

THE LAW OF RESTITUTION

Third Edition

ANDREW BURROWS

QC (HON), FBA, MA (OXON), BCL, LL.M (HARVARD)

*Professor of the Law of England and Fellow of All Souls College,
University of Oxford; Honorary Bencher of the Middle Temple*

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Table of statutes</i>	xv
<i>Table of cases</i>	xix

PART ONE FUNDAMENTAL IDEAS

1 INTRODUCTION TO UNJUST ENRICHMENT AND RESTITUTION	3
1. Recognition of a law of restitution based on the principle of reversing unjust enrichment	3
2. Developments since <i>Lipkin Gorman v Karpnale Ltd</i>	5
3. Restitution of an unjust enrichment and restitution for wrongs	9
4. Restitution beyond unjust enrichment and wrongs?	12
5. Restitutionary rights and remedies	14
6. Common law and equity	25
7. The essential ingredients of a claim for restitution of an unjust enrichment	26
2 COMPETING THEORIES	28
1. Implied contract	28
2. Stoljar's proprietary theory	29
3. Unjust sacrifice	30
4. The views of Dietrich, Jackman and Jaffey	31
5. Hedley's critique	34
6. The scepticism of the High Court of Australia	35
3 BENEFIT	44
1. Introduction	44
2. Objective benefit	45
3. Overcoming subjective devaluation	47
4. Subjective overvaluation?	60
5. Edelman's approach	61
6. Separation of the benefit and injustice enquiries	62
4 AT THE EXPENSE OF THE CLAIMANT	63
1. Introduction	63

2. The correspondence question	64
3. The third party question	69
5 UNJUST FACTORS OR ABSENCE OF BASIS?	86
1. Unjust factors	86
2. Absence of basis	95
6 TRACING	117
1. What is tracing?	117
2. Tracing at common law	123
3. Tracing in equity	132
4. Conclusion	143
7 SUBROGATION	144
1. Introduction	144
2. Subrogation to extinguished rights	148
3. Subrogation to subsisting rights	160
4. Conclusion	166
8 PROPRIETARY RESTITUTION	168
1. Introduction	168
2. Newly created, not pre-existing, proprietary rights	168
3. Proprietary rights, after unauthorised substitution, reverse unjust enrichment	169
4. Other examples of proprietary restitution reversing unjust enrichment	171
5. What is the justification for proprietary restitution?	173
6. Critics rejecting the unjust enrichment analysis of proprietary restitution	181
7. McFarlane's re-analysis of equitable proprietary rights under a trust	191
8. The contrast with the approach in the United States	193
9. Does retention of title preclude unjust enrichment?	194

PART TWO UNJUST FACTORS

9 MISTAKE	201
1. Introduction	201
2. Mistaken payments	203

3. Benefits in kind rendered by mistake	237
4. Rescission of an executed contract entered into by mistake	243
10 DURESS	255
1. Introduction	255
2. Duress of the person	263
3. Duress of goods	264
4. Illegitimate threats (other than by a public authority <i>ultra vires</i>) made to support a demand for payment in excess of what is permitted by statute	266
5. Economic duress	267
6. Illegitimate threats to prosecute or sue or publish information	280
11 UNDUE INFLUENCE	283
1. Introduction	283
2. Actual undue influence	292
3. Presumed undue influence	293
12 EXPLOITATION OF WEAKNESS	300
1. Introduction	300
2. Exploitation of the claimant's mental weakness	301
3. Exploitation of the claimant's circumstantial weakness (ie, difficult circumstances)	306
4. Illegality designed to protect a vulnerable class from exploitation	307
5. Conclusion	309
13 HUMAN INCAPACITY	311
1. Infancy	311
2. Mental incapacity and drunkenness	314
14 FAILURE OF CONSIDERATION I	318
1. Introduction	318
2. What is meant by failure of consideration?	319
3. Is it a prerequisite for failure of consideration that any relevant contract be ineffective?	327
4. Should it be necessary for the failure of consideration to be total?	330
5. Is free acceptance an unjust factor?	334

