

# The Law and Economics of Article 82 EC

Robert O'Donoghue and A Jorge Padilla



• H A R T •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2006

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i> .....	vii
<i>Authors' preface</i> .....	xi
<i>Table of cases</i> .....	xxv
<i>Table of legislation</i> .....	lxiii
<b>1. INTRODUCTION, SCOPE OF APPLICATION, AND BASIC FRAMEWORK</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 INTRODUCTION .....	1
1.2 HISTORY, DEVELOPMENT, AND MODERNISATION OF ARTICLE 82 EC .....	7
1.2.1 The Historical Context Of Article 82 EC .....	8
1.2.2 Development Of Article 82 EC .....	12
1.2.3 The Modernisation Of Article 82 EC .....	16
1.3 ENTITIES AND ACTIVITIES BOUND BY ARTICLE 82 EC.....	21
1.3.1 The Definition Of An Undertaking.....	21
1.3.1.1 Generally.....	21
1.3.1.2 Public bodies as undertakings .....	22
1.3.1.3 Sporting and cultural activities .....	27
1.3.2 State Action Defence .....	28
1.3.3 Parent Liability For A Subsidiary's Actions Under Article 82 EC.....	33
1.4 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ARTICLE 82 EC AND OTHER LEGAL INSTRUMENTS .....	36
1.4.1 Article 82 EC And General Principles of Community Law.....	36
1.4.2 The Relationship Between Article 82 EC And Article 81 EC .....	38
1.4.3 Article 82 EC And Merger Control Laws .....	39
1.4.4 Article 82 EC And The Rules On State Action .....	42
1.4.5 Article 82 EC And Regulation .....	45
1.4.6 Article 82 EC And National Abuse Of Dominance Laws .....	48
1.4.7 Article 82 EC And Arbitration .....	51
1.5 THE BASIC PROCEDURAL FRAMEWORK .....	52
1.5.1 Cooperation Within The Network Of Competition Authorities.....	54
1.5.2 Cooperation Between The Commission And National Courts .....	56
1.5.3 Guidance Letters .....	57
1.5.4 Methods Of Bringing Article 82 EC Claims.....	58
1.5.5 The Conduct Of Commission Proceedings.....	59
1.5.6 Sector Inquiries.....	60

<b>2.</b>	<b>MARKET DEFINITION</b> .....	63
2.1	INTRODUCTION .....	63
2.2	PRODUCT MARKET DEFINITION: BASIC CONCEPTS.....	69
	2.2.1 Demand-Side Substitution.....	69
	2.2.2 Supply-Side Substitution .....	71
	2.2.3 Chains of Substitution .....	75
2.3	RELEVANT PRODUCT MARKETS: FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE .....	76
	2.3.1 Hypothetical Monopolist Test: Overview .....	76
	2.3.2 Assessing Demand-Side Substitution Under The HMT.....	78
	2.3.2.1 Quantitative techniques.....	78
	2.3.2.2 Qualitative evidence .....	86
	2.3.2.3 Other sources of evidence.....	88
	2.3.3 Assessing Supply-Side Substitution Under The HMT .....	89
2.4	GEOGRAPHIC MARKET DEFINITION .....	91
	2.4.1 Key Concepts.....	91
	2.4.2 Defining Geographic Markets In Practice.....	93
2.5	SELECTED ISSUES ON MARKET DEFINITION.....	98
	2.5.1 Impact Of Price Discrimination On Market Definition.....	98
	2.5.2 Market Definition In Tying And Bundling Cases .....	100
	2.5.3 Aftermarkets.....	102
	2.5.4 Market Definition In Two-Sided Industries .....	105
<b>3.</b>	<b>DOMINANCE</b> .....	107
3.1	INTRODUCTION .....	107
3.2	SINGLE FIRM DOMINANCE.....	108
	3.2.1 Basic Approach.....	108
	3.2.2 The Starting Point: Market Shares.....	109
	3.2.3 Barriers To Entry And Expansion .....	116
	3.2.3.1 Definition of barriers to entry.....	117
	3.2.3.2 Characteristics inherent in the relevant market.....	119
	3.2.3.3 Characteristics specific to the allegedly dominant firm.....	124
	3.2.3.4 Conduct of the allegedly dominant firm .....	128
	3.2.4 Countervailing Buyer Power .....	129
	3.2.5 Evidence Of Actual Competition On The Relevant Market.....	134
	3.2.6 Conclusion.....	136
3.3	COLLECTIVE DOMINANCE.....	137
	3.3.1 Introduction.....	137
	3.3.2 The Economics Of Collective Dominance.....	138

