Intermediated Securities
Legal Problems and Practical Issues

Edited by
Louise Gullifer and Jennifer Payne

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2010
# Contents

*Foreword by Sir Roy Goode, CBE, QC*  
*Preface*  
*List of Contributors*  
*Table of Cases*  
*Table of Legislation*  
*Table of International Instruments*  

## 1. Ownership of Securities: the Problems Caused by Intermediation
*Louise Gullifer*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Risks of Intermediation</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Risks in General</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Risk of Legal Uncertainty: Conflict of Laws Solutions</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Risk of Legal Uncertainty: Substantive Law Solutions</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Pooled Accounts in the Intermediated Holding System</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Nature of The Interest of a Holder of Intermediated Securities</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Rights against the Intermediary</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Protection on the Intermediary’s Insolvency</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Problems Arising from Pooled Accounts</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Identification Problem</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Shortfall Problem</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Protection of Good Faith Purchasers</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Taking Security over Intermediated Securities</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Conclusion</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 2. Interests in Securities: Practical Problems and Conceptual Solutions
*Ben Macfarlane and Robert Stevens*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Twelve Issues</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Issue 1: What is the Nature of the Investor’s Rights in Relation to the Securities?</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Issue 2: Is there a Valid Trust at All?</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Issue 3: What Happens if There is a Shortfall in the Assets Held by the Intermediary?</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Issue 4: Can a Third Party Make a Claim to Assets in the Hands of the Intermediary?</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E. Issue 5: Perfection of a Security Interest</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Issue 6: The No-Look-Through Principle</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Issue 7: Upper-Tier Attachment</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Issue 8: How Should Priority Issues Be Resolved?</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Issue 9: Protection of Purchaser in Good Faith</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J. Issue 10: Assignments of Equitable Interests</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Issue 11: The Conflict of Laws</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Issue 12: Civilian Systems</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Conclusion</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. **Intermediated Securities: Issues arising on Insolvency**
   
   **Gabriel Moss, QC**
   
   I. Introduction                                                      | 61   |
   II. Legal Concepts and Practical Problems                            | 62   |
   III. The Nature of the Investor's Right in Intermediated Securities  | 65   |
   IV. Is There a Valid Trust At All?                                   | 66   |
   V. Shortfall                                                         | 66   |
   VI. The Conflict of Laws                                             | 67   |
   VII. Conclusion                                                      | 68   |

4. **Core Issues under the UNIDROIT (Geneva) Convention on Intermediated Securities: Views from the United States and Japan**
   
   **Charles W Mooney, Jr and Hideki Kanda**
   
   I. Introduction                                                      | 69   |
   II. Structure and Background                                          | 72   |
   A. Intermediated Securities Holding Systems                          | 72   |
   B. Goals and Approach                                                | 74   |
   C. Significance of Relevant Legal Doctrine and Relationship to Systemic Risk | 76   |
   III. Overview of Convention and United States and Japanese Legal Regimes | 79   |
   A. Background on Legal Frameworks                                    | 79   |
   B. Dematerialisation                                                 | 82   |
   C. Basic Attributes of Intermediated Securities                      | 83   |
   D. Acquisition of Intermediated Securities                           | 85   |
   E. Duties of Intermediary                                             | 87   |
   IV. Innocent Acquisition and Priorities                              | 94   |
   A. Innocent Acquisition of Intermediated Securities (‘Good Faith Purchase’) | 95   |
   B. Priority Rules                                                    | 108  |
   V. Relationship of Convention to Insolvency Law                     | 119  |
   A. Background                                                        | 119  |
   B. Convention Interests in an Insolvency Proceeding: In General     | 120  |
## Contents

