International Airline Alliances: EC Competition Law / US Antitrust Law and International Air Transport

Angela Cheng-Jui Lu
Chapter 1: Relevant Background to International Airline Alliances 9

1. Historical Background 10
   1.1. Establishment of the Doctrine of Sovereignty over Airspace—Paris Convention 1919 10
   1.2. Sovereignty and Exchange of Air Operating and Traffic Rights
      1.2.1. Chicago Conference 1944 11
      1.2.2. Chicago Convention 1944 13
   1.3. Bilateral Air Service Agreements 15
      1.3.1. Substantial Ownership and Effective Control Clause 16
      1.3.2. Prohibition of Cabotage 23
   1.4. New Developments, Questions and Problems 23
Table of Contents

2. Economic Background 24
   2.1. Deregulation in the United States 1978 24
   2.2. Liberalisation in the European Union 1993 30
      2.2.1. Three Liberalisation Packages 30
      2.2.2. Relationship between the European Community and Third Countries 35
         2.2.2.1. General 35
         2.2.2.2. Open Skies Agreements 39
         2.2.2.3. Reactions to the ECJ Judgment 45
         2.2.2.4. Comments on the ECJ Judgments on Open Skies Agreements 46

3. Modern Trends 50
   3.1. Liberal Bilateral and Open Skies Agreements 50
   3.2. Consolidation, Globalisation and Concentration 53
   3.3. Difficulties of Mergers and Equity Sharing between Airlines of Different Nationalities 54
   3.4. Difficulties in Exchanging Traffic Rights on a Multilateral Basis 55
   3.5. Forming Alliances to Meet Competition and Consumer’s Preferences 56

4. Airline Alliances 56
   4.1. Different Models of International Airline Alliances and Their Growth 56
   4.2. Benefits of International Airline Alliances for Airlines 63
   4.3. Benefits of International Airline Alliances for Consumers 65
   4.4. Disadvantages of International Airline Alliances: Anti-Competitive Practices 67
# Table of contents

4.5. Antitrust Immunity for International Airline Alliances 68
4.6. Comments on International Airline Alliances 68

5. Application of Competition/Antitrust Law to the International Air Transport Sector 70
   5.1. Inevitability of Application of Competition/Antitrust Law 70
   5.2. Special Attention Required in International Air Transport 72
   5.3. Escalation of Conflicts and Differences in Applications of Competition/Antitrust Law to International Economic Activities 73
   5.4. Effects of Applying Competition/Antitrust Law to International Economic Activities 73
Concluding Remarks 74

Chapter 2: Overview of European Community Competition Law and Its Applications to Transatlantic Airline Alliances 81

1. Basic Background to EC Competition Law 81
   1.1. Brief Introduction to the European Union 81
      1.1.1. The European Community and Its Legal Institutions 82
      1.1.2. The Legal Instruments 84
   1.2. Sources of EC Competition Law 85
   1.3. Relationship between the European Community and Member States regarding Competition Law 86
   1.4. EC Competition Law and the Air Transport Sector 87

2. Substantive EC Competition Law 88
   2.1. Article 81 of the EC Treaty 89

xi
# Table of Contents

2.1.1. The Prohibition of Article 81(1) 89
2.1.2. The Legal Effects of An Infringement of Article 81(1) 91
2.1.3. Group and Individual Exemptions under Article 81(3) 91

2.2. Article 82 of the EC Treaty 93
2.2.1. General Concepts 93
2.2.2. Relevant Market 93
2.2.3. Existence of Dominant Position 98
2.2.4. Abuse of Dominant Position 100
2.2.5. Application of Article 82 in the Air Transport Sector 100
2.2.6. Interface of Articles 81 and 82 102

2.3. The Implementation of EC Competition Law 103
2.3.1. General Implementation: Council Regulation No.17/62 103
2.3.2. Special Exemptions in Air Transport Sector 104
   (A) Council Regulation No. 141/62 104
   (B) Case: Nouvelle Frontière 106
   (C) Council Regulation No. 3975/87 107
   (D) Council Regulation No. 3976/87 109
   (E) Case: Ahmed Saeed 110
   (F) Commission Proposal for Amending Council Regulation Nos.
      3075/87 111

