STATE CONTINUITY AND NATIONALITY:
THE BALTIC STATES AND RUSSIA
PAST, PRESENT AND FUTURE AS DEFINED BY INTERNATIONAL LAW

Ineta Ziemele
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xxv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. THE PERSISTING SIGNIFICANCE OF NATIONALITY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. STATE CONTINUITY AND NATIONALITY: AN OVERVIEW OF THE ISSUES AND THE LIMITS OF INQUIRY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. THE STATE</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. CLAIMS OF THE BALTIC STATES TO STATE CONTINUITY</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Estonia</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Proclamation of the State (1918)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) The Loss of Independence</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Non-Recognition of Occupation and Illegal Annexation</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Restoration of Independence (1990-91)</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Main Principles of the 1992 Põhiseadus</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Latvia</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Proclamation of the State (1918)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Restoration of Independence (1990-91)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Main Principles of the 1922 Satversme</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Lithuania</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Proclamation of the State (1918)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Restoration of Independence (1990)</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Main Principles of the 1992 Konstitucija</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Conclusions</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. THE VIEW OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION CONCERNING ITS INTERNATIONAL LEGAL STATUS</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Constitutional Developments since 1990</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Declaration on the Russian Sovereign Statehood</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) The New Union Treaty</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Internal Changes during the Process of the Dissolution of the USSR</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

4.2 Continuity of the Russian Federation in the 1993 Constitution 55
4.4 Other Principles of the Constitution 59
4.5 Conclusions 61

5. INTERNATIONAL REACTIONS TO THE CLAIMS OF THE BALTIC STATES AND THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION 63
5.1 Introduction 63
5.2 The Practice of International Organisations 63
   (1) The United Nations 63
       (i) The Baltic States 63
       (ii) The Russian Federation 66
   (2) The International Labour Organisation 68
       (i) The Baltic States 68
       (ii) The Russian Federation 69
   (3) European Institutions 70
       (i) The Baltic States 70
       (ii) The Russian Federation 71
5.3 Bilateral Relations 72
   (1) Diplomatic Relations 72
       (i) The Baltic States 72
       (ii) The Russian Federation 75
   (2) Treaties 77
       (i) The Baltic States 77
       (ii) The Russian Federation 82
   (3) Financial Obligations 84
       (i) The Baltic States 84
       (ii) The Russian Federation 87
   (4) Property Abroad 88
       (i) The Baltic States 88
       (ii) The Russian Federation 90
5.4 Conclusions 91
   (1) The Baltic States 91
   (2) The Russian Federation 92

6. ASSESSMENT OF CLAIMS TO STATE CONTINUITY IN AN INTERNATIONAL LAW CONTEXT 95
6.1 Introduction 95
6.2 International Legal Personality of States 97
6.3 Statehood in International Law 99
   (1) Introduction 99
   (2) The Montevideo Legacy 100
   (3) The Normative Concept of Statehood 102
   (4) Conclusions 105
6.4 State Continuity and/or Identity 109
   (1) Introduction 109
(2) Opinions of Jurists Relating to State Continuity and/or Identity:
A Critical Appraisal 111
(3) Claims to State Continuity during the United Nations Era 118
(4) Conclusions 124
   (i) Applicable principles and rules 124
      A. Inter-temporal law 124
      B. Claim and recognition 126
      C. Prohibition of forcible annexation 126
      D. Self-determination 127
      E. Human rights 127
      F. Change in the territory, the population and the government 128
      G. Continuity v. identity 128
      H. State consent 129
   (ii) Specific observations vis-à-vis the claims of the Baltic States and the
        Russian Federation 130
6.5 State Succession v. State Continuity 133
   (1) Beyond the Two Vienna Conventions 133
   (2) Conclusions 138

III. Nationality 141

7. THE REGULATION OF NATIONALITY IN THE BALTIC STATES 143
7.1 Introduction 143
7.2 Estonia 145
   (1) Constitutional Provisions 145
   (2) Laws on Citizenship 146
   (3) Naturalisation Requirements 148
   (4) The 1993 Aliens Law 150
   (5) Commentary 153
7.3 Latvia 154
   (1) The 1919 Law on Citizenship 154
   (2) The 1994 Law on Citizenship 156
   (3) Naturalisation Requirements 158
   (4) Aliens Legislation 160
   (5) Diplomatic Protection of Latvian Non-Nationals Abroad 164
   (6) Commentary 166
7.4 Lithuania 167
   (1) Constitutional Provisions 167
   (2) The Scope of Lithuanian Nationality before 2003 167
   (3) Naturalisation Requirements 169
   (4) Changes in the Legislation in 2002 170
   (5) Aliens Legislation 171
   (5) Commentary 172
7.5 Conclusions 174
# Table of Contents

