Divergences of Property Law, an Obstacle to the Internal Market?

edited by
Ulrich Drobnig,
Henk J. Snijders,
Erik-Jan Zippro
A. General Introduction

1. Divergences of Property Law, an Obstacle to the Internal Market?
Ulrich Drobnig, Henk J. Snijders and Erik-Jan Zippro

1.1 Prologue
1.2 Summary of the contributions
1.3 Conclusions

B. Transfer and Creation of Property Rights in General

2. General Aspects of Transfer and Creation of Property Rights including Security Rights
Frank M.J. Verstijlen

2.1 Introduction
2.2 Different legal systems
2.3 Divergences in the creation and transfer of property rights and the internal market
2.4 Obstacles relating to the closed list of property rights especially security rights
2.5 Competition between legal systems
2.6 Transaction costs
2.7 Private international law problems
2.8 European action
2.9 Conclusion
3. General Aspects of Transfer and Creation of Property Rights, including Security Rights
   Comments by Torgny Hästad

   3.1 Introduction 37
   3.2 Passing of property, main issues 37
   3.3 Seller's insolvency 40
   3.4 Buyer's insolvency 41
   3.5 Invalidity, causal or abstraction principles, bona fidei acquisitions 43
   3.6 Other breaches of contract, conditions 44
   3.7 Sales for another and acquisitions for another 44

C. Effects of Security Rights

4. The Effect of Security Rights Inter Partes
   Andrew J M Steven

   4.1 Introduction 47
   4.2 True securities and functional securities 48
   4.3 Creating the contractual nexus 49
   4.4 What obligations can be secured? 50
   4.5 Obligations on the parties whilst the security subsists 51
   4.6 Obligations on the parties when the security is being enforced 54
   4.7 Effect of the invalidity of the security agreement 56
   4.8 Areas for consideration if harmonisation is to take place 58
   4.9 Conclusion 61
   Appendix 62

5. The Effect of Security Rights Inter Partes; some observations from a Netherlands law perspective
   Comments by Reinout D. Vriesendorp

   5.1 Introduction 63
   5.2 The distinction between “genuine” and “functional” securities; the obligations to be secured 64
   5.3 The obligations to be secured 64
   5.4 The obligations of the debtor vis-à-vis the creditor 66
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.5 The obligations of the creditor vis-à-vis the debtor</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Limitations on freedom of contract and judicial involvement for enforcement</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Harmonisation of European security law: yes or no?</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Effect of Security Rights vis-à-vis Third Persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eric Dirix</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Introduction</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Pari-passu principle</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Ranking of creditors</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Priority conflicts</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Enforcement of security rights and third parties</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Transfer of secured claims</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Effect of Security Rights vis-à-vis Third Persons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments by Meinhard Lukas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Collateral Security Law in the European Context</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Publicity</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Purchase Money Security Rights</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Concluding remarks</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Recognition and Adaptation of Foreign Security Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulrich Drobnig</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Recognition and Adaptation of Foreign Security Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 The Issues</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 Practical Reactions by Stakeholders</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Conclusions</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9. Recognition, Enforcement and Transformation of Foreign Proprietary Rights – a handful of observations and suggestions

Comments by Maurice V. Polak

9.1 Introduction 117
9.2 European legislation and Dutch implementation: Article 4 of the Directive on combating late payment in commercial transactions and Article 92a of Book 3 of the Civil Code 118
9.3 Transformation of foreign proprietary rights: Dutch legislation-in-the-making and Dutch case law 120
9.4 Can freedom of choice solve the problems? 124
9.5 Towards a functional choice of law rule? 126
9.6 Suggestions for the future 127

E. Consequences of General Standards of EU Law

10. Diversity between National Laws in the Internal Market

Stephen Weatherill

10.1 Introduction 131
10.2 The law governing free movement 131
10.3 The law governing the harmonisation programme 136
10.4 The dynamic nature of the EC legal order 144
10.5 Conclusion 149

F. European Regulation of Security rights

11. Access to Civil Securities and Free Competition in the EU, a Plea for One European Security Right in Movables

Henk J. Snijders

11.1 Introduction 153
11.2 Conclusions of earlier research 153
11.3 Further considerations on the problem 155
11.4 Private international law solutions 156
11.5 Harmonisation and unification of law 157
11.6 A European security right (ESR) in movables 159
11.7 Earlier transnational (draft) rulings 162
11.8 Characteristics and requirements 163

12.
European Regulation of Security Rights
Comments by Eva-Maria Kieninger

12.1 Introduction 165
12.2 The European Security Right (ESR) 166
12.3 Art. 9 UCC as a model 169
12.4 The UNCITRAL Model Law 170
12.5 Conclusion 171

G.
Legal, Economic and Social Aspects (analysis of factual obstacles to a properly functioning internal market)

13.
Divergences of the Law on Securities.
A Law and Economics Approach
Boudewijn Bouckaert

13.1 Introduction 175
13.2 Markets and Property Rights. Markets and Securities 176
13.3 Non-possessory securities on movable goods. Economic reflections 179
13.4 Divergences in property rights’ systems: a typology 181
13.5 How to solve the divergence-problem? 187
13.6 Conclusion 192

14.
Analysis of Obstacles to the Proper Functioning of the Internal Market: Legal, Economic and Social Aspects
Comments by Georges Affaki

14.1 Introduction 195
14.2 Do cross-country differences in the legal rights of secured creditors explain the differences in the development rate of credit activity across the countries? 196
14.3 Does a better developed credit activity cause faster economic growth? 196
14.4 The internal market 197
14.5 Conclusion 198

H. Harmonisation of National Security rights

15. Harmonisation of National Security Rights
Willem (Pim) Rank

15.1 Introduction 201
15.2 Harmonisation 201
15.3 Security rights 202
15.4 Why harmonisation? 204
15.5 Harmonisation is not simple 206
15.6 Methods of harmonisation (instruments) 208
15.7 Restrictive Approach 213
15.8 Functional Approach 214
15.9 Conclusion 215

16. Harmonisation of Security Rights and the Communications on Contract Law
Comments by Jacobien W. Rutgers

16.1 Introduction 217
16.2 The Communications of the European Commission 218
16.3 The Common Frame of Reference and security interests in movables 219
16.4 EU-wide General Conditions 222
16.5 Optional Instrument 223
16.6 Conclusions 227
1. Summary of the Discussion

Summary of the Discussion at Leiden University
Kristof Cox

17.1 Introduction 231
17.2 Divergences in security law as an obstacle to the internal market 231
17.3 Solutions 235
17.4 Conclusion 239