Legitimacy in European Administrative Law: Reform and Reconstruction

Edited by Matthias Ruffert
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v
Contents vii

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1 Legitimacy in Administrative Law: Reform and Reconstruction
Pascale Gonod 1

1 General Remarks 3
1.1 Claim (or Expectation) 3
1.2 Decomposition 4
2 Forms of Legitimacy 4
2.1 Deepening of Democratic Legitimacy 4
2.2 Development of Participative Legitimacy 4
2.3 A Procedural Legitimacy? 6

LEGITIMACY AND ACCOUNTABILITY AS A BASIS FOR ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANISATION AND ACTIVITY

CHAPTER 2 Legitimacy in Administrative Law? A French Perspective
Jacques Cailllosse 9

1 Understanding the Question 11
1.1 What Does ‘Legitimacy’ Actually Mean? 11
1.1.1 On the Uncertain Legal Status of Legitimacy 12
1.1.2 The Variety of Forms and Types of Legitimacy 13
1.1.3 Historic Roots and Contingency of Legitimacy 13
1.2 Administrative Law on the Issue of Legitimacy 14
1.2.1 Discourse on Legitimacy 15
1.2.2 Questioning Legitimacy in other Ways 15
1.2.3 Mechanisms for Providing Legitimacy 16
1.3 Conclusions on ‘Legitimacy in Administrative Law’ 16
1.3.1 Distinction between Legitimacy of Administrative Law and of Administration 17
1.3.2 Interdependence of Administrative Law and Power 17
2 What Response(s) are Provided by French Administrative Law? 18
2.1 From Legitimation through Law... 19
2.1.1 Material or Functional Analysis 21
2.1.2 Legitimacy on a Constitutional Basis 21
2.2 ...to de-Legitimation through Management? 24
3 Potential Developments 25
CHAPTER 3
People as ‘Users’ and ‘Citizens’ The Quest for Legitimacy in British Public Administration
Andrew Le Sueur

1 Introduction 29
1.1 Outline 29
1.2 Concepts of Legitimacy 30
2 The British Constitutional Context 31
2.1 Power from ‘We, the people’ in Britain? 31
2.2 Two Spheres of Legitimacy: the Micro and the Macro 32
3 Is there a Legitimacy Crisis in Britain? 33
4 Micro Legitimacy in the Individual Sphere: Users 36
4.1 The User Perspective Agenda 36
4.2 The ‘Principles of Good Administration’ Agenda 39
5 Macro Legitimacy in the Collective Sphere: Participation 40
5.1 Identification of Problems and Policy Formation
   (Stages 1 and 2) 42
5.2 Providing Legal Authority for Policy (Stage 3) 45
5.3 Questions of Institutional Design 45
6 Closing Comments 48

CHAPTER 4
Legitimacy and Accountability as a Basis for Administrative Organisation and Activity in Germany
Eberhard Schmidt-Aßmann

1 Introduction 51
2 What is State Authority (‘Staatsgewalt’)? 52
3 What is People (‘Volk’)? 52
4 What does ‘Derives’ (‘geht aus’) Mean? 53
4.1 Personal Legitimation 54
4.2 Substantial Legitimation 54
5 The Idea of a Sufficient Level of Legitimacy
   (‘Legitimationsniveau’) 55
6 Some Current Problems 55
6.1 Independent Agencies 55
6.2 Privatization 56
7 Perspectives: Legitimacy and Accountability in European Context 56
# CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 5

**Legitimacy and Accountability in Italian Administrative Law. A Critical Analysis**  
Giacinto della Cananea  
59

1. **Distingue Frequenterr**  
61
2. **The Legitimacy of Administrative Action:**  
Three Constitutional Models  
62
3. **'Power from the People' – Rhetoric and Reality**  
64
4. **The Obsession for Legality and its Drawbacks**  
66
5. **From Legality to Legitimacy: The General Principles of Law**  
69
6. **Procedural Legitimacy**  
71
7. **Accountability as Responsibility**  
73
8. **Accountability, Performance and Transparency**  
75
9. **Institutional Constraints on Political Power: Independent Authorities**  
77
10. **Accountable to None? Public-Private Corporations**  
79

## CHAPTER 6

**The Legitimacy of the Administration in Spain**  
Francisco Velasco Caballero  
81

1. **Administration, Democracy and the Constitution**  
83
   1.1 **Methodological Plan**  
83
   1.2 **Spanish Public Administration**  
84
      1.2.1 **Pre-constitutional Administration**  
85
      1.2.2 **The Constitutional Administration**  
87
2. **The Diversity of Legitimacy Arguments: Law, Political Theory and Administrative Science**  
89
   2.1 **Political Theory: the Concept of Democracy**  
89
   2.2 **Administrative Science: Effectiveness and Participation**  
90
3. **Levels of Constitutional Legitimacy**  
92
4. **Forms of Legitimacy**  
94
   4.1 **Legality as a Criteria of Legitimacy**  
94
   4.2 **Parliamentary Control**  
96
   4.3 **Citizen Participation**  
98
   4.4 **Submission to the Direction of Government**  
101
   4.5 **Objectivity and Efficacy in the Service of the General Interest**  
102
5. **Special Analysis of some Types and Forms of Administration**  
106
   5.1 **Independent Administrations**  
106
   5.2 **Corporate Administration**  
110
   5.3 **Mixed Administration**  
112
   5.4 **Local Administration**  
113
CHAPTER 7


