# Contents

**Foreword**  
*page xv*

**Table of Authorities**  
*xviii*

1 An overview of crimes under international law  
1.1 Legal sources for definitions of crimes under international law  
1.2 Structure of crimes under international law  

2 Crimes against humanity  
2.1 Evolution of crimes against humanity  
2.1.1 Development through the Second World War  
2.1.2 Post-Second World War development  
2.1.3 Developments through the *ad hoc* Tribunals and beyond  

2.2 Elements of crimes against humanity  
2.2.1 Requirements unique to the *ad hoc* tribunals  
2.2.1.1 ICTY: armed conflict as a jurisdictional requirement  
2.2.1.2 ICTR: discriminatory basis as a jurisdictional requirement  

2.2.2 General requirements  
2.2.2.1 Preliminary question: whose conduct and mental state may satisfy the contextual general requirements?  
2.2.2.2 The attack requirement  
2.2.2.3 The targeting requirement  
2.2.2.3.1 The definition of a ‘civilian’  
2.2.2.3.2 The definition of a ‘civilian population’  
2.2.2.3.3 The meaning of ‘directed against’
## 2.2.3 Underlying offences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.1</td>
<td>Murder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.2</td>
<td>Extermination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.3</td>
<td>Enslavement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.4</td>
<td>Deportation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.4.1</td>
<td>The displacement of persons was caused by expulsion or other coercive acts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.4.2</td>
<td>The persons displaced were lawfully present in the area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.4.3</td>
<td>The displacement occurred without grounds permitted under international law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.4.4</td>
<td>Is intent that the removal be permanent an element of forcible displacement?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.4.5</td>
<td>Additional element for deportation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.5</td>
<td>Imprisonment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.6</td>
<td>Torture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.6.1</td>
<td>The severity requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.6.2</td>
<td>The prohibited purpose requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.7</td>
<td>Rape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.8</td>
<td>Persecution on political, racial, and religious grounds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.8.1</td>
<td>Specific requirements for persecution as a crime against humanity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.8.7</td>
<td>The equal gravity requirement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.8.8</td>
<td>The requirement of discrimination 'in fact'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3.8.9</td>
<td>The discriminatory intent requirement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

3.2.1.2.3 Definitions of the protected group and the targeted group 168
3.2.1.3 Requirement of actual membership in the group? 173

3.2.2 Underlying offences 176
3.2.2.1 Killing 178
   3.2.2.1.1 Physical elements 178
   3.2.2.1.2 Mental element 178
3.2.2.2 Causing serious bodily or mental harm 181
   3.2.2.2.1 Physical elements 181
   3.2.2.2.2 Mental element 183
3.2.2.3 Deliberate infliction of eventually destructive conditions of life 183
   3.2.2.3.1 Examples of qualifying conduct 183
   3.2.2.3.2 Mental element? 186
3.2.2.4 Prevention of births 186
   3.2.2.4.1 Examples of qualifying conduct 186
   3.2.2.4.2 Mental element? 187
3.2.2.5 Forcible transfer of children 187
   3.2.2.5.1 Mental element? 188

3.3 Elements of conspiracy to commit genocide 188
3.4 Elements of direct and public incitement to commit genocide 191
3.5 Elements of attempt to commit genocide 197
3.6 Genocide in The International Criminal Court and Internationalised Tribunals 198
   3.6.1 The International Criminal Court 198
      3.6.1.1 The Rome Statute 198
      3.6.1.2 The Elements of Crimes 201
   3.6.2 The Internationalised Tribunals 206
      3.6.2.1 Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) 206
      3.6.2.2 East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC) 206
      3.6.2.3 The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC) 207
      3.6.2.4 Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) (also known as the Iraqi High Tribunal (IHT)) 210

4 War crimes 213
   4.1 Evolution of war crimes 219
      4.1.1 Ancient to modern conceptions of war crimes 219
4.1.2 The birth of modern international humanitarian law sanctioning war crimes  223
4.1.3 The distinction between international and non-international armed conflict in war crimes law  227
4.1.4 Contribution of the *ad hoc* Tribunals to the development of war crimes law  230

