Oliver on Free Movement of Goods in the European Union

Fifth Edition

Peter J Oliver
Legal Advisor to the European Commission
Professor at the Université Libre de Bruxelles

Contributing Editors

Stefan Enchelmaier
Professor of European and Comparative Commercial Law at the York Law School,
University of York

Malcolm Jarvis
Barrister, 20 Essex Street

Angus Johnston
University Senior Lecturer in Law, University of Cambridge, Fellow of Trinity Hall

Sven Norberg
Former Director of the Legal Affairs department, EFTA Secretariat,
Former Judge of the EFTA Court
Former Director at DG Competition, European Commission

Christopher Stothers
Counsel to Arnold & Porter (UK) LLP, London
Visiting Lecturer in the Faculty of Laws, University College, London

Stephen Weatherill
Jacques Delors Professor of European Law, University of Oxford
Fellow of Somerville College

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2010
# Table of Contents

**Preface**

**List of Abbreviations** xvii

**Table of Cases** xix

**Table of European Treaties** lxvii

**Table of Other Conventions, Treaties etc** lxxxix

**Table of European Legislation** xciii

**List of National Regulatory and Legislative Acts**

1  **Introduction** 1

*Peter Oliver*

2  **Scope: Subject Matter** 14

*Malcolm Jarvis*

I.  **The Meaning of “Goods”** 15

II.  **Goods “Originating In Member States” and Goods from Third Countries “In Free Circulation” in the Union** 22

   A.  **Goods Originating in the Member States** 23

   B.  **Goods from Third Countries in Free Circulation in the Union** 23

III.  **The Nationality of the Owner** 27

IV.  **The Transactions Covered** 28

   A.  **General** 28

   B.  **Ancillary Movements of Goods** 32

      (i)  **Goods and Services** 32

      (ii)  **Goods and Workers** 39

      (iii)  **Goods and Establishment** 40

      (iv)  **Goods and Capital** 41

3  **Scope: Territory** 44

*Peter Oliver*

I.  **Introduction** 44

II.  **The Scope of Articles 34 to 36** 45

III.  **The Scope of the Provisions on Harmonisation** 54

4  **Scope: Persons Bound** 55

*Malcolm Jarvis*

I.  **Member States** 55

II.  **The Institutions of the Union** 60

III.  **Private Parties** 67

   A.  **Introduction** 67

   B.  **The First Question** 68

  ix
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. Import Inspections and Controls</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Obligation to Produce a Certificate</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Certain Sanctions or Fines</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. The Obligation to Make a Declaration of Origin</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. The Prohibition on the Sale of Goods</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Marketing or Type Approval</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Requirements as to the Presentation and Labelling of Products</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Incitement to Purchase Domestic Products</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. The Obligation to Appoint a Representative in the Importing Member State</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Rules Imposing Liability on the Importer</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Import Monopolies</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Conditions of Payment, Obligatory Deposits and Guarantees and</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restrictions on Credit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. Restrictions on Advertising and Promotion</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O. Requirements that Goods be Sold by Qualified Persons or Licensed</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. Discriminatory Restrictions on the Time and Place where Goods may</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be Sold</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q. Restrictions or Requirements on Stocking Goods</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Reference Back to the Law of the Exporting Member State</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Discrimination in Public Supply Contracts</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T. The Abusive Reservation of Appellations of Origin or Indications of Source</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U. Abusive Restrictions on the use of Generic Terms</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Obligatory Origin Marking</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W. Language Requirements</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. The Duty to Keep Records</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y. Restrictions on Use</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z. Restrictions on Possession</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AA. Restrictions on Health Care Coverage</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BB. Certain Price Controls</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC. Discriminatory Rules of Procedure and Evidence</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DD. Regulation of Conditions of Production</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EE. Restrictions on Goods in Transit</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Measures Falling Outside Article 34</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Measures of Equivalent Effect under Article 35 TFEU</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Export Licences, Controls and Certificates</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Local Bottling and Preparation Requirements</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Export Monopolies</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Discriminatory Conditions of Insurance</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Discriminatory Rules of Procedure</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. The Obligation to Land Fish in the Flag State</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Providing a Particular Advantage for National Processors</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Prohibition of the Use of Foreign Temporary (&quot;Customs&quot;) Number Plates</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I. Prohibition on Receiving Payment before the End of the Return Period in Consumer Sales 211
J. Requirement of Prior Registration with an Official Body and Submission to Marketing Measures 212
K. Restrictions on Production 212
L. Restrictions on Goods in Transit 213
V. Restrictions on Transit 213

