Security: A General Principle of Social Security Law in Europe

Edited by Ulrich Becker, Danny Pieters, Friso Ross, Paul Schoukens
CHAPTER 1

Introduction to the General Principles of Social Security Law in Europe

Ulrich Becker

1 Introduction
2 Theoretical background: on legal principles – a comparative view
2.1 Principles as explanations of legal structures
2.2 Principles and the methodology of legal comparison
2.2.1 Starting point: functionality
2.2.2 Outcome: legal comparison and legal doctrine
2.3 Principles and social security law
2.3.1 Research in other fields of law
2.3.2 Peculiarities of social security law
3 Research agenda
3.1 Preliminary remarks
3.1.1 Functional approach
3.1.2 Underlying concept and limitations
3.2 A catalogue of general principles
3.2.1 Solidarity: the collective aspect
3.2.2 Individual responsibility: the individual aspect
3.2.3 Protection: the paternalistic and procedural aspect
3.3 Security as a general principle: the time dimension
3.4 Questionnaire

CHAPTER 2

Country Report on Belgium

Danny Pieters and Paul Schoukens

Part I Legislative Aspects
1 State obligation to introduce and maintain social security
1.1 Article 23 of the Belgian Constitution
1.1.1 Contents
1.1.2 Content analysis
1.1.3 Direct effect
1.1.4 Corresponding obligations
1.1.5 Standstill principle
1.1.6 Conclusion
1.2 Other constitutional provisions
1.3 Statute holding the General Principles of Social Security for Wage Earners
1.4 Practical relevance of international law instruments
2 Legal duties to respect a 'position' of the individual
SECURITY: A GENERAL PRINCIPLE OF SOCIAL SECURITY LAW IN EUROPE

2.1 Property right and the Belgian Constitution 38
2.2 Property right and the ECHR 40
2.3 The principles of confidence and legal security; ‘acquired rights’ in the Belgian social security legal order 42
3 Legal changes and transitional measures 43
4 Executive-branch regulations 46

Part II Administrative Aspects 47
1 Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits 47
1.1 Discretionary powers in social security law 47
1.2 Policy rules in answer to the attribution of discretionary powers 49
1.3 Limits to the exercise of discretionary powers by social security institutions 51
1.3.1 Preventive legal protection 52
1.3.2 Repressive (judicial) legal protection 56
2 Administrative decisions and legal changes 59
3 Binding effects of administrative decisions 59
3.1 Wrong decision as to affiliation 60
3.2 Wrong decision leading to undue benefit payment 61
3.3 Social ruling 62
4 Consequences of non-information/incorrect information 63

CHAPTER 3 Country Report on the Czech Republic
Martin Štefko 67

Part I Legislative Aspects 69
1 State obligation to introduce and maintain social security 69
1.1 Constitutional framework of social security law 69
1.2 Constitutional power guaranteed to social security law 70
1.3 The impact of international law on Czech social security law 71
2 Legal duties to respect the position of the individual in the Czech social security system 73
3 Legal changes and transitional measures 75
3.1 The standards of transitional measures 75
3.2 Fundamental changes to social security 77
3.3 The increase in retirement age 79
3.4 The abolishment of employment categories 80
4 Executive-branch regulations (the tertiary legislation) 82
5 Conclusion 83

Part II Administrative Aspects 84
1 Discretionary power of the administration and its limits 84
1.1 The definition of discretionary power 84
1.2 The common types of discretion 86
1.3 Limits of discretion 87
1.4 The discretion without judicial control and an individual's protection against the use of discretion in hardship clause 88
2 Administrative decisions and legal changes 89
  2.1 Valorisation 91
  2.2 Introduction of new benefits systems or abolition of old benefits systems 91
3 Binding effects of administrative decisions 92
4 Consequences of dearth or inaccuracy of information 93

