Kerstin Ann-Susann Schäfer

Application of Mandatory Rules in the Private International Law of Contracts

A Critical Analysis of Approaches in Selected Continental and Common Law Jurisdictions, with a View to the Development of South African Law
Chapter 1: Introduction and preliminary matters

I The Problem: Application of mandatory rules in the conflict setting

II Historical background: From Savigny and the 'liberal state' to the modern welfare state of the 20th century

III Party autonomy and mandatory rules

IV Recent legislative approaches

V Definition of different kinds of mandatory rules
   1 Mandatory rules in a domestic sense or international sense
   2 The country of origin
   3 Private law or public law
   4 Application as law or consideration as fact

VI Determination and limitation of the scope of examination
   1 A comparative study
   2 The choice of countries
   3 The contexts of application of mandatory rules in the private international law of contracts

VII Structure of this study
# Chapter 2: Party autonomy and mandatory rules

## I Party autonomy and its limitations by the application of mandatory rules under the Rome Convention

1. **Art 3 (3) of the Rome Convention: Purely domestic contracts**
   a. International contracts versus purely domestic contracts
   b. Requirements for purely domestic contracts
   c. Mandatory rules in the sense of art 3 (3) of the Rome Convention
   d. Art 3 (3) Rome Convention as a multilateral conflict rule

2. **Limitation of the parties' choice in order to protect the weaker contracting party**
   a. Background and purpose of articles 5 and 6 of the Rome Convention
   b. **Art 5 (2) of the Rome Convention**
      (1) Conditions of art 5 (2) of the Rome Convention
      (2) Mandatory rules in the sense of art 5 (2) of the Rome Convention
      (3) The relationship between the chosen law and the mandatory rules of the law of the consumer’s country of habitual residence
   c. **Art 6 (1) of the Rome Convention**
      (1) Contracts subject to art 6 of the Rome Convention
      (2) Mandatory rules in the sense of art 6 (1) of the Rome Convention
      (3) The relationship between the chosen law and the mandatory rules of the otherwise applicable law according to paragraph (2)
   d. Application of articles 5 and 6 of the Rome Convention by analogy
   e. Relationship of articles 5 and 6 to article 7 of the Rome Convention
   f. Concluding remarks
Table of Contents

II Restriction of party autonomy under the Swiss IPRG 67
   1 Domestic contracts 68
   2 Consumer contracts 68
   3 Employment contracts 69

III The Swiss solution of restricting party autonomy versus the favour principle of the Rome Convention 69

IV Internationally mandatory rules 71

V Evasion of law (*fraus legis*) 72
   1 The doctrine of *fraus legis* 72
   2 Evasion of law as limitation of party autonomy? 74
   3 Evasion of law under the Rome Convention 77
   4 Conclusion and remarks 78

VI Proposal for South African private international law of contracts on the limitation of party autonomy 79
   1 Party autonomy and its limitations under present South African private international law of contracts 80
   2 Proposal 84

Chapter 3: Internationally mandatory rules 89

I The application of internationally mandatory rules: Three issues 94

II Characterising, identifying and distinguishing internationally mandatory rules 95
   1 The *formal* criterion: Internationally mandatory rules as unilateral conflict rules 97
   2 The *material* criterion: The purpose of the rule 99
      a Time of enactment of the rule 99
b The distinction between public law and private law 99

c Interests and purposes pursued by the rule 101

d Concluding remarks 102

Chapter 4:
Internationally mandatory rules of the *lex fori* 105

I Methodological approaches 105

1 Positive function of *ordre public* 106

2 ‘*Special connection*, ‘*lois d’application immédiate*’, ‘*overriding statutes*’ 108

3 Critical remarks 111

II Art 7 (2) of the Rome Convention, art 18 of the Swiss IPRG 112

1 Domestic contact 113

2 Internationally mandatory rules 114

3 Legal consequences 116

III Examples of internationally mandatory rules of English, German and Swiss law 116

