Competition Law and Consumer Protection

Katalin Judit Cseres
# Contents

Abbreviations xiii

**Introduction** 1

Definition of the research problem 1
The method of the research 5
The plan of the book 6

1 **Law and economics** 11

1.1 Why law and economics? 11
1.2 What is law and economics? 12
1.2.1 The method of law and economics 12
1.2.2 The role of economic analysis 14
1.2.3 Economic efficiency 16
1.2.4 Standards of welfare economics 17
1.2.4.1 Efficiency trade-offs 18
1.2.4.2 Consumer welfare 20
1.2.4.3 Total welfare 21
1.3 Brief history of law and economics 22
1.3.1 Chicago: the school established 23
1.3.2 Posner: the school accepted 24
1.3.3 The school challenged 25
1.4 Europe 28
1.4.1 European Law 32
1.4.2 Centralisation or decentralisation in the EU? 33
1.4.3 Eastern Europe 36
1.4.4 Hungary 36
1.5 Conclusions 38

2 **Schools of thought in law and economics** 41

2.1 US schools 41
2.1.1 The Harvard School 42
2.1.2 The Chicago School 45
2.1.2.1 The goal of antitrust policy: ‘the misleading’ consumer welfare 47
2.1.2.2 Mergers 49
Contents

2.1.2.3  Policy implications 51
2.1.2.4  Vertical agreements 52
2.1.2.5  Tying arrangements 53
2.1.3  The Chicago-Harvard debate 55
2.1.4  Criticism of the Chicago school – the Post-Chicago School 56
2.1.5  Contestable markets 62
2.1.6  New Institutional Economic 63
2.1.7  Transactions costs theory 64
2.1.8  Modern industrial organisation: Game theory 65
2.2  Are information problems antitrust problems? 68
2.2.1  Kodak 68
2.2.2  Information problems revisited 70
2.2.3  The aftermath of Kodak – Microsoft 73
2.3  Conclusions 78

3  European competition law and economics 81

3.1  European schools 82
3.1.1  The Freiburg School 83
3.1.2  The influence of the Freiburg School: policy implicatons 88
3.1.3  The workability of competition 88
3.1.4  The Austrian School 89
3.1.5  Freedom of competition 91
3.2  The European Community 92
3.2.1  The foundations: the Freiburg School 92
3.2.2  The enforcement of European competition law 94
3.2.3  Departure from the Freiburg School 96
3.2.3.1  From an economic constitution to a political constitution 96
3.2.3.2  From the Ordoliberal framework to an economic framework 99
3.2.4  The role of economic theories in EC competition law 101
3.2.4.1  Harvard influence in Europe 101
3.2.4.2  The attractiveness of Harvard for EC competition law 102
3.2.5  Modernisation of competition law 104
3.2.5.1  Modernisation in the narrow sense 104
3.2.5.2  Modernisation in the broad sense 106
3.2.5.3  The purpose of modernisation 107
3.3  Increasing the role of economics in competition law 108
3.3.1  The Commission’s conceptual framework: a ‘European School of thought’? 109
3.3.2  Economic analysis in the Commission’s Notice on the definition of the relevant market 111
3.3.2.1 The SSNIP test 113
3.3.2.2 The shortcomings of the SSNIP test 114
3.3.2.3 The evaluation of the Notice 115
3.3.3 From economic freedom to consumer welfare: Article 81 (1) and (3) EC 116
  3.3.3.1 The narrow interpretation of Article 81 EC 116
  3.3.3.2 Regulation 1/2003 118
  3.3.3.3 Guidelines on the application of Article 81 (3) EC 119
3.3.4 Economic analysis in vertical agreements 120
  3.2.4.1 Forms 122
  3.2.4.2 Effects 122
  3.2.4.3 The old approach 124
  3.2.4.4 The new approach 126
3.3.5 Economic analysis in merger control 131
  3.3.5.1 The substantive test in the old Regulation 132
    3.3.5.1.1 The dominance test 132
    3.3.5.1.2 The Airtours judgement 134
    3.3.5.1.3 Learning from the defeat: Airtours, Schneider/Legrand and Tetra Laval/Sidel 135
  3.3.5.2 The new substantive test 137
  3.3.5.3 Efficiencies 139
    3.3.5.3.1 The old approach 140
    3.3.5.3.2 The new approach 141
    3.3.5.3.3 Efficiency arguments under Article 81 (3) EC and Article 2 (1) Merger Regulation 144
3.3.6 The new chief economist 145
3.4 Conclusions: the new shape of European competition policy 147

4 Consumer protection 151

4.1 The consumerist society 152
4.2 The necessity for state intervention 154
4.3 What is consumer law? 155
  4.3.1 Consumer law as a separate branch of law? 157
4.4 National approaches 158
  4.4.1 Consumer protection in the US 158
  4.4.2 Consumer protection in Western Europe 159
  4.4.3 Germany 160
  4.4.4 Nordic countries 162
  4.4.5 Common law countries 163
  4.4.6 Franco-Roman countries 164
  4.4.7 Consumer protection in Eastern Europe 166
Contents

4.4.7.1 In the centrally-planned economy 166
4.4.7.2 Moderate changes 167
4.4.7.3 Transition 168
4.4.7.4 Summary 170

4.5 Theories of consumer protection 170
4.5.1 Legal theories of consumer protection 172
4.5.1.1 The 'traditional' theory of consumer protection 172
4.5.1.2 German discussion 172
4.5.1.2.1 The information model 173
4.5.1.2.2 The alternative models 174
4.5.1.2.3 A synthesis 175