Gunilla Edelstam

1 Introduction 117
2 Legitimacy and Monarchy 118
2.1 Legitimacy of the King in Ancient Times 118
2.2 Legitimacy of the King Today 120
2.3 Legitimacy at the Decline of the Power of the Monarchy 122
3 Legitimacy and Democratic Constitution 123
3.1 Introduction 123
3.2 Legislation and Legitimacy 124
3.2.1 The Constitution on Legislation 124
3.2.2 Control of Legislation 125
3.2.3 Legitimacy Issues 126
3.2.3.1 Commitment of the MP 127
3.2.3.2 Framework Legislation 128
3.2.3.3 The Quantity of Legislation 129
3.2.3.4 Respect for Fundamental Rights of the Citizens 130
3.2.3.4.1 Strong Protection 130
3.2.3.4.2 Weak Protection 131
3.2.3.4.3 No Protection 131
3.3 Application and Legitimacy 134
3.3.1 The Constitution on Issues of Application 134
3.3.2 Control of Application 136
3.3.3 Legitimacy Issues 137
3.3.3.1 Rule of Law and Fair Procedure 137
3.3.3.2 Jurisdiction or Administration? 138
4 Legitimacy and Facts 139
4.1 Introduction: Questions of Law and Questions of Facts 139
4.1.1 Questions of Law 139
4.1.2 Questions of Discretion 140
4.1.3 Questions of Facts 140
4.1.4 Methods 140
4.2 Fact-Finding 141
4.2.1 Burden of Proof 143
4.2.2 Duty to Investigate 143
4.2.3 Standard of Proof 144
4.3 Responsibility 145
5 Concluding Remarks 151
## Chapter 8

### The History of Legitimate Administration in Europe

**Juli Ponce Solé**

- **Introduction** 157
- **The Bureaucratic Paradigm** 158
- **New Public Management** 160
- **Governance** 161
- **Quality of Administrative Action: The Right to Good Administration and Procedural Legitimacy** 162
- **Quality of Administrative Action** 166
- **Good Administration and Good Governance: Administration and Democratic Legitimacy** 168

## Chapter 9

### Democracy, Legitimacy and Accountability – is there a Common European Theoretical Framework?

**Roberto Caranta**

- **Foreword** 177
- **The Democratic Nation-State and its Administration** 179
- **The Weak Spots in the Paradigm** 181
- **Improvements to the Paradigm or an Alternative Paradigm?** 184
- **Shortcomings of the New Paradigm – and of some of its Institutions – and their Cure** 187
- **The Quest for Legitimacy and Accountability in the EU** 189
- **Conclusions** 195

## Chapter 10

### Legitimacy in Administrative Law: European Union

**Paul Craig**

- **Formal Legitimacy** 199
- **Legitimacy and Legal Accountability** 201
  - **Availability of Judicial Review** 201
  - **Targeting Judicial Review** 205
- **Legitimacy and Political Accountability** 208
- **Legitimacy and Substantive/Output Accountability** 208
  - **The CAP and the Structural Funds** 209
  - **Utilities Regulation** 210
- **Conclusion** 215
## CHAPTER II

### Historical and Prospective Views on Comparative Law as a Tool to Build a Framework for Legitimacy in Europe

Susana de la Sierra 217

1. Introduction: The Transformation of Administrative Law as a Transformation of Powers 219
2. Administrative Law through Time from a Comparative Perspective: A Tentative Chronology 222
   2.1. The Precedents of Administrative Law 223
   2.2. The 'French Legal Empire' as a Model of Reference 225
   2.3. The Administrative Law of the Welfare State and the Incorporation of other 'Foreign Elements' 226
   2.4. Globalisation as a North American Approach 228
3. Some Questions for the Comparative Analysis 230
   3.1. The Particular Forces of Specific Legal Orders: The Concept of 'Legal Diplomacy' 230
   3.2. Globalisation of Language, Globalisation of Concepts? 230
   3.3. The Import of Legal Concepts and the Assumption of Political and Constitutional Contexts 231
5. A Look into the Future: Farewell to the Weberian Administration? 233

## CHAPTER 12

### The Legitimacy of Administration: German Ideas and how they are Received in France

Patrice Chrétiens 235

1. A German View of the Question of Democratic Legitimation of the Administration in France 241
   1.1. 'In France, the question of democratic legitimation of the administration is not really discussed' 241
   1.2. 'In practice, democratic legitimation of the administration is nonetheless fragile...' 243
2. The German Theory of Democratic Legitimation of Administration 245
   2.1. General Observations 246
   2.2. The Fragility of the Democratic Principle 248

