THE RECAST OF THE EUROPEAN WORKS COUNCIL DIRECTIVE

Edited by
Filip DORSSEMENT
Thomas BLANKE

intersentia
Antwerp – Oxford – Portland
CONTENTS

Preface ................................................................. vii
About the contributors ............................................. xxv

A. BACKGROUND AND LOOPHOLES OF THE EWC
DIRECTIVE 94/45

1. The fundamental right of workers to information and consultation
under the European Social Charter

Csilla Kollonay Lehoczky ........................................... 3

Introduction .......................................................... 3
I. Precedence and sequence of emerging involvement rights in Europe .... 6
   1. The alleged precursor: Article 6 paragraph 1 .......................... 6
   2. The sequence of emerging involvement rights in Europe ............ 8
II. Common features of Articles 21 and 22 ............................... 10
   1. Legal framework .................................................. 10
   2. Personal scope ................................................... 11
      2.1. Employers obliged to involve workers in issues of
           management ..................................................... 11
      2.1.1. Restriction of the obligation to 'undertakings' .......... 11
      2.1.2. Exempting religious communities and spiritual/
               ideological undertakings ................................. 14
      2.1.3. Exempting small employers ................................ 14
      2.2. The concept of workers' representatives ....................... 16
      2.3. The 'great majority' rule .................................. 18
III. The different attributes of Articles 21 and 22 ................. 20
    1. Material scope, rules and procedures under Article 21 ......... 20
    2. Material scope, rules and procedures of Article 22 ............. 23
IV. Article 29: scope, content, rules and procedures ............ 26
V. Sanctions .......................................................... 28

2. Worker involvement in secondary EC law prior to the Recast
Directive

Filip Dorssemont .................................................... 31

Introduction .......................................................... 31
Contents

I. A conceptual study .................................................. 34
   1. Worker involvement ........................................... 37
   2. Information .................................................... 38
   3. The right to consultation ..................................... 39
   4. The right to participation .................................... 46
   5. The representation and the collective defence of the interests
      of workers ..................................................... 48

II. Basic principles of the Community right to worker involvement ... 50

III. The substantive scope of application of the directives in retrospect ... 54

IV. The spirit of cooperation: re-negotiatonal, pre-contractual and
    post-contractual ................................................ 55

V. Horizontal subsidiarity ........................................... 58

VI. To whom does this right to information and consultation belong? ... 62

VII. Limitations of the fundamental right to information and consultation ... 66
   1. Limitations ratione personae in Treaty articles and human rights
      instruments ................................................... 67
   2. The limitation ratione personae in the worker involvement
      directives ...................................................... 68
      2.1. Undertakings, public and/or private sector ............... 68
      2.2. Thresholds and levels .................................. 71
      2.3. Tendenzschutz .......................................... 74
      2.4. Seagoing vessels ........................................ 77
   3. Reservation and confidentiality ................................ 78
   4. Bankruptcy and analogous insolvency proceedings ............. 83

VIII. Sanctions .......................................................... 84

IX. Conclusion: On articulation and codification ....................... 87
   1. The issue of definitions ...................................... 87
   2. Articulation .................................................. 88
      2.1. Collective Redundancies Directive, Transfer of
      2.2. EWC Directive and the transfer of undertakings: Effects of
           structural change ......................................... 88
      2.3. SE Directive and EWC Directive ........................ 89

3. The first test of the Maastricht Social Protocol: European works
   councils
      JON ERIK DØLVIK ............................................ 91

I. Background .......................................................... 91
II. The talks about talks ............................................. 95
III. Organizational and analytical lessons ................................ 99

References .................................................................. 103
4. The EWC in domestic and ECJ case law .................................................. 105

I. European works councils related litigation – Rationale for a systematic analysis

ROMUALD JAGODZIŃSKI ................................................................. 107

Summary ................................................................. 107
1. Existing legal studies on EWCs ........................................... 107
2. Background of the research project on EWC-related case law ....... 109
3. Research approach .......................................................... 110
4. Conclusion ................................................................. 112
References ........................................................................... 113

