Retroactivity and the Common Law

Ben Juratowitch
# CONTENTS

Foreword v
Acknowledgements vii
Table of Cases xiii
Table of Legislation and International Instruments xxv

Introduction 1

1 Concepts, Labels and Limitations 5
   A Introduction 5
   B Retroactivity 6
   C Retrospectivity 9
   D Confusing Usage 12
   E Problematic Usage 13
       1 Waldron on Criminal Sentencing 13
       2 Fuller on Tax Liability 16
   F The Scope of this Book 17
   G Illustrations of Conceptual Distinctions 17
       1 Cases Relating to Contractual Rights 18
       2 Cases Relating to Personal Status 21
   H Conclusion 25

2 Historical Review 27
   A Introduction 27
   B General History and Statutory Construction 27
   C Adjudicative Retroactivity 35
   D Conclusion 42

3 Rationales for a General Presumption Against Retroactivity 43
   A Introduction 43
   B Certainty 44
       1 The Meaning of Certainty 44
       2 Certainty and Reliance 44
           (a) The Case for Actual Reliance 44
           (b) Evaluation of the Role of Actual Reliance 45
           (c) Certainty and the Ability to Rely on the Law 47
   3 Certainty and Autonomy 48
C Negative Liberty 50
1 Negative Liberty Generally 50
2 Deprivation of Security Relating to Past Events 50
3 Removal of an Actual Freedom 51
4 Negative Liberty and Criminal Law 52
   (a) Nullum Crimen Sine Lege Antea Exstanti 52
   (b) Nulla Poena Sine Lege Antea Exstanti 52
D Fair Warning 57
E Defeasibility 60
1 Introduction to Defeasibility 60
2 A General Principle of Fairness 61
3 Where Uncertainty is Inevitable 62
4 The Exceptional Nature of Retroactivity 63
F Conclusion 65

4 The Presumption Against Retroactivity in Statutory Construction 67
A Introduction 67
B The Nature of the Presumption Against Retroactivity 68
C Applications of the Presumption Against Retroactivity 71
D Fairness as a Determinant of the Applicability of the Presumption 76
E A Presumption of Variable Strength? 79
F Rebuttal of the Presumption Against Retroactivity 80
   1 Express Words or Necessary Intendment 80
   2 Validating Statutes 81
   3 Importance of Subject Matter 86
G Detailed Studies 91
   1 The Intertemporal Effect of the Human Rights Act 1998 (UK) 91
      (a) Was Retroactivity in Issue? 91
      (b) Treatment of the Presumption Against Retroactivity 93
      (c) Applicability of the Presumption Against Retroactivity 94
      (d) Fairness and a Presumption of Variable Strength 96
      (e) Statutory Language 101
   2 Retroactive Sentencing 102
      (a) Article 7 of the ECHR and the Common Law Presumption Against Retroactivity 102
      (b) The Common Law Presumption Against Retroactive Sentencing 112
      (c) Retroactive Changes in Favour of the Defendant 115

H Conclusion 118

5 Adjudicative Retroactivity 119
A Introductory Matters 119
   1 What is Adjudicative Retroactivity? 119
   2 The Declaratory Theory 119
   3 The Scope of this Chapter 121
B The Doctrine Of Precedent and Judicial Attachment to Existing Principle in Novel Cases 125
C The Marital Rape Cases 127
  1 Outline of the Facts, Decisions and Issues 127
  2 Foreseeability of Legal Change 130
  3 Heinous Conduct 133
  4 Changed Status of Women 136
  5 An Illogical Immunity 136
  6 Conclusions on the Marital Rape Cases 137
D Restitution of Money Paid under a Mistake of Law 138
  1 The Facts and Issues in *Kleinwort Benson v Lincoln County Council* 138
  2 Reasons for Retroactivity 142
E Private Law 143
  1 The Creation of New Law without Overruling Prior Authority 144
      (a) Existing Authorities in Disarray Making a Degree of Retroactivity Inevitable 144
      (b) Ability to Rely on the Law not in Issue 145
      (c) Gradual Development of New Law 146
      (d) Moral Obloquy 150
      (e) Use of Obiter Dicta to Signal a Change in the Law 151
  2 The Creation of New Law by Overruling a Prior Authority 153
      (a) Ability to Rely on the Law not in Issue 153
      (b) Prior Authority Wrong in Principle 154
      (c) Response to Changed Legal Circumstances 159
      (d) Response to Changed Factual Circumstances 161
      (e) Absence of Effect on Litigants before the Court 163
      (f) Refusal to Overrule a Decision because of Potential Retroactive Effects 165
  3 Overruling a Prior Judicial Interpretation of a Statute 166
  4 Conclusions on Private Law 171
F Public Law 172
  1 The Creation of New Law without Overruling Prior Authority 172
  2 The Creation of New Law by Overruling Prior Authority 175
      (a) Judicial Review of Questions of Law 175
      (b) Judicial Review of Questions of Fact 177
  3 Overruling a Prior Judicial Interpretation of a Statute 178
  4 Conclusions on Public Law 182
G Criminal Law 183
  1 The Creation of New Law without Overruling Prior Authority 184
      (a) Judicial Response to New Factual Circumstances 184
      (b) Perceived Immorality 185
  2 The Creation of New Law by Overruling Prior Authority 189
      (a) Prior Authority Wrong in Principle 189
      (b) Retroactivity in Favour of a Defendant 192