Moral Rights

Principles, Practice and New Technology

Mira T. Sundara Rajan
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOREWORD</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREFACE</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 1: Introduction: Moral Rights in the Virtual Age</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Moral Rights: Theory and Purpose</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Doctrine of Moral Rights</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The Author</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The Work</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. A Special Relationship</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Legal Implications</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The Protection of &quot;Moral&quot; Interests</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Attribution and Integrity</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. International Protection</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Characteristics of Moral Rights</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Independence of Moral and Economic Rights</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. Perpetual Protection</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. Inalienability and the Possibility of Waiving Moral Rights</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Practical Implications</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Economic Consequences of Moral Rights</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Public Policy: The Dissemination of Knowledge</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Moral Rights in the Digital Context</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Conceptual Challenges</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Authorship: Human or Machine?</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The Disintegration of the Work</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Fame: A Relic of the Past?</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Enforcement Difficulties</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Scope and Structure of this Study</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 2: Moral Rights: History of an Idea</strong></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Principles of Interpretation: Legal Virtuosity and Its Limits</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Origins of the Doctrine</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C. Moral Rights at Home: France 51
   1. An Unresolved Past: Moral Rights and Revolutionary Ideals 53
   2. The Modern Doctrine: A Controversial Model Law 59
      a. The Pre-Eminence of Moral Rights 60
      b. Les droits moraux: The Rights Defined 64
         i. Disclosure 65
         ii. Withdrawal 66
         iii. Integrity vs. Reputation: Proof 66
         iv. Criticism 67
      c. Le dualisme: The Theory of Protection and Its Practical Effects 67
         i. Inalienability and the Prohibition of Waivers 68
         ii. Permanent Protection 69
      d. Technological Features 69
         i. Audiovisual Works 70
         ii. Computer Programs 71
         iii. Moral Rights Reforms 71
         iv. Defenses to a Moral Rights Claim: Parody and Pastiche 72
      e. Conclusions 73

D. German Moral Rights: Romance of a Theory 75
   1. The Birth of Monism 76
   2. Monism in Practice 77
   3. The Modern Moral Rights: Germany and Austria 82
   4. Historical and Cultural Context: The Nazi Past and the Significance of Reputation 85
   5. Conclusion 88

E. Great Britain: Second Thoughts—The Reasons Behind an Early Rejection of Moral Rights 88
   1. Early History and the Statute of Anne, 1710 92
      a. Early Recognition of a Moral Copyright: Millar v. Taylor (1769) 94
      c. Modern Approach 100
         i. Moral Rights in the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 104
         ii. Practical Difficulties 105
         iii. Inalienability and Waiver 106
         iv. Conceptual Confusion 107
   F. Conclusion 110

CHAPTER 3: A Theory in Flux: The Evolution in Progress of Moral Rights 115

A. Spread of the Doctrine: Moral Rights and the Common Law 119
1. Canada: A Country in Transition
   a. A Common Law Pioneer 123
   b. Innovation and Convention: Attribution, Integrity, and Association 127
   c. Opportunities and Limitations: The Visual Arts 128
   d. Inalienability and the Canadian Penchant to Waive 129
   e. A Drought in the Courts 130
   f. Theoretical Confusion and Its Practical Effects: Monism vs. Dualism 130
   g. Canadian Copyright Reform: Moral Rights for Performers and an Opportunity Missed? 134
   h. Conclusions 136

2. The United States: A Difficult Future?
   a. Moral Rights and the Berne Convention: Chronic Dissatisfaction 139
      i. From Shostakovich to Dastar: The Moral Rights Landscape in the United States 142
         (a) Shostakovich: The Integrity of the Public Domain 142
         (b) Dastar: Limits on Alternate Legal Mechanisms for Moral Rights 144
      ii. Better to be Foreign: National Treatment as a Way Out? 148
   b. Conclusions 150

