OZONE PROTECTION:
THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL REGIME

by

GILBERT M. BANKOBEZA
### Table of Contents

**FOREWORD**
- xv

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**
- xviii

**INTRODUCTION**
- xix

**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**
- xxii

**CHAPTER I: LEGAL AND POLICY ASPECTS OF THE MONTREAL PROTOCOL REGIME**
- 1 Legal Foundation of the Regime 1
  - 1 Use of Framework Treaties 3
  - 3 Simplified Amendment Procedure, Provisional Treaty Application and Prohibition of Reservation 8
    - (a) Delegated law-making 8
    - (b) Provisional treaty application 11
    - (c) Reservations 12
- 4 The Use of Soft Law 13
- 5 Limiting Sovereignty 18
- 6 Focus on Community and Public Interests 21
- 7 Non-State Actors 24
  - (a) Non-governmental organisations 24
  - (b) The private sector 26
- 8 Conclusion 28

**CHAPTER II: PRINCIPLES UNDERLYING THE MONTREAL PROTOCOL REGIME**
- 1 Introduction 30
- 2 Precautionary Principle 31
  - (a) Historical evolution of the precautionary principle 33
TABLE OF CONTENTS

(b) Application of the precautionary principle in the Vienna Convention and the Montreal Protocol 36
   (i) Adjustment of ozone-depletion potential (ODP) of controlled substances 38
   (ii) Further adjustments and reductions of production and consumption of ozone-depleting substances 39

(c) Application of the precautionary principle in judicial decisions 41
   (i) International Court of Justice (ICJ) 41
   (ii) International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (ITLOS) 42
   (iii) WTO Appellate Body 42
   (iv) National Courts 43

PAKISTAN 43
UNITED KINGDOM 44
AUSTRALIA 44
INDIA 45

(d) Status of the precautionary principle in international law 46

(e) Conclusion 47

3 Sustainable Development 48
(a) Legal framework of sustainable development 50
(b) Elements of sustainable development as applied in the ozone protection regime 50
   (i) The principle of intergenerational equity 51
   (ii) The principle of sustainable use 52
       THE PRINCIPLE OF SUSTAINABLE USE AS APPLIED IN THE OZONE PROTECTION REGIME 52
   (iii) The principle of equitable use 54
       APPLICATION OF THE PRINCIPLE OF EQUITABLE USE TO THE OZONE PROTECTION REGIME 56
   (iv) The principle of integration of environment and development 57
       PHASE-OUT OF OZONE-DEPLETING SUBSTANCES ONLY WHEN SUBSTITUTES OR ALTERNATIVES ARE AVAILABLE 59
       DELAYED PHASE-OUT OF OZONE-DEPLETING SUBSTANCES TO MEET THE BASIC DOMESTIC NEEDS OF DEVELOPING COUNTRIES 60

(c) Conclusion 61

4 Common But Differentiated Responsibility 61
(a) Fundamentals of common responsibility 63
(b) Differentiated responsibility 64
   (i) Differentiated standards 65
   (ii) Special situation of developing countries 67
   (iii) Provision of technical and financial assistance 68
   (iv) Permitting grace period in implementation of obligations 69

(c) Application of the principle to the Montreal Protocol 69
(d) Sustainability of the principle in international environmental law
   (i) Unequal contribution to environmental damage by states 72
   (ii) Developed countries endowed with technology and more financial resources 73
   (iii) Distinction between current and contextual responsibility 74
   (iv) Other relevant considerations 75
(e) Conclusion 75

5 State Responsibility for Damage to the Environment of Other States or to Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction 76
(a) Obligations for protection of global commons 78
   (i) Customary international law through case law 79
   (ii) Declarations and Resolutions of the United Nations 81
   (iii) Examples of international co-operation under the principle of state responsibility in some environment-related treaties 83
(b) Relevance of the principle to the Montreal Protocol régime 84
   (i) Emphasis on causal connection 85
   (ii) No absolute or strict liability for transboundary environmental damage 86
   (iii) Timing for determination of an activity to be injurious to interstate environmental safety 87
   (iv) Responsibility separated from liability 87
   (v) Obligation to cooperate 89
(c) Conclusion 89

