The Contribution of the Rwanda Tribunal to the Development of International Law

by

L.J. van den Herik

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ICTR JUDGEMENTS, DECISIONS AND OTHER DOCUMENTS XIII
LIST OF ICTY JUDGEMENTS, DECISIONS AND OTHER DOCUMENTS XXIII
TABLE OF OTHER CASES XXVII
TABLE OF TREATIES XXXI
LIST OF UNITED NATIONS DOCUMENTS XXXV
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS XLV

INTRODUCTION 1
1 Aim of the research and statement of the problem 3
2 Structure of the thesis 5
3 Methodology 7

I HISTORICAL AND POLITICAL CONTEXT OF THE EVENTS IN RWANDA IN 1994 11
1.1 Reasons for providing background information 11
1.2 Rwanda before the colonisation 14
1.3 The colonisation of Rwanda 17
1.4 Renewed independence for Rwanda 19
1.5 The four years before the genocide (1990-1994) 21
1.6 The genocide (April-July 1994) 25

II THE ESTABLISHMENT, ORGANISATION AND JURISDICTION OF THE ICTR 27
II.1 The Rwandan conflict and the international community 27
II.1.1 The Security Council 28
II.1.2 Special Rapporteurs 29
II.1.3 The Commission of Experts 30
II.2 The establishment of the ICTR 31
II.2.1 The motion on jurisdiction in the Kanyabashi case 33
II.2.2 Rwanda: a threat to the peace? 34
II.2.3 Article 41 of the UN Charter 37
II.2.4 The ICTR as subsidiary organ: impartial and independent? 38

II.3 The pros and cons of an international tribunal 41
   II.3.1 Facilitating several goals 41
   II.3.2 Rwanda’s opposition against the Tribunal 42
   II.3.3 An abundance of objectives 43
   II.3.4 Critical notes 46
   II.3.5 The relationship with national courts 49
   II.3.6 Moderate expectations 56

II.4 The organisation of the ICTR 57
   II.4.1 Chambers 59
   II.4.2 The Prosecution 63
   II.4.3 The Registry 66

II.5 The jurisdiction of the ICTR 67
   II.5.1 Substantive jurisdiction 68
   II.5.2 Personal jurisdiction 71
   II.5.3 Territorial jurisdiction 80
   II.5.4 Temporal jurisdiction 80

II.6 Conclusion 84

III ICTR CASE LAW ON GENOCIDE 87

III.1 The development of the concept of genocide 88
   III.1.1 The doctrinal concept 89
   III.1.2 The legal concept 91
   III.1.3 The definition of the Convention 92
   III.1.4 The Draft Codes of the ILC 95
   III.1.5 Two Special Rapporteurs 96
   III.1.6 The ICTY, ethnic cleansing and genocide 96
   III.1.7 The ICC Statute and Elements of Crimes 98

III.2 The legality of including genocide in the ICTR Statute 99

III.3 Genocide in Rwanda 102

III.4 The mental element 105
   III.4.1 Travaux préparatoires of the 1948 Genocide Convention 106
   III.4.2 Required level of the mental element 108
   III.4.3 Evidence required to prove the mental element 110
   III.4.4 Motive 115
   III.4.5 ‘In whole or in part’ 117
   III.4.6 Evaluation 121

III.5 The protected group 124
   III.5.1 Travaux préparatoires of the 1948 Genocide Convention and early writings 124
Table of contents

III.5.2 The Tutsi as a protected group 127
III.5.3 Evaluation 132

III.6 The physical element 135
III.6.1 Different types of genocide 135
III.6.2 Travaux préparatoires of the 1948 Genocide Convention 137
III.6.3 Killing members of the group 138
III.6.4 Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group 140
III.6.5 Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part 142
III.6.6 Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group 143
III.6.7 Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group 144
III.6.8 Evaluation 145

III.7 Conclusion 147

IV ICTR CASE LAW ON CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY 151
IV.1 Notion and development of the term crimes against humanity 152
IV.2 The ICTR definition and rationale of crimes against humanity 158
   IV.2.1 The Commission of Experts 158
   IV.2.2 ICTR case law 159
IV.3 Part of a widespread or systematic attack against any civilian population 160
   IV.3.1 ‘A widespread or systematic attack’ 161
      IV.3.1.1 The word ‘attack’ 161
      IV.3.1.2 The phrase ‘widespread or systematic’ 163
   IV.3.2 ‘Any civilian population’ 167
   IV.3.3 ‘Part of’ 171
IV.4 The mental element 172
IV.5 The discriminatory element 174
   IV.5.1 Nature of the element: jurisdictional or substantive? 175
   IV.5.2 Enumeration of the grounds 178
IV.6 The physical element 179
   IV.6.1 Murder 180
   IV.6.2 Extermination 183
   IV.6.3 Imprisonment 188
   IV.6.4 Torture 189
   IV.6.5 Rape 191
   IV.6.6 Persecution on political, racial and religious grounds 194
   IV.6.7 Other inhumane acts 195
IV.7 Conclusion 196
## Table of contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>ICTR CASE LAW ON WAR CRIMES</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.1</td>
<td>The regulation of non-international armed conflicts</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.2</td>
<td>The drafting of Article 4 of the ICTR Statute</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3</td>
<td>The legality of Article 4 of the ICTR Statute</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.1</td>
<td>Relevant ICTY findings</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.2</td>
<td>ICTR case law</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.3.3</td>
<td>Evaluation of the case law of the two ad hoc Tribunals</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4</td>
<td>The armed conflict in Rwanda: was it really non-international?</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4.1</td>
<td>A non-internal armed conflict</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4.2</td>
<td>The impact of UN peace operations</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4.3</td>
<td>The involvement of third States</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4.4</td>
<td>The role of Uganda</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4.5</td>
<td>The involvement of France</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.4.6</td>
<td>Evaluation of the ICTR's characterisation of the conflict in Rwanda</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.5</td>
<td>Temporal and territorial applicability of common Article 3 and Additional Protocol II</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6</td>
<td>A direct link between the alleged crime and the armed conflict</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6.1</td>
<td>The class of perpetrators</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6.2</td>
<td>The class of victims</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6.3</td>
<td>Further details on the requirement of a link</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6.4</td>
<td>Some ICTY cases</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6.5</td>
<td>A shift in the ICTR application of the requirement of a connection</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.6.6</td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.7</td>
<td>The criminal acts</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.8</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>THE INTERRELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE THREE CRIMES</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.1</td>
<td>The hierarchy of the three crimes</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.2</td>
<td>Concurrence and cumulative convictions</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.3</td>
<td>Correspondence between the specific crime definitions</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.3.1</td>
<td>Genocide and crimes against humanity</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.3.2</td>
<td>Genocide and war crimes</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.3.3</td>
<td>Crimes against humanity and war crimes: the requirement of a connection</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table of contents

### VII CONCLUSIONS: CONTRIBUTIONS, CHALLENGES AND CONCERNS 261

- VII.1 Rwanda and the ICTR 262
- VII.2 The creation of an international criminal tribunal 265
- VII.3 The ICTR case law on genocide 266
- VII.4 The ICTR case law on crimes against humanity 270
- VII.5 The ICTR case law on war crimes 273
- VII.6 The ICTR and sources of international law 274
- VII.7 The contribution of the ICTR to the development of public international law 278
- VII.8 The ICTR’s legacy: looking towards the future 283

### BIBLIOGRAPHY 285

### INDEX 301

### APPENDICES

- I: Security Council Resolution 955, 8 November 1994 307
- II: Statute of the ICTR 311