Posthumous Interests

Legal and Ethical Perspectives

Daniel Sperling

SJD, BA (Philosophy)
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>page xiii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of cases</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of national provisions</td>
<td>xxiv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Introduction

1 Posthumous harm, posthumous interests and symbolic existence

- Harm
  - General
  - Interests
- Posthumous harm: the real puzzles
  - The experience problem
  - Death as harm
  - The Epicurean argument
  - Surviving interests
  - The problem of retroactivity
  - The moment of harm
- Solving the problem of posthumous (non-)existence
  - Existence as a possibility
  - Existence in after-life
  - Harm and change without existence
  - Harm in no particular time
- Persistent existence of the Human Subject
  - My proposal
  - The nature of the Human Subject
  - The relation between the Human Subject and the person
  - Strengths of the Human Subject model
- Symbolic existence
  - The concept of social self
  - Legal support for the interest in symbolic existence
- Conclusion

2 Posthumous rights

Specific theories of posthumous rights

- Hillel Steiner
- Annette Baier

ix
Contents

Carl Wellman 59
Raymond Belliotti 61
General theories of rights 63
The choice theory 63
Critique of the choice theory 64
The exclusion of right-holders 67
The dead as right-holders 69
The interest theory 71
Versions of the interest theory 73
The idea of interest 76
Applying the interest theory to the dead 79
Should the dead be actual right-holders? 80
Content of posthumous rights 83
Duration of posthumous rights 84
Conclusion 86

3 Proprietary interest in the body of the deceased 88
Is there a proprietary interest in the body of the deceased? 89
The 'no property' rule 89
Haynes' Case 90
Coke's commentary 91
R v. Sharpe 92
Exelby v. Handside 93
Common law exceptions to the 'no property' rule 94
Possession with regard to the duty to bury 94
The 'work and skill' exception 103
The 'long-dead' exception 107
Undermining the 'no property' outcomes 110
Undermining the 'no will' rule 111
Undermining the 'no theft' rule 113
Should there be a proprietary interest in the body of the deceased? 114
Possible theoretical models for acquiring property in the body of the deceased 114
Transfer of property 114
Property vests in the state 115
Abandonment 117
Res nullius 121
The conceptual meaning of a proprietary interest in the body of the deceased 122
Ownership 123
Possession 126
Use and management 127
Disposal 127
Transferability and the right to enjoy fruits 128
General rationales for a proprietary interest 131
Property as a natural right 131
Property as the advancement of autonomy and freedom 132
Property as constituting personality 132
Property as a system of distributive justice 134
Property as a form of utilitarianism 135
4 Determining the disposal of one's body after death

Conclusion

Alternatives to the will mechanism
- Human tissue gift laws
- Donor cards
- Living wills
- Trust
- Agency
- Contract

Alternatives to the property classification criterion

Substantial limitations of enforcing bodily testaments
- Limitations directly established under legislation
- Limitations directly established under case law
  - Clear and convincing demonstration by competent and credible testimony
  - Reason, decency and accepted customs of mankind

Limitations indirectly established under case law
- Timing
- Cost
- Practicability
- Harm to society
- Public mores and vulnerabilities of other groups
- A more general opposition to public policy
- Procedural obstacles
- Protection from harm to third parties
- Quality of familial relationship
- Conditioned bodily testaments
- Quality of relationship to place of disposal

Conclusion

5 Medical confidentiality after death

Introduction

Post-mortem confidentiality in ethics and law
- Ethics of post-mortem confidentiality

The legal position
- International law
- Canada
- The USA
- The UK

General justifications for confidentiality
- Consequentialism
- Rights-based justifications
  - Privacy
  - Autonomy
  - Property
## Contents

Fidelity (equity)
- The durability of the obligation to act in confidence 204
- Survivability of the physician–patient relationship 204
- An analogy from posthumous attorney–client privilege 206
- The duty to keep promises: a contractual justification 207

Practical solutions to breach of confidentiality 212

General solutions to post-mortem confidentiality
- More weight to confidentiality during life 212
- The ‘no-difference’ approach 214
- More weight to post-mortem confidentiality 214

Casuistical case analysis of post-mortem confidentiality
- Disclosure to protect at-risk third parties 215
- Disclosure in the best interests of another patient 216
- Disclosure in death certificates 216
- Autopsy disclosures
  - Disclosure prior to performing an autopsy 220
  - Disclosure from the autopsy procedure itself 220
  - Publication of autopsy reports 222
- Disclosure to providers of disposal services and organ procurement organizations 226
- Disclosure of research outcomes concerning dead subjects 226
- Disclosure for teaching purposes 229
- Disclosure for contesting a will or supporting an insurance claim 230
- Disclosure of the medical history of public figures 231

Conclusion 234

Conclusions 236
- The application of the interest in the recognition of one’s symbolic existence 238
- The proprietary interest in the body of the deceased 238
- The testamentary interest in determining the disposal of one’s body after death 241
- The interest in post-mortem confidentiality 243

Possible objections to the idea of symbolic existence 244
- Subject of interest 244
- Duration of symbolic existence 245
- Balancing the interest in the recognition of one’s symbolic existence with other interests 246
- A right to the recognition of symbolic existence 247

Select bibliography 250

Index 265