II. National reports ............................................................ 115

Austria

DOMENICO RIEF ................................................................. 115

Procedural part ................................................................. 115
1. List of the judgments .................................................... 115
   a. Austrian judgments: Kühne & Nagel AG & Co KG (Germany) v
      Kühne & Nagel GmbH (Austria) ........................................... 115
   b. Parties ........................................................................ 115
   c. Stage of the procedure .................................................. 116
2. Procedure to take legal action ........................................ 116
   a. Standing .................................................................... 116
   b. Financial costs of the legal procedure .......................... 118
3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and Article 13 Agreements ... 120

Substantial part ................................................................. 120
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather
   clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13
   agreements ................................................................. 120
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives')
   of the Community-scale dimension of transnational establishments
   and of enterprises .......................................................... 120
   a. Decision of the Court of first instance ........................... 121
   b. Decision by the Court of Appeals ................................... 123
   c. Decision by the Supreme Court ..................................... 123
   d. Comment .................................................................. 125
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a
   European works council ................................................ 126
4. Legal issues of Article 6 Agreements .................................. 126
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC ................................. 126
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. External restrictions to information and consultation</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Subsidiary requirements</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Other issues</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filip Dorssemont</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Procedural part ........................................................................ 127
1. List of all the cases .................................................. 127
2. Procedure to take legal action ........................................... 128
3. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and Article 13 agreements .... 130
4. Judicial and territorial competence .................................. 130

Substantial part ...................................................................... 130
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements ........................................... 130
   a. Facts .................................................................. 131
   b. Ruling ................................................................ 132
   c. Anticipatory agreements and representativity ............. 132
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings .............................................. 136
3. “The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European Works Council” ......................................................... 136
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements .................................. 136
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC .................................. 136
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ........................................................................ 136
   a. Facts .................................................................. 136
   b. Ruling ................................................................ 137
   c. Assessment ..................................................... 138
   d. Sanctions in case of violation of the information and consultation procedure ......................................................... 138
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation .............................................. 138
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ................. 138
9. Subsidiary requirements ........................................................................ 138
10. Other issues ........................................................................ 139
France

RACHID BRIHI

Introduction ........................................................................................................ 141
Procedural part ................................................................................................. 141
1. List of all cases ............................................................................................. 141
2. Standing of the EWC: the issue of legal personality ....................................... 142
3. Procedure to take legal action ...................................................................... 143
Substantial part ................................................................................................ 144
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 Agreements ....................................................................................................... 144
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings ................................................................. 144
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council ................................................................. 144
4. Legal issues of Article 6 Agreements ................................................................ 144
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC .......................................................... 144
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ............ 144
   a. On the EWC's right to information .......................................................... 144
   b. On the EWC's right to consultation ......................................................... 146
   c. What sanctions should there be for the rights of the EWC? .................. 152
7. On the links between the EWC and the national bodies for the representation of workers ................................................................. 154
8. External restrictions to information and consultation ................................... 156
9. Subsidiary requirements ............................................................................... 156
10. Other issues: towards the affirmation of a true transnational stakeholder? ......................... 156

Germany

THOMAS BLANKE .................................................................................. 159

List of abbreviations ....................................................................................... 159
1. Case studies .................................................................................................. 159
   1.1. Schneider Electric: Review of the appointment of national employees' representatives to the EWC – national jurisdiction ........................................................................................................... 159
   1.2. Forbo: The European works council does not supersede national participation rights ................................................................................................................................. 162
   1.3. Valora/Stielke: Priority of the request to set up a Special Negotiating Body pursuant to §9 EBRG over a judicial declaration of the invalidity of an agreement in accordance with §41 EBRG (= Article 13 Directive) ......................................................... 164
1.4. British Airways: Injunctive relief for the European Works Council in the case of a failure to consult in temporary injunction proceedings and inadmissibility of the cautioning of a EWC chairperson because she visited a works council abroad (Vienna) in connection with outsourcing measures 166


