The Landmark Rulings of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights on the Rights of the Child

Protecting the Most Vulnerable at the Edge

By
Mónica Feria Tinta

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN • BOSTON
2008
Contents

Acknowledgements .............................................................. xv
Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments .............. xix
Table of Cases ................................................................. xxii

Introduction ........................................................................ 1

Chapter I. Protecting the Right to Life of At-risk Children:
The Street Children case ....................................................... 13
1. Torture and issues of evidence: the ages of the victims and 16
their context in the considerations of the Court
2. The absolute prohibition of torture, inhuman and 18
degradating treatment and the expansion of the notion of
"victim"
3. The notion of the right to life: the positive obligation on 25
the part of the State to tend and encourage "a right to
harbour a project of life" for all children under its
jurisdiction
4. An evolutive interpretation of rights and obligations for the 27
protection of children under current international law
5. The right to a prompt and effective recourse and to judicial 30
protection
6. The principle that human rights violations of children are 32
of particular seriousness

Chapter II. Children as True Legal Persons ........................ 35
1. The family as the focal point for protection ........................ 39
2. The concept of a "decent life" and children under the care 40
of the State
3. Due process and guarantees: the rights of children during 41
proceedings in the determination of their rights
4. The principles concerning the right to liberty of children
under scrutiny in a contentious case: The Bulacio case 44
5. Institutionalised children and conditions of detention for minors in conflict with the law: the Instituto del Menor Panchito López case .................................................. 49

Chapter III. The First International Law cases concerning the protection of children in times of war in the world .............. 55
1. The Molina Theissen case ..................................................... 56
2. The Gómez Paquiyauri Brothers case ...................................... 58
   A. The facts at the basis of the controversy in the Gómez Paquiyauri Brothers case .................................................. 61
   B. Issues of State Responsibility ............................................ 71
   C. Arbitrary detention in the context of states of emergency .................................................. 93
   D. The prohibition of torture and the right to life of children in the context of an armed conflict .................. 102
      i. *The consolidated enlarged notion of victim following the Villagráin Morales et al. principle* .................. 121
      ii. *The aim of torture today* ............................................ 151
      iii. *The prohibition of torture and the right to life as norms of ius cogens equally applicable in times of peace as in times of war* .................................................. 153
   E. Some specific considerations held by the Court relating to Article 19 in the Gomez Paquiyauri Brothers case ... 154
   F. The legal notion of impunity ............................................. 161
3. The hermeneutics of the international law of human rights and international humanitarian law in the protection of children .................................................. 170
4. The Serrano Cruz Sisters case .............................................. 172
   A. A case of judicial guarantees and judicial protection .... 175
      i. *The respect for the principle of being heard within a "reasonable time"* ............................................ 177
      ii. *The State's duty of carrying out investigations in all seriousness and not as a mere formality* .................. 180
   B. The Right to the Truth as a legal right ............................. 181
5. The Dissenting Opinions on the Serrano Cruz Sisters case ..... 188
   A. The notion of a “continuous violation” ........................... 188
   B. The centrality of the rights of the child in the Serrano Cruz sisters case .................................................. 192
C. The fundamental right to a life of dignity ................................................. 195
D. The right to an identity ........................................................................... 196
E. Rights of the family ................................................................................ 200
F. The right to a name ................................................................................ 205

Chapter IV. The Right to Nationality and to Equal Protection: 

The Yean and Bosico Children case ................................................................. 209

1. The crux of the Yean and Bosico children case: The denial of late registration ................................................................. 212
2. The previous question of jurisdiction in the Yean and Bosico children case before the Court ................................................. 215
3. The best hermeneutics for the protection of the rights of children: an interrelated approach to rights that are indivisible ......................................................................................... 217

A. The right to juridical personality .............................................................. 219
B. The right to nationality: an inherent, non-derogable right ................................................................. 221
C. The right to equal protection and non-discrimination .................. 224
D. The right to a name ................................................................................ 226
E. The effects of these joint violations and the duties of special protection towards children ......................................................... 227
F. Measures of public impact: Implementing guarantees of non-repetition through adopting legislative and administrative measures ................................................................................. 230

Chapter V. Consolidating Principles on the Protection of Children in Internal Armed Conflicts: The Case of the Massacre of Mapiripán and the Case of the Massacres of Ituango vs. Colombia ................................................................. 233

1. Non-State actors and State Responsibility, for gross human rights violations of a civilian population in the context of an armed conflict ......................................................................................... 234

A. The State’s acknowledgment of Responsibility in the Mapiripán case was only for “omission” (failure to protect the population of Mapiripán): it rejected attribution of acts of the paramilitary to the State of Colombia ......................................................................................... 237
B. The Court's holding with regard to State Responsibility of Colombia in the case of Mapiripán: Obligations _erga omnes_ binding the State of Colombia ........................................ 239

C. The Recognition of State Responsibility in the case of the Massacres of Ituango ............................................................. 250

