 55
Extension to International Cases 56
Specific regional non-common law country differences and methods 59
Host Country Rules – Dispute Boards under Common, Civil or Sharia Law 69

Chapter 4  Case Histories 70
Dispute Boards in Operation 70
Historical Cases 72
China: Ertan Hydroelectric Project 72
Africa: Katse Dam Project 72
Hong Kong: Hong Kong Airport 73
England: Docklands Railway 74
England: Saltend Private Power Plant 75
Canada: Niagara Tunnel Project 75
China: Yellow River Diversion Project 76
Contents

USA: I-15 Reconstruction – Salt Lake City, Utah 77
France–England: Eurotunnel 78

Chapter 5  Appointing and Establishing a Dispute Board 79
Composition of Dispute Boards 79
  Single-member dispute boards 79
  Two-member dispute boards 79
  Three-member dispute boards 80
  Mega-member dispute boards 80
  Micro-dispute boards 80
  Ad hoc dispute boards 81
  Miscellaneous situations 81
Major International Appointing Bodies 82
  The major forms of dispute board rules 82
  Sample 5.1 Dispute Adjudication Board Rules for use in independently administered dispute board matters 93
Basic Standards 101
  Dispute board guidelines in practice 101
  Sample 5.2 Dispute review board – additional dispute review board guidelines and procedures 101
  Sample 5.3 Dispute adjudication board – additional dispute adjudication board guidelines and procedures 103

Chapter 6  Selection of a Dispute Board 108
Qualifications 108
  Good people skills 108
  Independence 108
  Sample 6.1 Disclosure of conflicts 118
The need for continuing disclosure 122
  Sample 6.2 Continuing Disclosure 122
  Additional qualifications 123
Where Can Dispute Board Members be Found? 125
Dispute Board Member Qualification, Training and Certification 126
  The process of selection 126
  After selection – the dispute board agreement 129
  Sample 6.3 Dispute adjudication board member agreement – one person 131
  Sample 6.4 Dispute adjudication board member agreement – three person 132
  Sample 6.5 Ad hoc dispute adjudication board member agreement – three-person (or more) 133
  Sample 6.6 Ad hoc dispute adjudication board member agreement – three person (or more), long form 135
Unilateral dispute board agreements 142
Sample 6.7 Dispute adjudication board member agreement unilateral version 145
Default appointments 147
Payment of board members 149
Sample 6.8 Acceptance letter 152
Replacing dispute board members 153

Chapter 7 Referral to a Dispute Board 155
Starting the Process – Informal versus Formal 155
Is notification of a dispute necessary? 156
Sample 7.1 Request for informal opinion 158
Dispute Board Dispute Referral Notice 161
Sample 7.2 Notice (FIDIC proceedings) 161
Procedural Requirements 162
Sample 7.3 Timetable and details 162
Duties of the Parties 164
Witnesses and witness statements 165

Chapter 8 Elements of a Referral 168
Referral by the Contractor 168
Sample 8.1 Preliminary notice before referral letter 169
Elements of the referral 169
Sample 8.2 Referral 170
Referral by the Employer 176
Preliminary Matters and Setting Out the Dispute 176
Sample 8.3 Dispute adjudication board sequence of events 176
Dispute adjudication board member form 177
Sample 8.4 Record of claims form 178
Sample 8.5 Record of claims form in use 178
Sample referrals 181
Sample 8.6 A dispute adjudication board briefing memorandum 181
Issue List 184
Sample 8.7 A dispute adjudication board issues list 185
Sample 8.8 A dispute adjudication board evidence list 185

Chapter 9 Site Visits 187
The Concept of Site Visits 187
Contractual requirements 187
Preparation prior to site visit 189
Sample 9.1 Site visit schedule format 189
Establishing an Agenda 190
Sample 9.2 Agenda format 190
Sample 9.3 Detailed agenda format 191
Sample general agenda 191
Sample 9.4 General agenda format (style 1) 192
Chapter 11  Board Member Conflicts  254
Pre-Existing Conflicts of Interest  255
- Conflicts which can develop during the hearings  256
- Evident partiality  256
- Interpretation of the evident partiality standard  257
- Ethical requirements of board members  258
The Dispute Board Federation Code of Ethics  260

Chapter 12  Removal of Board Members  269
Contract Provisions  269
Voluntary Removal  270
Non-Voluntary Removal  271
- Sample 12.1 Clauses to remove a board member  271
Consequences of Dispute Board Member Removal  272
Adding New Board Members During Proceedings  272
Notice of Termination of Dispute Board Member by Parties  272
- Sample 12.2 Notice of termination by the parties  272
- Sample 12.3 Notice of termination by member  273
- Sample 12.4 Notice of termination by dispute board chair  274
- Sample 12.5 Notice – Voluntary resignation by dispute board member  274
- Sample 12.6 Notice – Voluntary mutual termination agreement  275