CHAPTER 4
Country Report on Germany
Ulrich Becker and Simone von Hardenberg 97

Part I Legislative Aspects 99
  1 State obligation to introduce and maintain social security 99
    1.1 Preliminary observation 99
    1.2 German Constitution (Basic Law) 100
    1.3 International law 104
  2 Legal duties to respect a 'position' of the individual 105
    2.1 Preliminary note 105
    2.2 Right to property (Art. 14 para. 1 GG) 107
      2.2.1 General requirements for the scope of protection (applicability) 107
      2.2.2 Protected positions in social benefits law 109
      2.2.3 Restrictions – further detailed questions regarding pension insurance 111
    2.2.4 Justification 112
    2.2.5 Interim findings 114
  2.3 Protection of marriage and the family (Art. 6 para. 1 GG) 115
  2.4 Equality before the law (Art. 3 para. 1 GG) 116
  3 Legal changes and transitional measures 117
    3.1 Protection of confidence (legitimate expectations) 117
    3.2 Retroactive legal measures 118
    3.3 Transitional regulations 119
    3.4 Examples from jurisdiction 120
  4 Delegated legislation 122
    4.1 Forms and legal basis 122
    4.2 Significance for social security law 123

Part II Administrative Aspects 125
  1 Discretionary powers of administrative bodies and their limits 125
    1.1 Forms and scopes of action in social administration 125
    1.2 Discretionary powers of administrative bodies and judicial review 127
  2 Administrative decisions and legal changes 131
2.1 General starting point: lawful decisions versus legitimate expectations

2.2 Special regulations for legislative amendments

3 Binding effects of administrative decisions

3.1 General: system of annulment regulations

3.2 Revocation of an unlawful disadvantageous administrative act (s. 44 SGB X)

3.3 Revocation of an unlawful advantageous administrative act (s. 45 SGB X)

3.4 Withdrawal of lawful administrative Acts (s. 46, 47 SGB X)

3.5 Annulment of administrative acts with permanent effect in the case of substantially altered circumstances (s. 48 SGB X)

4 Consequences of non-information / incorrect information

CHAPTER 5

Country Report on Greece

Olga Angelopoulou

Part I Legislative Aspects

1 The obligation of the State to introduce and maintain social security

1.1 The obligations of the State and the rights of individuals

1.2 'Social acquis'

1.2.1 'Social acquis' and 'sustainable social policy' in the field of social insurance

1.2.2 'Social acquis' in the field of social assistance

1.3 Other limits in the field of social insurance

1.3.1 Constitutional guarantee of the social insurance institution

1.3.2 Compulsory social insurance as an exclusive state responsibility

1.3.3 Gender equality

1.4 Other limits in the field of social assistance

1.4.1 Constitutional guarantee of family as an institution

1.4.2 The meaning of the term 'family' with the Greek Constitution and its consequences for gender equality

1.5 Other limits in the field of health protection

2 Legal duties to respect the right of the individual

2.1 The concept of 'established' rights

2.2 Retrospective law may not abolish adjudicated claims

2.3 'Established' rights and their protection from retrospective law

2.4 'Possessions' under the meaning of Art. 1 of the Protocol

2.4.1 Possessions and retrospective legislation

2.4.2 Possessions and pension indexation
2.4.3 Possessions and discrimination on grounds of nationality 173
2.4.4 Possessions and the loss of pension rights as a disciplinary sanction 173
2.4.5 Possessions and the ‘special contribution’ on pensions 174
2.4.6 Rights and expectations not falling under the meaning of ‘possessions’ of Art. 1 of the Protocol 175
2.5 Equality of law and the ‘pure contributory character’ of social insurance benefits 176
3 Legal changes and transitional measures 178
3.1 Exemptions from mature expectations 178
3.2 Optional exemptions from mature expectations 179
3.3 Transitional periods 180
3.4 The distinction between ‘formerly’ and ‘newly’ insured persons 180
3.5 The diverse implications of mergers and unifications for social insurance rights and expectations 181
3.6 Legislation removing discrimination on grounds of sex in the field of survivors’ pensions 183
4 Executive-branch regulations 185

Part II Administrative Aspects 186
1 Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits 186
1.1 Discretion in the field of social insurance 186
1.2 Discretion in the field of social assistance 189
1.2.1 Short reference to the structure of the Greek social assistance system 189
1.2.2 Social assistance benefits in cash 192
1.2.3 Social assistance services 195
2 Administrative decisions and legal changes 198
2.1 Statutory obligation to an ex-officio repetition of the administrative process 199
2.2 Statutory obligation to repeat the administrative process if requested by the insured 200
2.3 The obligation to repeat the administrative process as a general principle of social insurance law 203
3 Binding effects of administrative decisions 207
3.1 The general principle of ‘formal’ insurance 208
3.2 The general principle on the prohibition of reclaiming unduly paid benefits 213
4 Consequences of non-information/ incorrect information 216

