The Humanization of International Law

by

Theodor Meron
Table of Contents

Acknowledgements xi
Introduction xv

Chapter 1: The Humanization of the Law of War 1
A. Introduction and General Principles 1
B. From an Inter-State to an Individual Rights Perspective: Reciprocity and Reprisals 9
C. The Martens Clause, Principles of Humanity, and Dictates of Public Conscience 16
   I. The Origins of the Clause 17
   II. The Modernization of the Clause 19
   III. The Clause and General Principles 21
   IV. The Clause and Public Conscience 22
   V. The Clause and the Nuclear Weapons Opinion 25
   VI. The Current Significance of the Clause 27
D. Applicability of International Humanitarian Law 29
   I. The Thresholds of Applicability of Humanitarian Law 29
   II. Personal Applicability of Humanitarian Law Treaties: Redefining “Protected Persons” 33
E. Protection of Victims 38
   I. Individual Rights and Duties and the Inalienability of Rights 38
   II. Repatriation of Prisoners of War and Personal Autonomy 41
   III. Convergence of Protection under Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law 45
   IV. Application of Humanitarian Law by Human Rights Organs 50
   V. Application of Human Rights Treaties in Humanitarian Law Contexts 55
   VI. Minimum Humanitarian Standards: Fundamental Standards of Humanity 58
F. Means and Methods of Warfare and Protection of Combatants 61
   I. The Principle of Proportionality 61
## Table of Contents

### II. Weapons of a Nature to Cause Unnecessary Suffering or to be Inherently Indiscriminate
- a) Weapons of a Nature to Cause Unnecessary Suffering
- b) Weapons that are Inherently Indiscriminate
- c) The Regulation of Weapons Causing Unnecessary Suffering and of Indiscriminate Weapons
- d) Anti-Personnel Land Mines
- e) Laser Weapons

### H. Limitations to Laws’ Effectiveness

### Chapter 2: Criminalization of Violations of International Humanitarian Law
- A. Introduction
- B. Crimes against Humanity
- C. The Yugoslavia and Rwanda Statutes’ Provisions on Internal Atrocities and the Tension between the *Nullum Crimen* Principle and Customary Law
- D. Criminality of Violations of Humanitarian Law
- E. Universality of Jurisdiction
- F. Non-Grave Breaches and Universal Jurisdiction
- G. War Crimes and Universal Jurisdiction
- H. War Crimes and Internal Conflicts
- I. The Challenges Facing the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
- J. The International Criminal Court
- K. Due Process of Law
- L. Judicial Independence and Impartiality in International Criminal Tribunals
  - I. The Setting
    - a) The Role of Judicial Independence
    - b) Ensuring Judicial Independence
  - II. International Courts
    - a) Selection of Judges
    - b) The Role of the ICTY President
    - c) When Judges Should Recuse Themselves
    - d) The Courts and the Public
- M. The Contribution Made by International Criminal Tribunals to the Effectiveness of International Law
- N. War Crimes Law Comes of Age

### Chapter 3: The Law of Treaties
- A. Normative and Multilateral Treaties
- B. Interpretation of Treaties
- C. *Jus Cogens* and Invalidity of Treaties
- D. Termination of Treaties
I. Withdrawal and Denunciation 208
II. Material Breach 209
E. Succession to Treaties 211
F. Reservations to Multilateral Treaties 218
   I. From the Unanimity Rule to the “Object and Purpose” Test 218
   II. Appropriateness of the Vienna Regime on Reservations for Human Rights Treaties 224
   III. Admissibility of Reservations to Normative Treaties 227
       a) Reservations to Customary Law 228
       b) Reservations to Peremptory Norms and to Non-Derogable Provisions 232
       c) Severability 234
IV. Reservations to Remedies and Procedural Provisions, and Competence of Human Rights Bodies to Assess Admissibility of Reservations 241

Chapter 4: Humanization of State Responsibility: From Bilateralism to Community Concerns 247
A. Origin of State Responsibility 247
B. Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness: Distress, Necessity, Consent 251
C. Differentiation of Norms 256
   I. Erga omnes Obligations 256
   II. International Crimes 265
D. Rights and Remedies 270
   I. Departure from State-Centric Enforcement 270
   II. Injured States 272
   III. Legal Standing 275
   IV. Choice of Remedies 281
E. Countermeasures 287
   I. The Right to Take Countermeasures 288
   II. Limitations on Countermeasures 293
   III. Countermeasures and Settlement of Disputes 300
F. Diplomatic Protection 301

Chapter 5: Subjects of International Law 307
A. The State 307
   I. Recognition of States 307
   II. Admission to International Organizations 310
   III. Recognition of Governments 313
B. Non-State Actors 314
   I. The Individual as Subject of International Law 314
   II. Individual Access to International Organs and Institutions 319
      a) Trade Organizations Dispute Settlement Mechanisms 319
         i) The World Trade Organization (WTO) 319
         ii) North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) 321
Chapter 6: Sources of International Law

A. State Practice and Opinio Juris
   I. State Practice
   II. Opinio Juris
   III. Inconsistent Practice
   IV. Persistent Objector

B. Relationship Between Custom and Treaty

C. General Principles of Law

D. International Organizations and Sources of International Law
   I. Resolutions and Declarations as Instances of State Practice
   II. Role of NGOs

E. Peremptory Rules
   I. The Acceptance of Jus Cogens
   II. Sources of Peremptory Rules
   III. Extension of the Concept of Jus Cogens beyond Law of Treaties

F. Revival of Customary Humanitarian Law
   I. Modern Customary Law as Applied by Non-Criminal Tribunals
   II. The ICTY's Conservative Approach to Customary Law
   III. Approaches of Other International Criminal Tribunals

Concluding Observations

Chapter 7: International Courts

A. The International Court of Justice

B. The European Court of Human Rights
   I. Character of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
   II. Reservations
   III. Interpretation of Treaties
IV. State Sovereignty, Consent to the Convention and Admission to the Council of Europe 446

V. Protection of the Environment 446
   a) A Right to a Healthy Environment 447
   b) Environmental Quality and the Protection of Existing Human Rights.
      i) Respect of Private Life, Home and Property 451
      ii) The Right to Life 454
      iii) Right to Information and Participation in Decision-Making 456
      iv) Access to Remedies 458
      v) Indigenous Rights 459

VI. State Responsibility: Erga Omnes Obligations 461

VII. State Responsibility: Diplomatic Protection 462

VIII. Responsibility and Territoriality 462

IX. State Responsibility for Non-Governmental Acts and Imputability (Drittwirkung) 466

X. International Humanitarian Law: Application of the Principle of Proportionality and Limits to Collateral Damage 470

Chapter 8: UN Institutions and the Protection of Human Rights 473

A. Human Rights, Development and Financial Institutions 475
   I. Approaches to Development Issues 476
      a) Right to Development 476
      b) Sustainable Development 477
   II. Human Rights and International Financial Institutions 478

B. Human Rights and the United Nations Practice under the Charter 483
   I. Human Rights and Peacekeeping Operations 483
   II. Promotion of Democracy, Election Monitoring and Nation Building 486
      a) Normative Standards 486
      b) Practice 492
   III. Humanitarian and Human Rights Factors in Sanctions 497
      a) Humanitarian Exemptions 502
      b) Application of Humanitarian Law to Sanctions Programs 507
   IV. Multilateral Intervention 509
      a) Humanitarian Assistance 509
      b) Interventions under Security Council Resolutions 510
      c) Other Multilateral Interventions 517
      d) Rhetoric and Reality 526

Index 527