Non-Flag State Enforcement in High Seas Fisheries

ROSEMARY GAIL RAYFUSE

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements v  
Abbreviations xv

## INTRODUCTION

Formulation of the Problem 3  
The Objective of the Study 7  
The Framework for the Enquiry 7  
The Outline and Scope of the Study 10

## PART I  
THE LEGAL BASIS FOR NON-FLAG ENFORCEMENT IN HIGH SEAS FISHERIES

Chapter 1 – The Failure of Flag State Jurisdiction 17  
1.1 Introduction 17  
1.2 Origin and development of the principle of exclusivity of flag state jurisdiction over vessels on the high seas 17  
1.2.1 The principle of the freedom of the seas 17  
1.2.2 Freedom’s corollary – the exclusivity of flag state jurisdiction 21  
1.3 Allocation of jurisdiction – Nationality of ships 22  
1.4 The failure of flag state jurisdiction in the general law of the sea context 24  
1.4.1 Unable or unwilling to regulate/control 24  
1.4.2 Flagging and reflagging to avoid control 25  
1.5 Improving the exercise of flag state jurisdiction: developing flag state responsibilities 26  
1.5.1 Finding the ‘genuine link’ 26  
1.5.2 Establishing ‘effective control’ 28
Table of contents

1.6 The failure of flag state jurisdiction in the high seas fisheries context 30
  1.6.1 Freedom of fishing on the high seas 30
    1.6.1.1 General obligations on states in respect of high seas fisheries 30
    1.6.1.2 Specific obligations of states in respect of high seas fisheries 32
  1.6.2 Problematic consequences of the exercise of the freedom to fish on the high seas 34
    1.6.2.1 'Free riders' 34
    1.6.2.2 Reflagging 35
    1.6.2.3 Lack of flag state responsibility 36
    1.6.2.4 The phenomenon of 'IUU' fishing 37
1.7 Developing flag state responsibilities in the high seas fisheries context 38
  1.7.1 The FAO Compliance Agreement 39
  1.7.2 The United Nations Fish Stocks Agreement 42
    1.7.2.1 'Institutionalisation' of the duty to cooperate 43
    1.7.2.2 'Only those who play by the rules may fish' 44
    1.7.2.3 Establishing 'effective control' 45
1.8 The continuing failure of flag state jurisdiction in the high seas fisheries context 48

Chapter 2 – Non-Flag Enforcement in the General Law of the Sea 51
2.1 Introduction 51
2.2 Situations giving rise to non-flag enforcement in the general law of the sea 52
  2.2.1 Situations provided for in LOSC Article 110 52
    2.2.1.1 Piracy 52
    2.2.1.2 Transporting slaves 54
    2.2.1.3 Unauthorised broadcasting 55
    2.2.1.4 Stateless vessels 56
    2.2.1.5 Disguised vessels of the interfering state 57
  2.2.2 Situations provided for in other treaties 57
  2.2.3 Self defence, including intervention in the case of accidents at sea 59
  2.2.4 United Nations embargoes 60
  2.2.5 Pollution from vessels on the high seas 60
  2.2.6 The question of consent 61
Table of contents

2.3 Modes of exercising non-flag enforcement 61
   2.3.1 At-sea measures 61
      2.3.1.1 The right of approach 62
      2.3.1.2 The right of visit and search 63
      2.3.1.3 Arrest 63
   2.3.2 Port state measures 65
      2.3.2.1 Port state control 65
      2.3.2.2 Port state control vs port state enforcement 69

Chapter 3 – The Juridical Bases for Non-Flag Enforcement in High Seas Fisheries
   3.1 Introduction 71
   3.2 High sea fisheries treaties providing for non-flag enforcement 71
      3.2.1 Bilateral and regional treaties 71
      3.2.2 Global agreements 73
         3.2.2.1 At-sea measures 73
         3.2.2.2 Port state measures 76
   3.3 The driftnet moratorium 78
   3.4 The FSA as an objective regime 82
      3.4.1 Objective regimes and the law of treaties 84
      3.4.2 Objective regimes and public law theories 88
      3.4.3 Objective regimes and subsequent practice 93
         3.4.3.1 The FSA and customary international law 93
         3.4.3.2 State practice 96
         3.4.3.3 Opinio juris 99

