The Treatment of Prisoners under International Law

Third Edition

SIR NIGEL RODLEY
School of Law, University of Essex
with
MATT POLLARD
School of Law, University of Essex

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

Selected Abbreviations xix
Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments xxi
Table of Cases xxxix

General Introduction 1

1. The Development of an International Law of Human Rights Applicable to Prisoners 1
2. The Nature and Scope of the Problem 8
   2.1 Torture and other ill-treatment 8
   2.2 Executions 12
   2.3 Enforced disappearances 13
   2.4 Prison conditions 14
3. The Inherent Dignity of the Enemy 15
4. The Approach 16

1. The Response of the United Nations General Assembly to the Challenge of Torture 18
   1. Introduction 18
   2. Discussion of Torture at the UN General Assembly 1973–1975 20
      2.1 Resolution 3059 (XXVIII) of 2 November 1973 20
      2.2 Resolution 3218 (XXIX) of 6 November 1974 23
      2.3 The Fifth UN Congress on the Prevention of Crime and the Treatment of Offenders (1975)
         2.3.1 Changes in definition 29
         2.3.2 International prohibition of torture 31
         2.3.3 Effective measures by states 31
         2.3.4 Implementation 33
      2.4 Resolution 3452 (XXX) of 9 December 1975—The Declaration against Torture 35
   3. Developments Following the Adoption of the Declaration against Torture 36
      3.1 Resolution 3453 (XXX) of 9 December 1975
         3.1.1 Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment 37
         3.1.2 Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials 38
         3.1.3 Principles of Medical Ethics 38
         3.1.4 Implementation 38
## Contents

3.2 Resolutions 32/62, 32/63, and 32/64 of 8 December 1977 39
3.2.1 A convention against torture 40
3.2.2 Questionnaire on the Declaration against Torture 41
3.2.3 Unilateral declarations against torture 42

4. Summary 43

2. The Legal Prohibition of Torture and Other Ill-treatment 45
   1. Introduction 45
   2. Treaties Prohibiting Torture and Other Ill-treatment 46
      2.1 The UN Convention against Torture 47
      2.2 The OAS Convention against Torture 50
      2.3 The human rights treaties 53
         2.3.1 The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 53
         2.3.2 Specific human rights treaties of universal applicability 56
         2.3.3 Regional human rights treaties 58
      2.4 The humanitarian law treaties 59
         2.4.1 Common article 3 and Protocol II 60
         2.4.2 The Geneva Conventions and Protocol I 62
   3. Unilateral Declarations against Torture 64
   4. General International Law and Torture 64
      4.1 The Charter of the United Nations and General Assembly resolutions 66
      4.2 Customary international law 69
      4.3 General principles of law 70
      4.4 Judicial decisions 71
      4.5 Teachings of publicists 77
      4.6 Treaty bodies and other UN experts 79
   5. Summary 80

3. What Constitutes Torture and Other Ill-treatment? 82
   1. Introduction 82
   2. Defining and Distinguishing Torture 85
      2.1 The status of the perpetrator 88
         2.1.1 International human rights law 88
         2.1.2 International criminal law 89
      2.2 Degree of pain or suffering 91
         2.2.1 The cumulative approach 92
         2.2.2 Acts recognised as torture in and of themselves 95
         2.2.3 Psychological torture 97
         2.2.4 Does torture involve aggravated pain or suffering? 98
            2.2.4.1 International human rights law 100
            2.2.4.2 International criminal law 115
      2.3 Purpose 117
         2.3.1 International human rights law 117
         2.3.2 International criminal law 120
## Contents

2.4 Conclusion: torture distinguished from other ill-treatment 122

3. The Scope of ‘Other Prohibited Ill-treatment’ 125
   3.1 General elements of ‘other prohibited ill-treatment’? 126
   3.2 Intentional use of physical force 131
   3.3 Handcuffs and other means of physical restraint 136
   3.4 Strip searches and other potentially humiliating treatment 137
   3.5 Fear and other forms of mental distress 140
   3.6 Conclusion: a definition of ‘other ill-treatment’? 143

4. Summary 143

4. The Legal Consequences of Torture and Other Ill-treatment 145

1. The Legal Consequences of Torture 145
   1.1 State responsibility for torture 145
      1.1.1 Investigation 147
      1.1.2 Bringing to justice 150
      1.1.3 Remedy and reparation
         1.1.3.1 Rehabilitation 156
         1.1.3.2 Compensation 157
         1.1.3.3 Satisfaction 159
      1.1.4 Guarantees of non-repetition 161
      1.1.5 Non-use of information obtained by torture 162
      1.1.6 Non-refoulement 166
      1.1.7 Responsibility of other states 179
   1.2 Individual responsibility for torture 180

2. The Legal Consequences of Other Prohibited Ill-treatment 190

3. Summary 194

5. International Mechanisms against Torture and Other Ill-treatment 195

1. Introduction 195
2. Historical Efforts 198
   2.1 General Assembly questionnaire on torture 198
   2.2 Sub-Commission annual review of prisoners’ rights 199
3. Special Rapporteur on Torture 202
   3.1 Nature and function of the Special Rapporteur 204
4. UN Convention against Torture 208
   4.1 Committee against Torture
      4.1.1 Review of periodic reports 210
      4.1.2 Interstate complaints 214
      4.1.3 Individual complaints 214
      4.1.4 Inquiry into systematic practices of torture 216
5. Voluntary Fund for Victims of Torture
  5.1 Origins of the Fund 220
  5.2 Beneficiaries of the Fund 224
  5.3 Intermediaries 225
  5.4 Country priorities 225
  5.5 Nature of aid 226