D. The historical relationship of the paramilitary and the State of Colombia in the fight against the guerrillas .... 259

E. The massacre of Mapiripán and Article 19 ....................... 265

F. The massacres of Ituango and Article 19 ....................... 272

2. A reflection on the evolution of the notion of victim as reflected in the massacre cases against Colombia for the best protection of children ......................................................... 275

Chapter VI. The Protection of Children of Indigenous Peoples: _The Case of the Sawhoyamaxa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay_ ................................................................. 279

1. Some previous observations on two recent contentious cases before the Court, _The Case of Moiwana Village v. Suriname_ and the _Case of Comunidad Yakye Axa v. Paraguay_ ......................................................... 281

A. The case of Moiwana Village v. Suriname ....................... 281

B. The case of Comunidad Yakye Axa v. Paraguay ............... 284

2. The first international case on the protection of children of indigenous peoples: _The Case of the Sawhoyamaxa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay_ ......................................................... 299

A. The consolidated notion of “the right to a life of dignity”: The right to a dignified and decent existence of (and the positive duties of States towards) endangered communities, indigenous children, and populations living in extreme poverty and exclusion .... 323

B. Some reflections in respect of the right to justice and the rights of indigenous peoples ................................................. 334

C. The right to juridical personality in the Sawhoyamaxa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay ....................................................... 339

D. A final reflection concerning the Sawhoyamaxa Indigenous community judgment _vis-à-vis_ the Yakye Axa v. Paraguay ................................................................. 342
Chapter VII. The Meaning of the Superior Interest of the Child in Post Conflict Societies: Servellón Garcia and others vs Honduras ................................................................. 351
1. On victims and victimizers ................................................ 355
2. An interrelated analysis of the law: Article 4 (right to life), Article 5 (right to humane treatment), Article 7 (right to personal liberty and security), Article 19 (rights of the child) and Article 1.1 (obligation to respect rights) .......... 359
   A. Issues of State Responsibility in the Servellón Garcia and others case ................................................................. 364
   B. The superior interest of the child ........................................ 367
3. The particular obligation to combat impunity in cases of violations of children’s rights ......................................................... 369
4. Measures of satisfaction and guarantees of non-repetition in the Servellón Garcia and others case ......................................................... 370

Chapter VIII. Child Soldiers in Paraguay: The Case of Vargas Areco .................................................................................. 373
1. Some issues pertaining to the denial of justice in the present case ................................................................. 378
2. The phenomenon of child conscription in the Paraguayan armed forces ................................................................. 387
3. Special norms for the protection of children involved in military activities both in times of peace and in times of war under international law ................................................................. 391
4. The prohibition by internal law of Paraguay to conscript minors below 18 years of age into the Armed Forces .......... 395
5. An interesting twist in the reparation award ........................................ 396

Chapter IX. The Pending Task of Construing the Meaning of the Rights of the Family in the Jurisprudence of the Court .... 399

Chapter X. Reparation in Cases of Violations of Human Rights of Children .............................................................................. 417
1. The issue of Aggravated State Responsibility ........................................ 419
2. The issue of quantum for loss of life in the case of children ................................................................. 421
3. Assessing harm in cases of multiple victims ........................................ 427
4. The importance of measures of public impact on cases involving children ................................................................. 431

Chapter XI. Upcoming Contentious Cases on Children's Rights in the System ................................................................. 435
1. Cases proceeding before the Inter-American Commission .... 435
2. The Rights of the Child as part of collectivities: an evolving trend in the jurisprudence of the Inter-American system ... 443
   A. The Case of the Communities of the Jiguamiandó and the Curbaradó ................................................................. 444
   B. The Community of San Mateo de Huanchor case .......... 447
   C. The Rights of the Child of indigenous peoples: The Kichwa Peoples of the Sarayaku Community and its members case ................................................................. 450

Concluding Remarks ........................................................................................................................................ 452

ANNEXES ...................................................................................................................................................... 455

INSTRUMENTS .................................................................................................................................................. 455
Annex I: American Convention on Human Rights ......................................................................................... 455
Annex III: Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture ............................................................. 498
Annex IV: American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man .................................................................... 505

OTHER DOCUMENTS AND MATERIALS ............................................................................................................ 515
Annex VI: ILO Convention No. 182: Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 ................................................. 519
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annex</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>The Rights of the Child under the reporting functions of the Inter-American Commission [Extracts from Reports]</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Situation of the Rights of Women in Ciudad Juárez, México: The Right to be Free from Violence and Discrimination</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Report on the Situation of Human Rights in Haiti 1995</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Buenos Aires declaration on violence against children (1 June 2005)</td>
<td>536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII</td>
<td>Inter-American Court of Human Rights, Advisory Opinion 17, on the Juridical Condition and Human Rights of the Child (2002)</td>
<td>557</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Index</td>
<td>665</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>