Customary Justice and the Rule of Law in War-Torn Societies

Deborah H. Isser, editor

UNITED STATES INSTITUTE OF PEACE PRESS
WASHINGTON, D.C.
## Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments .............................................. xi

Introduction: Shifting Assumptions from Abstract Ideals to Messy Realities .............................................. 1
   *Deborah H. Isser*
   Three Key Constraints .................................................. 3
   Embracing Complexity .................................................... 5

1. Dilemmas of Articulation in Mozambique: Customary Justice in Transition ...................................................... 13
   *Stephen C. Lubkemann, Helene Maria Kyed, and Jennifer Garvey*
   Mozambican Society: A Sociocultural Kaleidoscope ............... 16
   History of State/Society Relations in Mozambique ................. 17
   The Traditional Authority System and Customary Law .......... 24
   The Formal Legal System ............................................... 34
   Formal and Customary Justice: Ongoing Dilemmas of Articulation .................................................. 40
   Recommendations ....................................................... 64

2. Mayan Law in Post-Conflict Guatemala ................................ 77
   *Jan Hessbruegge and Carlos Fredy Ochoa Garcia*
   Guatemala's Justice Systems in the Context of Historic Discrimination .................................................. 79
   Nonstate Systems: Local Expressions of Mayan Law .............. 85
   The State Justice System ............................................... 99
   Coexistence of State and Nonstate Justice Systems ............. 105
   Conclusions and Recommendations ................................ 112

3. Local-Level Justice under Transitional Administration: Lessons from East Timor ........................................... 119
   *Tanja Chopra, Christian Ranheim, and Rod Nixon*
   Historical Background .................................................. 122
   Local-Level Justice ...................................................... 124
   Reestablishing the Rule of Law: From the Top Down .............. 131
   Approaches to Local Justice under the Transitional Administration .............................................. 136
### Contents

After the Transitional Administration ............................................. 150
Conclusions and Recommendations ................................................ 153

4. The Clash of Two Goods: State and Nonstate Dispute Resolution in Afghanistan ................................................................. 159  
*Thomas Barfield, Neamat Nojumi, and J Alexander Thier*

- Nonstate Dispute Resolution in Afghanistan ................................. 163
- The Formal Justice System ......................................................... 175
- Potential for Coexistence of the Formal and Informal Systems ........ 183

5. Unintended Consequences: Constraint of Customary Justice in Post-Conflict Liberia ......................................................... 193  
*Stephen C. Lubkemann, Deborah H. Isser, and Philip A. Z. Banks III*

- Rule of Law in Liberia: A Country’s Troubled History .................... 195
- Liberia’s Dual Justice System ...................................................... 199
- The Formal System ...................................................................... 204
- The Customary Justice System ..................................................... 207
- The Formal and Customary Systems in Comparative Perspective ........ 214
- Recent State Regulation of Customary Justice Systems .................. 220
- Conclusions and Recommendations ............................................. 226

6. Tribal Customary Law and Legal Pluralism in al Anbar, Iraq ........ 239  
*Patricio Asfura-Heim*

- Tribalism and Anbari Society ...................................................... 242
- Anbari Tribal Customary Law in Practice ...................................... 250
- Tribal Law and State Authority .................................................... 264
- Counterinsurgency and Tribal Customary Law ............................... 274
- Conclusion: The Future of Tribal Law in Iraq ................................. 279

7. Customary Law in the Cross Fire of Sudan’s War of Identities ...... 285  
*Francis M. Deng*

- Historical Background: Law, War, and Identity ............................ 287
- Customary Law in Its Cultural Context ......................................... 293
- Customary Law and Legal Pluralism ............................................ 304
- Customary Law, War, and Social Transformation ........................... 307
- The Challenges of Reform ......................................................... 312