---

3.3.2.1	Firms have the incentive to avoid competing.....	139
3.3.2.2	Reaching and maintaining a tacit agreement is feasible .....	141
3.3.2.3	Conclusion .....	146
3.3.3	Legal Principles Governing Collective Dominance .....	146
3.3.3.1	Evolution.....	146
3.3.3.2	Establishing collective dominance under Article 82 EC.....	151
3.3.3	Selected Issues On Collective Dominance .....	161
3.4	<b>DOMINANT BUYERS</b> .....	165
3.5	<b>“SUPERDOMINANCE”</b> .....	166
3.6	<b>COMPARING DOMINANCE UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC AND OTHER COMMUNITY LEGISLATION</b> .....	169
3.7	<b>SUBSTANTIAL PART OF THE COMMON MARKET</b> .....	173
<b>4.</b>	<b>THE GENERAL CONCEPT OF AN ABUSE</b> .....	174
4.1	INTRODUCTION .....	174
4.2	THE ECONOMICS OF ABUSIVE UNILATERAL CONDUCT.....	178
4.2.1	Evolution Of Economic Thinking On Unilateral Conduct .....	178
4.2.2	Designing Economically Optimal Rules For Unilateral Conduct .....	182
4.2.3	Recent Advances In Defining Exclusionary Conduct.....	184
4.2.3.1	The profit sacrifice test and its close relations.....	185
4.2.3.2	Equally efficient competitor test .....	189
4.2.3.3	Consumer welfare test .....	191
4.3	THE CATEGORIES OF ABUSE UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC .....	194
4.3.1	Exploitative Abuses (Article 82(a)) .....	195
4.3.2	Exclusionary Abuses (Article 82(b)).....	196
4.3.3	Discriminatory Abuses (Article 82(c)).....	202
4.3.4	Tying Abuses (Article 82(d)).....	206
4.3.5	Leveraging Abuses.....	207
4.3.6	The List Of Abuses In Article 82 EC: Illustrative Or Exhaustive?.....	213
4.4	ANTICOMPETITIVE EFFECTS UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC.....	215
4.4.1	The Need For Causation Between Dominance And The Abuse ..	215
4.4.2	The Standard For Anticompetitive Effects Under Article 82 EC ..	217
4.4.3	Identifying Actual Or Likely Anticompetitive Effects.....	221
4.4.4	Harm To Consumers Under The Four Clauses Of Article 82 EC .....	224

4.4.5	The Role Of Intent Evidence.....	225
4.5	OBJECTIVE JUSTIFICATION.....	227
<b>5.</b>	<b>PREDATORY PRICING</b> .....	<b>235</b>
5.1	INTRODUCTION .....	235
5.2	THE ECONOMICS OF PREDATORY PRICING.....	236
5.2.1	Basic Cost Definitions.....	237
5.2.2	Strategic Considerations .....	243
5.3	THE BASIC RULES ON BELOW-COST PRICE CUTTING UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC .....	245
5.3.1	Pricing Below AVC.....	246
5.3.2	Pricing Above AVC/AAC But Below ATC.....	249
5.4	SPECIFIC ISSUES WITH BELOW-COST PRICING UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC.....	252
5.4.1	Recoupment.....	253
5.4.2	Dealing With Joint And Common Costs .....	260
5.4.3	Cross-Subsidies .....	265
5.4.4	Situations Involving High Fixed And Low Variable Costs .....	269
5.4.5	Situations In Which A Product Incurs Inevitable Start-Up Losses .....	272
5.5	EXCLUSIONARY ABOVE-COST PRICE CUTS UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC.....	274
5.6	OBJECTIVE JUSTIFICATION.....	283
5.6.1	Introduction.....	283
5.6.2	Meeting Competition .....	284
5.6.3	Short-Term Promotional Offers.....	290
5.6.4	Market-Expanding Efficiencies .....	292
5.6.5	Loss-Leading And “Follow On” Revenues .....	296
5.6.6	Excess Capacity And Loss-Minimising .....	300
5.6.7	Miscellaneous Defences .....	301
<b>6.</b>	<b>MARGIN SQUEEZE</b> .....	<b>303</b>
6.1	INTRODUCTION .....	303
6.2	THE ECONOMICS OF MARGIN SQUEEZE .....	304
6.2.1	Types Of Margin Squeeze .....	304
6.2.2	Basic Economic Conditions For A Margin Squeeze .....	305
6.2.3	Anticompetitive Motivation For A Margin Squeeze.....	307
6.3	BASIC LEGAL CONDITIONS FOR A MARGIN SQUEEZE.....	309