8 Article 36 TFEU: General 215
Stefan Enchelmaier
I. Introduction 215
II. The Status of the “Mandatory Requirements” 216
III. The Burden of Proof 221
IV. Proportionality and Non-Discrimination 222
   A. “Arbitrary Discrimination” 222
   B. “Disguised Restriction” 224
   C. “Justified” 225
      (i) General 225
      (ii) Necessity 226
      (iii) Miscellaneous 229
      (iv) Mutual Recognition 231
V. Extra-Territorial Application of Article 36 236
VI. The Relationship between Article 36 and Community Legislation 238
VII. The Grounds of Justification 239
   A. General 239
   B. Fundamental Rights 241
   C. Public Morality 248
   D. Public Policy 251
   E. Public Security 253
   F. The Protection of Human Health and Life 257
      (i) The Importance of this Ground; The Precautionary Principle 257
      (ii) The Burden of Proof; Evidence 260
      (iii) Public Health and the “Mandatory Requirements” 260
      (iv) Specific Restrictions 261
         (a) Re-treatment in the Importing Member State 261
         (b) Import Licences 261
         (c) Import Controls and Inspections 262
         (d) Certificates 262
         (e) Vitamins, Minerals, and Other Additives in Foodstuffs 262
         (f) Pesticides and Biocides 265
         (g) Maximum Levels of Bacteria 265
         (h) The Prohibition of Harmless Foodstuffs 265
         (i) The Obligation to Appoint a Representative in the Importing Member State 266
         (j) Rules Imposing Liability on the Importer 267
         (k) Requirements that Goods be Sold by Qualified Persons Only 267
Table of Contents

(l) Restrictions on Parallel Imports of Pharmaceuticals 268
(m) Imports of Pharmaceuticals and Medical Products for Personal Use 269
(n) The Obligation to Repackage Pharmaceuticals Prior to Importation 271
(o) Ban on the Substitution of Identical Pharmaceutical Products 271
(p) Restrictions on Importation and Sale of Alcoholic Beverages 271
(q) Restrictions on Advertising and Sales Promotion 272
(r) Labelling Requirements 275
(s) Rules Relating to Pharmacies 276
(t) Accident Prevention, including Road Safety 276
(u) Miscellaneous 277

G. Animals and Plants 277
   (i) The Protection of Rare and Endangered Species 278
   (ii) The Prevention of Disease 279
   (iii) Animal Welfare 280

H. The Protection of National Treasures Possessing Artistic, Historic or Archaeological Value 281
I. The Prevention of Tax Evasion 283
J. Consumer Protection 285
   (i) General 285
   (ii) Language Requirements 287
   (iii) Generic Names 290
   (iv) Geographical Denominations 290
   (v) Other Names 290
   (vi) Distinctive Symbols 291
   (vii) Hallmarking 292
   (viii) Restrictions on Advertising and Sales Promotion 293
   (ix) Payment for Distance Sales 294
   (x) Assessing the Consumer's Understanding 294
   (xi) Criticism Deflected 297

L. The Protection of the Environment 302
M. The Improvement of Working Conditions 306
N. The Maintenance of the Diversity of the Press 307
O. The Preservation of the Financial Balance of Social Security and Health Care Systems 308
P. The Promotion of National or Regional Culture 309
Q. Protection of Commercial Reputation 311
R. Accident Prevention and Road Safety 311
S. Other Grounds 311

9 Article 36 TFEU: Intellectual Property
Christopher Stothers
I. General Remarks 313
II. Other Provisions Relating to Intellectual Property 316
# Table of Contents

A. Union Legislation 317  
B. International Agreements 319  
C. Article 18: Non-Discrimination 320  
D. Articles 101 and 102: Competition 321  
E. Article 17(2) of the Charter 324  