2.4. Merger Control and Joint Venture 113
2.4.1. Background to the European Community Merger Regulations
   ("ECMR") 113
2.4.2. The Relationship between the ECMR and Articles 81 & 82 114
2.4.3. The ECMR and Air Transport 115
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4. An Overview of the ECMR</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4.1. Basic Elements of the ECMR</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4.2. Notification and Procedure</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.5. Applications of the ECMR in the Air Transport Sector</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Applications of EC Competition Law to Economic Activities with Foreign Elements Involved</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Applications under Articles 81 and 82 of the EC Treaty</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. Before the <em>Wood Pulp</em> Case</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. The <em>Wood Pulp</em> Case</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3. Other Relevant Developments</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Applications of the ECMR</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. EC Competition Policy</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Overview</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. International Co-operation and the Commission’s Mandate</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. The Limited Scope of 1991 and 1998 Agreements</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. EC Competition Policy in the Air Transport Sector</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Applications of EC Competition Law to International Airline Alliances</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.1. LH/SAS Alliance</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.2. LH/SAS/BMI Alliance</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.3. LH/OS Alliance</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1.4. AF/AZ Alliance</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. Commission Notices on Transatlantic Airline Alliances</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1. KLM/Northwest (&quot;Wings&quot;) Alliance</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

6.2.2. LH/United/SAS ("Star") Alliance 140
6.2.3. BA/AA ("Oneworld") Alliance 143
6.2.4. Air France/Delta ("SkyTeam") Alliance 144
6.3. Comments on the Commission Notices on the KLM/NW, LH/United/SAS and BA/AA Alliances 145
Concluding Remarks 148

Chapter 3: Overview of US Antitrust Law Governing International Air Transport and Its Applications to Transatlantic Airline Alliances 151

1. Overview of Substantive US Antitrust Laws 152
   1.1. Basic Economics of US Antitrust Laws 152
   1.2. Substantive US Antitrust Laws 153
       1.2.1. The Sherman Act 154
           1.2.1.1. Section 1 of the Sherman Act 154
           1.2.1.2. Section 2 of the Sherman Act 156
           1.2.1.3. Relationship between the Sherman Act and Oligopoly 162
           1.2.1.4. Major Differences between Section 1 and Section 2 of the Sherman Act 163
       1.2.2. The Clayton Act – Mergers and Acquisitions 164
   1.3. Enforcement of US Antitrust Laws and Related Legal Departments 170
2. Applications of US Antitrust Laws to Economic Activities with Foreign Elements Involved 171
   2.1. Judicial Interpretations: From American Banana to Laker Airways 172
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Legislative Contribution: Direct, Substantial, and Foreseeable Effect Doctrine</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Academic Contribution: Reasonableness</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. A Step Backward: <em>Hartford Fire Insurance</em></td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5. Executive Contribution: Antitrust Enforcement Guidelines for International Operations</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1. Overview</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2. Defences against US Application</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. US International Antitrust Policy</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. US Antitrust Laws and International Air Transportation</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Special Provisions for International Air Transportation</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Antitrust Immunity and Public Interest Test</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1. The United States Code</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2. Procedural Rules</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Specific Regulatory Department</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. US Policy in International Air Transportation</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. DOT Decisions on Transatlantic Alliance Agreements</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1. Open Skies Agreements Required</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. Public Interest Test</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3. Merger Guidelines Invoked</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4. Definition of Relevant Market and the Carving-Out of Immunity</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5. Need for Competitive Remedies</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6. Requirement of Withdrawal from All IATA Tariff Co-ordination</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7. Computer Reservation System Issues</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of contents

4.1.2. Rationale for Tariff Co-ordination Process 232

4.1.3. Anti-Competitive Risks of Tariff Co-ordination Agreements 233

4.2. Comparison of the of EC Competition Laws and US Antitrust Laws Applicable to the Tariff Co-ordination/Consultation Agreement 234