1 Rules serving the state’s economic and political goals 116

   a Foreign exchange control and currency regulations 117

   b Competition and Anti-Trust Law 118

   c Import and Export Restrictions and Embargoes 120

   d Protection of landed property 122

2 Protection of the weaker contracting party 122

   a Excursus: Dispute about characterising of protective private laws as internationally mandatory rules 124

   b Examples 128

      (1) Employment protection 129

      (2) Consumer protection 131

      (3) Protection for tenants 133
Chapter 5: 
Foreign internationally mandatory rules

I Approaches of academic writers
1 ‘Schuldstatutstheorie’ or ‘Proper law doctrine’
2 ‘International administrative law’, ‘Public Conflict of Laws’
3 ‘Special Connection Theory’ or ‘Theory of Special Point of Contact’
   a ‘Conflict of Economic Laws’ (Wirtschaftskollisionsrecht)
   b Does the special connection imply a return to unilateralism?
   c Origins of the Special Connection Theory
   d Further developments
   e Double functionality of contracts
   f Elements of a conflict rule for a special connection
   g Internationally mandatory rule
   h Close connection
   i Control of the content, ‘shared values’
   j Legal consequences - Means and scope of application
   k Subsidiary consideration as fact in the substantive law
4 ‘Combination theory’
5 Consideration only on the level of substantive law
6 Summary
   a Internationally mandatory rules of the foreign proper law
   b Third country’s internationally mandatory rules
7 Critical analysis of the different approaches and final remarks
   a Principle of unity of the conflict of laws relating to contracts versus the special connection
   b Does taking account of (third countries’) internationally mandatory rules as ‘facts’ replace choice of law considerations?
   c The ultimate control of the forum
I

14 Table of Contents

d Principle of territoriality or non-applicability of foreign public law 167
e The advantage of the solution of the Special Connection Theory 169
f Does the special connection imply a departure from the traditional allocation technique? 170
g Other objections to a ‘special connection process’ 172
h International comity, decisional harmony 174
i Combination Theory 175

II German and Swiss case law solutions 177

1 The general rule: Application of mandatory rules of the proper law of the contract 178
a ‘Proper law doctrine’ of the Supreme Court of the German Reich 179
b Principle of ‘non-applicability of foreign public law’, ‘International Administrative Law’ or ‘Public Conflict of Laws’ of the Federal Supreme Court 180
c Exceptions to the principle of ‘non-applicability of foreign public law’ 183
(1) The foreign public law serves predominantly private interests 183
(2) The foreign state has the power to enforce its law 184
d Swiss case law solutions 185
e Concluding remarks 187

2 Internationally mandatory rules of a third country 189
a Non-applicability of third countries’ public law – Public Conflict of Laws 190
b Public Law rules serving private interests and internationally mandatory private law rules of a third country 191
c Consideration as factum within the substantive rules of the lex causae 192
d Infringement of foreign prohibition as violation of German boni mores 192
(1) Smuggling contracts and import restrictions 193
(2) The Federal Supreme Court 194
(3) Borax and Borsäure case - the foreign rule also serves German interests 195
(4) Nigerian mask case - the foreign rule serves interests shared in common by all civilised nations 196
(5) Generally valid moral principles 197
(6) Inapplicability of German boni mores 197

e Consideration within the operative facts of § 823 BGB 200
f Impossibility of performance or frustration of contract 201
g Swiss case law 204
(1) Refusal of application of third countries’ mandatory laws 204
(2) Consideration as fact within the substantive law of the lex causae 206
h Conclusion 209

3 Critical remarks 210
a Duality of solutions 211
b Public Conflict of Laws, principle of territoriality 212
c Different kinds of public law rules 214
d Consideration as fact within the applicable substantive law 215
(1) Are foreign rules facts? The need for choice of law considerations 215
(2) The need for a conflict rule 218
(3) The enlargement of substantive law rules 219
(4) The ultimate control of the forum state 219
e Conclusion 220

