Public Procurement and the EU Competition Rules

Albert Sánchez Graells

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2011
Contents

Foreword by Francisco Marcos v
Table of Cases and Opinions xiii
Table of Legislation xxi

Part I: Introduction 1

1 Introduction and Framework for Analysis 3
I. Introduction 3
II. General Approach to the Interrelationship between Competition and Public Procurement Law 12
III. Aim of the Study 13
IV. Structure of the Study and General Overview 14
V. Methodology: An Eclectic and Heuristic Multi-Disciplinary and Functional Approach to EU Law 18
VI. Normative Assumptions 23
VII. Delimitation of the Study: Exclusions and Limitations 25

Part II: Foundations and Principles. The Economic and Legal Basics of Public Procurement and Competition Law 31

2 An Economic Approach to Public Procurement and Competition 33
I. Introduction 33
II. Types of ‘Public Procurement Markets’ 35
III. Economic Dimensions of Public Procurement 47
IV. The Role of Public Authorities as Purchasing and Contracting Authorities 52
V. Public Procurement as a Market Failure: Difficulties in Recreating a Competitive Scenario and Competition-Restricting Effects 56
VI. Conclusions to this Chapter 72

3 Basics of Competition and Public Procurement Regulation 75
I. Introduction 75
II. Common Principles to Competition and Public Procurement Law as Two Sets of Economic Regulation 76
III. The Goal(s) of Competition Law 83
IV. Goals of Public Procurement 97
V. Conclusions to this Chapter: Common Goals of Competition Law and Public Procurement 110
Conclusions to Part II: Legal and Economic Normative Foundations of a More Competition-Oriented Public Procurement System 111

Part III: General Part—The Building Blocks of a Framework for the Competition Analysis of Public Procurement 113

4 EU Competition Law and Public Procurement—The Inability of EU Competition Rules to Rein in Anti-Competitive Public Procurement 115

I. Introduction 115

II. The Inability of Rules on the Grant of State Aid and Special or Exclusive Rights to Tackle Anti-Competitive Public Procurement 117

III. The Inapplicability of ‘Core’ EU Antitrust Rules to Public Procurement: A Jurisprudentially-Created Gap in EU Competition Law 128

IV. The Insufficiency of State Action Doctrine to Capture Most of the Anti-Competitive Public Procurement Regulations and Practices 136

V. Preliminary Conclusions: The Insufficiency of Current Competition Institutions and Potential Improvements to Achieve Better Results 146

VI. A Revision of Current Doctrine to Achieve Better Results (I): A More Economic Approach to the Concept of ‘Economic Activity’ in the Public Procurement Field 150

VII. A Revision of Current Doctrine to Achieve Better Results (II): Setting the Proper Bounds to the State Action Doctrine 166

VIII. Conclusions to this Chapter 186

5 The Principle of Competition Embedded in the EU Public Procurement Directives 189

I. Introduction 189

II. The Competition Principle Embedded in the EU Public Procurement Directives 190

III. Implications of the Competition Principle for the Shaping of Public Procurement Rules by Member States: The General Obligation to Develop a Pro-Competitive Public Procurement Framework 200

IV. The Principle of Equal Treatment and the Principle of Competition Distinguished 212

V. Conclusions to this Chapter 220

Conclusions to Part III: Sketching a Legal Framework to Discipline the Market Behaviour of the Public Buyer and to Guarantee Undistorted Competition in Public Procurement 221

Part IV: Analysis of Competition Distortions Caused by Public Procurement 225

6 A Critical Assessment of Current EU Public Procurement Directives and their Case Law from a Competition Perspective—Preventing Competitive Distortions by the Public Buyer 227

I. Introduction 227
II. A Competition Appraisal of Potential Distortions Derived from Public Procurement Processes 229

III. Two Examples of Potential Distortions Derived From the Exercise of Public Entities' Market Power 359

IV. Conclusions to this Chapter 364

7 Complementary Proposals for the Development of a More Competition-Oriented Public Procurement Framework 371

I. Introduction 371

II. Complementary Proposals Aimed at Limiting Publicly-Created Restraints of Competition 372

III. Complementary Proposals Aimed at Limiting Privately-Created Restraints of Competition 380

IV. Complementary Measures Aimed, in General, at Strengthening the Relationships between Competition and Procurement Authorities 385

V. Conclusions to this Chapter 389

Part V: General Conclusions 391

8 Conclusions of this Study on Public Procurement and the EU Competition Rules—Towards a More Competition-Oriented Procurement System 393

References 399

Index 455