CHAPTER III: ENVIRONMENTAL GOVERNANCE WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO OZONE PROTECTION 92
1 Introduction 92
2 Legal Profile of Environmental Institutions 95
   (a) Treaties as a source of legal obligations 95
   (b) The phenomenon of Conference/Meeting of the Parties 97
      (i) The Vienna Ozone Convention 98
      (ii) The Montreal Protocol 99
   (c) Legal character of the Conference/Meeting of the Parties 99
      (i) Legal powers set out in the Convention 99
      (ii) Implied powers 100
   (d) Decision-making powers 102
      (i) Procedural matters 103
      (ii) Substantive matters 103
      AMENDMENTS TO THE CONVENTION OR PROTOCOL 104
      AMENDMENTS TO THE ANNEXES TO THE CONVENTION OR PROTOCOL 105
      ADOPTION OF NEW PROTOCOLS 105
      (iii) Decision-making in the ozone protection regime 106
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONSENSUS</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAJORITY VOTING</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOUBLE MAJORITY VOTING</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEIGHTED VOTING</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Governance Through Institutions of the Montreal Protocol</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Meeting of the Parties and its functions</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Adoption of rules of procedure</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Adoption of financial rules</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Establishment of Assessment Panels</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Adoption of procedures for determining non-compliance</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) Establishment of a mechanism for financial and technical co-operation</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vi) Adjustments and reductions of ozone-depleting substances</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vii) Adoption of amendments</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE LONDON AMENDMENT</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE COPENHAGEN AMENDMENT</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE MONTREAL AMENDMENT</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE BEIJING AMENDMENT</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(viii) Establishing guidelines for reporting information</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ix) Powers of treaty interpretation</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(x) Policy-making functions</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The Secretariat</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Functions of the Secretariat</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON CONTROL OF TRADE WITH NON-PARTIES (ARTICLE 4)</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON CONTROL OF TRADE WITH PARTIES (ARTICLE 4A)</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON LICENSING SYSTEMS (ARTICLE 4B)</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON DETERMINATION OF DEVELOPING COUNTRY STATUS (ARTICLE 5)</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON MEETING THE BASIC DOMESTIC NEEDS OF DEVELOPING COUNTRIES (ARTICLE 5, PARAGRAPH 8)</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS RELATED TO THE WORK OF ASSESSMENT PANELS (ARTICLE 6)</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON REPORTING OF DATA</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROVISIONS OF THE NON-COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE (ARTICLE 8)</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE FINANCIAL MECHANISM AND TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER (ARTICLE 10 AND 10A)</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECISIONS ON FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS (ARTICLE 13)</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Legal value of some Secretariat recommendations</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS BASED ON ANALYSIS OF DATA ON PRODUCTION AND CONSUMPTION OF OZONE-DEPLETING SUBSTANCES</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Recommendations on Classification of Developing Countries** 135  
Oversight of Projects by the Secretariat of the Multilateral Fund 136  
(iii) Legal personality of the Secretariat 136  
(iv) Indirect influence of the Secretariat 138  
(c) Subsidiary bodies 139  
(i) Powers of subsidiary bodies 140  
Adoption of Binding Acts 140  
Adoption of Recommendations 140  
(ii) Functions of subsidiary bodies under the Montreal Protocol 142  
(A) Subsidiary Bodies for Policy and Technical Advice 143  
The Bureau 143  
Assessment Panels 143  
Open-ended Working Group 147  
(B) Subsidiary Body for Financial Mechanism and Technology Transfer 148  
(C) Subsidiary Body for Implementation and Compliance 150  
4 Issues of Legal Personality 152  
(a) Origins of legal personality 152  
(b) Elements of legal personality 154  
(i) Legal capacity 155  
(ii) Legal capacity of institutions created by environmental organisations 156  
(iii) Legal capacity under domestic law 158  
(iv) Legal capacity arising out of competence 159  
(c) Privileges and immunities 159  
(i) Privileges and immunities attached to the organisation 161  
(ii) Privileges and immunities attached to representatives and personnel 162  
Representatives of Member States (or Parties) 162  
Officials of the Organisation and Other Agents 163  
(d) Effects of international legal personality 164  
5 Role of NGOs in Environmental Governance 164  
(a) Identification of issues requiring action 166  
(b) Developing environmental norms and monitoring compliance 168  
(c) Participation as observers in international negotiations 171  
(d) Participation in the national implementation of principles and rules 172  
6 The Strength and Weakness of Current Institutional Arrangements 173  
(a) The strength of institutional arrangements 174
TABLE OF CONTENTS

(i) Contribution to the development of international environmental law 174
(ii) Implementation of and compliance with legal obligations 175
(iii) Co-operation and co-ordination 176
(iv) Settlement of disputes 177
(b) The weakness 178
   (i) Problem of "institutional fatigue" 178
   (ii) Problem of "treaty congestion" 179

7 Conclusion 180

CHAPTER IV: ENVIRONMENTAL FINANCING: TRUST FUNDS FOR OZONE PROTECTION 182
1 Introduction 182
2 Trust Funds for the Vienna Convention and the Montreal Protocol 184
   (a) Terms of reference for the administration of the trust funds 184
      (i) Rights of ownership of property subject to a trust are divided between the trustee and the beneficiaries 185
      (ii) A trustee must keep trust property separate from his own property 185
      (iii) A trust is not a legal entity 186
      (iv) A trustee to administer the trust solely in the interest of the beneficiary 187
      (v) Trustee must use reasonable care and skill 187
   (b) Non-voluntary nature of the trust funds 188
   (c) Activities financed by the Montreal Protocol Trust Fund 190
3 Establishment of the Multilateral Fund 191
   (a) The idea of a financial mechanism for the Montreal Protocol 192
   (b) Amendment of the Montreal Protocol to establish the financial mechanism 193
   (c) Terms of reference of the trust fund for the Multilateral Fund 195
      (i) Roles of implementing agencies 196
      (ii) Budget and contributions 198
      (iii) Administration of the Fund 201
      (iv) Terms of reference of the Executive Committee 202
4 Linking Financial Mechanism and Technology Transfer 205
5 The Concept of Incremental Costs 210
   (a) Indicative list of categories of incremental costs under the financial mechanism of the Montreal Protocol 211
      (i) Framework of general principles 212
      (ii) Agreed incremental costs 213
      SUPPLY OF SUBSTITUTES
      USE IN MANUFACTURING AS AN INTERMEDIATE GOOD
      END USE
      214
TABLE OF CONTENTS

