THE LAW OF
RESTITUTION

Third Edition

ANDREW BURROWS
QC (HON), FBA, MA (OXON), BCL, LLM (HARVARD)
Professor of the Law of England and Fellow of All Souls College,
University of Oxford; Honorary Bencher of the Middle Temple
CONTENTS

Table of statutes xv
Table of cases xix

PART ONE  FUNDAMENTAL IDEAS

1  INTRODUCTION TO UNJUST ENRICHMENT AND RESTITUTION  3
   1. Recognition of a law of restitution based on the principle of reversing unjust enrichment 3
   2. Developments since Lipkin Gorman v Karpnale Ltd  5
   3. Restitution of an unjust enrichment and restitution for wrongs  9
   4. Restitution beyond unjust enrichment and wrongs?  12
   5. Restitutionary rights and remedies  14
   6. Common law and equity  25
   7. The essential ingredients of a claim for restitution of an unjust enrichment  26

2  COMPETING THEORIES  28
   1. Implied contract  28
   2. Stoljar's proprietary theory  29
   3. Unjust sacrifice  30
   4. The views of Dietrich, Jackman and Jaffey  31
   5. Hedley's critique  34
   6. The scepticism of the High Court of Australia  35

3  BENEFIT  44
   1. Introduction  44
   2. Objective benefit  45
   3. Overcoming subjective devaluation  47
   4. Subjective overvaluation?  60
   5. Edelman's approach  61
   6. Separation of the benefit and injustice enquiries  62

4  AT THE EXPENSE OF THE CLAIMANT  63
   1. Introduction  63
2. The correspondence question 64
3. The third party question 69

5 UNJUST FACTORS OR ABSENCE OF BASIS? 86
1. Unjust factors 86
2. Absence of basis 95

6 TRACING 117
1. What is tracing? 117
2. Tracing at common law 123
3. Tracing in equity 132
4. Conclusion 143

7 SUBROGATION 144
1. Introduction 144
2. Subrogation to extinguished rights 148
3. Subrogation to subsisting rights 160
4. Conclusion 166

8 PROPRIETARY RESTITUTION 168
1. Introduction 168
2. Newly created, not pre-existing, proprietary rights 168
3. Proprietary rights, after unauthorised substitution, reverse unjust enrichment 169
4. Other examples of proprietary restitution reversing unjust enrichment 171
5. What is the justification for proprietary restitution? 173
6. Critics rejecting the unjust enrichment analysis of proprietary restitution 181
7. McFarlane's re-analysis of equitable proprietary rights under a trust 191
8. The contrast with the approach in the United States 193
9. Does retention of title preclude unjust enrichment? 194

PART TWO UNJUST FACTORS

9 MISTAKE 201
1. Introduction 201
2. Mistaken payments 203
CONTENTS xi

3. Benefits in kind rendered by mistake 237
4. Rescission of an executed contract entered into by mistake 243

10 DURESS 255
1. Introduction 255
2. Duress of the person 263
3. Duress of goods 264
4. Illegitimate threats (other than by a public authority ultra vires) made to support a demand for payment in excess of what is permitted by statute 266
5. Economic duress 267
6. Illegitimate threats to prosecute or sue or publish information 280

11 UNDUE INFLUENCE 283
1. Introduction 283
2. Actual undue influence 292
3. Presumed undue influence 293

12 EXPLOITATION OF WEAKNESS 300
1. Introduction 300
2. Exploitation of the claimant's mental weakness 301
3. Exploitation of the claimant's circumstantial weakness (ie, difficult circumstances) 306
4. Illegality designed to protect a vulnerable class from exploitation 307
5. Conclusion 309

