Principles of European Environmental Law

Edited by Prof. Richard Macrory

with Ian Havercroft and Ray Purdy

The Avosetta Series (4)
Proceedings of the Avosetta Group of European Environmental Lawyers
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1

Principles into Practice
Richard Macrory

CHAPTER 2

The Legal Nature of Environmental Principles in International, EC and German Law
Gerd Winter

I Overview of environmental propositions called principles
II The legal nature of environmental principles
1. Principles and policies
2. Principles and rules
3. Principles and the hierarchy of norms
a) General remark
b) German law
c) EC law
d) International law
4. Judicial review of principles
a) The context of providing powers
b) The context of commanding action
III Conclusion

CHAPTER 3

The Genesis of EC Environmental Principles
Ludwig Krämer

1 The birth
1.1 The origins
1.2 Principles in action programmes
2 The integration principle
2.1 Origins
2.2 Treaty amendments
2.3 Procedures inside the Commission
2.4 Sectoral initiatives
2.5 Cardiff process; impact assessments
3 The principle of preventive action
4 The precautionary principle
4.1 Birth of the principle
4.2 Precaution and prevention
4.3 Content
5 The rectification of environmental damage at source
5.1 Origins
5.2 Application
6 The polluter pays principle
6.1 Origins
6.2 State aids
6.3 EC law
6.4 Environmental liability
7 Concluding remarks

CHAPTER 4

The Precautionary Principle before the European Courts
Joanne Scott

I The status of the precautionary principle according to the case law of the European courts
II The implications of the precautionary principle
III The WTO and the elaboration of the precautionary principle

CHAPTER 5

European Environmental Law Principles in Belgian Jurisprudence
Luc Lavrysen

1 Introduction
2 The polluter pays principle
2.1 The Court of Arbitration
2.2 The Flemish Wastewater Tax case
2.3 The Walloon Waste Tax case
2.4 The Flemish Cooling Water Tax case
3 The precautionary principle
3.1 The Aubange-messancy Transmission Line case
3.2 The Wilrijk Waste Incinerator case
3.3 The Sint-Niklaas Waste Incinerator case
4 The prevention at source principle
5 The constitutional rights on the protection of a healthy environment and of privacy – The stand still principle
5.1 The constitutional rights
5.2 The Zolder Race Circuit case
5.3 The Bierset Airport case
5.4 The Brussels National Airport Night Flights case
6 Conclusion

CHAPTER 6

Implementation and Application of Environmental Principles in Danish Law
Peter Pagh
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## CHAPTER 7

**Principles into Practice – The German Case**  
Bernhard W. Wegener

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>101</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>The precautionary principle</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Precaution in the field of air quality protection and emission control</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Precaution under the ‘Bundesimmissionsschutzgesetz’</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The precautionary principle and the question of standing</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Precaution and the justification of environmental protection</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Precaution as a constitutional obligation</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>The polluter pays principle</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>The cooperation principle</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 8

**The Environmental Principles of the EC Treaty as a Legal Basis for Judicial Decisions in the Italian Case Law**  
Stefano Grassi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introductory remarks</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>The need for precautionary protection in the case law of the Constitutional Court</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The enforcement of the precautionary principle in civil case law</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>The precautionary approach in administrative case law</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>The precautionary principle in criminal case law</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>The principle that preventive action should be taken in Italian case law</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The principle that the polluter should pay in Italian case law</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The integration principle and the division of powers in a federal state</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The direct effects of EC environmental principles in Italian case law</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Further Observations on the Application of EC Environmental Principles before Italian National Courts**  
Massimiliano Montini

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 9

**European Environmental Principles in Dutch Case Law**  
Liselotte Smorenburg-van Middelkoop

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Legal principles and Dutch courts</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.2 The provenance of European environmental principles in the Netherlands

1.2.1 The polluter pays principle (het beginsel de vervuiler betaalt)

1.2.2 The precautionary principle (het voorzorgsbeginsel)

1.2.3 The rectification at source principle (het bronbeginsel)

1.2.4 The integration principle (het integratiebeginsel)

1.2.5 Codification of the principles

2 The European environmental principles in Dutch case law

2.1 The polluter pays principle

2.1.1 Is the polluter pays principle a general principle of law?

2.1.2 In the context of which issues is the polluter pays principle referred to?

2.1.3 Case law regarding the polluter pays principle in the context of Article 174(2) EC

2.1.4 Is the polluter pays principle applied ex officio?

2.2 The precautionary principle

2.2.1 A test against the precautionary principle: In the context of legislation, policy or autonomously?

2.2.2 The precautionary principle and Article 3:2 Awb (the general duty of care) or 3:46 Awb (the justification principle)