5 Conclusion 216

CHAPTER V: COMPLIANCE REGIME OF THE MONTREAL PROTOCOL 218

1 Introduction 218

(a) Background to the dispute settlement procedure under treaty law and MEAs 220
(b) The emerging compliance regime 224

2 Monitoring Compliance 226

(a) Implementation as a tool for compliance 227
(b) Reporting of data as a monitoring measure 228
(c) Monitoring as a supervision technique by international institutions 230
(d) Compliance incentives 232
   (i) Financial assistance 233
   (ii) Financial mechanism of the Montreal Protocol 234
   (iii) Common but differentiated responsibilities 237
   (iv) Transfer of technology 239

3 Enforcing Compliance 242

(a) Players in compliance enforcement 242
   (i) Enforcement by States 243
   (ii) Enforcement by international organisations 244
   (iii) Enforcement by non-state actors 244
(b) Means of enforcing compliance 245
   (i) Suspension 245
   (ii) Withdrawal of privileges 247
   (iii) Trade restrictions 248
   (iv) Dispute settlement procedures 250
   (v) State responsibility for enforcing treaty obligations 253
   (vi) Issuing cautionary statements 255

4 Non-Compliance Procedure of the Montreal Protocol 256

(a) A new approach in monitoring compliance 256
(b) The Non-Compliance Procedure 260
   (i) Membership and functions of the Implementation Committee 260
   PROCEDURES AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION COMMITTEE 264
   RECOMMENDATIONS ON DATA REPORTING 265
   RECOMMENDATIONS ON CLASSIFICATION OF DEVELOPING COUNTRIES 266
   RECOMMENDATIONS ON COMPLIANCE BY SPECIFIC PARTIES 267
   (ii) The Secretariat 267
   (iii) The Meeting of the Parties 268
| (c) Submissions on non-compliance | 270 |
| (d) Decision-making under the Non-Compliance Procedure | 272 |
| (e) Due process under the Non-Compliance Procedure | 276 |
| (i) Notification | 276 |
| (ii) Right to a fair hearing | 279 |
| (iii) Impartiality | 279 |
| (iv) Confidentiality | 280 |
| (v) Transparency | 281 |
| (f) Rationale for the establishment of the NCP | 281 |
| (i) Elimination of economic benefits due to non-compliance | 282 |
| (ii) Creation of internal non-compliance resolution without external adjudication | 282 |
| (iii) The Non-Compliance Procedure requires no “injured state” | 283 |
| (iv) Ensuring the fulfilment of non-reciprocal obligations | 283 |
| (v) Emphasis on prevention and cessation of harmful activity | 283 |

5 Relevant Aspects of Procedures and Mechanisms for Compliance Developed Under Other MEAs | 284 |
| (a) Monitoring as a supervision technique by international institutions | 285 |
| (b) Common but differentiated responsibilities | 285 |
| (c) Players in compliance enforcement | 286 |
| (i) Enforcement by states | 286 |
| (ii) Enforcement by international institutions | 287 |
| (iii) Enforcement by non-state actors | 287 |
| (d) Means of enforcing compliance | 288 |
| (i) Suspension | 289 |
| (ii) Trade restrictions | 289 |
| (iii) Issuing cautionary statements | 290 |
| (e) Composition of Compliance Committees | 290 |
| Membership of the Implementation Committee | 291 |
| (f) Submissions on non-compliance | 292 |
| Submission of action plans to return to compliance | 293 |
| (g) Due process | 293 |
| (i) Notification | 294 |
| (ii) Confidentiality | 294 |
| (iii) Right to a fair hearing | 295 |
| (iv) Transparency | 295 |
| (h) Procedures for decision-making | 296 |

6 Compliance Through Cooperation | 297 |
| CO-OPERATION IN THE CONTEXT OF THE MONTREAL PROTOCOL’S COMPLIANCE REGIME | 298 |

7 Conclusion | 300 |
# Table of Contents

**CONCLUSIONS**
- What has the Montreal Protocol achieved? 307
- Looking ahead at the future implementation of the Montreal Protocol 308

**ANNEX I: Terms of Reference for the Multilateral Fund** 313

**ANNEX II: Juridical Personality, Privileges and Immunities of the Multilateral Fund** 316

**ANNEX III: Agreement between the Government Of Canada and the United Nations ...** 317

**ANNEX IV: Non-Compliance Procedure of the Montreal Protocol** 321

**ANNEX V: Indicative List of Measures that might be Taken by a Meeting of the Parties in Respect of Non-Compliance with the Protocol** 324

**BIBLIOGRAPHY** 325

**INDEX** 337