Status and (Human Rights) Obligations of Non-Recognized De Facto Regimes in International Law: The Case of 'Somaliland'

The Resurrection of Somaliland Against All International ‘Odds’: State Collapse, Secession, Non-Recognition and Human Rights

Michael Schoiswohl

Martinus Nijhoff Publishers
LEIDEN / BOSTON
# Table of Contents

**Preface** vii

**Acknowledgments** ix

**Table of Contents** xi

## Part I — State Recognition and Secession

I. Preliminary Remarks
II. Introduction
III. Meaning of Recognition
IV. Recognition of States
V. The Criteria for Statehood
VI. The Loss of Statehood and 'Effectiveness' — State Continuity, State Collapse and Extinction of States
   1. Preliminary Remarks
   2. Statehood and 'Effectiveness' — State Continuity
   3. Failed States — State Collapse
   4. Extinction of States
   5. Conclusion
VII. Statehood and Recognition — Constitutive or Declaratory
VIII. The 'Synthesis' of Fact and Law — 'Evidentiary' and 'Semi-Constitutive' Function of Recognition
IX. Secession and Recognition
   1) Preliminary Remarks
   2) Secession in General and in the Context of State Collapse
   3) The Interplay between Secession, Presumption of Continuity and Recognition
   4) Concluding Remarks
X. Self-Determination and Recognition
   1) Preliminary Remarks
   2) The 'Right' to Self-Determination — An Overview
   3) Self-Determination, Recognition and the 'Thresholds of Effectiveness'
XI. Conclusion
   1) Preliminary Remarks
2) Variants of Non-Recognition 80
3) Non-Recognition and Secession – A Summary 83
4) A Word to State Practice and Methodology 84
5) Policy and Philosophy 87

Part II – The Statehood of Somaliland 95
I. Somalia and Somaliland 97
1) History of Somalia 97
i. Colonization 97
ii. Independence 100
iii. Dictatorship 101
iv. The Somali Civil War 104
2) History of Somaliland and its ‘Independences’ 111
i. Colonial History 111
ii. Somaliland’s Independence in 1960 112
iii. The Somaliland Population after the Civil War in Somalia 115
iv. The Declaration of Independence in 1991 116
v. The Civil War in Somaliland 120
3) Somalia Today 123
4) Somalia – A Failed, Collapsed, or Presumed State? 131
5) Somaliland Today 133
i. The Situation within Somaliland 133
ii. Somaliland’s Position in relation to Somalia 138
II. Independence of Somaliland – Secession vs. Dissolution (of Somalia) 140
1) Preliminary Remarks 140
2) Possible General (non-Legal) Justifications 141
i. Socio-historical – A Greater Somalia vs. Somaliland: the ‘Myth’ of a Somali Nation-State 141
ii. Economical 145
iii. Ethnical 146
iv. Political 147
v. International 149
3) Legal ‘Justifications’ for Secession 150
i. Introduction 150
ii. Historic Title – The 1960 Act of the Union and Restoration of Statehood 152
iii. Self-Determination 157
A. Introduction 157
B. Denied Decolonization – The Analogy to the Eritrean Case 158
Table of Contents

C. ‘Contemporary’ Self-Determination 160
   iv. Human Rights Violations 162
   v. Conclusion 164

III. Non-Recognition of Somaliland 165
   1) Somaliland – Fulfilling the Criteria of Statehood? 165
   2) A Decade of Unrecognized Independence 168
   3) Reasons for Non-Recognition?
      i. Historical 171
      ii. Regional 172
      iii. International 177

IV. Is Somaliland a State? 181
   1) Applying the Law of Recognition: Presumptions and
      Effectiveness 181
   2) Impact of Non-Recognition
      i. Internal 184
      ii. External/International 185
   V. Conclusion 186

Part III – Human Rights Obligations of Non-Recognized
   Entities – The Case of Somaliland 191
I. Preliminary Remarks 193
II. Introduction 194

III. Subjects of International Law 198
   1) Subjects of International Law – General 198
   2) Insurgents and Belligerents 202
   3) De Facto Regimes 206
   4) Conclusion 214

IV. Non-Recognized Entities and ‘Human Rights’
   Obligations 214
   1) Preliminary Remarks 215
   2) Statehood despite Non-Recognition: Customary
      Obligations 216
   3) Obligations of De Facto Regimes Below the Threshold
      of Statehood 219
      i. General 219
      ii. De Facto Regimes and Human Rights Agreements 221
         A. El Salvador 228
         B. Guatemala 231
         C. Other Cases 233
         D. Conclusion 235
iii. ‘Self-imposed’ Human Rights Obligations 238

iv. Minimum ‘Standards of Humanity’ Regarding De Facto Regimes 239

A. Minimum Obligations under International Humanitarian Law 239

B. Declarations of Minimum Humanitarian Standards and Codes of Conduct 250

C. Genocide, Crimes against Humanity and Torture 252

v. Obligations of De Facto Regimes 255

A. General 255

B. Obligations of De Facto Regimes with Respect to ‘Third’ States 256

C. Responsibility of De Facto Regimes for ‘Internal’ Human Rights 261

D. ‘Knock, Knock’ – Is There Any Law? 265

E. ‘Indirect’ Human Rights Obligations 269

a) General 269

b) Validity of Legal Acts of Non-Recognized Entities 270

c) ‘Devolution’ of and ‘Succession’ to Human Rights ‘Obligations’ (Limitations) 275

d) Limited International Personality and Human Rights Obligations: The ‘Functional’ Approach 279

e) Concluding Remarks 284

vi. Human Rights – The Rights of People 286

V. Excursus: Human Rights Obligations of a ‘Parent’ State with Respect to Non-Recognized Entities, Particularly in the Context of a Collapsed State 287

1) Collapsed States and Human Rights Obligations under International Law 287

2) Responsibility of Collapsed States for De Facto Regimes 288

VI. Conclusion 293

1) General 293

2) Application of Different Layers to Somaliland 295

3) Policy Issues and Prospect 298

Part IV – Summary Conclusions 303

Part V – Abbreviations, Resources and Annexes 309

I. Abbreviations 309

II. Index of Authorities 313

1) Treaties 313

2) Peace Agreements 314

3) UN Documents and Other Instruments 315
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4) International Cases, Arbitral Awards and Advisory Opinions</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Domestic Cases and Administrative Decisions</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) Treaties, Digests and Books</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) Journals and Yearbooks</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) News Reports</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9) Miscellaneous</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex I – Map of Somalia</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex II – Map of Somaliland</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex III – Historical Map of Colonial Borders in Africa</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>