State Measures Distorting Free Competition in the EC

A study of the need for a new Community policy towards anti-competitive State measures in the EMU perspective

Carl Michael von Quitzow
Jean Monnet Professor of EC-Law

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK
Contents

Acknowledgements xv
Foreword xvii
List of Abbreviations xix

Part A. Introduction; Competition Law in the
Community's Legal System

1. The Notion of Competition 3

1.1 Competition in a semantic and economic context 3
1.2 'Restriction of competition' and 'distortion of competition' 4

2. The Perspectives of Competition Policy 7

2.1 Distortions of competition in the 'Spaak report' 7
2.2 The function of Community competition policy in the system of
the EC Treaty 8
2.3 The competition policy regarding distortions of competition in
relation to private undertakings; a short survey 11
2.4 The competition policy in relation to State action in the market 15

3. Methodological Issues 17

3.1 The scope of the study and delimitations 17
3.2 The method of the study 18
3.3 State measures in earlier literature 19
3.4 Definitions and terminology 19
# Part B. Relevant Community Primary Legislation

4. **Different Types of National Measures Distorting Competition**

   4.1 Introduction
   4.2 Differences in national legislation
   4.3 Opting out of Community legislation
   4.4 Specific legislation according to different legal traditions in the Member States
   4.5 Economic policy measures
   4.6 Political measures
   4.7 State monopolies
   4.8 State participation in the market
   4.9 State aid
   4.10 Taxes
   4.11 Measures related to financing
   4.12 Miscellaneous
   4.13 Conclusions

5. **The Rules of the Treaty in relation to State Measures Distorting Cross-Border Competition - an Overview**

   5.1 Introduction
   5.2 Article 3(g)
   5.3 Article 10 (former Article 5)
   5.4 Article 12 (former Article 6)
   5.5 Article 34.2 (former Article 40.3)
   5.6 Article 71 (former Article 75)
   5.7 Article 81 (former Article 85)
   5.8 Article 82 (former Article 86)
   5.9 Article 86 (former Article 90)
   5.10 Articles 87-89 (former Article 92-94)
   5.11 Article 90 (former Article 95)
   5.12 Articles 94 and 95 (former Articles 100 and 100a)
   5.13 Articles 96 and 97 (former Articles 101 and 102)
   5.14 Certain issues on the sectorial policies of the Treaty; CAP and CTP
   5.15 Conclusions
### 6. The Aims and Principles of the Treaty in relation to Competition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Introduction</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 The rules of the Treaty concerning free movement in relation to</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the competition rules</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 The nature of State measures distorting free competition</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Relevant case law of the Court regarding passive distortions and</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>free movement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Recent case law of the Court due to passive distortions in relation</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to Articles 3(g), 10 and 81 (former Articles 5 and 85)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Distortions of competition due to active State measures</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1 Public undertakings</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.2 The notion of a public undertaking</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.3 Direct effect of Article 86</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.4 Duties of Member States regarding publicly owned undertakings</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and undertakings enjoying particular rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.5 Limits of public influence on undertakings</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.6 Measures contravening the Treaty</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.7 Exemptions provided for by Article 86.2</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.8 Public interests benefiting from the exemption</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.9 The sectors in which Article 86 may play an important role</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.10 The tasks of the Commission</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.11 Activities of the Commission according to Article 86.3</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.12 A survey of the case law concerning Article 86 and the</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>general test to be applied within the scope of that provision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.13 Article 86 and recent developments regarding State monopolies</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1.14 Conclusions</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2 State aid (Articles 87-89, former Articles 92-94)</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.2 Delimitation in relation to other Treaty provisions</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.3 State aid and public undertakings</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.4 State aid and regional development</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.5 Balancing of interests</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.6 Trends in relation to the granting of State aid</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2.7 Systematic aspects of the Treaty rules regarding aid</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

6.6.2.8 The role of the Court of Justice 147
6.6.2.9 Other sources 148
6.6.2.10 The notion of aid 151
6.6.2.11 The market investor principle 153
6.6.2.12 The extensiveness of the notion 'State aid' 154
6.6.2.13 Distortion of competition 157
6.6.2.14 Requirements and conditions set by the Commission for the granting of exemptions enabling Member States to grant subsidies 160
6.6.2.15 Conclusions on the substantive aspects regarding State aid 164
6.6.2.16 Procedural aspects 165
6.6.2.17 The distinction between existing and new subsidies 168
6.6.2.18 The position of private undertakings 171
6.6.2.19 Conclusions 172
6.7 Distortions of competition due to indirect taxation 173
6.7.1 Introduction 173
6.7.2 The notion of fiscal discrimination 173
6.7.3 The definition of competing products 175
6.7.4 The need to define the relevant market 175
6.7.5 De Minimis 176
6.7.6 Balancing of interests 176
6.7.7 Prohibition against double taxation 177
6.7.8 Protectionist motives 177
6.7.9 Third-country products 177
6.7.10 Harmonization 178
6.7.11 Conclusions 178
7. Distortions of Competition and Harmonization 181
7.1 The scope of harmonization 181
7.2 Harmonization by the use of Article 94 183
7.3 Harmonization through Article 95 185
7.4 More specifically about harmonization and the clearing away of distortions of competition 188
7.5 Harmonization by the use of Articles 96 and 97 (former Articles 101 and 102) 189
CONTENTS