15	FAILURE OF CONSIDERATION II	340
	1. Introduction	340
	2. Contracts discharged for breach	341
	3. Contracts discharged by frustration	361
	4. Incomplete or anticipated contracts	371
	5. Contracts unenforceable for want of formality	381
	6. Void contracts	385
	7. Failure of consideration as the failure of an unpromised future event	398
	8. Proprietary restitution in respect of payments made for a failed consideration	399
16	IGNORANCE	403
	1. The argument for recognising ignorance	403
	2. Two-party cases	409
	3. Standard three-party cases: X transfers C's property, or its substitute, to D	409
	4. Other three-party cases	431
	5. Proprietary restitution in respect of property transferred without the owner's knowledge	432
	6. Conclusion	434
17	LEGAL COMPULSION: COMPULSORY DISCHARGE OF ANOTHER'S LEGAL LIABILITY	436
	1. Introduction	436
	2. Legal compulsion: restitution by recoupment	440
	3. Legal compulsion: restitution by contribution	455
	4. When does payment of another's debt discharge that debt?	460
18	NECESSITY	469
	1. Introduction	469
	2. The case law granting a remedy to the necessitous intervener	470
	3. Authorities hostile to the necessitous intervener	478
	4. An unjust enrichment analysis	479
	5. Conclusion	486
19	ILLEGALITY	488
	1. Illegality as a ground for restitution and illegality as a defence	488
	2. Encouraging the abandonment of an illegal purpose: withdrawal in the <i>locus poenitentiae</i>	489

20 PUBLIC AUTHORITY ULTRA VIRES EXACTION AND PAYMENT	498
1. Ultra vires exaction by a public authority	498
2. Ultra vires payment by a public authority	517

PART THREE DEFENCES

21 CHANGE OF POSITION, ESTOPPEL, AND THE DEFENCE OF AGENCY	523
1. Introduction to defences	523
2. Change of position	524
3. Estoppel	550
4. Agency as a defence	558
22 OTHER DEFENCES	569
1. Counter-restitution	569
2. Bona fide purchase from a third party	573
3. Incapacity as a defence	581
4. Illegality as a defence	588
5. Dispute resolved	601
6. Limitation	604
7. Passing on	614

PART FOUR RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

23 INTRODUCTION TO RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS	621
1. Introduction	621
2. What is a civil wrong?	622
3. Concurrent liability	623
4. Classification	625
5. Causation	625
6. Enrichment	626
7. Restitutionary rights and remedies	627
8. Compensation <i>and</i> restitution for a wrong?	627
9. Multiple defendants	629
10. Multiple claimants	630
11. Edelman's thesis	633
12. Compensation for a lost opportunity to bargain?	635

13. Stevens' substitutive damages thesis	638
14. Restitution for crimes	640
24 RESTITUTION FOR TORTS	642
1. Meaning of 'waiver of tort'	642
2. Case law supporting restitution for torts	643
3. Some significant anti-restitution cases?	654
4. What should the law be on restitution for torts?	659
25 RESTITUTION FOR BREACH OF CONTRACT	663
1. Restitution for a wrong and restitution of an unjust enrichment	663
2. The law prior to <i>Blake</i> : no restitution subject to a rare exception	664
3. <i>Attorney General v Blake</i>	668
4. Cases subsequent to <i>Blake</i>	671
5. Conclusion on the law subsequent to <i>Blake</i>	676
26 RESTITUTION FOR EQUITABLE WRONGS	678
1. Introduction	678
2. Restitution for breach of fiduciary duty	680
3. Restitution for breach of confidence	689
4. Conclusion	694
27 DEFENCES TO RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS	696
1. Change of position?	697
2. Incapacity as a defence to restitution for wrongs	700
3. Limitation	703
<hr/>	
PART FIVE CONFLICT OF LAWS	
28 THE CONFLICT OF LAWS	709
1. Jurisdiction	709
2. Choice of law	715
<i>Index</i>	723