COLLECTIVE ACTION AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS IN EUROPE

Striking the Balance

Edited by
Edoardo Ales
Tonia Novitz

Contributors
Edoardo Ales
Antonio Baylos
Olaf Deinert
Filip Dorssemont
Lorenzo Gaeta
Teun Jaspers
Sylvaine Laulom
Tonia Novitz
Giovanni Orlandini
Aukje A.H. van Hoek

intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
CONTENTS

List of contributors ............................................................... xi

1. Preface .............................................................................. 1

2. National chapters ............................................................... 5

2.1. Collective action in Belgium. Looking for the right to strike
Filip Dorssemont ................................................................. 7

I. Collective action: what are we talking about? ................. 7
II. Collective action: juridical status ..................................... 9
   A. Sources of definition and regulation of collective action .... 9
   B. Entitlement .................................................................. 13
   C. Consequences for those organising or participating in a collective action .............................................. 15
III. Limitation of collective action with reference to its aims and content ................................................... 18
IV. Ex ante or ex post judiciary/administrative control .......... 19
V. Procedural requirements/preconditions for legality .......... 23
VI. Balancing collective action with other rights and freedoms (national level) .................................................. 23
VII. (Potential) impact of ECJ case law (on fundamental freedoms) on the national regulation concerning collective action ............................................................ 26
Conclusion ............................................................................. 27
Bibliography ........................................................................ 29

2.2. Collective action in France. Towards a restriction of the right to strike?
Sylvaine Laulom ................................................................. 31

I. Collective action: what are we talking about? ................. 31
II. Collective action: juridical status ..................................... 33
2.4. Collective action in Italy. Conceptualising the right to strike

EDOARDO ALES, LORENZO GAETA and GIOVANNI ORLANDINI........... 77

I. Collective action: what are we talking about? ...................... 77
   A. Historical background ........................................ 77
   B. Concept of collective action ................................... 79

II. Collective action: juridical status ............................... 82
   A. Sources of definition and regulation of collective action ...... 82
   B. (Legal) definition of the main features of collective action ... 83
   C. Entitlement .................................................. 83
   D. Consequences for those organising or participating in a collective
      action ....................................................... 85

III. Limitation of collective action with reference to its aims and content... 87

IV. Ex ante or ex post judiciary/administrative control .................. 89

V. Procedural requirements/preconditions for legality ............... 90

VI. Balancing collective action with other rights and freedoms
    (national level) .............................................. 90
   A. Preliminary remarks .......................................... 90
   B. The right to strike, abstention of law and strike in essential services
      ......................................................... 91
   C. The end of the abstention of law: Act n. 146 of 1990 ............ 94
   D. A change of perspective: conflict in essential services in the light
      of Act 83 of 2000 ........................................... 97

VII. (Potential) impact of ECJ case law (on fundamental freedoms) on
     the national regulation concerning collective action ............... 98
   A. Economic freedoms as constraints on industrial disputes ....... 98
   B. The principle of last resort and the purpose of the strike ......... 100
   C. Freedom to provide services and collective agreements .......... 101
   D. Compensation claims of undertakings damaged by an unlawful
      strike ...................................................... 103

Bibliography ...................................................... 105

2.5. Collective action in Spain

ANTONIO BAYLOS ............................................. 109

I. Collective action: juridical status ............................... 109
   A. Legal entitlement and exercise of the right to strike:
      strike action as a procedure ................................ 112
   B. Publicity of the strike, picketing and information ............. 114

II. Limitation of 'collective action': aims and content .............. 115
   A. External restrictions on the right to strike and the constitutional
      filter ...................................................... 116
B. Internal restrictions; the so-called 'predatory strikes': the presumption of abuse of rights (reference to case law, the Viking and Laval cases) ......................................................... 117

III. Consequences of exercising the right to strike: lawful and unlawful strikes ................................................................. 120
   A. Effects of strike action .......................................................... 120
   B. In particular, limiting the powers of the employer during the regular exercise of the right to strike .......................... 122
   C. Effects of an unlawful strike .................................................. 123