5. Differences in Interpretations and Applications of Laws 236

5.1. Defining the Relevant Market 236

5.2. Market Power and Dominant Position 239

5.3. Approaches to the Application of Competition/Antitrust Law to International Economic Activities 239

6. Comparison of the EC and US Authorities’ Reviews of Transatlantic Airline Alliances 242

6.1. Divergent Evaluations of Market Concentration 243

6.2. Concept of Anti-Competitive Practices 245

6.3. Different Remedies 246

7. Differences in Merger Control and Alliances (Joint Venture) 248

7.1. Differences in Applications of Laws to Alliances 248

7.2. Applications of Merger Regulations: Similar Rules but Contradictory Decisions 249

7.3. Clashes in Individual Cases 254

8. Differences in Policies 260

8.1. EC Competition Policy with Regard to International Air Transport 261

8.1.1. From the Judicial Point of View 261

8.1.2. From the Executive Point of View 262

8.1.3. From Case Studies 264

8.2. US Antitrust Policy with Regard to International Air Transport 265

xvii
Table of Contents

8.2.1. Application of US Antitrust Law to International Economic Activities 266
8.2.2. From the Perspective of Deregulation 266
8.2.3. Exporting “Open Skies” 267
8.2.4. DOT’s Approval of Antitrust Immunity for alliance Agreements 268
8.2.5. Approval of the Merger between Boeing and McDonnell Douglas 269
8.2.6. Analysis of US Antitrust and International Air Transport Policy 269

Concluding Remarks 270

Chapter 5: The Current International Competition Regulations regarding International Air Transport 273

1. Introduction 273
2. Multilateral Approach 273

2.1. A Unified International Competition Law 274
2.1.1. Havana Charter 274
2.1.2. United Nations Conference on Trade and Development Code 275
2.1.3. Munich Proposal- Draft International Antitrust Code 277

2.2. Review of Multilateral Approaches 279
2.3. Special Concerns in International Air Transport 280

3. Special Proposal for Applying Competition/Antitrust Law to International Air Transport 282
3.1. International Civil Aviation Organisation (“ICAO”) 282
3.1.1. Role of the ICAO 282
Table of contents

3.1.2. Contributions of the ICAO  282
3.1.3. Review of the ICAO's Contributions  286

3.2. World Trade Organisation (“WTO”)  287
3.2.1. GATT/GATS Mechanism  287
3.2.2. Different Considerations regarding Applying GATS to International Air Transport  289
3.2.3. Trade and Competition Policy under the WTO  293
3.2.4. Limits of GATS with regard to Trade in Services in International Air Transport  293

3.3. Other International Organisations  295

4. Regionalism  296
4.1. Supranational Approach  296
4.2. Transatlantic Common Aviation Area  299

5. Doctrine of Comity and Co-operation between Governments  305
5.1. Bilateral and Cooperative Approach  306
5.1.1. US and EC Comity Agreements  307
5.1.2. Review of US and EC Comity Agreements  310
5.2. Organisation on Economic Co-operation and Development Recommendations  311
5.3. Benefits of Comity Doctrine and Co-operation  314
5.4. Limits of Comity Doctrine and Co-operation  314

6. Synthesis  315

7. Convergence of Competition Policies  317
7.1 OECD: Global Forum on Competition  317
7.2. US: Global Competition Initiative  318
Table of Contents

7.3. EC: Global Competition Forum 319
7.4. Review of the GCF, GCI and ICN 321
Concluding Remarks 321

Chapter 6: Conclusion and Recommendations 323

1. Introduction 323
2. Brief Review of the Essential Elements for Fair and Free Competition in the International Air Transport Market 324
   2.1. Elements in Aviation Law 324
   2.2. Elements in Application of Competition Law to International Air Transport 325
3. Recommendations 326
   3.1. An International Air Transport Market with Free Competition 326
      3.1.1. Multilateral Approaches to Exchanging Traffic Rights 326
      3.1.2. Eliminating the Limitations on Ownership/Control and Cabotage 329
   3.2. Rules for Reducing the Conflicts over the Applications of Competition Laws to International Economic Activities 330
      3.2.1. Safeguarding Public Interests via the Application of Competition Law 331
      3.2.2. Harmonising Approaches to Applying Competition Laws to International Economic Activities 332
      3.2.3. Harmonisation in Procedures and Institutions 332
      3.2.4. Unified Criteria for Granting Immunity/Exemption 333
Table of contents

3.2.5. Harmonisation of Divergent Evaluations of Market Access 335
3.2.6. Harmonising the Concept of Anti-Competitive Practices 337
3.2.7. Providing Reliable Remedies 337
3.2.8. Convergence of Competition Policies 337

4. Supplements to Present Solutions 338
  4.1. Bilateral Agreements 339
    4.1.1. Expanding Application and Strengthening Binding Force 339
    4.1.2. Suggestions on Harmonising Substantive Laws 341
    4.1.3. Unified Procedural Rules 342
    4.1.4. Forum for Convergence of Competition Policies 342
  4.2. Transatlantic Common Aviation Area 343

5. Assistance from International Organisations 345

Concluding Remarks 346

Bibliography 349

Subject Index 407