Aboriginal Law
Since Delgamuukw

Editor-in-Chief: Maria Morellato, Q.C.
# Table of Contents

*Foreword* ........................................................................................................................................ iii
*Preface* ........................................................................................................................................... xi
*Biographical Notes on Contributors* ............................................................................................ xvii
*Table of Cases* ................................................................................................................................. xxxv

## PART I

**FOUNDATIONAL LEGAL PRINCIPLES AND OUTSTANDING ISSUES: THE PATH BEFORE US**

### Chapter 1  The Constitutional Basis of Aboriginal Rights

*Peter W. Hogg, Q.C.* .................................................................................................................. 3
- Aboriginal Rights Before 1982 ........................................................................................................ 3
- Constitution Act, 1982 .................................................................................................................. 5
- The Sparrow Case ......................................................................................................................... 7
- Definition and Proof of Aboriginal Rights .................................................................................... 9
- Duty to Consult Aboriginal People ............................................................................................... 11
- Conclusion .................................................................................................................................... 15

### Chapter 2  Disappointed Expectations: Why Delgamuukw Has Failed to Achieve Results on the Ground

*John J.L. Hunter, Q.C.* ................................................................................................................ 17
- Aboriginal Rights and Title .......................................................................................................... 18
- The Occupation Problem ............................................................................................................. 22
- Conclusion .................................................................................................................................... 29

### Chapter 3  Where To From Here: Reconciling Aboriginal Title with Crown Sovereignty

*Douglas Lambert* ....................................................................................................................... 31
- Introduction .................................................................................................................................... 31
- Reconciliation ............................................................................................................................... 32
- Aboriginal Rights ......................................................................................................................... 34
- Aboriginal Title ............................................................................................................................ 36
- The Possibility of Reconciliation Through Aboriginal Rights and Aboriginal Title ................. 37
- Justification for Infringement of Aboriginal Title ........................................................................ 39

xxv
Aboriginal Law Since Delgamuukw

Into the Constitutional Maze .................................................. 42
And Out Again........................................................................ 45
In the Meantime: The Content of Accommodation ...................... 51
Summary and Conclusion ......................................................... 53

Chapter 4  The Ghost
Louise Mandell, Q.C. ............................................................... 55
Spotting the Ghost .................................................................. 56
The Ghost Has Friends in High Places .......................... 57
The Ghost Is an Outlaw ......................................................... 58
The Ghost Survives Through Delay ........................................ 59
The Ghost Is Forced Out of the Shadows .......................... 61
The New Relationship ............................................................. 65
The Ghost Does Not Give Up .................................................. 66
  Morris............................................................................. 67
  Huu-Ay-Aht................................................................. 67
  Tsilhqot’iin ................................................................. 68
  Gitanyow .................................................................... 70
  Hupacasath ................................................................. 71
  Klahoose ................................................................... 72
  Okanagan (Jules and Wilson) .............................................. 72
Banishing the Ghost — Implementing the New Relationship .......... 76
  Setting the Standard of Recognition .................................... 77
  Creating Solutions to Current Obstacles .......................... 77
  Providing the Tools for New Relationships on the Ground .... 77
Key Components of the Discussion Paper .............................. 81
  Recognition principles ..................................................... 81
  The intent of the proposed legislation ............................ 82
  Indigenous nation rebuilding and the creation of an
  Indigenous Nation Commission ......................................... 82
  Shared decision-making and revenue- and benefit-sharing ..... 83

Chapter 5  Building Indigenous Legal Communities
Post-Delgamuukw: Where Are the Women?
Patricia A. Monture ............................................................. 87
## Table of Contents

### Chapter 6  The Spectre of Spectra: The Evolution of the Crown’s Fiduciary Obligation to Aboriginal Peoples Since Delgamuukw