IV. Balancing collective action with other rights and freedoms: strikes affecting 'essential services' ........................................ 124
   A. Defining the concept of “essential service” ............................ 125
   B. Formal and material guarantees surrounding the act of imposing a minimum service ............................................. 127
   C. Jurisdictional control and excess authority in the establishment of minimum services ............................................. 131

Bibliography ............................................................................. 133

2.6. Collective Action in The Netherlands

   TEUN JASPERS ................................................................. 135

I. Collective action: what are we talking about? ....................... 135
   A. Some figures ................................................................. 135
   B. The concept of collective action ...................................... 137

II. Collective action: juridical status .......................................... 139
   A. Sources of definition and regulation of collective action .... 140
   B. Legal definition of the main features of collective action .. 142
   C. Entitlement .................................................................... 145
   D. Consequences for those organising or participating in a collective action .................................................... 146

III. Limitation of collective action with reference to its aims and content ................................................................. 147
   A. Conventional peace clause ............................................. 148
   B. Conflict of rights ......................................................... 149
   C. The objective of the actions ........................................... 150

IV. Ex ante or ex post judiciary/administrative control ................ 160
   A. Ex ante: Conciliation and arbitration ................................ 160
   B. Ex post assessment: by court decision ............................ 163

V. Procedural requirements/preconditions for legality .............. 164

VI. Balancing collective action with other rights and freedoms (national level) ......................................................... 165

VII. (Potential) impact of ECJ case law (on fundamental freedoms) on the national regulation concerning collective action 168

Bibliography ............................................................................. 170
2.7. Collective action in the United Kingdom
TONIA NOVITZ ......................................................................................... 173

I. Collective action: what are we talking about? .................................. 173

II. Collective action: juridical status ................................................. 174
  A. Sources of definition and regulation of collective action ............ 175
  B. Legal definition of the main features of collective action. ........... 180
  C. Entitlement .................................................................................... 180
  D. Consequences of collective action on organisers/participants’ employment relationship ........................................... 182

III. Limitation of collective action referred to its aims and contents .... 187

IV. Ex ante or ex post administrative/judicial control ......................... 191

V. Procedural requirements/preconditions for legality. ..................... 194

VI. Balancing collective action with other rights and freedoms which fall outside the employment relationship (at national level). ......... 199

VII. The present and potential impact of ECJ case law (on fundamental freedoms) on national regulation concerning collective action. 200

Bibliography ......................................................................................... 210

3. Collective action in labour conflicts under the Rome II Regulation
FILIP DORSSEMONT and AUKE A.H. VAN HOEK ................................. 213

I. Conceptual framework .................................................................. 214
  A. Article 9 of Rome II: background and standard of evaluation ... 214
  B. Introducing the debate – Tor Caledonia ..................................... 217
  C. The debate during the Travaux préparatoires ......................... 220
  D. Cross-border industrial action in employment law and the private international law perspective .................................. 222

II. The difficult issue of classification: the scope of Article 9 of Rome II .... 227
  A. The concept “industrial action” ................................................... 227
  B. The non-contractual obligation ............................................... 232
  C. The scope regarding the ratione personae ............................... 234
  D. Main issues and preliminary issues ......................................... 235
  E. The right to strike as a “civil and commercial matter” ............. 237

III. The conflict of law rules ............................................................... 238
  A. The conflict of law rule, locus actus and alternatives ............... 238

Bibliography ......................................................................................... 240
4. The law and the courts. Regulating strike in seven European countries

   EDOARDO ALES ................................................................. 243

I. Collective action: what are we talking about? ......................... 243
II. Strike as a constitutional right ........................................... 243
III. Strike as a right .............................................................. 245
IV. Strike as a freedom ........................................................ 248
V. Some comparative remarks. .............................................. 248

5. The impact of Viking and Laval. Contesting the social function and legal regulation of the right to strike

   TONIA NOVITZ ................................................................. 251

I. Introduction ................................................................. 251
II. The judgments in Viking and Laval ...................................... 253
III. The assumptions underlying the ECJ jurisprudence ................ 256
IV. Running counter to ECJ assumptions: the evidence from the country reports .............................................. 258
V. An analysis of the challenge posed .................................... 269

Bibliography ................................................................. 272