Chapter 13  Dispute Boards – Use, Training and Current Practice  276
Maritime Industry Dispute Boards  276
Maritime Disputes  277
ICC Rules  278
- Sample scenario under ICC Rules  280
- What is the value of a non-binding recommendation?  281
Setting up the dispute board  281
The dispute board in operation  282
The use of dispute boards in other settings  285
Dispute Board Member Training Programmes  285
Contents

FIDIC 285
The Dispute Board Federation (Geneva) 286
ICC, World Bank and ICE 286
Default appointments 286
Practice in the United States 287
Post-dispute board matters 287

Chapter 14 Development Banks 289
The World Bank Rules 289
World Bank disputes review boards rules and procedures 289
Member acceptance 290
Sample 14.1 Form of board member’s declaration of acceptance 290
Termination 291
Member payment 291
Other board member requirements 293
Contractor requirements 293
Procedure for dispute referral to the board 293
Conduct of hearings 294
Dispute Review Experts 295
Other Multilateral Development Banks 299
Other dispute board uses 299

Chapter 15 Additional Forms 301
Sample Dispute Board Member Agreements 301
Sample 15.1 Dispute adjudication agreement (one-person DAB) – using FIDIC form agreements 301
Sample 15.2 Dispute adjudication agreement (three-person DAB) – FIDIC 302
Sample 15.3 Ad hoc agreement 303
Sample 15.4 Three persons – all signing one agreement 305
Sample 15.5 Disclosure statement – includes acceptance 309
General Operational Procedure Checklist 310
DRBF form – operating procedures 310
Sample 15.6 Hearing agenda – claim presented 315
Sample 15.7 First meeting agenda 316
Sample 15.8 Request for informal opinion 316
Sample 15.9 Notice (FIDIC proceedings) 317
Sample 15.10 Timetable and procedural details 317
Sample 15.11 Dispute synopsis 320
Sample 15.12 Proposed grouping document 323
Sample 15.13 Data checklist 325
Sample 15.14 Dispute adjudication board – decision (different format) 326

Appendix 1 FIDIC (Red Book) Conditions of Contract for Construction 332
Subclause 20 – Claims, Dispute and Arbitration 332
Contents

20.1 Contractor's claims 332
20.2 Appointment of the Dispute Adjudication Board 333
20.3 Failure to agree Dispute Adjudication Board 334
20.4 Obtaining Dispute Adjudication Board's decision 335
20.5 Amicable settlement 335
20.6 Arbitration 335
20.7 Failure to comply with Dispute Adjudication Board's decision 336
20.8 Expiry of Dispute Adjudication Board's appointment 336

FIDIC (Red Book) 337
Appendix 337
FIDIC (Red Book) General Conditions – Annex Procedural Rules 341

Appendix 2
FIDIC (Yellow Book) Conditions of Contract for Plant and Design-Build 343
Subclause 20 – Claims, Dispute and Arbitration 343
20.1 Contractor's claims 343
20.2 Appointment of the Dispute Adjudication Board 344
20.3 Failure to agree Dispute Adjudication Board 345
20.4 Obtaining Dispute Adjudication Board's decision 345
20.5 Amicable settlement 346
20.6 Arbitration 347
20.7 Failure to comply with Dispute Adjudication Board's decision 347
20.8 Expiry of Dispute Adjudication Board's appointment 347
FIDIC (Yellow Book) 348
Appendix – Plant and Design-Build 348
FIDIC (Yellow Book) 351
Conditions of Contract for Plant and Design-Build 351

Appendix 3
FIDIC (Silver Book) Conditions of Contract for EPC Turnkey Projects 353
Subclause 20 – Claims, Dispute and Arbitration 353
20.1 Contractor's claims 353
20.2 Appointment of the Dispute Adjudication Board 354
20.3 Failure to agree Dispute Adjudication Board 355
20.4 Obtaining Dispute Adjudication Board's decision 355
20.5 Amicable settlement 356
20.6 Arbitration 357
20.7 Failure to comply with Dispute Adjudication Board's decision 357
20.8 Expiry of Dispute Adjudication Board's appointment 357
FIDIC (Silver Book) 358
Appendix – EPC Turnkey Projects 358
FIDIC (Silver Book) 361
Conditions of Contract for EPC Turnkey Projects 361
Appendix 4  FIDIC (Gold Book) Conditions of Contract for Design, Build and Operate Projects 363
Subclause 20 – Claims, Dispute and Arbitration 363
  20.1 Contractor’s claims 363
  20.2 Employer’s claims 365
  20.3 Appointment of the Dispute Adjudication Board 365
  20.4 Failure to agree Dispute Adjudication Board 366
  20.5 Avoidance of disputes 367
  20.6 Obtaining Dispute Adjudication Board’s decision 367
  20.7 Amicable settlement 368
  20.8 Arbitration 368
  20.9 Failure to comply with Dispute Adjudication Board’s decision 369
  20.10 Disputes arising during the Operation Service Period 369
  20.11 Expiry of Dispute Adjudication Board’s appointment 369
Clause 20 Claims, Disputes and Arbitration 370
Sub-Clause 20.3 Appointment of the Dispute Adjudication Board 370
Sub-Clause 20.4 Failure to agree Dispute Adjudication Board 370
Sub-Clause 20.8 Arbitration 371
Sub-Clause 20.10 Disputes arising during the Operation Service Period 371

