# Contents

*Table of Cases*  
Table of Cases xvi

*List of Documents*  
List of Documents xxvii

## 1. Introduction  
1. The growing relevance of prosecution in international law 1  
2. Impunity, amnesties, and flawed criminal proceedings 5  
3. Methodology and course of analysis 8

## 2. Prosecution under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights  
1. The duty to bring perpetrators of human rights violations to justice 12  
2. Justifying the duty to bring to justice 15  
3. Victims' rights 17  
   A. The right to a fair trial 18  
   B. The prohibition of retroactive criminal laws 19  
   C. Remedial rights 20  
   D. Punishment as retrospective protection 22  
4. New developments 22  
5. Inconsistencies and the need for a solid conceptualization 25

## 3. The required sanctions 27

## 4. Who needs to be punished? 31

## 5. Related duties 34  
1. Duty to investigate 34  
2. Compensation for victims 36

## 6. Amnesties under the Covenant 37  
1. The right to an effective remedy including compensation 38  
2. The duty to prosecute 40  
   A. Prosecution versus reconciliation? 41  
   B. Human rights violations which cannot be amnestied 43

## 7. Conclusion and outlook 46  
1. The scope of the obligation to prosecute 46
Contents

2. The underlying rationale  46
3. Amnesties  47

3. Prosecution under the American Convention on Human Rights  51
1. The duty to punish  53
2. Justifying the duty to punish  55
   1. Punishment as general human rights protection  55
   2. Victims' rights  56
      A. Punishment as retrospective protection  56
      B. The right to a fair trial  59
         a. The interpretation by the Commission and the Court  59
         b. Evaluation  62
      C. Remedial rights  64
      D. The right to justice  66
3. Related duties  68
   1. Investigation and the right to truth  68
   2. Humane treatment  71
4. Standards for the conduct of criminal proceedings  71
   1. The crimes to be prosecuted  72
   2. Investigation  72
   3. Criminal proceedings  74
      A. Trial stage  74
         a. Trial before regular courts  74
         b. Expeditious trial  76
         c. Evaluation of evidence  76
         d. Sentence  77
         e. The rights of the accused  78
      B. Post-trial stage  79
5. Statutes of limitation  79
6. Extradition for serious human right violations  81
7. The role of the Inter-American Court in criminal cases  82
   1. The supervisory function of the Court  82
   2. The power of the Court to order investigation and
      punishment under article 63  82
8. Amnesties under the American Convention  85
   1. The developing interpretation by the Inter-American Commission  85
      A. The flexible approach  85
      B. The influence of the Velásquez Rodríguez Case  86
      C. Limiting the scope for amnesties  87
      D. The struggle between justice and political considerations  90
      E. The right to justice as the decisive factor in the
         evaluation of amnesties  91
      F. Absolute prohibition of amnesties as the current position  94
      G. Summary  96
2. The jurisprudence of the Inter-American Court 97
   A. The Castillo Píez Case 97
   B. The Barrios Altos Case: prohibition of self-amnesties 100
   C. The role of truth commissions 102
   D. The current position: absolute prohibition of amnesties? 102

9. Conclusion and outlook 105

4. Prosecution under the European Convention on Human Rights 111
   1. The duty to have recourse to criminal law 112
      1. The duty to criminalize serious offences 112
      2. The duty to establish a criminal-law machinery and conduct criminal proceedings 114
   2. Justifying the duty to criminalize, investigate, and prosecute 116
      1. Procedural protection: criminalization and prosecution as general human rights protection 116
      2. Prosecution and its relevance for individual rights 120
   3. Victims’ rights 121
      A. The right to a fair trial 121
      B. The strict denial of a right to justice 123
      C. Remedial rights: the right to an investigation 124
      D. Retrospective protection 126
      E. Distinguishing retrospective protection from remedial rights 130
      F. Humane treatment 132
   3. Standards for the conduct of criminal proceedings 132
      1. Independent and effective criminal investigation 133
      2. Taking and evaluation of evidence 134
      3. Expedience of investigation 136
      4. Transparency 137
      5. Trial and punishment 137
      6. Involvement of victims in criminal proceedings 138
      7. Enforcement of criminal sentences 139
   4. The role of the European Court of Human Rights 140
   5. Amnesties 141
   6. Conclusion and outlook 146

5. Universal Human Rights Conventions Explicitly Requiring Prosecution 153
   1. The scope of criminal obligations 153
      2. The Convention against Torture 158
      3. The Conventions on Slavery, Traffic in Persons, Exploitation of Prostitution and Apartheid 168
4. The scope of the Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity 170
5. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination 172
6. International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances 175

2. Comparative analysis 183

6. Conceptualizing the Duty to Prosecute under Human Rights Treaties 189

1. Comparing different approaches to prosecution and investigation 189
   1. Rationalizing the call for prosecution 190
      A. The right to justice controversy 190
      B. Remedies 191
   2. Rationalizing the right to an investigation 193

2. Significance of the legal rationale 194

3. Evaluation: the duty to prosecute and its proper legal rationale 196
   1. Prosecution as a matter of human rights law 197
      A. The ‘respect and ensure’ provisions 198
         a. Prosecution as prevention 198
         b. Retrospective protection of substantive rights 204
      B. The right to an effective remedy 206
   2. Evaluation of amnesties 214

4. Summary: suggestions for future conceptualization 222

7. Prosecution of Human Rights Violations under Customary International Law 229

1. The protection of aliens 230
   1. The duty to punish injuries to aliens 230
   2. Amnesties for injuries to aliens 232
   3. Applicability to human rights violations 233

2. The rules of State responsibility 234
   1. Punishment under the rules of State responsibility 235
   2. Human rights and State responsibility 238
      A. The controversial individual right to reparation 240
      B. Punishment as an emerging or de lege ferenda form of reparation? 244
   3. Conclusion 247

3. International individual criminal responsibility 248

4. Universal jurisdiction 254

5. Aut dedere aut judicare 257
6. State international criminal responsibility? 261
7. The relevance of treaties providing for a duty to prosecute 263
8. The relevance of non-binding documents 266
9. Current State practice 268
   1. Limiting the option for amnesties internationally 269
   2. Domestic State practice 273
   3. Human rights violations outside the scope of international crimes 274
10. General principles of law 277
11. Conclusions 277

8. Conclusion 281
   1. Role of prosecution for the protection of human rights 281
   2. Amnesties and the way forward 285
   3. Human rights and international criminal law 289

Bibliography 295
Index 305