Contents

Introduction xi

PART ONE INTERPRETATION 1

Chapter One
What Is Legal Interpretation? 3
1. Definition of Legal Interpretation 3
2. The Limits of Interpretation 16
3. Basic Problems in Interpretation 26
4. Systems of Interpretation in Law 30
5. Advantages and Disadvantages of Interpretive Rules 38
6. The Status and Sources of Interpretive Rules 47
7. Laws of Interpretation, Jurisprudence, and General Hermeneutics 54

Chapter Two
Non-Interpretive Doctrines 61
1. The Essence of Non-Interpretive Doctrines 61
2. Filling in a Gap in a Legal Text 66
3. Resolving Contradictions Normatively 74
4. Correcting Mistakes in the Language of a Text 77
5. Deviating from the Language of the Text to Avoid Absurdity 80
6. Cy Pres Performance 80
7. From Interpretive Theory to Purposive Interpretation 82

PART TWO PURPOSIVE INTERPRETATION 83

Chapter Three
The Essence of Purposive Interpretation 85
1. "Purposive Interpretation": Terminology 85
2. Fundamentals of Purposive Interpretation 88

Chapter Four
The Semantic Component of Purposive Interpretation 97
1. Interpretive Theory and Semantic Theory 97
2. Types of Language 103
3. Canons of Interpretation 107
Chapter Five
The Purposive Component of Purposive Interpretation 110
1. The Essence of Purpose 110
2. Multiple Purposes 113

Chapter Six
Subjective Purpose: Authorial Intent 120
1. The Essence of Subjective Purpose 120
2. Abstract Purpose and Concrete Purpose 126
3. Subjective Purpose and the Problem of Multiple Authors 129
4. Sources of Subjective Purpose 135
5. Subjective Purpose as a Presumption about the Text’s Purpose 145

Chapter Seven
Objective Purpose: Intent of the Reasonable Author; Intent of the System 148
1. The Essence of Objective Purpose 148
2. Sources of Objective Purpose: Internal and External 157
3. Presumptions of Objective Purpose 170
4. Contradictions between Purposive Presumptions 176

Chapter Eight
The Purposive Component: Ultimate Purpose 182
1. The Weight of Subjective and Objective Purpose in Determining Ultimate Purpose 182
2. Type of Text: Will, Contract, Statute, and Constitution 185
3. Type of Text: The Effect of a Text’s Age on Its Ultimate Purpose 191
4. Type of Text: Distinguishing Texts by Scope of Issues Regulated 193
5. Type of Text: Changes in Regime Character and Society’s Fundamental Assumptions 195
6. Type of Text: Texts Based on Rules and Texts Based on Standards 197
7. Type of Text: Content of the Provision 200
8. The Effect of Type of Text on Ultimate Purpose 203
9. Formulating Ultimate Purpose 205

Chapter Nine
Discretion as a Component in Purposive Interpretation 207
1. The Essence of Judicial Discretion 207
2. Situations of Judicial Discretion 214
Chapter Ten
The Theoretical Basis for Purposive Interpretation

1. The Need to Justify a System of Interpretation
2. Social Support for Purposive Interpretation
3. Jurisprudential Support for Purposive Interpretation
4. Hermeneutic Considerations in Favor of Purposive Interpretation
5. Constitutional Considerations in Favor of Purposive Interpretation

Chapter Eleven
Purposive Interpretation and Its Critique of Other Systems of Interpretation

1. Purposive Interpretation and Subjective Systems of Interpretation
2. Purposive Interpretation and Objective Systems of Interpretation: Textualism, “Old” and “New”
3. Purposive Interpretation and Pragmatism
4. Purposive Interpretation and Dworkin’s System of Interpretation
5. Purposive Interpretation and Free Interpretation
6. Critique of Purposive Interpretation and Some Responses

PART THREE INTERPRETATION IN LAW

Chapter Twelve
The Interpretation of Wills

1. The Uniqueness of a Will and How It Affects Interpretation
2. The Language of a Will
3. The Purpose of a Will

Chapter Thirteen
The Interpretation of Contracts

1. The Uniqueness of a Contract and How It Affects Interpretation
2. Contract Theory and Contractual Interpretation
3. The Purpose of a Contract
4. The Subjective Purpose of a Contract
5. Sources of Subjective Purpose
6. The Objective Purpose of a Contract
## CONTENTS

7. Presumptions for Identifying Objective Purpose 334  
8. The Ultimate Purpose of a Contract 336  

**Chapter Fourteen**  
Statutory Interpretation 339  
1. The Uniqueness of a Statute and How It Affects Interpretation 339  
2. The Subjective Purpose of a Statute 341  
3. Subjective Purpose Learned from the Language of a Statute 342  
4. Subjective Purpose Learned from Sources External to the Statute: Legislative History 344  
5. The Objective Purpose of a Statute 350  
6. Sources of Objective Purpose 352  
7. Presumptions of Objective Purpose 358  
8. The Ultimate Purpose of a Statute 363  

**Chapter Fifteen**  
Constitutional Interpretation 370  
1. The Uniqueness of a Constitution and How It Affects Interpretation 370  
2. The Language of a Constitution 372  
3. The Subjective Purpose of a Constitution 375  
4. The Objective Purpose of a Constitution 377  
5. Sources of Objective Purpose 377  
6. The Ultimate Purpose of a Statute 384  

**Appendix 1** The Structure of Legal Interpretation 395  
**Appendix 2** Purposive Interpretation 396  
**Appendix 3** Weighting Subjective and Objective Purposes 397  
**Index** 399