3. Australia and a Moral Right in Indigenous Culture

B. Growth of the Doctrine: Moral Rights and Developing Jurisdictions
   1. India and Other British Colonies: Common Law, or Not? 163
   2. Moral Rights and the Protection of Culture: Indian Copyright Law 164
      a. History of the Indian Right of Integrity 167
      b. Independence from Economic Rights 168
      c. Term of Protection and Inheritance of Moral Rights 169
      d. Remedies 172
      e. Judicial Chivalry: The Practical Dynamics of India’s Moral Rights 172
      f. Amar Nath Sehgal: Duties of the Government 174
         i. Interim Ruling: 1992 175
            (a) Right to Prevent Destruction 175
            (b) Duty of Care of the Government 176
            (c) Amendments to the Copyright Act 176
         ii. Final Ruling: 2005 178
   g. Proposed Amendments: The Copyright Bill of 2010 179
   3. Conclusion 180

C. Moral Rights and “Honor” in a New Technological Society: Japan 181
### D. Moral Rights and Creative Freedom: Post-Socialist Countries and the Example of Russia

1. Russia's Place in the Post-Socialist World

   - a. Publication and Use
   - b. Authorship and Name
   - c. Integrity as Inviolability
   - d. Inalienability and Inheritance
   - e. Duration
   - f. Performers

3. International Influence: The Copyright Act of 1993
   - a. Dualism
   - b. Duration of Protection: Perpetual Moral Rights and the Question of Inheritance
   - c. Moral Rights in the Public Domain: *Domaine public payant*
   - d. Reputation vs. Integrity
   - e. Performers' Moral Rights
   - f. *Droit de suite* for the Visual Arts
   - g. Disclosure in the Post-Socialist Context

4. Programmers' Moral Rights: The Law on Computer Programs and Databases and the Recognition of Scientists

5. Return to the Future: The 2008 Civil Code Provisions on Copyright
   - b. General Principles
   - c. Copyright
     - i. Moral Rights Defined
     - ii. Special Features
     - iii. Moral Rights vs. Exclusive Rights
     - iv. Moral Rights and Technology
     - v. Fair Use and Parody
     - vi. Visual Art
   - d. Neighboring Rights
   - e. Patents

6. Continuing Improvements to Moral Rights in Russia

7. A New Moral Right in Russian Law: The Renewal of Copyright Terms for Rehabilitated Authors

8. Conclusion

### E. Conclusion: The Modern Doctrine

---

### CHAPTER 4: Moral Rights in the International Copyright Regime

A. The International Copyright Regime: An Overview
B. First Principles: International Copyright in Practice 233
   1. Minimum Standards 233
   2. National Treatment 235
      a. Practical Implications 235
      b. Choice of Law 237
      c. Most-Favored-Nation 238
C. The Global Status of Moral Rights 239
   1. The Berne Convention: An Uneasy Compromise 239
      a. The Age of Authorship: The Original Text of 1928 239
         i. Literary Language 242
         ii. Legal Language 243
      b. The Era of Trade: Moral Rights in a Commercial Age 244
      c. The Technological Era: Moral Rights and the Unknown 247
   2. The TRIPs Agreement: Reality or Illusion? 250
   3. Moral Rights in the Digital Age: The WIPO Treaties 258
      a. The WCT: A Digital Right of Disclosure 259
      b. The WPPT: Dissemination is the New Creation 263
   4. The European Union: Unfulfilled Promise 272
   5. Bilateral Agreements: A Deceptive Way Forward 277
D. Conclusion 279

CHAPTER 5: The Programmer as Author: Moral Rights in Information Technology 283
A. Computer Software 284
   1. Legal Position: A New Kind of "Literary Work" 287
   4. Programmers: A Special Case? 297
   5. The Software Industry: Practical Fallout? 302
   6. Infringement of Moral Rights in Software 303
   7. Should Waivers of Moral Rights be Allowed? 307
   8. Conclusions 308
B. Technology Meets Art: Moral Rights and New Artistic Creation 309
   2. New Kinds of Works: Appropriation Art 312
   3. The Problems of Authorship 314
      a. Programmer as Author 314
      b. Performer as Author 315
      c. Audience as Author 315
C. Recommendations 316
D. Conclusion 318