CHAPTER 6
Country Report on Iceland
Cynthia Jeans, Guðný Björk Eydal and Stefan Olafsson 227

Part I Legislative Aspects 229
Introduction 229
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>State obligation and the Constitution of the Republic of Iceland</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Constitution of the Republic of Iceland</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>International law and conventions</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Rights to appeal</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Legal duties to respect a position of the individual</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Property rights</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Respect of legitimate expectations</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Respect of confidence</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Legal changes and transitional measures</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Reduction of protection of previously privileged groups</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Equality for men and women</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Old-age pension schemes</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Occupational injury insurance</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Health care schemes</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Disability schemes</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Social assistance</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Social assistance under local authorities</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Policies for children and families with children</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The executive branch regulations</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part II Administrative Aspects**

1 | State Social Security Institute of Iceland | 243 |
2 | Administrative branches of the State Social Security Institute | 244 |
3 | The Social Security Ruling Committee | 245 |
3.1 | Binding effects of the Social Security Ruling Committee | 247 |
3.2 | Social Security Ruling Committee decisions | 247 |
3.3 | Flow and availability of information | 248 |
4 | Administration of Internal Revenue in Iceland | 249 |
5 | Administrative branches of Unemployment Benefit Fund | 250 |
6 | Unemployment Insurance and Labour Market Measures Complaints Committee | 252 |
7 | Administration of Maternity/Paternity and Parental Leave in transition | 252 |
8 | The Maternity/Paternity and Parental Leave Complaints Committee | 253 |
9 | Conclusion and discussion | 254 |

**CHAPTER 7**

**Country Report on Ireland**

Mel Cousins

**Part I** Legislative Aspects 263
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>State obligation to introduce and maintain social security</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Legislation</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Regulations and guidelines</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>The Irish Constitution</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>International law</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Legal duties to respect a 'position' of the individual</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>A contractual right to benefits</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Legitimate expectation</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Proportionality</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Legal changes and transitional measures</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Executive-branch regulations</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Part II</td>
<td>Administrative Aspects</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Administrative decisions and legal changes</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Binding effects of administrative decisions</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Decisions</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Revision of decisions</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Appeal</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Further appeal and revision</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Overpayments and repayments</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.5.1</td>
<td>Overpayment</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.5.2</td>
<td>Repayment</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.5.3</td>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.5.4</td>
<td>Code of practice</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.5.5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Consequences of non-information/ incorrect information</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 8**

**Country Report on Italy**

Matteo Borzaga | 297

**Part I**

Legislative Aspects | 299

Introduction | 299

1 | State obligation to introduce and maintain social security | 300

1.1 | The role played by the Italian Constitution | 300

1.2 | The impact of national statute laws | 304

1.3 | International social security law | 308

2 | Legal duties to respect the 'position' of the individual | 309

3 | Legal changes and transitional measures | 313

4 | Executive-branch regulations | 320

**Part II**

Administrative Aspects | 322

Introduction | 322

1 | Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits | 323
| 1.1 | Discretionary powers of the administration in the field of social insurance | 325 |
| 1.2 | Discretionary powers of the administration in the field of social assistance | 327 |
| 2 | Administrative decisions and legal changes | 333 |
| 3 | Binding effects of administrative decisions | 335 |
| 4 | Consequences of non-information or incorrect information | 342 |

**CHAPTER 9**

**Country Report on Luxembourg**

Fanny Etienne-Robert 347

**Part I Legislative Aspects**

1 State obligation to introduce and maintain social security 349

1.1 Constitution 349

1.1.1 Obligations of the State 349

1.1.2 Subjective rights 351

1.2 Limitation of change 352

1.2.1 Due to the Constitution 352

1.2.2 Due to International/ European law 352

2 Legal duties to respect a 'position' of the individual 353

2.1 The 'acquired rights' as 'social acquired rights' 354

2.2 'Acquired rights' strict sensu 355

3 Legal changes and transitional measures 356

4 Executive-branch regulations 358

**Part II Administrative Aspects**

1 Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits 358

1.1 Case law 360

1.2 Legislative evolution 360

1.3 Control of Lawfulness 361

2 Administrative decisions and legal changes 361

2.1 Classification of the different possible provisions 361

2.2 Ombudsman and fairness 362

3 Binding effects of administrative decisions 363

3.1 Change in the situation of the beneficiary and absence of information or misinformation of the administration in question 363