8. **THE REGULATION OF NATIONALITY IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION**
   - 8.1 Introduction
   - 8.2 The Constitutional Provisions
   - 8.3 The 1991 Law on Citizenship
   - 8.4 The Right of a Child to Russian Nationality
   - 8.5 Federal Law on State Policy regarding Compatriots Abroad
   - 8.6 The 2002 Citizenship Law
   - 8.7 Commentary

9. **THE REGULATION OF NATIONALITY IN INTERNATIONAL LAW**
   - 9.1 Introduction
   - 9.2 International Law Concept of Nationality
   - 9.3 Traditional Principles
     1. The Hague Convention on Certain Questions Relating to the Conflict of Nationality Laws
     2. The Code of Private International Law
     3. The Harvard Draft Convention on Nationality
   - 9.4 Modern Developments
   - 9.5 Customary International Law and General Principles of International Law
     1. *Jus Sanguinis* and *Jus Soli*
     2. Other Principles
        i. Naturalisation
        ii. *Ex lege* conferral of nationality
   - 9.6 The Effective Link Principle
     1. The Nottebohm Case
     2. The Effective Link Principle in Situations of Territorial Change
        i. Articles on Nationality of Natural Persons in Relation to the Succession of States
        ii. The European Convention on Nationality
        iii. The Council of Europe Commission for Democracy through Law Declaration on the Consequences of State Succession for the Nationality of Natural Persons
   - 9.7 Validity of Nationality in International Law
     i. ‘Conferral’ of nationality for the purposes of international law
     ii. Statehood and nationality
   - 9.8 Conclusions

10. **THE REGULATION OF NATIONALITY IN SITUATIONS OF TERRITORIAL CHANGE: SELECTED STATE PRACTICE**
    - 10.1 Introduction
    - 10.2 Principles relating to Nationality in the Context of State Continuity
      1. Non-Extinction of States despite Changes
         i. Germany
         ii. India
Table of Contents

13.2 Reception of International Human Rights Law in the National Legal Systems:
Main Principles
(1) Estonia
(2) Latvia
(3) Lithuania
(4) Russia

13.3 The Right to a Nationality
(1) Estonia
   (i) General determination of nationals
   (ii) Nationality of children
   (iii) Naturalisation
(2) Latvia
   (i) General determination of nationals
   (ii) Nationality of children
   (iii) Naturalisation
   (iv) Rights of residence and the European Convention on Human Rights
(3) Lithuania
   (i) General determination of nationals
   (ii) Nationality of children
   (iii) Naturalisation
(4) Russia
   (i) General determination of nationals
   (ii) Nationality of children
   (iii) Naturalisation
(5) Summary

13.4 The Non-Discrimination Rule
(1) Estonia
   (i) General prohibition of discrimination
   (ii) Language and other naturalisation requirements
   (iii) Privileged treatment
   (iv) Differences between nationals by birth and nationals through naturalisation
(2) Latvia
   (i) General prohibition of discrimination
   (ii) Language and other naturalisation requirements
   (iii) Privileged treatment
   (iv) Differences between nationals by birth and nationals through naturalisation
(3) Lithuania
   (i) General prohibition of discrimination
   (ii) Language and other naturalisation requirements
   (iii) Privileged treatment
   (iv) Differences between nationals by birth and nationals through naturalisation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4</th>
<th>Russia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>General prohibition of discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii)</td>
<td>Language and other naturalisation requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii)</td>
<td>Privileged treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv)</td>
<td>Differences between nationals by right and nationals through naturalisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13.5 The Principle of the Reduction of Statelessness

(1) Estonia

(2) Latvia

(3) Lithuania

(4) Russia

(5) Summary

13.6 Conclusions

14. NATIONALITY LAWS AND MINORITY RIGHTS IN THE BALTIC STATES

14.1 Introduction

14.2 Background Information

(1) Estonia

(2) Latvia

(3) Lithuania

14.3 Obligations Stemming from Minority Rights Relevant in Matters of Nationality

14.4 Minority Rights of Non-Nationals

14.5 Future Challenges

V. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

Statehood 385

State Continuity 386

Nationality 387

Human Rights 389

The Baltic States 390

The Russian Federation 392

Final Remarks 393

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Selected Studies and Reports on the Baltic States and the Russian Federation 415

INDEX 417