PART II
PRACTICE WITHIN REGIONAL FISHERIES ORGANISATIONS

Chapter 4 – Regional Fisheries Organisations Dealing with Anadromous Species
   4.1 Introduction 103
   4.2 The North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organisation 104
      4.2.1 Background 104
      4.2.2 The Convention 104
      4.2.3 The fishery 106
Table of contents

4.2.4 Non-flag enforcement in NASCO 108
  4.2.4.1 Enforcement measures adopted 108
  4.2.4.2 Enforcement practice 113
4.2.5 Discussion 115
4.3 The North Pacific Anadromous Fish Commission 117
  4.3.1 Background 117
  4.3.2 The Convention 119
  4.3.3 The fishery 122
  4.3.4 Non-flag enforcement in the NPAFC 124
    4.3.4.1 The Convention provisions 124
    4.3.4.2 Enforcement measures adopted 126
    4.3.4.3 Enforcement practice 130
  4.3.5 Discussion 134

Chapter 5 – Regional Fisheries Organisations Dealing with Highly Migratory Species 137
5.1 Introduction 137
5.2 The Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission 138
  5.2.1 Background 138
  5.2.2 The Convention 139
  5.2.3 The fishery 141
  5.2.4 Non-flag enforcement in the IATTC 145
  5.2.5 Non-flag enforcement in a renegotiated IATTC 152
  5.2.6 Discussion 155
5.3 The International Commission for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas 157
  5.3.1 Background 157
  5.3.2 The Convention 157
  5.3.3 The fishery 159
  5.3.4 Non-flag enforcement in ICCAT 163
    5.3.4.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 163
      (i) The 1975 ICCAT scheme of joint international inspection 163
      (ii) The 1995 Canadian proposal 165
      (iii) Discussions on a broad based monitoring and inspection scheme 167
      (iv) A general outline of proposed measures for an integrated scheme 168
      (v) The 2002 EU proposal 169
5.3.4.2 Port state controls 174
   (i) The 1978 ICCAT scheme of port inspection 175
   (ii) The 1997 revised port inspection scheme 177
   (iii) The 1998 recommendation banning landings and
        transshipments from non-contracting party vessels 178
   (iv) The 2002 EU proposal 179

5.3.5 Discussion 180

5.4 The Indian Ocean Tuna Commission 182
   5.4.1 Background 182
   5.4.2 The Convention 183
   5.4.3 The fishery 185
   5.4.4 Non-flag enforcement in the IOTC 187
      5.4.4.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 189
      5.4.4.2 Port state controls 190
   5.4.5 Discussion 191

5.5 General Fisheries Commission for the Mediterranean 192
   5.5.1 Background 192
   5.5.2 The Convention 193
   5.5.3 The fishery 193
   5.5.4 Non-flag enforcement in the GFCM 196
   5.5.5 Discussion 197

5.6 Commission for the Conservation of Southern Bluefin Tuna 197
   5.6.1 Background 197
   5.6.2 The Convention 198
   5.6.3 The fishery 199
   5.6.4 Non-flag enforcement in the CCSBT 202
   5.6.5 Discussion 202

Chapter 6 – Regional Fisheries Organisations Dealing with Straddling
Fish Stocks 205

6.1 Introduction 205

6.2 The North-East Atlantic Fisheries Commission 207
   6.2.1 Background 207
   6.2.2 The Convention 208
   6.2.3 The fishery 210
   6.2.4 Non-flag enforcement in NEAFC 212
      6.2.4.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 212
         (i) Between contracting parties 212
         (ii) Against non-contracting parties 217
         (iii) Practice under the NEAFC schemes 217
### Table of contents