6.4	<b>THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MARGIN SQUEEZE AND OTHER ABUSES</b> .....	321
6.4.1	Margin Squeeze And Excessive Pricing.....	321
6.4.2	Margin Squeeze And “Pure” Predatory Pricing.....	322
6.4.3	Margin Squeeze And Cross Subsidies .....	324
6.4.4	Margin Squeeze And Refusal To Deal Under Article 82 EC .....	325
6.5	<b>DIFFICULTIES WITH IDENTIFYING AN ANTICOMPETITIVE MARGIN SQUEEZE IN PRACTICE</b> .....	327
6.6	<b>DISCRIMINATORY MARGIN SQUEEZES AND RELATED STRATEGIES</b> .....	339
6.6.1	Problem Stated .....	339
6.6.2	Examples of Discrimination By A Vertically Integrated Dominant Firm.....	340
6.7	<b>CONFLICTS BETWEEN REGULATION AND COMPETITION LAW IN MARGIN SQUEEZE CASES</b> .....	345
7.	<b>EXCLUSIVE DEALING, LOYALTY DISCOUNTS, AND RELATED PRACTICES</b> .....	351
7.1	INTRODUCTION .....	351
7.2	EXCLUSIVE DEALING .....	352
7.2.1	Economics of Exclusive Dealing .....	352
7.2.2	Exclusive Dealing Under Article 82 EC .....	357
7.2.2.1	Evolution of the decisional practice and case law .....	358
7.2.2.2	Assessing exclusive dealing under Article 82 EC.....	361
7.2.3	Practices Falling Short Of Outright Exclusivity .....	368
7.3	LOYALTY DISCOUNTS .....	374
7.3.1	Economics of Loyalty Discounts .....	375
7.3.2	Assessment of Loyalty Discounts Under Article 82 EC .....	381
7.3.2.1	Treatment of loyalty discounts under the case law .....	381
7.3.2.2	Factors that affect the economic effects of loyalty discounts.....	389
7.3.2.3	Alternative proposals for the assessment of loyalty discounts.....	393
7.3.3	Objective Justification .....	399
7.4	<b>SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION</b> .....	403
8.	<b>REFUSAL TO DEAL</b> .....	407
8.1	INTRODUCTION .....	407

8.2	THE ECONOMICS OF REFUSAL TO DEAL.....	415
8.2.1	IP Rights.....	415
8.2.2	Physical Property.....	421
8.3	THE DUTY TO DEAL WITH COMPETITORS.....	423
8.3.1	Evolution Of The Decisional Practice And Case Law.....	423
8.3.2	The Legal Conditions For A Duty To Deal With Rivals Under Article 82 EC.....	433
8.3.2.1	First contracts or licences.....	434
8.3.2.2	How many contracts must be concluded by the dominant firm.....	454
8.3.2.3	Terminating a course of dealing.....	458
8.3.2.4	Relevance of the source and perceived value of the property right.....	462
8.4	DUTY TO DEAL WITH CUSTOMERS UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC.....	463
8.4.1	The Duty To Supply Inputs To Customers.....	464
8.4.2	Refusals To Deal Arising At The Level Of Distribution Or Resale.....	467
8.4.3	Refusal To Deal And Parallel Trade.....	471
9.	TYING AND BUNDLING.....	477
9.1.	INTRODUCTION.....	477
9.2	THE ECONOMICS OF TYING AND BUNDLING.....	480
9.2.1	Efficiency Motivations.....	481
9.2.2	Possible Anticompetitive Motivations.....	483
9.2.3	Empirical Evidence.....	489
9.2.4	Conclusions.....	491
9.3	THE APPROACH TO TYING AND BUNDLING UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC.....	491
9.3.1	Contractual Tying.....	492
9.3.2	Technological Tying.....	495
9.3.3	<i>Microsoft</i> .....	496
9.3.4	Mixed Bundling.....	500
9.3.4.1	Overview.....	500
9.3.4.2	The legal treatment of mixed bundling.....	501
9.3.5	Tying In Aftermarkets.....	508
9.3.6	Classifying the overall approach to tying under Article 82 EC.....	509
9.4	SUGGESTED ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES TO TYING.....	511
9.5	CONCLUSIONS.....	517