4.6 A law and economics approach to consumer protection 176
4.6.1 Economics of information 179
4.6.2 Rationality and bounded rationality 182
4.6.3 Transaction costs 184
4.6.4 Information asymmetry 185
4.6.5 Designing consumer protection policies 186
4.6.6 Is regulation a necessary and feasible response? 188

4.7 Conclusions 191

5 Consumer protection in the European Community 193

5.1 The first phase: the beginning 194
5.2 The second phase: becoming autonomous 196
5.2.1 Consumer protection and the internal market 202
5.2.1.1 The significance of consumer law 204
5.2.1.2 The tension between the internal market impetus and consumer protection 206
5.2.2 The European model of consumer protection 209
5.2.2.1 The EC concept of the consumer 210
5.2.2.2 The role of information in the EC model 212
5.3 The third phase: a new approach 214
5.3.1 The rationale and the regulation technique of the new approach 217
5.3.2 Assessment of the new approach: systematic harmonisation v. 'a more fragmented Europeanisation' 220
5.3.3 Economic assessment of the new approach 222
5.3.3.1 Source of the problem: structural or informational 222
5.3.3.2 Necessity and feasibility of Community action 223
5.3.3.2.1 Why a market based solution is unlikely to work 223
5.3.3.2.2 Why the different legal solutions do not work 224
5.3.3.2.3 Why the aims can not be achieved at the national level 225
5.3.3.3 Costs and benefits 228

viii
5.3.4 Problems related to the proposal on unfair commercial practices 230
5.3.5 Problems related to a future European contract law 234
5.4 Conclusions 237

6 Consumer policy and competition policy 241

6.1 The goals of EC competition policy 244
6.1.1 Market integration 246
6.1.2 Freedom of economic action 248
6.1.3 Consumer welfare 251
   6.1.3.1 Consumer welfare considerations in Article 81 (3) EC 252
   6.1.3.2 Efficiency-equity trade-off in merger control 254
6.2 Conflict of goals 255
6.2.1 Freedom of action – consumer welfare: Article 81 (3) EC 256
   6.2.1.1 Which consumer interests? 258
   6.2.1.1.1 The Commission decisions in the past 259
   6.2.1.1.2 Future decisions 261
   6.2.1.1.3 Short-term v. long-term benefits 263
   6.2.1.1.4 Fair share 264
   6.2.1.2 Freedom of action – consumer welfare: outside of Article 81 (3) EC 267
6.2.2 Market integration – competition and consumer welfare: vertical agreements 271
   6.2.2.1 Europe v. US 275
   6.2.2.2 Regulation 2790/1999 275
   6.2.2.3 Consumer interests in vertical agreements 276
6.3 The goals of US antitrust v. Europe: ‘we protect competition, you protect competitors’ 278
   6.3.1 A disappointing experience of divergences through GE/Honeywell 278
   6.3.2 Questionable arguments 280
   6.3.3 In the light of Tetra Laval 283
   6.3.4 The different approaches to mergers 286
   6.3.5 Efficiencies 287
   6.3.6 The differences between the US and EU competition systems 289
   6.3.7 ‘We protect competition, you protect competitors’ 291
6.4 Which welfare standard counts? 293
   6.4.1 Which consumer welfare standard counts? 294
   6.4.2 Whose consumer welfare counts? 297
   6.4.3 How will the modernisation of competition law effect consumers? 297
6.5 Conclusions 303
Contents

7 The interface between consumer protection and competition: complementarities, conflicts and synergies

7.1 'The battle for the soul of antitrust'

7.1.1 The possible goals of competition policy
7.1.2 What are the goals of competition policy?
7.1.3 Which welfare standard counts?
7.1.4 Does it matter which welfare standard is adopted?
7.1.5 Alternatives to the two welfare standards
  7.1.5.1 'Long-term consumer interest'
  7.1.5.2 The balancing weights approach
  7.1.5.3 The 'rebalancing' model
7.2 What are the goals of consumer protection?
7.2.1 Paternalistic model
7.2.2 Liberal model
7.3 Do the goals of competition law correspond with the goals of consumer protection?
  7.3.1 Complements
  7.3.2 Tensions
7.4 Is competition law an effective tool to protect consumers?
  7.4.1 Competitive market v. information problems
  7.4.2 The true focus for consumer protection
  7.4.3 The 'Chicago trap'
  7.4.4 How to avoid the 'Chicago trap'?
  7.4.5 A complicated 'love-hate' relationship
7.5 The relationship between competition law and consumer protection
  7.5.1 The role of economics in the relation between competition policy and consumer protection
  7.5.2 Approaching the relationship between competition and consumer protection
    7.5.2.1 Paternalistic approach
    7.5.2.2 Liberal approach
  7.5.3 The contrast between the two approaches
7.6 Where does the EU fit in?

8 Hungary

8.1 Introduction
8.2 Developments before 1989
8.3 Transition
  8.3.1 The role of competition in the transition period
  8.3.2 The position of consumers during the transition
Contents

9.4 The marriage of consumer protection and competition law: the advantages of combining the enforcement of competition law and consumer protection under one single authority 411
9.5 Impact from the West and East: Proposals for European policy-makers 414

Bibliography 419
Table of cases 441
Index 447