3.2 Other cases/mistakes by the administration 364

4 Consequences of non-information/ incorrect information 364

4.1 Juridical sanction 364

4.2 Recommendations as sanction: the moral authority of the Ombudsman 365

4.2.1 General recommendation on information on users and good functioning of the administration 365

4.2.2 Complaints and recommendation on specific domain of information 366
Areas of discretionary power 422
Limits of discretionary power 426
Administrative decisions and legal changes 428
Binding effects of administrative decisions 431
Affiliation to social insurance 432
Granting of benefits or imposing duties 433
First instance decisions 433
Disagreement with the first-instance administrative decision 435
Temporal boundaries of final administrative decisions 438
Providing benefits without just cause 439
Settlements and understandings in social security 441
Consequences of non- or incorrect information 443
Concluding thoughts 444

CHAPTER 12

Country Report on Spain
Cristina Sánchez Rodas 449

Part I

Legislative Aspects 451
1
State obligation to introduce and maintain social security 451
1.1
Social security is a public task and a basic pillar of the Welfare State 453
1.2
Social security is financed by public resources 453
1.3
Universal personal scope 454
1.4
Material scope 454
2
Legal duties with to respect to the ‘position’ of the individual 456
3
Legal changes and transitional measures 463
3.1
Legal reform with no transitional measures 464
3.1.1
The implementation of homosexual marriage and its consequences in the field of death pensions 464
3.1.2
Unemployment allowances for migrant workers 464
3.2
Legal reforms in the field of old-age pensions with transitional arrangements giving beneficiaries a choice between the application of the old or new system 465
3.3
Legal reforms establishing a progressive period for implementation 465
3.3.1
Old-age pensions 465
3.3.2
Long-term care benefits 465
3.4
Legal reforms in the field of family benefits with a transitional arrangement allowing beneficiaries to receive benefits according to the old system 466
3.5
Legal reforms in which mixed transitional measures are adopted 466
4
Executive-branch regulations 466

Part II

Administrative Aspects 467
1
Discretionary power of the administration and its limits 467
CHAPTER 13

Country Report on Sweden
Thomas Erhag

Part I

Legislative Aspects
1
Duty to provide health care without a corresponding individual right to receive
1.2
Right to social security benefits in cash
1.3
Right to social assistance
2
Legal duties to respect a 'position' of the individual
2.1
Retroactivity
2.2
Property rights
3
Legal changes and transitional measures
3.1
Examples of limited changes concerning short-term cash benefits
3.2
Widows' pension
3.3
Reform of the statutory old-age pension system
4
Executive-branch regulations
5
Concluding remarks

Part II

Administrative Aspects
1
Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits
1.1
Discretion in social security law
1.2
Norm-oriented social security legislation
1.3
Framework legislation
1.4
Limits of discretionary power
2
Administrative decisions and legal changes
2.1
Withdrawal of favourable administrative decisions
2.2
Withdrawal of social security benefits due to new legislation
3
Binding effects of administrative decisions
3.1
Favourable or positive administrative decisions
3.2
Burdensome or negative administrative decisions
3.3
Rectification and reconsideration of decisions
3.4
The effects of a 'wrong' decision
3.5
The possibility of 'rulings' and 'settlements' in social security
4
Consequences of non-information or incorrect information
4.1
Service duties in administrative procedure
4.2
Failure to comply with service duties
List of References
CHAPTER 14

