Trading Fish, Saving Fish: The Interaction Between Regimes in International Law

Margaret A. Young
Contents

Foreword xi
Acknowledgements xiv
Table of cases xvii
Table of Conventions, Declarations and procedures xxiii
List of abbreviations xxxi

Part I: Trading Fish, Saving Fish 1

Chapter 1 Introduction 3
A Trade law and fisheries sustainability 5
B Fragmentation of international law 8
C Scope, methodology and use of terms 16
   1 A case-study approach 16
   2 The vocabulary of regimes 19
   3 The legal framework for regime interaction 22
   4 The stakeholders 24
D Outline of the book 29

Chapter 2 Relevant laws and institutions: an overview 32
A The law of the sea 33
   1 UNCLOS and the EEZ regime 34
   2 UNCLOS's high seas, fish stocks and regional regimes 38
   3 FAO fisheries management regime 46
   4 Interdependencies with other regimes 50
   5 Further links: the UN Consultative Process 53
B International environmental law 56
   1 Convention on the International Trade in Endangered Species 56
   2 Convention on Migratory Species 61
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part II</td>
<td><strong>Selected Case Studies</strong></td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 3</strong> The negotiation of WTO rules on fisheries subsidies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Subsidies and overfishing</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B The forum shop: regimes of relevance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 The WTO's SCM Agreement</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 The Doha negotiations</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Opposition to the role of the WTO</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 Responses</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C Inter-regime learning</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 WTO members as conduits</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Participation and observership by others</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Other forums including UNEP</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D Entrenching interaction</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Notifications</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Classifying subsidies using fisheries standards</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Conditionality through benchmarking and peer review</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E Settling disputes</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F Conclusions</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 4</strong> The restriction of trade in endangered marine species</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Endangered marine species</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B The forum shop: regimes of relevance</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 Listing marine species in the CITES Appendices</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 Opposition to the role of CITES</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 Responses</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
C  The Memorandum of Understanding between CITES and the FAO 154
   1  Legal status 155
   2  Evolution of the MOU 158
   3  Substantive and procedural constraints 169
   4  National policy coordination 174
D  Entrenching interaction through the MOU 176
   1  Information-sharing and observership 176
   2  Capacity building 179
   3  Involvement in CITES listing criteria 179
   4  Consultation and review of listing proposals 181
   5  Reporting and resource allocation 184
E  Settling disputes 184
F  Conclusions 186

Chapter 5  Adjudicating a fisheries import ban at the WTO 189
A  Shrimp fisheries and marine by-catch 190
B  The forum shop: regimes of relevance 190
   1  The US ban on shrimp products 191
   2  Complaint at the WTO 193
C  Settling the dispute: scope for regime interaction 195
   1  Applicable law 195
   2  Treaty interpretation 197
   3  Relevant facts 204
D  Settling the dispute: methods of regime interaction 206
   1  Panellists, AB members and the Secretariat 206
   2  The parties' submissions 209
   3  Consultation with scientific experts 211
   4  Consultation with IGO secretariats 215
   5  Amicus curiae briefs from NGOs and others 220
E  Problems and challenges 224
   1  Selection of the adjudicators 226
   2  Framing by the parties 227
   3  Parallel membership of treaties and organisations 229
   4  Legitimacy and the need for guidance in the use of exogenous sources 235
F  Conclusions 239
Part III: Towards Regime Interaction

Chapter 6  From fragmentation to regime interaction
A  From forum shopping to interaction
B  The promotion of regime interaction
   1  National policy coordination
   2  Learning and information-sharing
   3  Allocation of resources
C  Impediments to regime interaction
   1  Exclusivity of forum
   2  Lack of transparency and openness
   3  Need for parallel membership
D  Conclusions

Chapter 7  A legal framework for regime interaction
A  The multiple bases of regime interaction
   1  Parallel membership
   2  Mutual agreement
   3  Institutional arrangements
B  Legitimacy of regime interaction
   1  Consent and sovereignty
   2  Express and implied powers
   3  The risk of managerialism
C  Accountable regime interaction
D  Duties to take others into account
E  Conclusions

Chapter 8  Implications for international law
A  Appropriate regime interaction in practice
   1  Law-making
   2  Implementation
   3  Dispute settlement
B  Further implications
   1  The ILC fragmentation study
   2  Beyond fisheries governance
   3  Confronting managerialism
   4  Situating the participants
Appendices 307

A: Draft consolidated text of the proposed fisheries subsidies disciplines 307
B: Final text of the FAO-CITES Memorandum of Understanding 316

Bibliography 318

Books and edited collections 318
Articles 325
Policy papers, news sources and unpublished works 333
Papers submitted to or produced by international organisations 334
Selected websites 342

Index 344