7.5.1 Introductory remarks 189
7.5.2 Further about the criteria for the application of Article 96 191
7.5.3 Formal aspects of the application of Article 96 197
7.5.4 Relation to other Treaty provisions 198
7.5.5 The predecessors of Article 96 199
7.5.6 Article 97 (former Article 102) 199
7.5.7 The same way of reasoning applies in agriculture and transport fields despite that the Community holds exclusive competence in these fields 202

8. Distortions of Competition and Harmonization in some Specific (Flanking Policy) Areas 203

8.1 Social policy and culture (Articles 136-145, former Articles 117-128) 203
8.2 Public health and consumer protection (Articles 152 and 153, former 129-129a) 206
8.3 Trans-European networks (Articles 154-156, former 129b-129d) 207
8.4 Industry (Article 157, former 130) 207
8.5 Economic and social cohesion (Articles 158-162, former 130a-130e) 208
8.6 Research and technological development (Articles 163-173, former 130f-130p) 209
8.7 Environment (Articles 174-176, former 130r-130t) 209
8.8 Development cooperation (Articles 177-181, former 130u-130y) 211
8.9 Summary on flanking/new policy areas 212
8.10 Conclusions 212

9. Local Regulations in the Case Law of the Court 215

9.1 Distortions of competition as a result of differences between national legislation relating to competition relations in the case law of the Court 215
9.2 The distinction between active and passive distortions 216
9.3 Distortions of competition as a result of State intervention in the market 223
9.4 Market regulatory effects versus anti-competitive effects 227
9.5 A wider use of market definitions 229
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Market thresholds and subsidiarity</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Evaluation of the Case Law of the Court</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Cross-border effects and purely internal effects</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Some introductory reflections on de minimis and subsidiarity</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Legal basis for Community secondary legislation affecting cross-border competition situations</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Subsidiarity and the legal basis for Community legislation affecting cross-border competition situations</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>Some reflections on issuing secondary Community legislation affecting cross-border competition</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part C. Summary and Conclusions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>A Summary and Chronological Survey of the Case Law of the ECJ in relation to State Measures Distorting Free Competition</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>The first period; the identification of problems</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>The second period; liberalization as a rule</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>The third period; hesitation and subsidiarity</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Discussions in legal literature on anti-competitive State measures</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>Intermediate conclusions regarding active distortions</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>Intermediate conclusions regarding passive distortions</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Articles 3(g), 10 and 81 Construction</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>The limits of case law</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>Would it be possible to adopt a wider approach on the basis of the mentioned provisions?</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

13. The Use of Articles 96 and 97 263
   13.1 Introduction 263
   13.2 Why have the mentioned provisions not been used? 263
   13.3 Options and limits of the provisions 263
   13.4 Subsidiarity and Article 96 264
   13.5 Conclusions 264

14. Articles 86 and 87 265
   14.1 Introduction 265
   14.2 The limits of the provisions 265
   14.3 Is there a need for changes regarding the application of these provisions? 265

15. The EMU 267
   15.1 Objectives and instruments 267
   15.2 National competence and EMU 269
   15.3 Conclusions

16. The Need to Clear Away Distortions of Competition 271
   16.1 Introduction 271
   16.2 The need for enhanced competition and further control mechanisms at Community level 271
   16.3 Local regulations versus global competition requirements 271

17. Conclusions and Proposed Solutions 273
   17.1 The notion of serious threat against market integration 273
   17.2 Appreciable effects and de minimis as operative criteria 273
   17.3 Pros and cons of the proposed solutions 273
   17.4 Judicial remedy aspects 274
   17.5 Conclusions 274
## Part D. Possible Future Developments Concerning State Measures Distorting Free Competition

18. **The Future Perspective**

18.1 Competition as an essential part of the Community mechanisms

18.2 Access to competitive instruments/rule of reason

18.3 Natural distortions of competition

18.4 Artificial distortions of competition; differences between national legislation and State action

18.5 Harmonization and anti-distortive policies, a de lege feranda perspective

19. **The Possibility of a Multi Speed Europe**

19.1 The concept of a two-speed integration

19.2 Multi-speed integration and competition

19.3 Conclusions concerning flexible integration and the clearing away of distortions of competition

20. **Conclusions**

**Table of Cases**

**Bibliography**

**Index**

**Other Titles in this Series**