2.2.3 Administrative case law regarding the precautionary principle and the Wadden Sea

2.2.4 Case law regarding the precautionary principle in the context of Article 174(2) EC

2.2.5 Case law regarding the precautionary principle in the context of Articles 28-30 EC

2.2.6 Civil courts and the precautionary principle

2.2.7 The precautionary principle applied ex officio?

2.3 Rectification at source (het bronbeginsel)

2.3.1 Case law regarding the rectification at source principle in the context of Article 174(2) EC

2.3.2 Case law on the proximity and self-sufficiency principle within the scope of Regulation 259/93

2.3.3 The rectification at source principle applied ex officio?

2.4 The integration principle

2.4.1 Article 21 of the Constitution, does it contain the integration principle?

3 Similar principles that have emerged in the Netherlands

3.1 The ‘alara’ ("as low as reasonably achievable") principle

3.2 The stand still principle

3.3 The substitution principle

4 Conclusions
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 10

The Application and Interpretation of the Core Environmental Principles by the Portuguese Courts
Alexandra Aragão

1 Introduction 161
2 Legal context 161
3 The Portuguese cases 164
3.1 Illegal activities and the prevention principle: Comital Mining case and Azeméis Dairy case 165
3.2 Locally unwanted land uses and the prevention principle: Estarreja Incinerator case and Maia Petrol Pump case 167
3.3 The polluter pays principle: Minderica Dyers and Coruche Stork Nests case 168
3.4 The polluter-pays and prevention principles: first Póvoa de Lanhoso landfill case 169
3.5 The principles of precaution and prevention: Second Póvoa de Lanhoso Landfill case 170
3.6 The principles of prevention and polluter-pays: Cerveira Scrap-ground case 172
3.7 The principles of prevention and integration: Nisa Swallow Nests case and New Bridge case 173
4 Final remarks on the national application of the principles 175
4.1 The precaution principle 175
4.2 The polluter pays principle 176
4.3 The integration principle 176
5 Conclusion 176

CHAPTER 11

The Application of the Core EC Environmental Principles by Spanish Courts
Angel-Manuel Moreno

1 Methodological remarks 181
2 EC environmental principles applied in jurisdictional 'environmental' adjudication. 182
2.1 The polluters pays principle (el que contamina, paga) 183
2.2 The principle of prevention/precaution (principio de cautela y acción preventiva) 188
2.3 Rectification at source, producer or extended responsibility, regional variations, scientific base, and the integration principle. 191
3 Environmental principles enshrined in Spanish legislation 191
4 Conclusions 191
CHAPTER 12  Environmental Principles in the United Kingdom
Richard Macrory and Ian Havercroft

1 Principles in UK legislation 195
2 Environmental principles in UK legislation and policy 197
3 Environmental principles in policy documents 198
4 Significant case law involving environmental principles 200
4.1 Polluter pays principle 200
4.2 The precautionary principle 204
4.3 Prevention at source 209
4.4 Producer or extended responsibility 209
5 Conclusions 212

CHAPTER 13  Environmental Principles – Experiences of Transition Countries
Gyula Bándi 215

CHAPTER 14  Environmental Principles, Modern and Post-modern Law
Nicolas de Sadeleer

1 Introduction 225
2 Modern law 225
3 Post modern law 227
3.1 Dispersion of the law makers 228
3.2 Fragmentation of law 228
3.3 Acceleration of time 229
3.4 Decline of State authority 230
3.5 Increasing dependence of the law on extra-legal spheres 230
3.6 The undermining of the premises of modern law 231
4 Environmental principles represent the interface between modern law and post modern law 231
4.1 Enabling function 232
4.2 Directing function 233
4.3 Interpretative function 234
4.4 Weighing the conflicting interests 235
5 Conclusions 235

Table of Cases 238

Index 250

Contributors 254