A. Creation or Production? Moral Rights and New Musical Techniques 327
   1. Sampling 328
   2. Mixing 330
   3. Production 332
   4. Electronic Music 337

B. Communication 338
   1. File-sharing: Moral Rights in the Grip of Illegality 340
   2. Downloading: Moral Rights as a Corporate Obligation 345
   3. Global Licensing: Moral Rights and Overgeneralizations 349

C. Mobile Technology: Music in a New Form 353
   1. Moral Rights and Media Neutrality 353
   2. Moral Rights in Mobile Ringtones 356
      a. Integrity of a Ringtone: Germany Leads the Way 357
         i. Excerpts 357
         ii. Modifications 358
      c. Attribution 361

D. Performers: The New Authors 362
   2. Recording and Broadcasting 367

E. Recommendations 371

F. Conclusion: The Public Interest in Music 373

CHAPTER 7: Twenty-First Century Classics: Film and the Complexities of the Collaborative Work 375

A. Commerce Meets Creation: Authorship of a Film 380
B. The Film as a Derivative Work: An Argument Against Moral Rights? 394
C. Practical Challenges: Film Litigation in India and France 397
   1. India: Moral Rights in a Culture of Adaptation 403
      a. Producer vs. Author: Mannu Bhandari 403
         i. Moral Rights and Film Contracts 407
         ii. “Certain Modifications” 408
         iii. Remedies 410
         iv. Cultural Heritage 411
      b. Digital Re-creation: Anand Patwardhan 413
   2. Colorization: Producers vs. Directors in France 415
D. Digital Technology: Film as a Technological Work 421
1. Editing, Creative Allusion, and Re-use: From Fan Films to Family Movies 421
2. Internet and the Communication of Films 429
3. Fame Beyond the Grave: Reviving Deceased Actors 432
E. Recommendations 432
F. Conclusion 435

CHAPTER 8: The Virtual Museum: Moral Rights in Art and Artefacts 437
A. Special Rights and Privileges? Unique Moral Rights for Visual Art 439
B. Sanctum Sanctorum: Originality and the Special Status of Art 449
C. Moral Rights and Traditional Art: The Legal Paradox of Living Traditions 453
D. Artworks and Artefacts: Intellectual Property or Cultural Property? 455
1. Property or Heritage? 456
2. Moral Rights and the Life-Cycle of an Artwork 458
   a. Phase 1: Intellectual Property 459
   b. Phase 2: Post Mortem Auctoris 459
   c. Phase 3: Cultural Property and Moral Rights 462
      i. Works in Copyright 464
      ii. The Public Domain: Shiva Nataraja’s Rights of “Attribution” and “Integrity” 466
         (a) Legal Issues Assessed by the Courts 470
            (i) Title 471
            (ii) Legal Capacity under Local Law 472
            (iii) “Juristic Entity” in English Law 472
         (b) A Moral Rights Perspective 474
E. Moral Rights and Modern Art: The Transition to Virtual Galleries 476
   1. Digital Images: New Technology to Reach Old Masters 476
   2. Building Virtual Galleries 479
   3. Artistic Innovation: From Collages to Parodies 481
F. Recommendations 483
G. Conclusion 484

CHAPTER 9: Friends or Enemies? Moral Rights and Open Access 487
A. Creative Commons: Implicit Recognition of Moral Rights 496
   1. Copyright Infringement and Creative Commons: License or Contract? 497
   2. The Basic License: Attribution Affirmed 499
3. The Creation of Derivative Works: Integrity or Attribution? 500
4. Reputation: The Heart of Open Access 502
5. The Dark Side of Open Access: Art as a Profession in Decline 503
B. Open Access: A Practical Need for Moral Rights 506
C. Collective Creation: Moral Rights and Web 2.0 513
D. Ownership of Open Source? Google Books and the Alternatives 519
E. Freedom to Create: The Price and Promise of Copyleft Movements 525
F. Recommendations 529
G. Conclusion 532

CHAPTER 10: Conclusion: Moral Rights and the Future of Copyright Law 533

INDEX 537