UNIVERSITY OF HAMBURG
SCHOOL OF LAW

THE ARBITRAL DELIMITATION DECISION OF THE ERITREAN–ETHIOPIAN BOUNDARY DISPUTE AND THE POST-DELIMITATION AWARD EVENTS

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO HAMBURG UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF LEGAL SCIENCE

SUPERVISOR: Prof. Dr. Rainer Lagoni

STUDENT: Niway Zergie Aynalem

JANUARY 2008
Table of Contents

Preface.................................................................................................................. i

Abbreviations........................................................................................................ iii

Glossary of Geographic Place Names...................................................................... iv

Introduction........................................................................................................... 1

CHAPTER ONE

The Treaty Background of the Boundary Dispute between Eritrea and Ethiopia

1.1. The Geographical Description of Eritrea and Ethiopia........................................ 6

1.2. The Italian Occupation of Eritrea and Invasion of Ethiopia.................................. 11

1.2.1. The Italian Occupation of Eritrea..................................................................... 11

1.2.2. The Italian Invasion of Ethiopia........................................................................ 14

1.3. The Question of Eritrea vs. the Four Powers and the United Nations....................... 20

1.3.1. The Question of Eritrea vs. the Four Powers...................................................... 20

1.3.2. The Question of Eritrea vs. the United Nations.................................................. 22

1.4. The Federation of Eritrea with Ethiopia and the Restoration of Unity....................... 26

1.5. The 1993 Referendum of Eritrea........................................................................... 29

1.6. The Admission of Eritrea to the United Nations.................................................... 36

1.7. The Peace Process in the 1998 Eritrea-Ethiopia Conflict......................................... 42

1.7.1. The Cause of the Conflict................................................................................. 42
CHAPTER TWO

International Boundary Dispute Arbitration Decision

2.1. Boundary Disputes

2.1.1. International Boundary Disputes in General

2.1.2. African Boundary Disputes in Particular

2.2. Distinction between Delimitation and Demarcation of International Boundaries

2.3. International Boundary Dispute arbitrations

2.4. The Delivery and Enforcement of International Boundary Dispute Arbitral Decisions

2.4.1. The Delivery of International Boundary Dispute Arbitral Decisions

2.4.2. The Enforcement of International Boundary Dispute Arbitral Decisions

2.5. Nullification of International Boundary Dispute Arbitral Awards

CHAPTER THREE

The Arbitral Delimitation Decision of the Eritrean-Ethiopian Boundary Dispute

3.1. The Procedural Laws of the Decision of the EEBC

3.1.1. The EEBC’s Rules of Procedure
CHAPTER FOUR

The Post-Delimitation Award Events of the Eritrean-Ethiopian Boundary Dispute

4.1. Ethiopia's Reaction to the Decision of the EEBC ......................................................... 162

4.1.1. Ethiopia's Request for Interpretation, Correction and Consultation...................... 167

4.1.2. Ethiopia's Comment on the EEBC Decision............................................................... 170

4.1.3. Ethiopia's Call for an Alternative Mechanism........................................................ 173

4.1.4. The Rejection of Ethiopia's Call for an Alternative Mechanism........................... 177

4.1.5. Ethiopia's Five Point Peace Plan proposal................................................................. 181

4.1.5.1. Resolving the Dispute between Ethiopia and Eritrea through Peaceful Means................................................................. 183

4.1.5.2. Resolving the Root Causes of the Conflict through Dialogue with the View to Normalizing Relations between the two Countries................................................................. 184

4.1.5.3. Accepting the EEBC Decision in Principle............................................................ 185

4.1.5.4. Starting Dialogue to implementing the EEBC's decision.................................... 187

4.2. Eritrea's Reactions and Responses............................................................................ 190

4.2.1. Eritrea's Reaction to the Decision of the EEBC ...................................................... 190

4.2.2. Eritrea's Response for Ethiopia's Peace plan Proposal......................................... 191

4.2.3. Eritrea's occupation of the Temporary Security Zone.......................................... 196

4.3. Reports and Resolutions Regarding the Demarcation and Implementation Problems of the EEBC Award................................................................. 198

4.3.1. Demarcation Directions, Orders and Reports of the EEBC ................................ 199

4.3.2. UN Security Council Resolutions ......................................................................... 210
CHAPTER FIVE

Comments on the Ruling of the EEBC on Ethiopia's Request for Interpretation, Correction and Consultation

5.1. The Ruling of the EEBC on Ethiopia's Request for Interpretation, Correction and Consultation ................................................................. 217

5.2. Comments on the Ruling of the EEBC on Ethiopia's Request Interpretation, Correction and Consultation ................................................................. 221

5.2.1. The Rule of Interpretation vs. Ethiopia's Request Interpretation, Correction and Consultation ................................................................. 223

5.2.2. The Rule of Rectification/Correction vs. Ethiopia's Request Interpretation, Correction and Consultation ................................................................. 229

5.2.3. The Rule of Revision vs. Ethiopia's Request Interpretation, Correction and Consultation ................................................................. 232

5.3. Comments on the 'Virtual Demarcation' of the Eritrean-Ethiopian Boundary....... 238

CHAPTER SIX

Comments on the Procedure and Delimitation Decision of the Eritrean-Ethiopian Boundary Dispute

6.1. Comments on the Procedural Laws of the EEBC........................................ 241

6.1.1. The Problems of the Algiers Agreement/ the Compromis under International Law......................................................................................... 243

6.1.2. The Status of the Pertinent Colonial Treaties under International Law........ 248

6.2. Comments on the Award of the EEBC........................................ 265
6.2.1. Fairness and Soundness of the Award of the EEBC ...........................................266

6.2.2. Defects of the Award of the EEBC ........................................................................268

6.2.2.1. Inconsistency in Applying the Applicable International Law ...............................273

A. Inconsistence Application of Effectivités ......................................................................285

B. Inconsistence Application of uti possidetis ..................................................................294

C. Inconsistence Application of Estoppel ..........................................................................301

D. Inconsistence Application of Map Evidences .................................................................310

6.2.2.2. The Unaddressed Questions of the Border People and Division of Towns and
Villages .................................................................................................................................321

6.2.2.3. No Visit to the Border Area ..................................................................................328

6.2.2.4. Insufficient Transparency .....................................................................................331

6.3. The Finality of the Award Vis-à-Vis the Doctrine of Nullification ...............................335

6.4. The Possible Grounds for the Nullification of the Award of the EEBC .......................338

6.4.1. Unreasoned Awards ..................................................................................................339

6.4.2. Systematic Partiality and Inconsistency in Reasoning ..............................................345

6.4.3. Serious Factual Errors ..............................................................................................348

6.4.4. Ultra Petita ..................................................................................................................354

CHAPTER SEVEN

Remedies Available to Eritrea and Ethiopia

7. Remedies Available to Eritrea and Ethiopia .................................................................364