III. Intellectual Property and Article 36 324  
A. General rule 325  
   (i) Conditions and Procedures for Grant 325  
   (ii) The Scope of Protection 326  
   (iii) Expiry of Term 328  
   (iv) Comment 328  
B. Exception 1: Non-Discrimination 329  
C. Exception 2: Goods in Transit 331  
D. Exception 3: Exhaustion 334  
   (i) General 334  
   (ii) The Concept of Consent 337  
E. Geographical Denominations 360  

10 Other Exception Clauses 370  
*Angus Johnston*  
I. Article 14 TFEU (ex 16 EC) 371  
II. Article 106 TFEU (ex 86 EC) 373  
III. Article 122 TFEU (ex 100 EC) 377  
IV. Articles 143 and 144 TFEU (ex 119 and 120 EC) 380  
V. Article 134 EC (ex 115 EEC) 384  
VI. Article 345 TFEU (ex 295 EC) 385  
VII. Article 346 TFEU (ex 296 EC) 386  
VIII. Article 347 TFEU (ex 297 EC) 390  
IX. Article 215 TFEU (ex 301 EC) 395  
X. Article 350 TFEU (ex 306 EC) 396  
XI. Article 351 TFEU (ex 307 EC) 397  

11 Agriculture and Fisheries 401  
*Peter Oliver*  
I. Where No Common Market Organisation Exists 402  
II. Where a Common Market Organisation Does Exist 403  

12 State Monopolies of a Commercial Character 412  
*Angus Johnston*  
I. Introduction 412  
II. Some Established Principles 414  
III. The Definition of a “State Monopoly” 416  
IV. The Prohibitions in Article 37(1) and (2) 418  
V. Article 37 and Articles 34 and 35 422  
VI. Agriculture 425  
VII. The Link with Article 36 (ex 30) 425  
VIII. Assessment 426
13 Union Legislation Relating to the Free Movement of Goods

Stephen Weatherill

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Legal Bases for Harmonisation</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Attribution of Powers to the Union</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Internal Market: Article 115</td>
<td>430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Internal Market: Article 114</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) The Relationship between Articles 114 and 115</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) The Scope of Article 114</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Achieving High Standards</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Article 114 and Minimum Harmonisation</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) The Exception Clauses in Article 114(4) to (9)</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vi) Article 114(10)</td>
<td>446</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Agriculture</td>
<td>446</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Correcting Competitive Distortions</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Customs Co-operation</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Worker Protection</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Culture</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Public Health</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Consumer Protection</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. The Environment</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. General Objectives</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Enhanced Co-operation</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. The “Mainstreaming Provisions”</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O. The Choice of Legal Basis</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. General Principles of Union Law</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Fundamental Rights</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Subsidiarity</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Proportionality</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Legal Certainty and Legitimate Expectation</td>
<td>464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Equality</td>
<td>465</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Regional Disparities in the Internal Market</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Techniques of Harmonisation</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Total and Optional Harmonisation</td>
<td>467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Minimum Standards</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Safeguard Clauses</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Technical Adaptation</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Notification of National Measures</td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Directive 98/34</td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Regulation 764/2008</td>
<td>478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Regulation 2679/98</td>
<td>481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Public Procurement</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Conclusion: The Relationship between Harmonisation and Articles 34 to 36</td>
<td>484</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
14 The European Economic Area
Sven Norberg

I. Introduction 487
II. Analysis of the Agreement 490
   A. General 490
   B. The Free Movement of Goods 492
   C. "Old" Legislation 495
   D. "New" Legislation 497
   E. Enforcement 499
   F. Dispute Settlement 500
III. Subsequent Developments 502
   A. General 502
   B. Judgments of the European Court of Justice and the General Court 503
   C. EFTA Court Judgments 504
IV. Conclusion 505

15 Conclusion
Peter Oliver

Annex I Table of Equivalences of Treaty Articles 509

Annex II Extracts from Leading Judgments 510

Annex III Selected Bibliography on Articles 34 to 36 TFEU 513

Index 519