Multilingualism and the Harmonisation of European Law

Edited by

Barbara Pozzo and Valentina Jacometti
Table of Contents

Index of Authors xiii

Preface xv

Barbara Pozzo
Valentina Jacometti

Part I
Legal Terminology and the Harmonisation of European Law

Chapter 1
Multilingualism, Legal Terminology and the Problems of
Harmonising European Private Law 3

Barbara Pozzo

1. EUROPEAN MULTILINGUALISM 3
2. COMMUNITY INITIATIVES FOR IMPROVING THE
   DRAFTING QUALITY OF COMMUNITY LEGISLATION 5
3. THE TRANSLATION OF LEGAL CONCEPTS AND THE
   EXPERIENCE OF COMPARATIVE LAW 6
   3.1. Legal Concepts and Layers of Meaning: the Study of
        Reference Contexts 6
   3.2. Identifying the Demarcation Function in Legal Concepts 8
   3.3. Legal Concepts which Result from Certain Intellectual
        Movements and National Cultures 9
4. SOME REFLECTIONS ON THE LANGUAGE USED BY
   THE COMMUNITY LAW-MAKERS 12
   4.1. The Absence of Definition in Community Texts 13
   4.2. Where There is a Non-technical Definition 13
   4.3. The Lack of Internal Coherence 14
5. SOME PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS 18
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 2
**Comparative Jurilinguistics: A Discipline in Statu Nascendi**
*Heikki E.S. Mattila*

1. **HISTORICAL REMARKS** 21
2. **COMBINING A LINGUISTIC RESEARCH APPROACH AND LEGAL INFORMATION NEEDS: LEGAL LINGUISTICS** 22
3. **AN EXAMPLE OF JURILINGUISTIC RESEARCH: LEGAL ABBREVIATIONS IN FINLAND** 23
4. **THE INTERNATIONAL POINT OF VIEW: COMPARATIVE JURILINGUISTICS** 26
5. **A STUDY OF COMPARATIVE JURILINGUISTICS: THE INTERNATIONAL COHERENCE OF LEGAL LATIN** 27
6. **A SEQUEL: SCREENING THE MOST IMPORTANT LATIN QUOTATIONS IN INTERNATIONAL PRIVATE LAW** 29
7. **PRODUCING SYNTHESIS: GENERAL SURVEYS OF COMPARATIVE JURILINGUISTICS** 31

## Chapter 3
**Communicating in an International Context**
*Silvia Ferreri*

1. **ENGLISH LANGUAGE AS DOMINANT** 33
2. **SOME NOTES** 35
3. **A SECOND OBSERVATION** 38
4. **THE IMPACT OF INTERNATIONAL ENGLISH ON THE MEMBER STATES LANGUAGE: SOME INHERITANCES IN ITALIAN** 39
5. **WHY USE ENGLISH** 43

## Chapter 4
**The Terminologies of Civil Protection: Rights, Remedies and Procedures**
*Simon Whittaker*

1. **RIGHTS AND REMEDIES: A CIVIL LAW/COMMON LAW DIVIDE?** 47
2. **EU COMPETENCE IN RELATION TO CIVIL PROCEDURE** 50
3. **THE THREE-FOLD DISTINCTION IN ACTION: THE EXAMPLE OF THE CONSUMER GUARANTEES DIRECTIVE** 52
Table of Contents

(a) The Language of Obligation and Rights 52
(b) ‘Liability’ for Non-conformity and the ‘Remedies’ 54
4. CONCLUDING REMARKS 60

Chapter 5
The Role of the Court of Justice of the European Communities in the Interpretation of Multilingual Texts 61
Fabrizio Vismara

1. THE COURT OF JUSTICE AND THE UNIFORM APPLICATION OF COMMUNITY LAW 61
2. A SHORT DESCRIPTION OF THE DIFFICULTIES ARISING FROM THE INTERPRETATION OF MULTILINGUAL TEXTS 63
3. SOLUTIONS TO PROBLEMS OF INTERPRETATION OF MULTILINGUAL TEXTS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW 65
4. THE INTERPRETATION CRITERIA ADOPTED BY THE COURT OF JUSTICE 66
5. CONCLUDING REMARKS 68

Chapter 6
What Legal Translation is and is not – Within or Outside the EU 69
Jean-Claude Gémar

1. WHAT IS TRANSLATION? 70
2. TRANSLATION PROBLEMS 71
3. TRANSLATION AND LANGUAGE 71
4. LAW AND ITS LANGUAGE 72
5. PROBLEMS OF LEGAL TRANSLATION 73
6. THE LANGUAGE OF THE LAW, A LANGUAGE OF RULES AND (LEGAL) EFFECTS 75
7. CONCLUSION 77

Chapter 7
Multilingualism and the Coherence of European Private Law 79
Gianmaria Ajani
Piercarlo Rossi

1. INTRODUCTION: HARMONISATION OF LAWS AND MULTILINGUALISM 79
2. MULTILINGUALISM AS A CULTURAL ISSUE 81
3. MULTILINGUALISM AS A PRACTICAL PROBLEM 84
## Table of Contents

4. LIVING WITH MULTILINGUALISM: A STALLED PROCESS 85  
5. LIVING WITH MULTILINGUALISM: THE 'LANGUAGE OF LAW' 86  
6. TRANSLATION AND INTERPRETATION 88  
7. CONCLUSIONS 91  