13 HUMAN INCAPACITY 311
1. Infancy 311
2. Mental incapacity and drunkenness 314

14 FAILURE OF CONSIDERATION I 318
1. Introduction 318
2. What is meant by failure of consideration? 319
3. Is it a prerequisite for failure of consideration that any relevant contract be ineffective? 327
4. Should it be necessary for the failure of consideration to be total? 330
5. Is free acceptance an unjust factor? 334
15 FAILURE OF CONSIDERATION II 340
1. Introduction 340
2. Contracts discharged for breach 341
3. Contracts discharged by frustration 361
4. Incomplete or anticipated contracts 371
5. Contracts unenforceable for want of formality 381
6. Void contracts 385
7. Failure of consideration as the failure of an unpromised future event 398
8. Proprietary restitution in respect of payments made for a failed consideration 399

16 IGNORANCE 403
1. The argument for recognising ignorance 403
2. Two-party cases 409
3. Standard three-party cases: X transfers C's property, or its substitute, to D 409
4. Other three-party cases 431
5. Proprietary restitution in respect of property transferred without the owner’s knowledge 432
6. Conclusion 434

17 LEGAL COMPULSION: COMPULSORY DISCHARGE OF ANOTHER'S LEGAL LIABILITY 436
1. Introduction 436
2. Legal compulsion: restitution by recoupment 440
3. Legal compulsion: restitution by contribution 455
4. When does payment of another’s debt discharge that debt? 460

18 NECESSITY 469
1. Introduction 469
2. The case law granting a remedy to the necessitous intervener 470
3. Authorities hostile to the necessitous intervener 478
4. An unjust enrichment analysis 479
5. Conclusion 486

19 ILLEGALITY 488
1. Illegality as a ground for restitution and illegality as a defence 488
2. Encouraging the abandonment of an illegal purpose: withdrawal in the locus poenitentiae 489
CONTENTS

20 PUBLIC AUTHORITY ULTRA VRIES EXACTION AND PAYMENT 498
1. Ultra vires exaction by a public authority 498
2. Ultra vires payment by a public authority 517

PART THREE DEFENCES

21 CHANGE OF POSITION, ESTOPPEL, AND THE DEFENCE OF AGENCY 523
1. Introduction to defences 523
2. Change of position 524
3. Estoppel 550
4. Agency as a defence 558

22 OTHER DEFENCES 569
1. Counter-restitution 569
2. Bona fide purchase from a third party 573
3. Incapacity as a defence 581
4. Illegality as a defence 588
5. Dispute resolved 601
6. Limitation 604
7. Passing on 614

PART FOUR RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

23 INTRODUCTION TO RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS 621
1. Introduction 621
2. What is a civil wrong? 622
3. Concurrent liability 623
4. Classification 625
5. Causation 625
6. Enrichment 626
7. Restitutionary rights and remedies 627
8. Compensation and restitution for a wrong? 627
9. Multiple defendants 629
10. Multiple claimants 630
11. Edelman’s thesis 633
12. Compensation for a lost opportunity to bargain? 635
13. Stevens’ substitutive damages thesis 638
14. Restitution for crimes 640

24 RESTITUTION FOR TORTS 642
1. Meaning of ‘waiver of tort’ 642
2. Case law supporting restitution for torts 643
3. Some significant anti-restitution cases? 654
4. What should the law be on restitution for torts? 659

25 RESTITUTION FOR BREACH OF CONTRACT 663
1. Restitution for a wrong and restitution of an unjust enrichment 663
2. The law prior to Blake: no restitution subject to a rare exception 664
3. Attorney General v Blake 668
4. Cases subsequent to Blake 671
5. Conclusion on the law subsequent to Blake 676

26 RESTITUTION FOR EQUITABLE WRONGS 678
1. Introduction 678
2. Restitution for breach of fiduciary duty 680
3. Restitution for breach of confidence 689
4. Conclusion 694

27 DEFENCES TO RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS 696
1. Change of position? 697
2. Incapacity as a defence to restitution for wrongs 700
3. Limitation 703

PART FIVE CONFLICT OF LAWS

28 THE CONFLICT OF LAWS 709
1. Jurisdiction 709
2. Choice of law 715

Index 723