2. Judgment of the Labour Court of Düsseldorf (19.3.2008): Inadmissibility of the cautioning of the EWC chair on account of a visit to a works council abroad (Austria) with regard to an outsourcing matter 168

1.5. Junk/Kühnel: Timeliness of the consultation procedure 170

1.6. Jungheinrich: Free choice of venue for the EWC committee and the scope of the information obligation – no decision on the merits 172

1.7-8-9 Bo-frost, Kühne & Nagel, ADS Anker: The right to information in accordance with Article 11, subsection 2 EWC Directive ($§5, subsection 1 and 2 EBRG) 173

1.7. Bo-frost: Claim for information by the EWC for the purpose of clarifying the scope of application of the EBRG 175

1. History of the proceedings and central legal issues 175

2. The reception of the ECJ decision in the German literature 178

3. The decision of the first division of the Federal Labour Court of 30.3.2004: The right to information presupposes a certain real probability if the directive is to be applicable 179

4. The internal right to information between undertakings 180

1.8. Kühne & Nagel: Horizontal request for information by the deemed central management against all group undertakings 181

1. Facts of the case: Judicial proceedings in connection with preparing an application 181

2. Judicial proceedings to assert the right to information 183

3. Enforcement of adjudicated claims 185

4. The central works council’s own efforts 186

5. Alternative courses of action and evaluation: Self-constitution of a EWC? 186

1.9. ADS Anker: ‘Horizontal’ right to information also against a foreign parent company 188

1.10. General summary of cases VII–IX: Need for further proceedings 189

1.11. Crawford Tar: No information 191
2. European works councils – A foreign body in German law? 191

The Netherlands

Robbert van het Kaar 193

I. Procedural part 193
1. List of cases 193
2. Legal standing 193
3. Costs 193
4. Role of trade unions 194
5. Interpretation of judges 194
6. Forum 194

II. Substantial part 194
1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive): case law related to Article 13 agreements 194
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers (‘representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertakings or groups of undertakings 194
3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European works council 194
4. Legal issues of Article 6 agreements 197
5. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC 197
6. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure 197
7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation 197
8. External restrictions to information and consultation 197
9. Subsidiary requirements 197
10. Other issues 197

References 198

Slovak Republic

Maria Svorenova 199

Procedural part 199
1. List of all the cases 199
2. Procedure to take legal action 200
3. Financial costs of legal proceedings 200
4. The role of trade unions 201
5. Judicial interpretation of Article 6 and 13 Agreements 201
6. Judicial and territorial competence 201
2. The reported case law: litigation in four stages ........................................... 226
   a. Legal disputes prior to the start of negotiations ................................. 227
   b. Legal disputes which arise at the start or during the negotiations .. 228
   c. Legal disputes at the start and in the course of a statutory or
      conventional EWC ........................................................................... 229
   d. Legal disputes subsequent to the expiry or the termination of the
      agreements ....................................................................................... 233
3. The standing of the European Works Council ............................................. 233
4. The domestic Courts and the issue of interpretation ................................... 235
5. Private International Law Issues: the issue of competence and
   standing ............................................................................................... 238
Substantial issues ......................................................................................... 241
1. The exemption from the “obligations arising from the EWC
   Directive”: the validity of existing agreements challenged ...................... 241
2. Legal issues related to the assessment of the Community-scale
   dimension of transnational establishments and of enterprises .............. 243
3. The designation of national workers’ representatives ............................... 248
4. Issues related to the internal Functioning of the SNB and the EWC
   in view of the new Recast Directive ...................................................... 250
5. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure ... 253
   a. The competence of the EWC regarding transnational matters ......... 253
   b. The right to information and consultation within the Recast
      Directive ............................................................................................. 256
   c. Quality of the information and consultation procedure .................. 260
   d. Time is of the essence ........................................................................ 261
   e. Sanctions in the case of violation of the information and
      consultation procedure ...................................................................... 261
6. Issues related to the termination of an Article 6 agreement ....................... 262
7. External restrictions to information and consultation ............................... 263
8. Articulation or concordantia with other EC instruments related to
   worker involvement ............................................................................... 264
Conclusions ................................................................................................. 268