6. Mechanisms for Preventing Torture and Other Ill-treatment 228
  6.1 General obligation to prevent torture and other ill-treatment 229
  6.2 European Convention for the Prevention of Torture 231
    6.2.1 History 231
    6.2.2 The Committee 233
    6.2.3 Visits 233
    6.2.4 Publication 235
  6.3 Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture 239
    6.3.1 History 239
    6.3.2 Subcommittee on Prevention 240
    6.3.3 National preventive mechanisms 241
    6.3.4 Visits 241
    6.3.5 Publication 244

7. Summary 244

6. Extra-legal Executions 246
  1. General Prohibition of Murder by Government 246
    1.1 Racially motivated killing and genocide 251
  2. Extra-legal Executions as Arbitrary Deprivations of Life 252
    2.1 Killings as necessary measures of law enforcement 253
    2.2 Killings in non-international armed conflict 260
    2.3 Killings in international armed conflicts 264
  3. Legal Consequences of Extra-legal Executions 266
    3.1 State responsibility 266
    3.2 Individual responsibility 271
  4. International Remedies 275
    4.1 Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions 275

5. Summary 277

7. The Death Penalty 279
  1. Introduction: The Objective of Abolition 279
    1.1 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 283
    1.2 Other UN initiatives 284
      1.2.1 Developments in political bodies 284
      1.2.2 Optional Protocol to the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 287
      1.2.3 Statutes of international criminal tribunals 289
5. International Remedies
   5.1 Working Group on enforced or involuntary disappearances
      5.1.1 The scope of the Working Group's concern
      5.1.2 General approach
      5.1.3 Cases and countries considered
      5.1.4 Sources of information
      5.1.5 Screening of information received/admissibility
      5.1.6 Transmittal of information
      5.1.7 Country visits
      5.1.8 Urgent action
      5.1.9 Annual report
   5.2 Committee on Enforced Disappearances
   6. Summary

9. Conditions of Imprisonment or Detention
   1. The Legal Rules
   2. Institutional Ill-treatment
      2.1 Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners
      2.2 Practice of the Human Rights Committee
         2.2.1 Prison conditions which violate human dignity
      2.3 Prison conditions in the work of European regional bodies
         2.3.1 The Greek Case at the European Commission of Human Rights
         2.3.2 European Court of Human Rights
         2.3.3 Practice of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture
      2.4 Prison conditions in the work of American regional bodies
      2.5 Prison conditions in the work of the African Commission
      2.6 Practice of the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment
   3. Solitary Confinement
   4. Denial or Misuse of Medical Treatment or Other Basic Necessities
   5. Medical or Scientific Experimentation on Human Beings
   6. Other Areas of Possible Abuse of Prisoners
      6.1 Persons detained on mental health grounds
      6.2 Forcible feeding
      6.3 Separation of categories of prisoner
   7. Legal Consequences of Unlawful Conditions of Imprisonment or Detention
   8. International Remedies
   9. Summary
## 10. Corporal Punishment

1. The Geography of Corporal Punishment
2. United Nations Activities Concerning Corporal Punishment
3. International Humanitarian Law
4. International Human Rights Law
5. Summary

## 11. Guarantees against Abuses of the Human Person: Arbitrary Arrest and Detention

1. United Nations Body of Principles
   1.1 Legal assistance
   1.2 Notification of and communication with families
   1.3 Length of interrogation
   1.4 Pre- and post-interrogation medical examinations
   1.5 Record-keeping
   1.6 Appearance before a judge and judicial supervision
   1.7 Challenging the legality of detention and treatment
   1.8 Other aspects of the Body of Principles
2. Incommunicado Detention and Habeas Corpus under Treaty and Customary Law
   2.1 Incommunicado detention under the Covenant
      2.1.1 Requirement of promptness in article 9(3)
      2.1.2 Nature and independence of the authority in article 9(3)
      2.1.3 Application of article 9(3) to criminal matters only
      2.1.4 Other rights implicated by incommunicado detention
   2.2 Habeas corpus under the Covenant
   2.3 Incommunicado detention and habeas corpus under other universal human rights treaties
   2.4 Incommunicado detention and habeas corpus under the regional conventions
      2.4.1 Incommunicado detention
      2.4.2 Habeas corpus
   2.5 General international law
3. States of Emergency
4. Summary

## 12. International Codes of Ethics for Professionals

1. Introduction
2. UN Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials
   2.1 Background
   2.2 Addressees of the Code
   2.3 The scope of the Code
   2.4 Expected response to non-compliance with the Code
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Implementation</td>
<td>505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Training and dissemination</td>
<td>507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Council of Europe Ethical Instruments on the Police</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Code(s) of Military Ethics?</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>UN Principles of Medical Ethics</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Addressees of the Principles</td>
<td>513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>The scope of the Principles</td>
<td>514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Expected response to non-compliance with the Principles</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Implementation</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Training and dissemination</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Ethical Principles for Lawyers?</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Concluding Reflections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annex</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Being Subjected to Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2a.</td>
<td>Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment [excerpts]</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2b.</td>
<td>Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture [excerpts]</td>
<td>548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2c.</td>
<td>European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment [excerpts]</td>
<td>552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2d.</td>
<td>Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment [excerpts]</td>
<td>556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners</td>
<td>562</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment</td>
<td>578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5a.</td>
<td>Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials</td>
<td>587</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5b.</td>
<td>Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials</td>
<td>591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5c.</td>
<td>Declaration on the Police—Part A</td>
<td>596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5d.</td>
<td>European Code of Police Ethics [excerpts]</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6a.</td>
<td>Principles of Medical Ethics relevant to the Role of Health Personnel, particularly Physicians, in the Protection of Prisoners and Detainees against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6b.</td>
<td>Principles on the Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Istanbul Principles)</td>
<td>602</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 8a. Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance 609
Annex 9b. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights [excerpts] 635

Bibliography 645
Index 663