Appendix 5  Dispute Board Rules of the International Chamber of Commerce 375
Introductory Provisions 375
  Article 1: Scope of the Rules 375
  Article 2: Definitions 375
  Article 3: Agreement to submit to the Rules 376
Types of Dispute Boards 376
  Article 4: Dispute Review Boards (DRBs) 376
  Article 5: Dispute Adjudication Boards (DABs) 376
  Article 6: Combined Dispute Boards (CDBs) 377
Establishment of the Dispute Board 377
  Article 7: Appointment of the DB Members 377
Obligations of the Dispute Board Members 378
  Article 8: Independence 378
  Article 9: Work of the DB and confidentiality 379
  Article 10: DB Member Agreement 379
Obligation to Cooperate 379
  Article 11: Providing of information 379
  Article 12: Meetings and site visits 380
  Article 13: Written notifications or communications; time limits 380
Operation of the Dispute Board 381
  Article 14: Beginning and end of the DB’s activities 381
  Article 15: Powers of the DB 381
Procedures before the Dispute Board 381
  Article 16: Informal assistance with disagreements 381
### Contents

**Article 17: Formal referral of Disputes for a Determination; Statement of Case** 382

**Article 18: Response and additional documentation** 382

**Article 19: Organization and conduct of hearings** 383

**Determinations of the Dispute Board** 383

**Article 20: Time limit for rendering a Determination** 383

**Article 21: Review of Decisions by the Centre** 383

**Article 22: Contents of a Determination** 384

**Article 23: Making of the Determination** 384

**Article 24: Correction and interpretation of Determinations** 384

**Article 25: Admissibility of Determinations in subsequent proceedings** 385

**Compensation of the Dispute Board Members and ICC** 385

**Article 26: General Considerations** 385

**Article 27: Monthly Retainer Fee** 385

**Article 28: Daily Fee** 385

**Article 29: Travel costs and other expenses** 386

**Article 30: Taxes and charges** 386

**Article 31: Payment arrangements** 386

**Article 32: Administrative Expenses of ICC** 387

**General Rules** 387

**Article 33: Exclusion of liability** 387

**Article 34: Application of the Rules** 387

**Appendix** 387

**Schedule of costs** 387

**Standard ICC Dispute Board Clauses** 388

**ICC Dispute Review Board followed by ICC Arbitration if required** 388

**ICC Dispute Adjudication Board followed by ICC Arbitration if required** 388

**ICC Combined Dispute Board followed by ICC Arbitration if required** 389

**Model Dispute Board Member Agreement** 389

#### Appendix 6

**Sample Oaths and Affirmations** 393

- Witness oath – Muslim 393
- Witness oath – Christian 393
- Witness oath – Jewish 393
- Affirmation 393
- Interpreter witness oath – Muslim 393
- Interpreter witness oath – Christian, Jewish 394
- Interpreter witness affirmation 394

#### Appendix 7

**The Dispute Board Federation Dispute Adjudication Board Ad Hoc Rules for Use in Independently Administered Dispute Board Matters** 395

- Introductory Provisions 395
# Contents

1.0 Definitions .................................................. 395
2.0 Agreement to Submit to the Rules ......................... 396
3.0 Appointment of the Dispute Board Members ............. 396
4.0 Conflicts of interest ........................................ 396
5.0 Dispute Board Member Agreement ....................... 397
6.0 Cooperation of the Parties .................................. 398
7.0 Meetings and site visits ..................................... 398
8.0 Written notifications or communications; time limits .... 399
9.0 Beginning and end of the Dispute Board's activities .... 399
10.0 Powers of the Dispute Board ............................... 400
11.0 Payment of Dispute Board Members ..................... 400
12.0 Procedures before the Dispute Board ................. 402
12.4 Formal referral of Disputes for a Decision; Statement of Case .... 402
12.5 Response and additional documentation .............. 402
12.6 Organization and conduct of hearings .............. 403
13.1 Decisions of the Dispute Board; Time limit for rendering a Decision .... 404
13.2 Contents of a Decision .................................... 404
13.3 Making of the Decision .................................... 404
13.4 Correction and interpretation of Decisions .......... 404
13.5 Admissibility of Decisions in Subsequent Proceedings .... 405
14.0 Administrative expenses of the Appointing Body ...... 405
15.0 General Rules .............................................. 405

*Resources* ...................................................... 406

*Table of Cases* .............................................. 407

*Index* .......................................................... 409