<b>10.</b>	<b>EXCLUSIONARY NON-PRICE ABUSES</b> .....	519
10.1	INTRODUCTION .....	519
10.2	EXAMPLES OF EXCLUSIONARY NON-PRICE ABUSES .....	522
	10.2.1 Predatory Design Changes/Product Introduction .....	523
	10.2.2 Vexatious Litigation .....	526
	10.2.3 Use And Abuse Of Regulatory Or Government Procedures .....	529
	10.2.4 Abuses In Standard-Setting Organisations .....	535
	10.2.5 Abusive Acquisition Or Accumulation Of IPRs.....	543
	10.2.6 Miscellaneous Practices.....	548
<b>11.</b>	<b>ABUSIVE DISCRIMINATION</b> .....	552
11.1	INTRODUCTION .....	552
11.2	THE ECONOMICS OF PRICE DISCRIMINATION .....	556
	11.2.1 Conditions For Price Discrimination .....	556
	11.2.2 Welfare Effects Of Price Discrimination .....	558
	11.2.3 Conclusion .....	561
11.3	LEGAL CONDITIONS FOR ABUSIVE DISCRIMINATION .....	562
	11.3.1 Equivalent Transactions .....	563
	11.3.2 Dissimilar Conditions .....	567
	11.3.3 Competitive Disadvantage .....	568
11.4	SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF ABUSIVE DISCRIMINATION UNDER ARTICLE 82(C) .....	573
	11.4.1 Pure Secondary-Line Discrimination .....	574
	11.4.2 Nationality Discrimination .....	578
	11.4.3 Discrimination Intended To Partition National Markets.....	580
	11.4.4 Most-Favoured Company Clauses.....	585
	11.4.5 Discriminatory Supplies In Times Of Shortage .....	591
11.5	OBJECTIVE JUSTIFICATION.....	592
11.6	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION.....	601
<b>12.</b>	<b>EXCESSIVE PRICES</b> .....	603
12.1	INTRODUCTION .....	603
12.2	THE ECONOMICS OF EXCESSIVE PRICES .....	605
12.3	THE LEGAL TEST(S) FOR EXCESSIVE PRICES.....	608
12.4	DIFFICULTIES WITH THE CURRENT APPROACH TO EXCESSIVE PRICES UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC.....	621
12.5	ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES TO EXCESSIVE PRICING UNDER ARTICLE 82 EC .....	628



12.6	CONCLUSION .....	637
<b>13.</b>	<b>OTHER EXPLOITATIVE ABUSES .....</b>	<b>639</b>
13.1	INTRODUCTION .....	639
13.2	ABUSE OF MONOPSONY PURCHASING POWER .....	640
	13.2.1 Basic Economics Of Monopsony Power .....	640
	13.2.2 Conditions For A Possible Abuse .....	642
13.3	UNFAIR AND EXPLOITATIVE CONTRACT TERMS .....	646
	13.3.1 Reasons For A Limited Case Law .....	646
	13.3.2 Legal Test For Abusive And Unfair Contract Terms.....	648
	13.3.3 Conclusion.....	657
14.	<b>EFFECT ON TRADE.....</b>	<b>659</b>
14.1	INTRODUCTION .....	659
14.2	BASIC LEGAL CONDITIONS FOR EFFECT ON TRADE.....	660
14.3	SPECIFIC APPLICATIONS OF THE EFFECT ON TRADE CONCEPT .....	666
	14.3.1 Abuses Covering Several Member States .....	667
	14.3.2 Abuses Covering A Single Member State.....	668
	14.3.3 Abuses Covering Only A Part Of A Member State .....	671
	14.3.4 Abuses Concerning Trade Outside The EU .....	673
<b>15.</b>	<b>REMEDIES .....</b>	<b>676</b>
15.1	INTRODUCTION .....	676
15.2	GENERAL PRINCIPLES GOVERNING REMEDIES.....	677
	15.2.1 Objectives Of Remedies .....	677
	15.2.2 Remedies Must Be Effective.....	680
	15.2.3 Remedies Must Be Proportionate .....	682
15.3	PRINCIPAL TYPES OF ADMINISTRATIVE DECISIONS.....	683
	15.3.1 Interim Measures .....	683
	15.3.2 Commitment Decisions.....	690
	15.3.2.1 Overview .....	690
	15.3.2.2 Commitment decision procedure .....	695
	15.3.2.3 Legal effect of commitment decisions .....	699
	15.3.3 Undertakings .....	706
	15.3.4 Final Infringement Decisions.....	708
15.4	PRINCIPAL TYPES OF REMEDIES .....	708
	15.4.1 Fines .....	708
	15.4.2 Behavioural Remedies.....	718

---

15.4.2.1	Exclusionary pricing abuses.....	719
15.4.2.2	Remedies for excessive pricing.....	720
15.4.2.3	Remedies in discrimination cases.....	721
15.4.2.4	Compulsory dealing remedies.....	723
15.4.2.5	Remedies in tying cases .....	731
15.4.3	Structural Remedies.....	733
15.4.3.1	Introduction and overview .....	733
15.4.3.2	Conditions for ordering a structural remedy .....	735
15.4.3.3	Case study: <i>Microsoft</i> .....	738
15.5	PRIVATE LITIGATION AND REMEDIES.....	739
15.5.1	Introduction.....	739
15.5.2	Goals Of Private Enforcement .....	740
15.5.3	Legal Basis For Private Enforcement.....	742
15.5.4	Obstacles To Effective Private Enforcement .....	745
15.5.5	Conclusion.....	751
	<i>Index</i> .....	753