6.2.4.2 Port state controls 220
6.2.5 Discussion 222

6.3 The Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Organisation 224
  6.3.1 Background 224
  6.3.2 The Convention 225
  6.3.3 The fishery 226
  6.3.4 Non-flag enforcement in NAFO 234
    6.3.4.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 234
      (i) The ICNAF years 234
      (ii) The 1979 NAFO Scheme of Joint International Enforcement 236
      (iii) The 1988, 1992 and 1995 amendments 236
      (iv) The NAFO Scheme of Joint International Inspection and Surveillance 238
      (v) Non-contracting parties 242
      (vi) Practice under the NAFO schemes 243
        (a) Non-flag boarding and inspection as between contracting parties 243
        (b) Non-flag boarding and inspection of non-contracting party vessels 250
  6.3.5 Discussion 256

6.4 The Commission for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources 259
  6.4.1 Background 259
  6.4.2 The Convention 260
  6.4.3 The fishery 263
  6.4.4 Non-flag enforcement in CCAMLR 272
    6.4.4.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 272
    6.4.4.2 Port state controls 278
  6.4.5 Discussion 282

6.5 The Convention on the Conservation and Management of Pollock Resources in the Central Bering Sea 284
  6.5.1 Background 284
  6.5.2 The Convention 285
  6.5.3 The fishery 288
  6.5.4 Non-flag enforcement in the Central Bering Sea 291
    6.5.4.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 291
    6.5.4.2 Port state controls 293
  6.5.5 Discussion 293
Table of contents

Chapter 7 – Regional Fisheries Organisations Currently Being Established 295

7.1 Introduction 295

7.2 Western Central Pacific Fisheries Commission 296

7.2.1 Background 296

7.2.2 The Convention 299

7.2.3 Non-flag enforcement in the WCPC 302

7.2.3.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 303

7.2.3.2 Port state controls 306

7.2.4 Discussion 306

7.3 South East Atlantic Fisheries Organisation 308

7.3.1 Background 308

7.3.2 The Convention 309

7.3.3 Non-flag enforcement in SEAFO 311

7.3.3.1 At-sea boarding and inspection 312

7.3.3.2 Port state controls 313

7.3.4 Discussion 314

7.4 The Galapagos Agreement 315

7.4.1 Background 315

7.4.2 The Agreement 318

7.4.3 The EU-Chile swordfish dispute 320

7.4.4 Discussion 322

PART III
ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 8 – The Status of Non-Flag Enforcement in High Seas Fisheries 327

8.1 Introduction 327

8.2 The elements of non-flag enforcement: control and sanction 327

8.3 The status of non-flag sanction 329

8.3.1 Non-flag sanction and at-sea boarding and inspection 329

8.3.2 Non-flag sanction and port states 335

8.3.3 Conclusions on non-flag sanction 337

8.4 The status of non-flag control 338

8.4.1 The status of non-flag at-sea boarding and inspection 338

8.4.1.1 Practice within RFOs 339

8.4.1.2 RFOs and non-contracting parties 344

8.4.1.3 Unilateral non-flag boarding and inspection 349

8.4.1.4 Conclusions on the status of non-flag at-sea boarding and inspection 349
8.4.2 The status of non-flag port state controls
  8.4.2.1 Practice within RFOs 351
  8.4.2.2 RFOs and non-contracting parties 353
  8.4.2.3 Unilateral port state controls in support of RFOs 354
  8.4.2.4 Conclusions on the status of port state controls 355

8.5 Conclusions on the status of non-flag enforcement 355

Chapter 9 – Conclusion: The Future of Non-Flag Enforcement in High Seas Fisheries

9.1 Introduction 357
9.2 Overcoming impediments to non-flag enforcement 359
  9.2.1 Overcoming practical impediments to non-flag enforcement 359
  9.2.2 Overcoming legal and political impediments to non-flag enforcement 364
9.3 Non-flag enforcement and third party effect of RFOs 373
9.4 Conclusion 374

Table of Treaties, Agreements and Declarations 377
Table of Legislation 385
Table of Cases 387
Bibliography 389
Index 429