Country Report on Switzerland

Thomas Gächter

Part I Legislative Aspects
1 State obligation to introduce and maintain social security
1.1 Social security in the Swiss federal state
1.2 Legal basis of social security
1.2.1 Federal level
1.2.2 State level (Cantons)
1.3 Subjective rights to social security
1.4 Influence of international law on changes in Swiss social security law
2 Legal duties to respect a ‘position’ of the individual
2.1 Concept of the right to property
2.2 Right to property and social security
2.3 Other concepts with influence on changes in social security systems
2.3.1 Rights acquired by a special act (Wohlerworbene Rechte)
2.3.2 Protection of confidence
2.3.3 Protection of collective confidence / Security of Law
2.3.4 Protection of acquired rights
2.3.5 Equality and equal treatment
3 Legal changes and transitional measures
3.1 Dogmatic approach towards transitional measures
3.2 Usual structure of transitional measures in social security law
3.3 Actual legal changes introduced and accompanied by transitional provisions
3.4 Stability of transitional measures
4 Executive-branch regulations
5 Concluding remarks

Part II Administrative Aspects
1 Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits
1.1 Preliminary remarks
1.2 Discretionary power in the shaping of autonomous rules
1.3 Discretionary powers in the granting of benefits in social insurance
1.4 Discretionary powers in the granting of social assistance
1.5 Limits of discretionary power
2 Administrative decisions and legal changes
2.1 Singular and short termed prestations
2.2 Long-termed prestations
3 Binding effects of administrative decisions
3.1 Preliminary remarks
3.2 Binding effects concerning the affiliation to a social security system
3.3 Binding effects concerning the granting of benefits
3.4 Unduly paid benefits
3.5 'Rulings' in social security
3.6 Consequences of non-information or incorrect information
3.7 Consequences of incorrect information
3.8 The duty to inform in Swiss social security law
3.9 Concluding remarks

CHAPTER 15
Country Report on the United Kingdom
Neville Harris

Part I
Legislative Aspects
Introduction
1 State obligations to introduce and maintain social security
1.1 The legal basis to social security under national law
1.2 Incorporation of the ECHR
1.3 EC Law
2 Legal duties to respect a 'position' of the individual
2.2 Protecting rights: other checks and safeguards
3 Legal changes and transitional measures
4 Executive branch regulations

Part II
Administrative Aspects
Introduction
1 Discretionary powers of the administration and their limits
1.1 Claims
1.2 Recovery
1.3 Discretion in relation to particular social security benefits
1.3.1 The Social Fund
1.3.2 Jobseeker's Allowance (JSA)
1.3.3 Income Support
1.3.4 Incapacity Benefit (IB) and Employment and Support Allowance (ESA)
2 Administrative decisions and legal changes
3 Binding effects of administrative decisions
3.1 Appeals, revisions and supersessions
3.2 Overpayment of benefit
3.3 'Rulings'
4 Provision of information
CHAPTER 16
‘Security’ as General Principle of Social Security Law in Europe: Conclusions on Legislative Aspects
Bob De Mars, Danny Pieters and Paul Schoukens 605

Introduction 607
1 State obligation to introduce and maintain social security 607
1.1 Constitutional provisions dealing with social security 607
1.1.1 Lack of constitutional provision 608
1.1.2 Constitutional protection in the form of a policy guideline 608
1.1.3 General constitutional protection by proclaiming the state as a ‘social’ state 609
1.1.4 Constitutional protection by granting competences in the matter of social security 611
1.1.5 Constitutional protection in the form of a fundamental social right 611
1.2 International provisions dealing with social security 615
2 Legal duties to respect a ‘position’ of an individual 618
2.1 Property protection of social security rights 618
2.2 Acquired rights and legitimate expectations 623
2.2.1 ‘Fairness’ 623
2.2.2 Equality 628
2.2.3 Proportionality 629
3 Legal changes and transitional measures 629
4 Executive-branch regulations 632
5 Some concluding thoughts 633

CHAPTER 17
‘Security’ as General Principle of Social Security Law in Europe: Conclusions on Administrative Aspects
Friso Ross 637

Introduction 639
1 Discretionary powers of the social administration and their limits 641
1.1 Areas of discretionary power 642
1.2 Limits of discretionary power 642
2 Administrative decisions and legal changes 643
3 Binding effects of administrative decisions 644
3.1 Wrong decision as regards affiliation 645
3.2 Wrong decision leading to undue benefit payment 646
3.3 Binding effects of rulings 647
4 Consequences of non- or misinformation 647
5 Concluding thoughts 648