**Part II**  
The Community Institutions  

### The European Commission

#### Chapter 8  
The Quality of Community Legislation and the Role of the European Commission Legal Revisers 99  
*Stefania Dragone*

1. INTRODUCTION 99  
2. THE LEGAL REVISERS 100  
3. CONSULTATION PROCESS 100  
4. MONITORING LEGAL AND LINGUISTIC CONSISTENCY 100  
5. NEW METHODS 101  
6. SOURCES AND INSTRUMENTS 102  
7. THE INTERINSTITUTIONAL AGREEMENT AND THE CASE LAW 104  
8. CONCLUSIONS 106  

### The Council of the European Union

#### Chapter 9  
Multilingual Legislation and the Legal-linguistic Revision in the Council of the European Union 109  
*Manuela Guggeis*

1. INTRODUCTION 109  
2. THE MULTILINGUAL REGIME 110  
3. SOME ASPECTS OF LEGAL LANGUAGE REVISION IN THE COUNCIL 113  
4. CONCLUSIONS 117
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 12
Legislative Process from a Parliament Perspective – Past Practice in 11 Languages and Current Challenges in 20

*Pekka Hakala*

1. INTRODUCTION 147
2. CODECISION: A GROWING INDUSTRY . . . UP UNTIL 1 MAY 2004 148
3. CODECISION STEP BY STEP 149
   3.1. First Reading 149
   3.2. Second Reading 152
   3.3. First and Second Reading Agreements 153
   3.4. Linguistic Considerations on First and Second Reading 154
   3.5. Third Reading – Conciliation 155
   3.6. EP Delegation of 25 Members and x Languages 156
   3.7. Linguistic Considerations on the Conciliation Phase 157
4. LEGISLATING IN 20 LANGUAGES: PRINCIPLES AND THEIR PRAGMATIC IMPLEMENTATION 159

## The European Central Bank

## Chapter 13
Optimal Use of Multilingual Resources in Legal Drafting – the European Central Bank’s Approach

*Juliet Weenink-Griffiths*

1. HISTORY AND ORGANISATION OF THE JURISTES-LINGUISTES DIVISION 167
2. RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE JURISTES-LINGUISTES DIVISION 168
3. WORKING PROCEDURES 172
   3.1. First Phase – Preparation 172
   3.2. Second Phase – Drafting and Editing 172
   3.3. Third Phase – Translation 173
   3.4. Fourth Phase – Publication 174
4. FUTURE CHALLENGES 174

## The European Court of Justice

## Chapter 14
Organisation and Features of Translation Activities at the Court of Justice of the European Communities

*Giovanni Gallo*

179
## Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION 179  
2. THE ROLE OF TRANSLATION AT THE COURT OF JUSTICE 180  
3. THE TRANSLATORS THAT WORK FOR THE COURT OF JUSTICE 182  
   3.1. Lawyer-linguists 182  
      3.1.1. Specialisation by Language 183  
      3.1.2. Subject Specialisation 185  
   3.2. External or Free-lance Translators 185  
   3.3. Revisers 187  
   3.4. Permanent Training of Lawyer-linguists 187  
4. THE ORGANISATION OF THE TRANSLATION SERVICE AT THE COURT OF JUSTICE 188  
5. WORKING METHODS AND INSTRUMENTS 189  
   5.1. Processing Texts 189  
   5.2. Speech Recognition 190  
   5.3. Automatic Translation 190  
6. LINGUISTIC RESEARCH INSTRUMENTS 191  
   6.1. Dictionaries, Glossaries, Databases 191  
7. INFLUENCE ON THE DRAFTING OF ACTS 191  
8. RELATIONS WITH OTHERS 193  
   8.1. Relations with Other Language Divisions 193  
   8.2. Relations with the Authors of the Texts 193  
   8.3. Relations with Other Institution or Bodies 194  
9. CONCLUSION 195  

---

### Chapter 15

Legal Translation at the European Court of Justice, Problems and Techniques 197  
*Beatrice Oddone*

1. INTRODUCTION 197  
2. THE CURRENT LANGUAGE REGIME 198  
3. THE ACTS TO BE TRANSLATED AND THE PRINCIPLE OF FULL MULTILINGUALISM 199  
4. PRESERVING FULL MULTILINGUALISM IN THE UNION OF 25 STATES: THE PIVOT-LANGUAGE MECHANISM 202  
5. THE STRATIFICATION OF TRANSLATIONS AND THE NEED TO GUARANTEE HOMOGENEITY AND CONSISTENCY 204  
6. CENTRAL PROCESSING, TEXT ANALYSIS AND TEMPLATES 205  
7. CONCLUSIONS 206
### Table of Contents

Part III  
From Debate to Critique: Reflections and Perspectives  

Chapter 16  
Clashing Strategies: Law, Language and Identities in a Framework of Failures?  
*P.G. Monateri*  

1. LANGUAGE AND EUROPEAN LAW: A MULTIFACETED ISSUE  
   209  
2. THE WORKING LANGUAGE: AESTHETICS AND THE POLITICS OF EXCLUSION  
   210  
3. THE LANGUAGE OF LEGISLATION AND THE INTERPRETATION OF EUROPEAN LAW: TWO MATCHING STRATEGIES  
   214  
   216