4.2 Elements of war crimes  232

4.2.1 General requirements for war crimes  232

4.2.1.1 Existence of an armed conflict  233

4.2.1.1.1 Is knowledge of the existence of the armed conflict an element of war crimes?  236

4.2.1.2 Nexus between the underlying offence and the armed conflict  239

4.2.1.3 Additional general requirements for grave breaches of the Geneva conventions: war crimes committed in international armed conflict  243

4.2.1.3.1 The requirement of an international armed conflict  244

Knowledge of the nature of the armed conflict  248

4.2.1.3.2 The protected persons or property requirement  250

4.2.1.4 Additional general requirement for violations of *Common* Article 3 and Additional Protocol II under Article 4 of the ICTR Statute: war crimes committed in non-international armed conflict  256

4.2.1.5 Additional general requirements for violations of the laws or customs of war under Article 3 of the ICTY Statute: war crimes committed in any armed conflict  258

4.2.1.5.1 The alleged underlying offence infringes a rule of customary or conventional international humanitarian law  260

4.2.1.5.2 The violation is ‘serious’  262
4.2.1.5.3 The violation of the rule entails the individual criminal responsibility of the person breaching the rule 262
4.2.1.5.4 Knowledge of status of targets of underlying offences 263

4.2.2 Underlying offences 263
4.2.2.1 Destruction of property 264
  4.2.2.1.1 Extensive destruction under Article 2(d) of ICTY Statute 264
  4.2.2.1.2 Wanton destruction and unjustified devastation under Article 3(b) of the ICTY Statute 266
  4.2.2.1.3 Destruction or wilful damage to institutions dedicated to religion, charity and education, the arts and sciences, historic monuments and works of art and science under Article 3(d) 268
  4.2.2.2 Hostage-taking 270
  4.2.2.3 Inhuman treatment or cruel treatment 271
  4.2.2.4 Murder or wilful killing 273
  4.2.2.5 Outrages upon personal dignity 275
  4.2.2.6 Plunder, pillage, or extensive appropriation 278
  4.2.2.7 Rape 280
  4.2.2.8 Slavery or unlawful labour 281
  4.2.2.9 Terror 281
  4.2.2.10 Torture 284
  4.2.2.11 Unlawful attack on civilians and civilian objects 285
  4.2.2.12 Unlawful confinement 287
  4.2.2.13 Unlawful deportation or transfer 288
  4.2.2.14 Violence to life and person 288
  4.2.2.15 Wilfully causing great suffering or serious injury to body or health 290
  4.2.2.16 Other underlying offences 290

4.3 War crimes in the International Criminal Court and Internationalised Tribunals 291
4.3.1 The International Criminal Court 291
  4.3.1.1 The Rome Statute 291
  4.3.1.2 The Elements of Crimes 297
## Contents

4.3.2 The Internationalised Tribunals
- 4.3.2.1 Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) 304
- 4.3.2.2 East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC) 310
- 4.3.2.3 The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC) 312
- 4.3.2.4 Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) (also known as the Iraqi High Tribunal (IHT)) 314

5 Cumulative convictions and sentencing
- 5.1 Cumulative and alternative charging 319
- 5.2 Cumulative convictions 324
  - 5.2.1 Pre-Čelebići jurisprudence 324
  - 5.2.2 The February 2001 Čelebići appeal judgement 326
  - 5.2.3 Application of the Čelebići test to different statutory crimes (‘inter-article’ convictions) 331
  - 5.2.4 Application of the Čelebići test to different underlying offences of the same statutory crime (‘intra-article’ convictions) 334
    - 5.2.4.1 Intra-article convictions for crimes against humanity 335
    - 5.2.4.2 Intra-article convictions for war crimes 348
    - 5.2.4.3 Intra-article convictions for genocide 349
  - 5.2.5 Effect of trial chamber error in failing to convict cumulatively when cumulative convictions are available 354
- 5.3 Sentencing 356
  - 5.3.1 No coherent sentencing practice 359
  - 5.3.2 No hierarchy of crimes 363
  - 5.3.3 The Appeals Chamber’s interference in sentence determination by trial chambers 367