## CHAPTER 13

### Problems of Legitimacy in Contracting-Out and Privatisation

Catherine Donnelly 251

1. Introduction 253
2. Experience of Contracting-Out in the UK and Ireland 254
   2.1. UK 254
## CONTENTS

2.2 Ireland

3 Input Legitimacy

3.1 Constitutional Legitimacy

3.1.1 The UK

3.1.2 Ireland

3.2 Democratic Legitimacy

3.2.1 Direct Participatory Democracy

3.2.2 Indirect Participatory Democracy

3.2.3 Liberal Democracy

3.2.4 Civic Republican Democracy

3.2.5 Public Choice Democracy

3.2.6 Policy-Making/Policy-Implementation

4 Output Legitimacy

4.1 Efficiency and Effectiveness

4.1.1 Managerial Explanations for Efficiency and Effectiveness

4.1.2 Political Explanations for Efficiency and Effectiveness

4.1.3 Ensuring Efficiency and Effectiveness

4.2 Accountability

4.2.1 Political Accountability

4.2.2 Legal Accountability

4.2.2.1 The Need for Public Law Accountability

4.2.2.2 Public Law in the UK

4.2.2.3 Public Law in Ireland

5 Enhancing Legitimacy of Contracting Out and Privatisation

6 Conclusion

### CHAPTER 14

**Legitimacy: From Politics to Expertise and Public Opinion?**

Dawn Oliver

1 Introduction

2 Politics, Politicians and Legitimacy

3 The UK Experience

3.1 The Regulation of Politicians' Decision Making

3.2 Depoliticisation and the Immunisation of Decisions from Politics

3.3 The Balancing of Participation and the Public Interest

3.4 A Case Study: The UK Planning Act 2008

4 Why the Difference between the UK and other Countries?

5 Constitutional Narratives

6 Political Style, Culture and Traditions

7 Summary and Conclusions
LEGITIMACY IN EUROPEAN ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

CHAPTER 15

Legitimacy and Accountability: Integration and Compensation
Athanasios Gromitsaris

1 Introduction: Structures and Descriptions of European Integration
1.1 Structural Tensions
1.2 Descriptions and Normative Standards
2 Thesis
3 The Institutionalization of Cooperation, Competition and (Mutual-) Control of the Agents of European Integration
3.1 Institutional Balance and Hierarchy of Norms
3.2 Comitology and Delegated Legislation
3.3 Creation of Institutions
3.4 Informality and Illegality
4 Institutionalization of the Tension between Information and Resources
4.1 Uncertainty and Dependence
4.2 Information Gathering and Monitoring
4.3 Management of Resources, Budgets, and Government Control
5 Generating Confidence through Institutionalizing Distrust
5.1 Mutual and Reflexive Supervision Processes
5.2 Rules on Correct Rule Application
5.3 EMU Conditionality, 'Vincolo Esterno' and Conflict of Legitimacies
6 Institutionalization of the Tension between Person and Institution
6.1 Rationales for Participation
6.2 Feelings of Right and Legal Enforceability
6.3 Union Citizenship: A Surprise Package
6.4 Public Scrutiny and 'Transcendence'
7 The Role of Judicial Review
7.1 Principles Necessary in a Democratic Society
7.2 Keeping Authorities within Legal Bounds
7.3 Proportionality: The EU as an Amorphous Sand-Heap of Market Participants? The Tension between Market-Oriented Liberties and Democratically Legitimated National Institutions
7.4 Rights to effective Judicial Remedies for the Citizen in the Context of Integrated Administration
8 Legal Practical and Institutional Rationality
8.1 Practical Rationality of Legal Institutions and Rationality of Sciences
CONTENTS

8.2 Agent Sensitive Institutions and Interest Group Representative Democracy 341
8.3 Institutional Linkages and the Channels of Democratic Input in the EU 342
8.4 Calculability and External Enforcement of Expectations 343
8.5 Accountability and Law 344
8.6 Administration as Market Economy and Routinized Charismatic Authority 345
9 Conclusion: Belief in the Rational Resolvability of the Guiding Tensions Underlying the Nexus of Law and Politics as Legitimacy 346
9.1 Hierarchy, Heterarchy, Synarchy, Polyarchy and Polyecephalous Physiognomy of the EU 346
9.2 Accountability to ‘idées directrices’, and Guiding Tensions 347

RESULTS AND PERSPECTIVES

CHAPTER 16 Comparative Perspectives of Administrative Legitimacy
Matthias Ruffert 351

1 The Legal Meaning of Legitimacy in Administrative Law 353
1.1 Legitimacy in Legal Terminology 353
1.2 Legitimacy between Constitutional and Administrative Law 353
1.3 Legitimacy and its Plethoric Terminology 355
2 Legitimacy, the Democratic Principle, and beyond 356
2.1 Legitimacy and Forms of Government 356
2.2 Legitimacy and the Democratic Principle 357
2.2.1 Democratic Legitimacy 357
2.2.1.1 Strict Approaches 357
2.2.1.2 Participatory Broadening 357
2.2.2 Legitimacy beyond Democracy 358
2.2.2.1 The Role of the Output 358
2.2.2.2 Good Administration 358
2.2.3 Some Instances of Compromise 359
3 Unfolding Legitimacy in Administrative Law 359
4 Legitimacy Controlled 360
5 Conclusion 360