

# Beyond Self-Control: Analysis and Critique of Gottfredson & Hirschi's General Theory of Crime (1990)

Some Considerations on Theory Construction  
and Theoretical Integration  
in Positivist/Etiological Criminology

Stefan Schulz



Duncker & Humblot • Berlin

# Contents

<b>1. Introduction</b> .....	1
<b>2. Criminological theorizing today</b> .....	5
2.1 The state of criminological theory.....	5
2.2 The mutual relevance of criminology and criminal justice.....	16
2.2.1 Criminology and the criminal law.....	19
2.2.2 Criminology and corrections.....	21
2.3 The desirability of general theories of crime: exigencies.....	24
<b>3. 'A General Theory of Crime' (Gottfredson and Hirschi, 1990)</b> .....	27
3.1 Foundations.....	27
3.1.1 Aspirations.....	28
3.1.2 Assumptions.....	29
3.1.2.1 What is crime?.....	29
3.1.2.2 A modern version of the classical conception of crime.....	31
3.2 Theme, structure and propositions.....	34
3.2.1 Against positivism.....	35
3.2.2 Crime, free will, and choice.....	36
3.2.2.1 'Absent' a conception of the dependent variable (crime).....	38
3.2.2.2 The agency of the offender.....	41
3.2.2.3 The notion of crime: acts of force and fraud.....	43
3.2.2.3.1 Force, fraud, and self-interest.....	43
3.2.2.4 Self-control.....	48
3.2.2.4.1 The theoretical function of self-control.....	49
3.2.2.4.2 The descriptive/predictive features of self-control.....	49
3.2.2.4.3 The formation of self-control.....	51
3.2.2.4.4 Self-control and criminality.....	52
3.2.2.5 Opportunity.....	53

<b>4. Towards an analytical framework</b> .....	54
4.1 Under focus: action, individuals, groups .....	54
4.2 The sociological model of explanation .....	56
4.2.1 The 'basic' model .....	59
4.2.2 Sociological versus psychological explanations .....	60
4.2.3 The definition of the situation and the selection of action	61
4.2.3.1 The definition of the situation .....	61
4.2.3.2 The logic of the selection (action theory) .....	64
4.3 The explicative range of self-control theory .....	65
4.3.1 The logic of the situation according to self-control theory	66
4.3.2 The logic of selection according to self-control theory ....	69
4.3.2.1 <i>Expectancy x value</i> : the initial (peripheral) conditions .....	71
4.3.2.2 <i>Expectancy x value</i> : self-control in operation .....	72
4.4 Limits to generality: What can self-control theory explain? .....	76
<b>5. Theory construction</b> .....	77
5.1 Deductive theories .....	77
5.2 Criteria for (methodological) critique .....	79
<b>6. Self-control theory: a critical appraisal</b> .....	81
6.1 Reception of self-control theory by other scholars .....	82
6.2 Methodological criteria (structure) .....	88
6.2.1 Axiomatic foundations of 'A General Theory of Crime'. 88	
6.2.2 Hypotheses (theorems) .....	90
6.3 Methodological criteria (content, logic and consistency) .....	93
6.3.1 Self-control .....	93
6.3.2 Opportunity .....	99
6.3.3 Versatility .....	106
6.3.4 Stability – crime declines with age .....	120
6.3.4.1 The age critique of criminological theories .....	124
6.3.4.2 Situational explanations of maturational reform	126
6.3.4.3 Social theories of crime and the age effect	130
6.3.4.4 Age, crime, the definition of the situation and human development across the lifespan .....	131

6.3.4.5 The age effect and action ( <i>expectancy x value</i> ) theory .....	132
6.3.4.6 A lifespan approach to social motivation .....	135
<b>7. The empirical status of self-control theory</b> .....	140
7.1 Testing self-control theory.....	141
7.2 Self-control theory through the studies: The core propositions.....	142
7.2.1 Self-control .....	159
7.2.2 Opportunity.....	159
7.2.3 Gender differences in delinquency .....	168
7.3 A meta-analysis of low self-control (Pratt and Cullen, 2000).....	172
7.4 Empirical status: resume.....	174
<b>8. Self-control theory, public policy and ideology</b> .....	177
8.1 Practical yields from self-control theory according to Gottfredson and Hirschi.....	178
8.1.1 'Family empowerment' .....	180
8.1.2 Incapacitation.....	181
8.2 Ideological issues in self-control theory .....	183
8.2.1 'Important reductions in crime'/' Theoretically derived wants' .....	184
8.2.2 Self-control, gender and power positions .....	185
<b>9. Summing up</b> .....	191
9.1 The challenge of criminology .....	191
9.2 Self-control theory .....	193
9.2.1 Self-control theory in brief .....	193
9.2.2 Effects and operation of self-control .....	194
9.2.3 Genesis of self-control .....	195
9.3 Limits to generality.....	197
9.3.1 Prevalence and incidence of complex economic crimes	198
9.3.2 Complex crimes other than economic crimes.....	201
9.4 Performance of self-control theory in empirical studies.....	202
9.4.1 Measuring self-control in operation.....	202
9.4.2 The role of opportunity .....	203
9.4.3 Self-control: unidimensional or multidimensional? .....	205

9.4.4	Self-control theory: confirmed or falsified? .....	207
9.5	Methodological quality .....	213
9.6	No redemption: big noise about modest claims? .....	215
9.6.1	The interpretation of “generality” .....	215
9.6.2	Unexpected spin offs .....	216
9.6.3	Self-control theory and post-modernity .....	218
<b>10.</b>	<b>Looking ahead: on the prospects of theoretical integration .....</b>	<b>220</b>
10.1.	Theoretical integration in criminology .....	221
10.2.	(Back) towards an analytical framework .....	223
10.2.1.	What should be integrated? .....	223
10.2.2.	How to integrate? .....	224
10.3.	Levels of explanation .....	232
10.4.	Macro-, micro- and individual level theories .....	234
10.4.1	Macro-level analysis .....	235
10.4.1.1	Anomie theory (Robert K. Merton, 1938) .....	235
10.4.2	Micro-level analysis .....	239
10.4.2.1	Social learning (Ronald L. Akers, 1998) .....	239
10.4.2.2	‘Biosocial’ criminology .....	242
10.4.2.3	Control theory (Travis Hirschi, 1969) .....	245
10.4.2.4	Self-control theory (Michael R. Gottfredson and Travis Hirschi, 1990) .....	248
10.5	Fears of reductionism .....	251
10.6	Partial criminological theories and limitation of scope .....	252
<b>11.</b>	<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>255</b>
	<b>Epilogue: Beyond self-control .....</b>	<b>259</b>
	<b>Appendix 1 Grasmick et al.’s (1993) Self-control Scale Items .....</b>	<b>260</b>
	<b>Appendix 2 Pratt and Cullen (2000) Empirical Studies Sample .....</b>	<b>261</b>
	List of Tables .....	XVII
	List of Figures .....	XVII
	List of Text-boxes .....	XVIII
	<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>262</b>