6 Conclusion 370
- 6.1 The content and context of international crimes 371
  - 6.1.1 Definitions of the crimes should not refer only to the accused or the physical perpetrator 372
  - 6.1.2 The elements of the crimes and the elements of the forms of responsibility answer separate legal inquiries 373
  - 6.1.3 Judgements should specify, in their dispositions, the precise conduct for which the accused has been convicted 374
- 6.2 The relative importance of the crimes in the different courts and tribunals 375
6.3 Variations in the definitions of crimes in the different courts and tribunals 379

6.4 The need for a more coherent conviction and sentencing practice 383

Annex: Elements of core international crimes and sample combinations with forms of responsibility 387

1. Common underlying offences 390
   1.1 Arbitrary deprivation of liberty 390
   1.2 Destruction of real or personal property 390
   1.3 Forcible displacement 390
   1.4 Murder 391
   1.5 Rape 391
   1.6 Torture 391

2. Crimes against humanity 391
   2.1 General requirements for crimes against humanity 391
   2.2 Murder as a crime against humanity 392
   2.3 Extermination as a crime against humanity 392
   2.4 Enslavement as a crime against humanity 392
   2.5 Deportation as a crime against humanity 393
   2.6 Imprisonment as a crime against humanity 393
   2.7 Torture as a crime against humanity 393
   2.8 Rape as a crime against humanity 393
   2.9 Persecution as a crime against humanity 394
   2.10 Other inhumane acts as crimes against humanity 396

3. Genocide and related crimes 397
   3.1 General requirements for genocide 397
   3.2 Genocide by killing 397
   3.3 Genocide by causing serious bodily harm 397
   3.4 Genocide by causing serious mental harm 398
   3.5 Genocide by deliberate infliction of eventually destructive conditions of life 398
   3.6 Genocide by prevention of births 398
   3.7 Genocide by forcibly transferring children to another group 399
   3.8 Conspiracy to commit genocide 399
   3.9 Direct and public incitement to commit genocide 399
   3.10 Attempt to commit genocide 399

4. War crimes 399
   4.1 General requirements for all war crimes 399
   4.2 Additional general requirements for grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions of 1949 400
4.3 Additional general requirements for war crimes arising from breaches of Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions ('Common Article 3') or Additional Protocol II to the Geneva Conventions ('Additional Protocol II')

4.4 Additional general requirements for violations of the laws or customs of war under Article 3 of the ICTY Statute

4.5 ‘Extensive destruction of property, not justified by military necessity and carried out unlawfully and wantonly’ as a grave breach

4.6 ‘Wanton destruction’ of property as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.7 ‘Unjustified devastation’ of property as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.8 ‘Destruction or wilful damage to institutions dedicated to religion, charity and education, the arts and sciences, historic monuments and works of art and science’ as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.9 Hostage-taking as a grave breach

4.10 Hostage-taking as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.11 Inhuman treatment as a grave breach

4.12 Cruel treatment as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.13 Wilful killing as a grave breach

4.14 Murder as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.15 Outrages upon personal dignity as a violation of Additional Protocol II / the laws or customs of war

4.16 ‘Extensive appropriation of property, not justified by military necessity and carried out unlawfully and wantonly’ as a grave breach

4.17 Plunder as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.18 Rape as a grave breach

4.19 Rape as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.20 Slavery as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.21 Unlawful labour as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.22 Terror as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.23 Torture as a grave breach

4.24 Torture as a violation of the laws or customs of war

4.25 Unlawful attack on civilians as a violation of the laws or customs of war
4.26 Unlawful attack on civilian objects as a violation of the laws or customs of war 409
4.27 Unlawful confinement of a civilian as a grave breach 409
4.28 Unlawful confinement as a violation of the laws or customs of war 409
4.29 Unlawful deportation or transfer as a grave breach 410
4.30 Wilfully causing great suffering or serious injury to body or health as a grave breach 410

5. Sample combinations of elements of crimes and forms of responsibility 410
   5.1 Torture as a crime against humanity 411
   5.2 Murder as a form of persecution as a crime against humanity 415
   5.3 Genocide by killing 421
   5.4 Extensive destruction of property as a grave breach 424
   5.5 Plunder as a violation of the laws or customs of war 429

Index 435