*Dr. James I. Reynolds*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: The Fiduciary Relationship</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiduciary Obligations Applicable to Reserve Lands</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Protection of Aboriginal and Treaty Rights</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Litigation</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duty to Consult and Accommodate</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Exercise of Governmental Powers Generally</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who Has a Fiduciary Relationship with Aboriginal Peoples?</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Whom Is the Duty Owed?</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Outstanding Questions</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the relationship based on strict trust, a trust-like relationship, or a sui generis fiduciary relationship?</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What rules govern the fiduciary obligation?</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the relationship between the honour of the Crown and the Crown’s fiduciary relationship with Aboriginal peoples?</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 7  The Metamorphosis of Aboriginal Title

*Brian Slattery*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Basic Argument</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptions of Aboriginal Title</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aboriginal Title as a Customary Right Rooted in Indigenous Law</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicting Indigenous claims</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicting claims between an Indigenous group and a private party</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Crown’s relationship to Indigenous lands</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfers of Indigenous lands</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The extinguishment of Aboriginal title</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The collective title of the Indigenous group as a whole</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aboriginal Title as a Translated Right Held Under English Common Law</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aboriginal Title as a Sui Generis Right at Common Law</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judicial Adoption of the Sui Generis Theory</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Canadian Jurisprudence</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Marshall/Bernard Decision</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principles of Recognition and Reconciliation</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xxvii
PART II
ADDRESSING ABORIGINAL AND
METIS RIGHTS ON THE GROUND:
LEGAL AND PRAGMATIC CONSIDERATIONS

Chapter 8  Aboriginal Title and Private Property
Gordon Christie .......................................................... 177
The Nature of Private Property and the Development of Aboriginal
Title ..................................................................................... 182
Private Property in Broad Outline .......................................... 182
Aboriginal Title in Broad Outline ........................................ 184
The Core Issue — Battling Exclusivities ................................. 187
The Jurisprudence — Guidance of a Subtle Form .................... 188
Guiding Principles? .......................................................... 190
Driving Forces ..................................................................... 195
Other Ways Forward .......................................................... 200

Chapter 9  A Decade Since Delgamuukw: Update from an
Industry Perspective
Anna Fung, Q.C., Anne Giardini and Rob Miller ................. 205
Introduction ........................................................................ 206
Background — The Duty to Consult up to and including Haida .... 208
The Role of Industry in the Consultation Process .................... 212
The Practical Perspective: Good Business Sense .................... 212
The Social Perspective: Human Cost and Fairness ................. 213
The Legal Perspective: Appropriate Delegation ...................... 213
Delegation in Practice: Consultation Guidelines ..................... 215
The Role of Tribunals and Boards in the Consultation Process .... 216
Identifying the Group with Whom to Consult ......................... 220
Bodies Corporate and Other Associations ............................. 221
Dissident Groups and Traditional Groups ............................. 223
Overlapping Claims .......................................................... 224
Conclusions ........................................................................ 224
Injunctions and Similar Relief ................................................ 225
Balancing Competing Interests .............................................. 225
Injunction and Haida Motion Applications by First Nations .... 226
Injunction Applications by Industry ....................................... 230
Six Nations ......................................................................... 232
Platinex ............................................................................. 238
Who Pays? ........................................................................ 242
Interim Measures .............................................................. 246
Planning ............................................................................. 248
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information Sharing .............................................. 248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Agreements ............................................... 248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good Neighbour Activities ....................................... 249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Obligations ....................................... 251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One Perspective on the Unfolding Law — Tsilhqot'in ........... 254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background .......................................................... 254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aboriginal Title ..................................................... 254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Jurisdiction over Resources ......................... 260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications for Industry ....................................... 262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Conclusion: Some Thoughts on What Works .................... 264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix: Current Resources for Industry ...................... 266</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Chapter 10 Fishing for More than One Day: Aboriginal Equality After Delgamuukw  
  Roy W. Millen and Jennifer Spencer ................................ 269 |
| Introduction .......................................................... 269 |
| Discussion ............................................................ 271 |
| Equality Claims Inside Communities due to Federal Action .... 271 |
| New Avenues: Canadian Human Rights Act Amendments .......... 280 |
| Individual Rights Versus the Exercise of Collective Aboriginal Rights .................................................. 281 |
| Conclusion: Where To From Here? The Next Decade ............ 287 |
| Chapter 11 Tsilhqot'in Nation v. British Columbia: A Decade After Delgamuukw  
  David M. Robbins and Jack Woodward ............................ 291 |
| Introduction to the Significance, History and Nature of the Case ............................ 291 |
| Procedural Issues ................................................... 292 |
| Evidentiary Issues ................................................... 295 |
| Substantive Issues .................................................. 298 |
| Identity of the Proper Rights Holding Group – The Tsilhqot'in ... 298 |
| Aboriginal Title Related Issues ................................ 298 |
| Aboriginal Rights Related Issues ................................ 304 |
| Reconciliation ....................................................... 309 |
| Chapter 12 The Duty to Consult and Accommodate: A Judicial Innovation Intended to Promote Reconciliation  
  Arthur Pape ........................................................... 313 |
| Introduction .......................................................... 313 |
| History and Nature of the Duty to Consult and Accommodate .... 314 |
| The Sparrow Paradigm ................................................. 314 |
| The Haida Paradigm ................................................... 315 |
| The Substantive Nature of the Duty to Consult .................. 317 |