IV. Format for the national reports related to EWC case law
   FILIP DORSSEMONT .............................................................................. 271

Procedural part ............................................................................................. 271
Substantial part ............................................................................................ 272
Third part: Collected materials .................................................................... 272
   Thematic analysis structure (cf. second part) ........................................... 273
   1. The exemption from the EWC Directive based on the
      grandfather clause (Article 13 EWC Directive) ................................. 273
2. Legal issues related to the assessment by workers ('representatives) of the Community-scale dimension of transnational undertaking and groups of undertakings

3. The responsibility of central management for the establishment of a European Works Council

4. Functioning of the SNB and the EWC

5. Legal issues related to the information and consultation procedure
   a. Content and space
   b. Time is of the essence
   c. Quality of the information and consultation procedure
   d. Sanctions in case of violation of the information and consultation procedure

7. Relation between EWCs and national works councils or national bodies of employee representation

8. External restrictions to information and consultation

9. Subsidiary requirements

10. Other issues

B. THE RECAST OF THE EWC DIRECTIVE (2009/38)

   SÉVERINE PICARD

I. The recasting technique: the EU legislator in a straightjacket
   1. Recast vs revision – definitions and procedural consequences
   2. Political consequences of the recast – a limited agenda for reform

II. ‘Back to the future’ – the scope ratione temporis of the Recast Directive
   1. No obligation to renegotiate existing agreements
   2. A tailored application of the new rules to existing agreements

III. Towards a unification of the applicable regime to all company agreements? The key role of the adaptation clause

2. Review, revision or recast? The quest for an amended EWC Directive
   ROMUALD JAGODZIŃSKI

Introduction
I. The prelude to the EWC Directive of 1994
II. The first missed deadline for revision
III. Position of the European Trade Union Confederation
IV. The employers’ organisations
V. 2008: The final phase in the quest for a EWC revision
VI. The ETUC's reviewed position......................................................... 298
VII. The European Commission's proposal for a revised EWC Directive ... 299
VIII. Review, revision or recast? ........................................................... 300
IX. Reactions of the social partners...................................................... 301
X. The new EWC Directive ................................................................. 303
XI. Conclusion ....................................................................................... 308
References ............................................................................................ 309

3. Information and consultation in the Recast Directive
   CORINNE SACHS-DURAND ................................................................. 313

Introduction ............................................................................................ 313
I. Comparison between different concepts of information-consultation . 315
   1. The notion of information and consultation .................................... 315
      1.1. Effectiveness of information and consultation ......................... 315
            a. Effectiveness for the workers ........................................... 315
            b. Effectiveness for the employers ....................................... 315
      1.2. The definitions ...................................................................... 316
            a. The information ............................................................ 316
            b. The consultation ............................................................ 317
            c. The relation with contractual autonomy ............................ 318
            d. Information and consultation in the subsidiary
               requirements ..................................................................... 318
   2. Anticipation and action .................................................................. 319
II. Will the new concept of information and consultation be effective? ... 321
   1. The agreements: a possible evolution? .......................................... 321
   2. The case law: some tracks for the interpretation of the recast
      directive? .................................................................................... 323
      2.1. The autonomy of the EWC concerning the content of the
           information ............................................................................ 323
      2.2. The necessary quality of the information .............................. 324
      2.3. The respect of a time schedule allowing the workers' 
           representatives to play their role ........................................... 324
      2.4. The powers of the judge (in France) to modify the process, 
           if necessary ........................................................................... 325

4. Who is first? The correct timing of information and consultation
   of European works councils in relation to national rights of worker
   involvement
   THOMAS BLANKE and EDGAR ROSE ............................................... 327

I. The relevance of correct timing of information and consultation ...... 327
II. The correct time for information and consultation of the EWC ...... 329
2. More consensus-oriented approaches may prevail ............... 415
IV. Conclusions ..................................................... 416
References ................................................................. 417