III The English common law approach 221
1 The general rule: Application of mandatory rules of the lex causae 221
a Private and public law 222
b Exceptions to the general rule; non-enforcement of foreign penal, revenue and other public laws 226
c Concluding remarks 232
2 Application of third countries’ internationally mandatory rules

a English public policy, ‘international comity’ solution
   (1) Foster v Driscoll
   (2) Regazzoni v K C Sethia
   (3) Other cases
   (4) Inapplicability of English public policy despite the violation of foreign law
   (5) Application of English public policy where foreign public policy is violated, not a foreign statute
   (6) Summary

b Academic discussion of the rule of public policy and critical remarks
   (1) The scope of this rule of public policy
   (2) Public policy in English law
   (3) The juristic basis of the public policy rule
   (4) The public policy-comity rule as special conflict rule?
   (5) The vagueness of the public policy rule

c The lex loci solutionis; Ralli Bros v Compania Naviera Sota y Aznar

d The juristic basis of the lex loci solutionis rule
   (1) Conflict of laws approach
   (2) Substantive law approach
   (3) Dicta in English case law

e Concluding remarks
   (1) The problematic situation
   (2) The necessity of choice of law considerations

f Illegality under legal systems other than the lex loci solutionis, in particular the lex loci contractus and the law of the parties domicile or nationality
   (1) Kleinwort Sons & Co v Ungarische Baumwolle Industrie AG
   (2) The lex loci contractus
(3) Rossano v Manufacturers' Life Insurance Co 260

3 Concluding critical remarks 260
   a The need for choice of law considerations 261
   b Internationally mandatory rules stemming from a law other than the *lex loci solutionis* 262
   c Internationally mandatory rules of the proper law 264

IV Foreign internationally mandatory rules under the Rome Convention and the Swiss IPRG - approaches of the legislature 267
   1 Article 7 (1) of the Rome Convention, article 19 of the Swiss IPRG 268
      a The law of another country 270
      b With which the situation has a close connection 271
      c Internationally mandatory rule 271
      d Article 19: Legitimate and overriding interests of a party 273
      e Discretion of the court 275
         (1) Evaluation of the nature and purpose and regard to consequences 275
         (2) To give effect / to take into account 277

2 Academic debates and criticism 279

3 Reservation to article 7 (1) 282

4 Internationally mandatory rules of the proper law 283
   a The Rome Convention 283
   b Article 13 of the Swiss IPRG 284

5 Impact on the law in Germany, England and Switzerland 285
   a Germany 285
      (1) Closing of the loophole 285
      (2) Scope of reference of the normal conflict rules 287
   b England 288
      (1) Does the public policy-comity rule survive the Rome Convention?
(2) Does the *lex loci solutionis* rule survive the Rome Convention? 290

c Switzerland 292

(1) Art 19: A special connection of third countries’ internationally mandatory rules 292

(2) Influence of article 13 sentence 2 of the Swiss IPRG 294

6 Concluding critical remarks: Was the reservation in respect of article 7 (1) of the Rome Convention justified? 297

a Unity of the law applicable to contracts and the confidence of the parties in the application of only one legal system 298

b Party autonomy is unduly restricted 299

c Uncertainty in law 300

d Move towards Unilateralism 301

e International comity and decisional harmony 303

f The structurally preferable solution 304

g Conclusion 305

Chapter 6:
Proposal for the application of internationally mandatory rules with a view to South African private international law of contracts 307

I Legal situation in South African private international law 307

1 Application of the internationally mandatory rules of the *lex fori* 307

2 Application of (internationally) mandatory rules of the *lex causae* 309

3 Internationally mandatory rules of a third legal system 311

a Public policy of the forum state 311

b Reasonable claim of application 314

c South African cases on this issue 315

4 Conclusion 316
II Proposed Approach 317

1 The common denominator 318
   a Internationally mandatory rules of the forum 318
   b Internationally mandatory rules of the proper law 319
   c Internationally mandatory rules of a third country 320

2 The structurally preferable solution: A special connection of internationally mandatory rules 322
   a Internationally mandatory rules of the lex fori 324
      (1) Special connection of internationally mandatory rules 324
      (2) Identification of internationally mandatory rules 325
   b Internationally mandatory rules of a third country 327
      (1) The structurally preferable solution 328
      (2) A special connection in conformity with conflict of laws 330
      (3) General guidelines for special conflict rules 331
      (4) Subsidiary consideration of the factual effects on the private relationship 335
   c Internationally mandatory rules of the proper law 336

Bibliography 339

Table of cases 357

Abbreviations of Journals and Reports 363