Constitutional Design for Divided Societies: Integration or Accommodation?

Edited by
SUJIT CHOUDHRY

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
**Detailed Contents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>xiii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PART I INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW

1 Bridging comparative politics and comparative constitutional law: Constitutional design in divided societies  
*Sujit Choudhry*

- 1. Introduction: Comparative constitutional law missing in action 3
- 2. The Lijphart-Horowitz debate 15
- 3. Integration versus accommodation 26
- 4. Lessons for the integration-accommodation debate 32

2 Integration or accommodation? The enduring debate in conflict regulation  
*John McGarry, Brendan O'Leary, and Richard Simeon*

- 1. Distinguishing integration and accommodation from assimilation 42
- 2. Integration 45
- 3. Accommodation 51
  - Centripetalism 53
  - Multiculturalism 56
  - Consociation 58
  - Territorial pluralism 63
- 4. Engagements between integrationists and accommodationists 67
  - Stability 71
  - Distributive justice 78
  - Democracy 82
- 5. When is integration or accommodation appropriate? 85
  - Integration 85
  - Accommodation 86
- 6. Conclusion 87

### PART II THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

3 Beyond the dichotomy of universalism and difference: Four responses to cultural diversity  
*Alan Patten*

- 1. Disestablishment 93
Detailed Contents

2. Nation building 97
3. Cultural preservation 101
4. Equality of status 105
5. Conclusion 109

4 The internationalization of minority rights 111
Will Kymlicka
1. The basic international framework 112
2. Limitations of the international framework 114
3. Rethinking the approach 126
4. Conclusion 138

5 Does the world need more Canada? The politics of 141
the Canadian model in constitutional politics and political theory
Sujit Choudhry
1. Introduction: Brian Barry versus Will Kymlicka 141
2. The Canadian model: Accommodation and integration 144
3. Will Kymlicka and the rise of the Canadian model in 153
political theory
4. The politics of the Canadian model: Canada in 159
constitutional crisis
5. Lessons from the Canadian model in crisis: A procedural 165
and a substantive crisis
6. Conclusion: The lesson of the Canadian model for multinational 171
polities

6 Ethnic identity and democratic institutions: A dynamic perspective 173
Richard H. Pildes
1. Ethnic identity 176
2. Democratic institutions 184
   Multistage democratic processes 185
   Novel voting systems 188
   Integrationist political spheres and accommodationist cultural 193
   spheres
   Courts as unwinders of ethnic political bargains 195
   Federalism and territorially-based devolution 198
3. A dynamic perspective on institutional design 200

PART III CASE-STUDIES

7 Indonesia’s quasi-federalist approach: Accommodation amid 205
strong integrationist tendencies
Jacques Bertrand
1. Introduction 205
## Detailed Contents

### 2. From integration to accommodation in Indonesia: Decentralization and "special" autonomy

- Page 208

### 3. Special autonomy: An ambiguous reconciliation for Papuans

- Page 222

### 4. The Law on Aceh: All but federacy

- Page 226

### 5. Conclusion

- Page 231

### 8 Integrationist and accommodationist measures in Nigeria's constitutional engineering: Successes and failures

*John Boye Ejobowah*

- Page 233

1. The background

- Page 234

2. Constitutional engineering through the combination of integrationist and accommodationist devices

- Page 239

3. Accomplishments of the Nigerian design

- Page 243

4. Inadequacies of the Nigerian design

- Page 246

5. Political patronage, godfathers, and lawlessness

- Page 249

6. Constitutional rescue

- Page 254

7. Conclusion

- Page 257

### 9 The limits of constitutionalism in the Muslim world: History and identity in Islamic law

*Anver M. Emon*

- Page 258

1. Introduction

- Page 258

2. Historicist jurisprudence: Manifesting the transcendent through law

- Page 261

3. Muslim state constitutions and protections for religious minorities

- Page 265

4. Illustrating the tension at work: Saudi Arabia and Egypt

- Page 267

5. Understanding historical Shari‘a

- Page 271

5.1 A Qur‘anic basis manifested in historical Shari‘a?

- Page 272

5.2 The case of wrongful-death damages

- Page 274

5.3 Restrictions on building and repairing religious places of worship

- Page 280

6. Conclusion

- Page 284

### 10 A tale of three constitutions: Ethnicity and politics in Fiji

*Yash Ghai and Jill Cottrell*

- Page 287

1. Background

- Page 288

2. The 1970 constitution

- Page 291

3. The 1990 constitution

- Page 297

4. The 1997 constitution

- Page 300

4.1 The approach of the commission

- Page 301

4.2 Modifications by the Joint Parliamentary Select Committee

- Page 303

4.3 The operation of the Constitution: The electoral system

- Page 305

4.4 Power sharing

- Page 307
4.5 Fijian administration 310
5. Coups and overthrow of the constitution 311
6. Conclusion 312

11 Rival nationalisms in a plurinational state: Spain, Catalonia, and the Basque Country
Michael Keating
1. Accommodating national diversity 316
2. Political traditions in Spain 318
3. Catalonia 319
4. The Basque Country 322
5. Accommodating nationalism 325
6. Renegotiating autonomy 332
7. The issues at stake 337
8. Conclusion 340

12 Iraq’s constitution of 2005: Liberal consociation as political prescription
John McGarry and Brendan O’Leary
1. Introduction 342
2. Iraq’s constitution: Self-rule and shared rule 347
3. Iraq’s constitution and federal shared rule 359
4. Conclusion 366

13 Consociation and its critics: Northern Ireland after the Belfast Agreement
John McGarry and Brendan O’Leary
1. Introduction 369
2. Consociational theory and Northern Ireland’s Belfast Agreement 373
   2.1 The neglected treatment of self-determination disputes 374
   2.2 The neglected role of external actors in the promotion and operation of consociations 379
   2.3 The neglected treatment of security issues 383
3. The debate between consociationalists and their integrationist and centripetalist critics 385
   3.1 Stability 385
   3.2 Fairness 396
   3.3 Democracy 401
4. Conclusion 407

14 Recognition without empowerment: Minorities in a democratic South Africa
Christina Murray and Richard Simeon
1. Mapping diversity in South Africa 409
2. Designs for a new South Africa 418
   2.1 The Lijphart-Horowitz debate 419
3. Constructing “The New South Africa” 422
   3.1. Elections, legislatures, and executives 424
   3.2 Language and cultural rights: Recognizing diversity in the private sphere 426
   3.3 Multilevel governance 431
4. Conclusion 434
15 Giving with one hand: Scottish devolution within a unitary state 438
   Stephen Tierney
   1. Introduction 438
   2. Plurinational constitutionalism: The conceptual challenge 440
   3. Devolution for Scotland: Plurinational realignment without federalism? 446
      3.1 Plurinational elements in the devolution settlement: Autonomy and recognition 447
      3.2 Integrationism within the devolution settlement: Intrastate relations 451
   4. Concluding remarks 459

Index 461