xxix
Aboriginal Law Since Delgamuukw

The Scope and Application of the Duty ........................................ 319
The Duty Can Promote Reconciliation ........................................... 323
Do Environmental Assessment and Licensing Regimes Satisfy the Duty? ................................................................. 324
Does the Duty Apply to Treaty Rights in Modern Land Claims Agreements? ................................................................. 327

Chapter 13  A Tale of Two Agreements: Implementing Section 52(1) Remedies for the Violation of Métis Harvesting Rights
Jean Teillet .................................................................................. 333
Introduction .................................................................................. 333
The Development of Section 35 Remedies ....................................... 337
Declarations .................................................................................. 340
The Role of Policy ........................................................................ 349
Métis Harvesting Agreements .......................................................... 355
The Ontario Métis Harvesting Agreement ....................................... 357
The Alberta Métis Harvesting Agreement ....................................... 361
The Legal Status of Negotiated Agreements ................................... 365
Conclusion .................................................................................... 368

PART III
ABORIGINAL GOVERNANCE:
LEGAL RIGHTS AND CUSTOMARY LAW

Chapter 14  Aboriginal Self-Government
James A. O'Reilly ........................................................................... 373
Introduction .................................................................................. 373
Inherent Sovereignty ...................................................................... 375
Historical Recognition of Aboriginal Sovereignty ......................... 377
Crown Sovereignty and the Courts ................................................ 378
Aboriginal Self-Determination ...................................................... 382
Different Meanings of Aboriginal Self-Government ...................... 383
The Indian Act .............................................................................. 385
The Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples .......... 385
Aboriginal Self-Government as an Aboriginal Right ...................... 386
Aboriginal Self-Government as a Treaty Right ............................... 387
Post-1995 Decisions of the Canadian Courts on Aboriginal Self-Government ................................................................. 388
Modern Treaties and Self-Government ........................................... 390
Projections Respecting the Future of Aboriginal Self-Government .. 391
Table of Contents

Chapter 15  An Unfulfilled Promise: Still Fighting to Make Space for Indigenous Legal Traditions
Ardith Walkem .................................................................393
Introduction ........................................................................393
Transforming Indigenous Laws to Evidence ..........................396
Rise of Extinguishment by Litigation .................................400
Lack of Specificity .............................................................403
Lack of Necessity ...............................................................405
Genealogy of Evidence ......................................................407
Bias ..................................................................................410
Self-serving bias (assessing Indigenous peoples’ evidence).......410
Absence of bias (assessment of Crown witnesses).................412
Lack of Unanimity .............................................................414
Assessing Credibility (Or, These Are Not Adaawk and Kungax)...416
Special Rights and Special Evidence ....................................420
Conclusion — Backlash Against the Positive Assessment of Indigenous Oral Evidence in Delgamuukw .................421
Indigenous Laws: Rooted in the Living Cultures of Indigenous Peoples and Territories ........................................421
An Unfulfilled Promise: Still Fighting to Make Space for Indigenous Legal Traditions ........................................423

