Feminist Judgments
From Theory to Practice

Edited by
Rosemary Hunter
Clare McGlynn
and
Erika Rackley
CONTENTS

Foreword by Baroness Hale of Richmond v
Acknowledgements vii
Notes on Contributors xiii
Table of Cases xvii
Table of Statutes and Legislation xxvii

Part I Introduction and Overview

1 Feminist Judgments: An Introduction 3
   Rosemary Hunter, Clare McGlynn and Erika Rackley

2 An Account of Feminist Judging 30
   Rosemary Hunter

3 The Art and Craft of Writing Judgments: Notes on the Feminist Judgments Project 44
   Erika Rackley

Part II Parenting

4 Evans v Amicus Healthcare Ltd 59
   Commentary: Sally Sheldon
   Judgment: Sonia Harris-Short 64

5 Re N (A Child) 83
   Commentary: Emily Jackson
   Judgment: Samantha Ashenden 89

6 Re G (Children) (Residence: Same-Sex Partner) 96
   Commentary: Daniel Monk
   Judgment: Alison Diduck 102

7 Re L (A Child) (Contact: Domestic Violence) 114
   Commentary: Christine Piper
   Judgment: Felicity Kaganas 120

8 Re A (Children) (Conjoined Twins: Surgical Separation) 134
   Commentary: Richard Huxtable
   Judgment: Geraldine Hastings 139

Part III Property and Markets

9 Royal Bank of Scotland Plc v Etridge (No 2) 149
   Commentary: Alison Diduck
   Judgment: Rosemary Auchmuty 155
Contents

10 Porter v Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis
    Commentary: Maureen O'Sullivan 170
    Judgment: Anna Grear 174

11 Baird Textile Holdings v Marks & Spencer Plc
    Commentary: John Wightman 184
    Judgment: Linda Mulcahy and Cathy Andrews 189

Part IV Criminal Law and Evidence

12 R v A (No 2)
    Commentary: Louise Ellison 205
    Judgment: Clare McGlynn 211

13 R v Stone and Dobinson
    Commentary: Neil Cobb 228
    Judgment: Lois Bibbings 234

14 R v Brown
    Commentary: Matthew Weait and Rosemary Hunter 241
    Judgment: Robin Mackenzie 247

15 R v Dhaliwal
    Commentary: Mandy Burton 255
    Judgment: Vanessa Munro and Sangeeta Shah 261

16 R v Zoora (Ghulam) Shah
    Commentary: Susan Edwards 273
    Judgment: Samia Bano and Pragna Patel 278

17 Attorney-General for Jersey v Holley
    Commentary: Clare Connelly 292
    Judgment: Susan Edwards 297

Part V Public Law

18 YL v Birmingham City Council and Others
    Commentary: Morag McDermont 311
    Judgment: Helen Carr and Caroline Hunter 318

19 R (Begum) v Governors of Denbigh High School
    Commentary: Holly Cullen 329
    Judgment: Maleiha Malik 336

20 Sheffield City Council v E
    Commentary: Jonathan Herring 346
    Judgment: Nicola Barker and Marie Fox 351

21 R v Portsmouth Hospitals NHS Trust, ex parte Glass
    Commentary: Anne Morris 363
    Judgment: Jo Bridgeman 369
Part VI Equality

22  Roberts v Hopwood
    Commentary: Stephanie Palmer  381
    Judgment: Harriet Samuels 387

23  Mundon v Del Monte Foods Ltd
    Commentary: Gwyneth Pitt 401
    Judgment: Rachel Horton and Grace James 407

24  James v Eastleigh Borough Council
    Commentary: Joanne Conaghan 414
    Judgment: Aileen McColgan 420

25  Wilkinson v Kitzinger
    Commentary: Karon Monaghan 425
    Judgment: Rosie Harding 430

26  EM (Lebanon) v Secretary of State for the Home Department
    Commentary: Judy Walsh 443
    Judgment: Karon Monaghan 449

Index 459