
A MATTER OF DISPUTE

MORALITY, DEMOCRACY, AND LAW

CHRISTOPHER J. PETERS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

Prologue: The Price of Law xiii

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION: A GOVERNMENT OF LAWS 1

1. The Problem of Exceptions 2
 - A. Can the Problem Be Solved with Rules? 4
 - B. The Necessity of Ad Hoc Decisionmaking 5
2. Aristotle's Challenge 7
3. The Plan of the Book 12
4. Theory (Legal, Political, Adjudicative, Constitutional) 15
 - A. Analytic Legal Philosophy and the Problem of Legal Authority 15
 - B. Political Theory and the Problem of Political Legitimacy 18
 - C. Adjudicative Theory and the Problem of Judicial Duty 20
 - D. Constitutional Theory and the Countermajoritarian Difficulty 22
5. Assumptions and Caveats 24
 - A. The First Assumption: The Subject-Specific Perspective 24
 - B. The Second Assumption: Persons as Good-Faith Moral Reasoners 27
 - C. The Third Assumption: The Irrelevance of Formal Sanctions 29
 - D. The First Caveat: An Account, Not a Comprehensive Theory 30
 - E. The Second Caveat: Sufficient, Not Necessary 31
 - F. The Third Caveat: The Persistent Possibility of Morally Justified Disobedience 32

CHAPTER 2. THE PROBLEM OF LAW'S AUTHORITY 33

1. The Normative Strength of Legal Authority 33
2. The Conceptual Nature of Legal Authority 37
3. Aristotle's Challenge Revisited 38

4.	The Epistemic-Guidance Account	39
	A. Epistemic Guidance, Substance, and Authority	41
	B. The <i>Prima Facie</i> Duty Revisited	44
	C. The Problem of Disagreement	47
5.	The Consensualist Account	49
	A. Legal Authority and Actual Consent	49
	B. Legal Authority and Constructive Consent	52
6.	The Dispute-Resolution Account	57
7.	Continuity, Coordination, and Legal Authority	61
8.	The Task Ahead	66
CHAPTER 3. A SIMPLE MODEL OF DISPUTE RESOLUTION		69
1.	Acceptable Dispute Resolution	70
2.	Dispute Resolution and Accuracy	71
3.	Accuracy and Competence	75
4.	Accuracy and Impartiality	78
5.	Accuracy and Efficiency	81
6.	Third-Party Adjudication, Participation, and Fairness	83
7.	Dispute Resolution and Consent	86
8.	Consent and Procedural Accuracy	88
9.	Dispute Resolution, Procedural Accuracy, and Constructive Consent	90
10.	Beyond the Bipartite Dispute	97
11.	Coordination and Constructive Consent	99
12.	The Encroachment Flaw Redux?	101
13.	Building from the Basic Model	104
CHAPTER 4. DISPUTES, LEGAL RULES, AND DEMOCRACY		107
1.	Madison's Insight	107
2.	Legislation as Dispute Resolution	109
	A. Legal Rules as <i>Ex Post</i> Dispute Resolution	109
	B. Legal Rules as <i>Ex Ante</i> Dispute Resolution	110

3. The Authority of Legal Rules 115
4. Acceptable Legislation 119
5. What Is “Democracy”? 122
6. Democracy as a Reasonably Accurate Procedure 123
 - A. Democracy and Impartiality 124
 - B. Democracy and Competence 128
7. Democracy as a Negative Ideal 134
 - A. Democracy as Reactive 135
 - B. Democracy as Imperfect 136
 - C. Expecting Too Much of Democracy 138
8. Democracy as Law 139

CHAPTER 5. DEMOCRATIC ADJUDICATION 141

1. The Indeterminacy of Text 142
2. The Indeterminacy of Legislative Intent 146
3. Formalism as a Default Principle 151
4. The Possibility of Democratic Adjudication 154
5. Participation and Representation in Adjudication 155
 - A. Adversary Adjudication 156
 - B. Common-Law Representation 160
 - C. Adjudication and Indeterminacy Redux 168
6. Text, Justification, and Derivative Democratic Authority 169
 - A. Primary and Derivative Authority 170
 - B. Legal Positivism as a Theory about Rules 173
 - C. Linguistic Intention and Justification 174
 - D. A Note on the Common Law 181
7. Courts, Litigants, and the Law 186

CHAPTER 6. THE FORMS AND LIMITS OF DEMOCRATIC ADJUDICATION 189

1. Judicial Pragmatism 190
2. Managerial Judging 195
 - A. Encouraging Settlement 196
 - B. Overseeing Discovery 201
 - C. Assessing the Merits before Trial 202

3. Public-Law Litigation (and Judicial Independence) 204
4. Judicial Minimalism 209
5. From Democratic Adjudication to Constitutionalism 213

CHAPTER 7. LAW VS. DEMOCRACY? 215

1. The Countermajoritarian Difficulty 215
2. Strategies for Resolving the Difficulty 216
 - A. The Substantive Strategy 216
 - B. The Proceduralist Strategy 221
 - C. Dualist Strategies 226
 - D. The Reductionist Strategy 237
3. Waldron's Challenge 240
4. Constituting Democracy 243
5. Resolving Disputes about Democracy 246
 - A. The Possibility of Democratic Dysfunction 247
 - B. The Inevitability of Democratic Disputes 248
 - C. The Partiality of Democratic Self-Judging 249
 - D. The Promise of Constitutional Dispute Resolution 251
 - E. The Advantages of Constitutional Rules 252
6. Democratic Malfunctions (and Constitutional Responses) 255
 - A. Agency Failure 256
 - B. Majority (and Well-Organized Minority) Factions 258
7. Whither "Substantive" Constitutional Rights? (The *Roe v. Wade* Problem) 267
8. From Law to Process 272

CHAPTER 8. CONSTITUTIONAL PROCESS 273

1. Externality and Impartiality 274
 - A. "The Dead Hand of the Past" 274
 - B. The Text 281
 - C. Judicial Review 282
2. Responsiveness and Competence 286
 - A. The Framing(s) 286

- B. The Political Dynamics of American
Constitutional Law 294
- C. Participatory Constitutional Adjudication 310
- 3. Interpretive Methodology 328
 - A. The False Promise of Formalism 329
 - B. The Allure of Pragmatism 335
 - C. An Interpretivist Alternative 338
 - D. Constitutional Precedent 341
- 4. The Countermajoritarian Difficulty: The Classic
Strategies Revisited 346

Epilogue: The Limits of Law 349

Index 353