PART IV
TREATY-MAKING AND SPECIFIC CLAIMS

Chapter 16  Cede, Release and Surrender: Treaty-Making, the Aboriginal Perspective and the Great Juridical Oxymoron Or Let’s Face It – It Didn’t Happen
Peter W. Hutchins .................................................................431
Introduction — A Proposition So Odious ...............................432
The Pledged Word ...............................................................435
Delgamuukw — A Moral, Philosophical and Jural Compass ....439
The Supreme Court of Canada Has Prepared the Way ..........441
The Golden Thread of Continuity .........................................445
The Supreme Court of Canada’s Recognition of the Aboriginal Perspective and Its Significance to a New Direction ......450
Reading Down — Reading Out .............................................453
Home Thoughts from Abroad ..............................................454
Conclusion — A Willingness to Relent ..................................461
Chapter 17 The Promise of Delgamuukw and the Reality of Treaty Negotiations in British Columbia

Murray Browne

Introduction ......................................................... 465
The Promise of Delgamuukw for Treaty Negotiations .......... 467
The Text in Modern Treaties: A Long and Winding Road .... 468
Summary of Current Government Treaty Mandates .......... 470

Land ........................................................................ 471
  Government land mandates ........................................ 471
Capital Transfer (Cash) .............................................. 472
  Government mandates for capital transfer (cash) negotiations. . 472
Aboriginal Rights ..................................................... 473
  Government mandates for Aboriginal rights .................. 474
Governance and Jurisdiction ....................................... 474
  Government mandates on governance and jurisdiction .... 475
Tax ....................................................................... 475
  Government mandates on tax ..................................... 476
Fiscal ...................................................................... 476
  Government fiscal mandates ..................................... 478

The Lowest Common Denominator: Is British Columbia the Worst Place in Canada to Negotiate? .......... 478

Land ........................................................................ 481
Constitutional Status of Treaty Lands ......................... 481
Title to Submerged Lands .......................................... 482
Co-Management ....................................................... 482
Environmental Assessment ........................................ 482
Cumulative Impact Monitoring and Management .......... 483
Protection of Water Rights ......................................... 483
Rights of First Refusal ............................................... 483
Commercial Fishing and Hunting Rights ..................... 483
Exclusive First Nation Laws ....................................... 484
Secure Own Source Revenue (OSR) Agreements .......... 484
Compensation ............................................................ 485
Revenue-Sharing ....................................................... 485

Legal or Political: Is the Crown Under Any Legal Obligation to Negotiate? ........ 486
Tsilhqot’in ................................................................ 487
Sparrow .................................................................. 488
Delgamuukw ............................................................ 489
Gitanyow ................................................................. 491
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Huu-Ay-Aht ................................................................. 492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haida ................................................................. 493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Stakes Are High and the Honour of the Crown Is at Stake ........ 496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Process of Negotiation ........................................ 497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Room at the Inn (to Negotiate)/The Creation of the Common Table ........................................ 497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Nations Take Governments to Task on Task Force Report .... 499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Problems with the Process ...................................... 501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government mandates are set behind the scenes .......... 501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The process is unbalanced ........................................... 502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no resort to the courts or an outside arbitrator ... 502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does the Duty to Consult Apply to Treaty Negotiations? .......... 502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion ...................................................................... 505</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 18  Specific Claims: Past, Present and Future**

_Allan Donovan_ ........................................................................ 507

| Introduction ................................................................. 507 |
| The Idea of a Specific Claims Process ............................ 508 |
| The Reality of the Specific Claims Process ....................... 510 |
| Specific Claims Reform ................................................ 515 |
| Generally ......................................................................... 515 |
| Specific Claims Resolution Act (Bill C-6) ......................... 515 |
| Specific Claims Tribunal Act (Bill C-30) ......................... 516 |
| Conclusion ...................................................................... 518 |

**Index** .............................................................................. 519