1. **Introduction**

2. **The Legal Nature of Securities: Inspirations from Comparative Law**
   - *Eva Micheler*
   - I. Introduction 131
     - A. Property Rights in Intermediated Securities 132
     - B. Quasi-Negotiability 134
   - II. The Legal Nature of Securities in German and Austrian Law 135
     - A. Modern German Theory 135
     - B. Earlier Theory: Securities as Intangibles 136
     - C. Securities as Assets of their own Kind 140
     - D. Savigny's Contribution 141
   - III. The Legal Nature of Securities in English Law 143
   - IV. The Characteristics of Securities 144
   - V. Securities as Circulating Rights 146
   - VI. Conclusion 148

3. **Reuse of Financial Collateral Revisited**
   - *Erica Johanssen*
   - I. Introduction 151
   - II. The Financial Collateral Directive 152
   - III. Financial Collateral Arrangement Regulations 152
   - IV. Geneva Securities Convention on Substantive Rules for Intermediated Securities 159
   - V. Protective Mechanisms Developed in the Financial Markets 160
   - VI. Protection of Account Holders' Rights: Legislative Recommendations 162
   - VII. Conclusion 164

   - *Antony Zacaroli, QC*
   - I. Introduction 167
   - II. The Convention and the EC Directive 168
     - A. Relaxation of Aspects of Insolvency Law 171
     - B. Formal Validity and Perfection of Security 173
   - III. Rights of Withdrawal and Substitution and the Fixed/Floating Charge Debate 174
   - IV. Floating Charges and the EC Directive 180
   - V. Floating Charges and the Convention 183
     - A. The Concept of 'Control' and the Convention 183

---

C. Convention Interests in the Relevant Intermediary's Insolvency Proceeding 122

D. Special Provisions for Collateral Transactions 127

VI. Conclusion 129

---

5. The Legal Nature of Securities: Inspirations from Comparative Law
   - *Eva Micheler*

6. Reuse of Financial Collateral Revisited
   - *Erica Johanssen*

   - *Antony Zacaroli, QC*
Contents

B. Floating Charges under English Law and Articles 11 and 12 of the Convention 184

8. Intermediated Securities and the Right to Vote in the UK:
   Jennifer Payne 187
   I. Introduction 187
   II. Corporate Governance in UK Public Companies 188
   III. Why might shares be held through an intermediary? 193
   IV. Enfranchising Indirect Investors Who May Want to Have a Corporate Governance Role 195
      A. The Beneficiary Instructs the Intermediary to Vote on his Behalf 197
      B. The Intermediary Delegates to the Beneficiary the Rights Attached to the Shares 201
   V. Indirect Investors Who Hold Via Institutional Investors 207
   VI. Assessment of The UK System 212
   VII. Conclusion 216

   Maisie Ooi 219
   I. Introduction 219
   II. The Choice of Law Problem 220
   III. The EU Directives 221
   IV. The Hague Securities Convention 222
   V. The Hague Securities Convention and EU Choice of Law Rules Compared 223
   VI. Concerns About the Hague Securities Convention’s Choice of Law Rule 225
   VII. Substantive law solution to the choice of law problem? 229
   VIII. Choice of Law Choices 230
      A. The Law of the System 231
      B. The Law Determined by Reference to the Transferor’s Intermediary 236
   IX. Comparison of Choice of Law Treatments 238
      A. The Hague Securities Convention Rule 239
      B. The EU Rule 241
      C. The Law of the System 242
      D. The Law Determined by Reference to the Transferor’s Intermediary 242
   X. Conclusion 243
Contents

10. Remarks on the development of the UNIDROIT (Geneva) Convention on Intermediated Securities and its future:  
    *Herbert Kronke*  
    I. Introduction 245  
    II. Functional Approach 246  
    III. Scope of the Instrument 247  
    IV. Implementation 248

11. Views from Europe:  
    *Habib Motani, Karin Wallin-Norman, Teun Struycken*  
    Habib Motani: United Kingdom 253  
    Karin Wallin-Norman: Sweden 254  
    Teun Struycken: Netherlands 255


*Index* 285

xiii